




fit in with 'real' punks. Both chapters appeal to a sense of authentic selfhood as a proposed solution. The paradox is interesting, but it probably does not need to be treated twice. While each essay offers a slightly different analysis of and solution to the paradox, the strikingly parallel treatments undercut the book's Wittgensteinian framing by showing more convergence than diversity.

In other cases, content-overlap draws attention to an inevitable feature of edited volumes, viz. the variability of writing styles and uneven quality of the chapters. For instance, Gwenda-Lin Grewal's 'A Punk by Any Other Name Would Smell as Rotten' (Chapter 11) and Christopher M. Innes's 'Revolting Punks' (Chapter 14) both treat Diogenes's punk sensibilities. Rather than feeling redundant, in this case, Grewal's essay stands out as an example of a particularly risky chapter. Grewal's essay, and a handful of others in the book, seem to embody punk's spirit by challenging the norms of philosophical writing. Punk though it might be, the danger in rebelling against established writing norms is that, like some punk songs, the audience may find it stylistically off-putting.

Finally, there is something a little strange about the project as a whole. One seemingly central feature of punk is a commitment to not 'selling out'. While the contributors to this volume boast impressive punk credentials, buying a book about punk from a major publishing house does feel a bit like seeing Henry Rollins in a commercial for Calvin Klein. To be fair, Markus Kohl's 'The Post-Punk Struggle for Authenticity' (Chapter 10) and a number of others directly address the issue of 'selling out' – and whether one can be an authentic punk in an age where punk is now a commodity unto itself.

Each chapter provides a Ramones song-length glimpse into a philosophical theme in punk, affording readers the opportunity to benefit without having to set aside several hours at a time to work through a dense academic text. At the same time, the thematic consistency provides a nice narrative cohesion for anyone reading cover-to-cover. So what does philosophy have to do with punk? *Punk Rock and Philosophy* will convince readers that punk is deeply philosophical and philosophy is punk as fuck.

Kristopher G. Phillips 

Eastern Michigan University  
[kphill50@emich.edu](mailto:kphill50@emich.edu)

## Reference

*Jacobellis v. Ohio*, 378 U. S. 184 (1964)

**Naná Vasconcelos's *Saudades*. By Daniel B. Sharp. Bloomsbury Academic, 33 1/3 Brazil series, 2021. 272 pp. ISBN: 978-1-501-34570-8**  
doi:10.1017/S0261143023000454

Daniel B. Sharp contributes to the Bloomsbury '33 1/3' series' Brazil list by taking a biographical approach in his treatment of *Saudades*, giving relatively little space to the album itself to understand the many choices and fortuitous events in the life of Brazilian musician Naná Vasconcelos (1944–2016) resulting in its creation.

The book traces a genealogy of Vasconcelos' musical innovations during the 1960s and 1970s, as the artist contributed to music scenes in Recife, Rio de Janeiro, Manhattan, Paris and Europe, before working on this album with Egberto Gismonti, released in 1979 (p. 12). Thinking about this varied and global career, in which *Saudades* is just one moment – Vasconcelos recorded through the 2000s – Sharp argues that 'jazz is the glue' (p. 82). In tracing Vasconcelos' musical career centred around his virtuosity on the berimbau, a folkloric instrument he employed in many jazz and electric psychedelic rock compositions drawing on an 'accumulated musical vocabulary', Sharp underscores how artistic creators learn from each other and how these relations affect ideas; his chapters are divided into significant encounters with people or places (105). Sharp's greatest contribution is his preference for particularising detail over homogenising sociological abstraction, with an engaging narrative style focusing on his subject's life and the local influences that formed his approach, which previously have not enjoyed a similar attention in English.

Vasconcelos was from Pernambuco, the Brazilian northeast, where the Brazilian counterparts of jazz swing are *suíngue* and *balanço*, with 'ecstatic, interlocking poly-rhythms' (45) influenced by Xangô toaque, a variety of Candomblé percussion. Vasconcelos escaped the stifling role of 'culture bearer' many Brazilians adopted abroad, argues Sharp, because 1960s Pernambuco itself reveled in experiment over stasis, serving as a laboratory for Paulo Freire's educational ideas and movements advocating state policies. Vasconcelos participated in several popular theatre collectives, before moving from the northeast to Rio, then abroad, in search of musical growth. In New York, Vasconcelos developed a consciousness of the importance of Indigenous and Afro-Brazilian popular culture, living with documentary filmmaker Glauber Rocha, a time of mutual influence. During the next decades, Vasconcelos collaborated extensively – he played tabla on Clementina de Jesus' 'Taratá'; brought together Arto Lindsay and Pat Metheny to watch Knicks *vs.* Celtics and make music; worked with tabla player Trilok Gurtu; recorded an album with guitarist Agustín Pereyra Lucena, *El Increíble NANA*; jammed with Gato Barbieri; and contributed to several projects with Don Cherry, a rich engagement that joined musical traditions from Africa, America and Asia, incorporating local chance sounds. Their collaborations included jazz trio Codona and the album *Don Cherry's New Researches featuring Vasconcelos' Organic Music Theatre*, featuring mouth noises and body percussion; the group toured in a VW Camper customised for driving in lotus position (80), where Naná played a glass version of the *ghatam*, or South Asian clay pot. Cherry's fascination with combining South American and Afro-diasporic styles with South Asian percussion, influenced by Indian Karnatak vocal melodies with devotional lyrics replaced by 'ah' and 'eh' sounds, coincided with Vasconcelos' interest in rhythmic textures crossing geographical boundaries.

With Gismonti, Vasconcelos discovered an 'explosive and complementary musical chemistry' that resulted in *Dança das Cabeças* (1970), then *Saudades* (p. 13). Sharp depicts the encounter as a moment of latent possibilities made manifest. Vasconcelos loved the sound images of Héctor Villa-Lobos and Karlheinz Stockhausen, while Gismonti was ambivalent toward erudition. *Saudades* was recorded in March 1979, with Gismonti's string orchestration. Their label, ECM, is known for its recording locations such as monasteries and concert halls favouring the creation of atmosphere, as well as its contemplative detail and acoustic-enhanced realism captured with highly precise top microphones. Vasconcelos' participation was a product of the political situation; Gismonti invited Nana to record with only

48 hours' notice, since the military government made travel difficult for his band. Those were the *anos de chumbo*, or leaden years, when Tropicalists were imprisoned and exiled to London, and Milton Nascimento had to replace the censored lyrics of his 1973 *Milagre dos Peixes* with wordless vocals.

Sharp addresses the common, sometimes allied struggle of jazz and 'world music' to make a space for themselves. A 1918 anti-jazz editorial 'The Location of Jazz', published in *New Orleans Times-Picayune*, speaks of the 'denigrated status of rhythm within Eurological notions of music', mentioning 'the hum of the Indian dance . . . the thumpy-tumpy of the [Black] banjo, and, in fact, the native dances of the world' (p. 23). In the case of Brazilian rhythms, the popularity of samba in the 1920s and 1930s gave way to the popularity of MPB and bossa nova, which reached global audiences through the soundtrack to the 1959 film *Black Orpheus*. In subtle ways, these patterns persisted through the 1970s. An essay by Manfred Eicher, head of ECM, 'The Periphery and the Centre', still operates in dichotomous terms: 'Those who are serious about culture will try to position themselves at the periphery and see how they are mirrored from there. The meaning of a culture reveals itself in its plenitude only through encounter and contact with a culture different, even alien to it' (p. 93). ECM press for *Saudades* reinforced the idea of Brazilian rhythms, and of Vasconcelos' and Gismonti's jazz, as representative of a premodern past. Its contrast of jungle with conservatory evoked a first encounter, notions also linked to blackness and wildness, in parallel to the more famous case of Jimi Hendrix. Rhythm was associated with howling and savagery, and a clean, steady pitch with humanity and civilisation. This 'nostalgia for primitivism', argues Sharp, was present in a great deal of European writing of the time, tropes that Nana struggled with as he carried his berimbau around Paris; he found himself most comfortable working as resident musician with schizophrenic children in a French hospital (65).

Sharp also focuses on transformations in musical technology. As sound mixing moved from mono to stereo, Vasconcelos stood out for his 'cinematic sense' of the parallax, or three-dimensional stereo field, deploying a playful yet deliberate placement of sounds. Sharp additionally praises him as a master of timing, with acoustic practices that drew on percussive vocals and a creative use of the Foley process, blurring boundaries between speech, melody and shout. Vasconcelos' dense harmonies layered 'a composition on top of a composition', to 'tell stories through sound' (p. 157).

The book ends with Sharp's brief track-by-track analysis of *Saudades*. In 'O Berimbau', the emphasis is on Vasconcelos' berimbau, which he strikes with a stone; in 'Vozes (Saudades)', a voice alludes to freedom, the 1888 abolition of slaves and the Quilombo dos Palmares, a community of escaped Africans and allies in 17th-century Portuguese Pernambuco; in 'Ondas (Na Ohlos de Petronila)', lyrics focus on a drought-prone region and 19th-century millenarian preacher Antonio Conselheiro, who spoke of apocalyptic transformation reaching from sertão to sea, in a track where tabla drums are spaced at centre/left and conga drums at centre/right to paint a sonic image; in 'Cego Alderaldo', Vasconcelos becomes a troubadour of the *cantoria de viola* as the song follows a 12-pulse cycle for Indian tabla, according to Sharp correcting the Orientalism of Baden Powell's 'O Cego Alderego' that treated the Northeast and Amazonas as 'others' within Brazil; in 'Dado', Vasconcelos works at higher pitches, in a track that could be a

friend's nickname, or in a more philosophical interpretation, a stock-taking of what life has given.

Here, as in many cases, Sharp's readings offer a refreshing alternative to more abstract or panoramic studies of Brazilian music, and justify the 33 1/3 series. An idiosyncratic figure like Vasconcelos, difficult to locate in national categories and musical genres, is well served by Sharp's more particular and speculative listenings made from his own sensibility, which infuse dense history with a more personal, indefinable nostalgia of remembrance, grief and love – his own *saudades*.

Jessica Sequeira 

Centre of Latin American Studies, Cambridge  
[js875@cam.ac.uk](mailto:js875@cam.ac.uk)

***Music City Melbourne: Urban Culture, History and Policy.* By Shane Homan, Seamus O'Hanlon, Catherine Strong and John Tebbutt. New York: Bloomsbury Academic Press, 2022. 213 pp. ISBN 978-1-501-36572-0  
doi:10.1017/S0261143023000223**

'City' and 'music' are terms that have been yoked together in different ways and to different ends over the last few years. 'Music city', for example, has circulated widely as of late, speaking to and for a diverse set of constituencies involved in urban music-making. Under this rubric, certain cities over others come to be called 'music cities'. For some, this occurs organically, and informally, by virtue of the depth of their musical histories, notable artists or renowned scenes, a legacy anchored to a culture supported by bars, bands, record shops, labels, local media (and, more recently, underwritten by urban policy makers). It is a title earned over time, emerging out of some combination of these aspects, in such a way that the city acquires a certain gravitas or a distinctive mythology. This can then serve as a semi-otic resource, which can be drawn from or mobilised by any number of those stakeholders invested in music-making. The results can be altruistic and/or opportunistic, shaping affective and creative affinities as much as political or policy responses, available as it is to musicians, audiences, venue owners, label owners, etc., through to the media, tourism operators, policy makers and urban brand managers.

'City of Music' shares in some of these aspects, but as of late has acquired a more formal dimension, being a title granted by application to UNESCO. Cities of Music around the globe include Auckland (Aotearoa/New Zealand), Ghent (Belgium), London (Canada), Ramallah (Palestine) and Norrköping (Sweden), among many others. It is up for debate that these cities of music are in fact the pre-eminent music cities in their respective nations, although they no doubt have robust musical cultures. That is, in part, because this appellation comes down to strategy, shoring up a city's musical resources to meet certain criteria as defined by UNESCO (hosting festivals, having institutional and industrial networks that feed into the city's musical culture, attract national and international artists, etc.). Teams need to be formed, blessings of local governments sought, bids then need to be packaged up and nominations entered before the designation is secured. And while there are advantages to being anointed a 'City of Music', connecting that city to others in the network for instance, where that title sits in the national