

RESEARCH TIMELINE

Analysing culture in language learning materials

Karen Risager

Roskilde University, Roskilde, Denmark

Email: risager@ruc.dk

(Received 26 April 2022; accepted 28 April 2022)

1. Introduction

This introduction contains three parts: First, a presentation of the timeline, including the selection of target languages. Second, an overview of trends of development in the international research field from the 1960s up until today. Third, a list of categories used in the subsequent table of annotated works.

2. Part I: The present timeline

2.1 Number of works, time span, delimitation of genres, and research foci

Scholarly interest in research on language learning materials, their production, cultural content, and use in intercultural learning, as well as their political and ideological significance, has been growing since the 1960s. ‘Cultural content’ here refers to the various textual and visual representations of a potentially wide spectrum of aspects such as people, everyday life and communication, ideas and concerns, languages, institutions, geography, and history. Underlying the whole field is an epistemological interest in ideologies concerning the cultural content, such as national stereotypes, middle-class bias, gender stereotypes, lack of ethnic and racial diversity, dominance of an ideology of individualism and consumerism, and so forth. The field has experienced an increased interest since the 1990s, and especially in recent years (see below), with a diverse development of methods and theories, a plethora of critical research questions, the inclusion of a growing number of target languages in the studies, and a growing number of publications (in many languages as well), among them a range of anthologies, monographs, and journal special issues (e.g., Canale, 2021; Curdt-Christiansen & Weninger, 2015; Gray, 2013; Risager 2018*).

The present timeline contains a small selection from this vast literature: 76 items. The selection consists of important and influential monographs, journal articles, and book chapters – most of them collected as part of my work with a larger project on representations of the world in language textbooks (Risager 2018*). The first work included in the timeline is from 1967. Before that, textbooks were also sometimes mentioned and evaluated – for example, in language teaching journals – but that was typically in the form of shorter reviews of recent publications. The timeline does not contain encyclopedia entries, but some entries may be mentioned here: Koreik and Pietzuch (2010); Risager (2010); Risager and Chapelle (2013); Verdelhan and Sercu (2013); and Weninger (2018).

The emphasis in the field at large, and in this timeline, is on *TEXTBOOK ANALYSIS* (where the ‘textbook’ typically stands for a printed book or book series, perhaps accompanied by audiovisual and digital materials and teacher’s and student’s guides). At the same time, there is somewhat less emphasis in the field, and in the timeline, on related fields such as *TEXTBOOK RECEPTION* (by students, teachers, authors) or on actual *TEXTBOOK USE IN CLASS*, although these are also important fields. Some of the publications in the timeline do include studies of reception and/or use; for example, Dechert and Kastner (1989)*; Sercu (2000)*; and Gray (2010)*. Other important publications – which are not in the

*Denotes the full reference is in the subsequent timeline.

timeline but address issues of reception and/or use – are, for example, Byram and Esarte-Sarries (1991); Sercu et al. (2005); McConachy (2018); and Derakhshan (2021). Furthermore, it should be noted that there are not many references to *TEXTBOOK DEVELOPMENT* in the timeline; compare this with the large literature on the design of textbooks to facilitate (English) language learning, including the composition of speech acts, grammatical structures, tasks, texts, and genres (Tomlinson, 2012; Tomlinson and Masuhara, 2010). However, many textbook analyses in the timeline do discuss ideas of enhancement or adjustment of existing materials, or present ideas of alternative materials.

The field dealt with here is strongly marked by interdisciplinarity. It reaches out of the field of linguistics and language education to find ways of interpreting the multiple aspects of cultural content accompanying language education. Thus, there are often references to scholars in the wider field of social sciences and humanities. It may be other scholars working in the field of language education, such as Byram (1997) or Kramsch (1993) (see also the timeline in Risager, 2011), or it may be other influential scholars like Bourdieu (1982); Fairclough (2002); Freire (1981); Geertz (1973); Kress and van Leeuwen (2006); and Lakoff (1975). There are many references to the general field of critical textbook analysis as well, particularly Apple and Christian-Smith (1991); Luke (1989); or Luke (2015).

2.2 Selection of target languages

Since the 1960s, textbook analysis with a focus on cultural representations has been applied to materials for more and more target languages. At the same time, a major problem is that the field is very fragmented (Weninger & Kiss, 2015*). Analyses are typically scattered in many different journals and other publications, each focusing on one language. There is not much communication or collaboration across languages, and this means that there is very little exchange of ideas across languages.

Since English has a dominant role among the widely taught foreign languages, analyses of textbooks for English constitute the largest field in terms of number of publications, and theoretical and methodological approaches. More and more researchers in other languages than English refer to studies of textbooks for English. This means that discourses and worldviews originating in the field of analysis of cultural representations in English language teaching (ELT) textbooks tend to be transferred to the analysis of textbooks for other languages and other language communities. This is unfortunate and a reflection of Western and especially Anglophone dominance in global academia (Risager, 2021).

To counterbalance this dominance, I have included as many target languages as I could (and also authors and publishers from many parts of the world). In most cases, English (43 times), but also French (12), German (12), and Spanish (11). To a lesser extent, Chinese (2), Russian (2), and Swahili (2). Whereas the following languages are dealt with only once: Arabic, Catalan, Danish, Esperanto, Italian, Korean, Latin, and Portuguese. Some publications deal with more than one target language.

Of course, this selection and distribution is related to my personal language repertoire and to my general knowledge about the world, which is marked by a European, Scandinavian perspective. I read Danish, Norwegian, Swedish, English, German, French, Spanish, and Esperanto, and have a more limited experience with Portuguese, Italian, Russian, and Latin. I do not read Arabic, Catalan, Chinese, Korean, or Swahili. As can be seen in the timeline, I have read about some of these target languages in publications written in English. The distribution of languages in the timeline might have been otherwise if I had known other languages, and I expect that there are publications in other languages that I am not aware of. The use of more and more languages as academic languages (which I welcome) makes it increasingly difficult to make international surveys of research by single individuals. It is becoming necessary to draw on multilingual collaboration for this sort of work.

3. Part II: Trends of development in the field of textbook analysis

In the following, the overview of trends of development is divided into three sections (for more thorough treatment, see the historical analyses in Risager (2007) and Risager (2012):

1. Representations of countries and the world (Figure 1 and comments)
2. Representations of sociocultural identities (Figure 2 and comments)
3. Methods of analysis (Figure 3 and comments)

3.1 Trends of development: Representations of countries and the world

Since the 1960s and during the whole period until now, we see many textbook analyses that focus on the representation of countries seen as coherent entities, for example, the USA (Heuer, 1967*), Germany (Byram, 1993*), and China (Hong & He, 2015*). The ‘country’ (or state/nation) is often chosen as the general frame of analysis, based on the (simplistic) idea that a language is typically associated with one or more specific countries. This kind of analysis may deal with many different dimensions of culture and society, such as everyday life, famous people, values, national institutions, and geography. It typically aims to exemplify and discuss national stereotypes, prejudices, and clichés, and argues for more realistic representations.

This national approach is often (in European language teaching) associated with the German concept of *Landeskunde*: knowledge of the country. The concept developed already in the last decades of the 1800s and was the object of a long debate among teachers in Germany (the various German states) until the 1970s. It concerned the aims and content of language and culture teaching: Should *Landeskunde* (the most unmarked term) focus on geographical and social facts (*Realienkunde*), or on cultural values and products (*Kulturkunde*), or on the national character of the people (*Wesenskunde*), or on the lives of different groups of people (*Leutekunde*)? Today, the debate is still well-known in German-speaking countries but takes new forms in accordance with the international development of the field.

Since the late 1980s and onwards, we see the cultural turn in large parts of (Western) humanities. There is an increased interest in culture, in (perceived) cultural differences, and in intercultural communication and understanding. There are interculturally oriented analyses of representations of target-language countries from the perspective of the learners, and a growing interest in the study of different voices (Canagarajah, 1993*; Kramsch, 1988*; Sercu, 2000*, Shardakova & Pavlenko, 2004*).

Since the 1990s, the center of research begins to leave the exclusive European/US-American scene and become more international. In the same period, it becomes more and more evident that the changing status of the English language into international and lingua-franca uses requires new approaches to the cultural content of ELT textbooks. Should textbooks still focus on ‘English-speaking’ countries, or should they (also) deal with the country of learning, or have a more transnational (international, global/local, universal) scope? (Adaskou et al., 1990*, Cortazzi and Jin, 1999*). Similar questions are raised in relation to other widely used languages, such as French (Starkey, 1991*) and Spanish (Eide, 2012*). In some parts of the world, for example in the Middle East, we see analyses of representations of the country of learning in EFL materials, for example, Morocco (Adaskou et al., 1990*), Pakistan (Mahboob, 2015*), and Iran

Period	Representations of countries and the world
1960s	target-language countries
1970s	
1980s	cultural differences, intercultural perspectives
1990s	the international scene; the country of learning
2000s	the global perspective; national and colonial history
2010s	

Figure 1. Representations of countries and the world: Chronological summary

(Dahmardeh & Kim, 2021*). Of course, materials for second language teaching, such as ESL for immigrants in Australia, typically focus on the country of learning.

Since around 2000, we see a growing emphasis on the global perspective in textbook analysis, not only with reference to English but other languages as well (Copley, 2018*; Gray & Block, 2014*; Risager, 2007; Risager, 2018*). In the same period, we see an increasing awareness of the role of history in cultural representations. It may be national history (Maijala, 2004*) or colonial history. There are postcolonial analyses that point to stereotypical historical accounts and argue for greater awareness of postcolonial situations and for decolonisation of language teaching at large (Risager, 2021; Thomas 2017*; Vinall, 2012*).

In the current situation, scholarly work in the field is characterised by, on the one hand, geographical and linguistic diversification and, on the other hand, concentration on one language: English. Textbooks for more and more languages are studied, not least on the background of transnational mobility (labour migration, etc.). Scholarly work is published in more and more languages. At the same time, the changing status of English into an international second language for educated people in many parts of the world, gives rise to a multitude of textbooks for English, often nowadays published locally and perhaps dealing primarily with the country of learning. This may foreground dilemmas of globalism and nationalism, (neo)colonialism and postcolonialism, and values: Western values, Confucian values, Islamic values, and others.

3.2 Trends of development: Representations of sociocultural identities

Before the 1970s, there was a tendency to treat the people of a country as a homogeneous group with a specific national character.

Since the 1970s, social class has been a dimension included in analyses, but not very prominently (Andersen & Risager, 1977*). That changes, however, during the 2010s, where a number of scholars stress the importance of drawing attention to the invisibility of the working class in language learning materials (Copley, 2018*; Gray, 2010*; Gray & Block, 2014*). They conduct critical analyses of neoliberalist ideology in global ELT coursebooks produced in Britain. Bori (2018*) draws attention to similar ideologies in textbooks for Catalan as a second language (for immigrants).

Since the 1970s, gender bias or sexism has been taken up; for example, by Hartman & Judd (1978*), with reference to textbooks for English in the US. Since then, and particularly since the publication of Porreca (1984*), the research focus on gender roles and gender stereotypes has proliferated in many countries, including Middle East countries like Pakistan, Saudi-Arabia, and Iran (Hall, 2014*).

Since the 1990s, issues related to ethnicity and race have been the object of critical analyses (Awayed-Bishara, 2015*; Canagarajah, 1993*; Thomas, 2017*). This development is part of the

Period	Representations of sociocultural identities
1960s	('the people' – national character)
1970s	social class gender
1980s	
1990s	ethnicity/race
2000s	religion
2010s	sexual orientation

Figure 2. Representations of sociocultural identities: Chronological summary

broad research interest in ethnic diversity and migration, in race and racism, and in postcolonial and decolonial studies.

Since the 2000s, religion and religious diversity has been taken up with studies like Ndura (2004*) on the invisibility of religion in US textbooks for English as a second language, and Mahboob (2015*) on religious education in a textbook for English in Pakistani public schools.

Since the 2010s, sexual orientation and the invisibility of LGBT+ people, as well as the role of heteronormative ideology has begun to be pointed out; for example, by Gray (2013*).

In the current situation, studies of representations of gender are on the rise in many parts of the world. Maybe we will also see intersectional studies across identity parameters like gender, sexuality, race, social class, religion, age, and so forth. Generally, the force of identity struggles and identity politics is strong in these times, and perhaps this will be reflected in textbook analyses that point to examples of discrimination, erasure and silencing of particular identities (e.g. speakers of minority languages in target-language countries). Perhaps we will also see analyses dealing with representations of global citizenship and issues like climate change and sustainable development (and not only in English language materials).

3.3 Trends of development: Methods of analysis

A basic dimension of language textbook analysis is the composition of textbooks for analysis. Textbook studies may concentrate on a particular textbook but very often we see that textbook studies consist of a limited number of textbooks that are compared in some way, whether it is a more systematic comparison or an assemblage of parallel analyses. The study may focus on two or more textbooks for a particular language, used in the same period in a particular country, and produced in that country, perhaps by the same publishers. Or the textbooks may have been produced in different countries; for example, in a target-language country and in the country of learning. The study may investigate textbooks for the same language but that are used in different countries. Or it may be a historical study focusing on textbooks produced over a longer period. There are also investigations of textbooks for a smaller number of different target languages, perhaps used in the same country.

Language textbooks constitute a composite genre typically consisting of many different elements: imagined conversations, drawings, photos, fiction texts and lyrics, non-fiction texts, instructions by the author, exercises, statistics and graphs, videos, and so forth. In the context of this diversity of genres, modes, and voices, many different methods of analysis have been exploited. Weninger and Kiss (2015*) propose to distinguish between three main approaches: content analysis, critical discourse

Period	Methods of analysis
1960s	content analysis
1970s	
1980s	intercultural analysis
1990s	critical discourse analysis
2000s	semiotic analysis
2010s	

Figure 3. Methods of analysis: Chronological summary

analysis, and semiotic analysis. I follow this tripartition but with some reservations concerning the first approach. I would like to highlight the existence of a family of intercultural methods of analysis that expand content analysis as it is traditionally understood.

Since the 1960s, many textbook analyses have been based on a form of content analysis, which is typically a quantitative approach: counting units like lexemes, country names, language names, cultural themes, and so forth. This has become much easier with the development of computational methods. Content analysis is, of course, accompanied by qualitative reflection and argumentation (Krippendorff, 2013 [1980]).

Since the 1980s, and the cultural turn referred to above, textbook analyses have expanded these qualitative elements in intercultural directions, drawing inspiration from the humanities: interpretative anthropology (Byram, 1993*), communication/literature studies (*énonciation*: Auger, 2007*), and dialogic and poststructuralist studies (Kramersch, 1988*, Kramersch, 1993).

Since the 1990s, critical discourse analysis has been on the rise. First, it should be emphasised that most textbook analyses, also those that apply content analysis/intercultural analysis, take their point of departure in a critical attitude to some aspects of the textbooks they are analysing; for example, dissatisfaction with national stereotypes. But from the 1990s, with the publication of Dendrinos (1992*), textbook analyses begin to refer to critical discourse analysis as a main inspiration (e.g., Fairclough, 2002), and thus introduce studies of ideology in language textbooks. This approach has been taken up by many others, especially after the publication of Gray (2010*) on neoliberal ideology in ELT global coursebooks (see also Littlejohn, 2012). As critical discourse analysis of textbooks typically refers to the larger social practices of textbook production and reception, this approach would point to the fact that textbooks produced by private publishing companies primarily reflect editors' perceptions of customer demands and tastes on local or global markets. In a somewhat similar way, textbooks produced by local authorities reflect their ideas of the learners as future citizens.

Since around 2000, semiotic analysis has been included among the methods. Already in the period since the late 1960s, the role of visual design (drawings, photos, decoration, colours) became more and more prominent in language learning materials, and some scholars commented on this. But not until about 2000 (Elissondo, 2001*), and especially after 2010 (Tyrer, 2012*, Weninger & Kiss, 2013*), we see a growing interest in approaches to semiotic analysis directed at the analysis of images and text-image relations, inspired by work in the field of multimodality (Kress & van Leeuwen, 2006).

In all the approaches mentioned above, there may be a special emphasis on the cultural dimensions of language and discourse. It may be questions related to the role of language and discourse in the construction of cultural representations (Kramersch, 1988*), or questions related to the construction of the relationship between the textbook and the learners (Auger, 2007*).

In the current situation, we see a great diversity of methods existing together, and they may be combined. Semiotic analysis is popular, and perhaps we will see semiotic analyses of other kinds of cultural representations as, for example, in virtual-reality materials. Critical discourse analysis is also popular. The great interest in textbook analysis of many kinds may lead to more studies of textbooks as cultural and ideological products that need to be read with critical eyes by both teachers and learners.

4. Part III: Categories used in the annotated table

A Target language(s) (their names in English ordered alphabetically)

A1 Arabic	A9 Italian
A2 Catalan	A10 Korean
A3 Chinese (Mandarin)	A11 Latin
A4 Danish	A12 Portuguese
A5 English	A13 Russian
A6 Esperanto	A14 Spanish
A7 French	A15 Swahili
A8 German	A16 No specific language

B Composition of textbooks for analysis

- B1 One textbook (or textbook series)
- B2 Two or more textbooks, same language, same country of use, same place of production
- B3 Two or more textbooks, same language, same country of use, different places of production
- B4 Two or more textbooks, same language, different countries of use
- B5 Two or more textbooks, same language, different times of production
- B6 Two or more textbooks, two or more languages

C Focus on representations of countries and the world

- C1 Focus on individual target-language countries (country)
- C2 Focus on the country of learning
- C3 Transnational (international, global/local, universal)
- C4 History and postcolonial relations

D Focus on representations of sociocultural identities

- D1 Social class
- D2 Gender
- D3 Race, ethnicity
- D4 Religion
- D5 Sexual orientation

E Methods of analysis

- E1 Content analysis/intercultural analysis
- E2 Critical discourse analysis
- E3 Semiotic analysis
- E4 Focus on the cultural dimensions of language and discourse

References

- Apple, M. V., & Christian-Smith, L. K. (Eds.). (1991). *The politics of the textbook*. Routledge.
- Bourdieu, P. (1982). *Ce que parler veut dire. L'économie des échanges linguistiques*. Fayard.
- Byram, M. (1997). *Teaching and assessing intercultural communicative competence*. Multilingual Matters.
- Byram, M., & Esarte-Sarries, V. (1991). *Investigating cultural studies in foreign language teaching*. Multilingual Matters.
- Canale, G. (Ed.) (2021) Language textbooks: Representation, interaction and learning. Special issue of *Language, Culture and Curriculum* 34(2).
- Curd-Christiansen, X. L., & Weninger, C. (2015). *Language, ideology and education. The politics of textbooks in language education*. Routledge.
- Derakhshan, A. (2021). Should textbook images be merely decorative? Cultural representations in the Iranian EFL national textbook from the semiotic approach perspective. *Language Teaching Research*, 41. Published online. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1362168821992264>
- Fairclough, N. (2002). *Analyzing discourse: Text analysis for social research*. Routledge.
- Freire, P. (1981). *Education for critical consciousness*. Paolo Freire. Continuum.
- Geertz, C. (1973). *The interpretation of cultures. Selected essays by Clifford Geertz*. Basic Books.
- Gray, J. (2013). *Critical perspectives in language teaching materials*. Palgrave Macmillan.
- Koreik, U., & Pietzuch, J. P. (2010). Entwicklungslinien landeskundlicher Ansätze und vermittlungskonzepte. In H. J. Krumm, C. Fandrych, B. Hufeisen, & C. Riemer (Eds.), *Deutsch als fremd- und zweitsprache* 2. Halbband (pp. 1442–1454). De Gruyter Mouton.
- Kramsch, C. (1993). *Context and culture in language teaching*. Oxford University Press.
- Kress, G. R., & van Leeuwen, T. (2006). *Reading images: The grammar of visual design*. Routledge.
- Krippendorff, K. (2013) [1980]. *Content analysis: An introduction to its methodology* (3rd ed.). Sage.
- Lakoff, R. (1975). *Language and woman's place*. Harper and Row.
- Littlejohn, A. (2012). Language teaching materials and the (very) big picture. *Electronic Journal of Foreign Language Teaching*, 9 (Suppl. 1), 283–297.
- Luke, A. (1989). Open and closed texts: The semantic/ideological analysis of textbook narratives. *Journal of Pragmatics*, 13(1), 53–80.
- Luke, A. (2015). Cultural content matters. A critical sociology of language and literacy curriculum. In X. L. Curdt-Christiansen, & C. Weninger (Eds.), *Language, ideology and education. The politics of textbooks in language education* (pp. 207–220). Routledge.

- McConachy, T. (2018). Critically engaging with cultural representations in foreign language textbooks. *Intercultural Communication*, 29(1), 77–88.
- Risager, K. (2007). *Language and culture pedagogy: From a national to a transnational paradigm*. Multilingual Matters.
- Risager, K. (2010). Landeskunde in der Germanistik im nichtdeutschsprachigen Europa. In H. J. Krumm, C. Fandrych, B. Hufeisen, & C. Riemer (Eds.), *Deutsch als fremd- und zweitsprache* 2. Halbband (pp. 1511–1520). De Gruyter Mouton.
- Risager, K. (2011). Research timeline: The cultural dimensions of language teaching and learning. *Language Teaching*, 44(4), 485–499.
- Risager, K. (2012). Introduction: Intercultural learning: Raising cultural awareness. In M. Eisenmann, & T. Summer (Eds.), *Basic issues in EFL teaching and learning* (pp. 143–155). Universitätsverlag Winter.
- Risager, K. (2021). Language textbooks and popular geopolitics: Representations of the world and (post)colonial history in English and French. *Journal of Postcolonial Linguistics*, 5, 12–30.
- Risager, K., & Chapelle, C. A. (2013). Culture in textbook analysis and evaluation. In C. A. Chapelle (Ed.), *Encyclopedia of applied linguistics* (pp. 5). Wiley/Blackwell.
- Sercu, L., Bandura, E., Castro, P., Davcheva, L., Laskaridou, C., Lundgren, U., Méndez García, M. C., & Ryan, P. (2005). *Foreign language teachers and intercultural competence. An international investigation*. Multilingual Matters.
- Tomlinson, B. (2012). Introduction: Textbooks and materials evaluation. In M. Eisenmann, & T. Summer (Eds.), *Basic issues in EFL teaching and learning* (pp. 343–355). Universitätsverlag Winter.
- Tomlinson, B., & Masuhara, H. (Eds.). (2010). *Research for materials development in language learning: Evidence for best practice*. Continuum.
- Verdelhan, M., & Sercu, L. (2013). Textbooks. In M. Byram, & A. Hu (Eds.), *Routledge encyclopedia of language teaching and learning* (2nd ed.) (pp. 720–724). Routledge.
- Weninger, C. (2018). Textbook analysis. In C. A. Chapelle (Ed.), *The encyclopedia of applied linguistics* (pp. 10). Wiley/Blackwell.

Karen Risager is Professor Emerita in Intercultural Studies at Roskilde University, Denmark. Her research interest is the complex relationships between language and culture in a transnational and global perspective, and the consequences for the view of foreign and second language teaching and learning and the analysis of cultural representations in language learning materials. Other selected publications include: *Language and culture: Global flows and local complexity* (Multilingual Matters, 2006); *Language and culture pedagogy: From a national to a transnational paradigm* (Multilingual Matters, 2007); *Representations of the world in language textbooks* (Multilingual Matters, 2018); and *Language textbooks: Windows to the world*, *Language, Culture and Curriculum* 34(2), 2021, 119–132.

Year	Reference	Annotation	Category
1967	Heuer, H. (1967). Zur Problematik des Amerikabilides in den Englisch-Lehrbüchern der Volksschule. <i>Jahrbuch für Amerikastudien</i> , Bd., 12, 227–239.	In post-WWII West Germany (BRD), the recognition of the importance of factual knowledge and understanding of other countries was growing. Heuer made one of the first studies of the image of America in textbooks for English in (West) German schools. He pointed to a range of stereotypes about cowboys, Indians and ‘the West’. In his work, he was inspired by American cultural anthropology, and he also drew on the long German debate on <i>Landeskunde</i> (knowledge of the country) in language teaching.	A5 B2 C1 E1
1977	Andersen, H., & Risager, K. (1977). Samfunds – og kulturformidling. In: E. Glahn, L. K. Jakobsen & F. Larsen (Eds.) <i>Fremmedsprogs pædagogik</i> (pp. 27–55). Gyldendal.	Andersen & Risager discussed the importance of securing socially realistic images of target-language countries. They undertook an analysis of (Danish) textbooks for French, English, German, and Latin. They referred to the French debate on language teaching and were also inspired by the German debate on <i>Landeskunde</i> (see also Andersen, H. & K. Risager, 1981, What did you learn in French today? <i>ITL Review of Applied Linguistics</i> 53, 23–36).	A5, A7, A8, A10 B6 C1 D1 E1
1978	Hartman, P. L., & Judd, E. L. (1978). Sexism and TESOL materials. <i>TESOL Quarterly</i> , 12(4), 383–393.	Critical analysis of textbooks and other learning materials in the USA started with a focus on sexism in English as a second language. Hartman & Judd described several kinds of sexism, including sex bias in the use of the English language, inspired by American sociolinguistics.	A5 B2 C2 D2 E1, E4
1979	Neuner, G. (1979). Zum Wandel der Englischlehrwerke der Sekundarstufe I in der Bundesrepublik seit dem zweiten Weltkrieg. In: G. Neuner (Ed.) <i>Zur Analyse fremdsprachlicher Lehrwerke</i> (pp. 40–67). Peter Lang.	Neuner undertook an analysis of the changing linguistic, cultural, and methodological contents of textbooks for English from the idealistic approaches of the 1950s to the pragmatic and communicative approaches of the 1960s and 1970s. He was inspired by American cultural anthropology and pragmatics.	A5 B5 C1 D1 E1
1979	Schulze, M. (1979). Das England- und Amerikabild im Englischunterricht der DDR dargestellt am Lehrwerk ‘English for you’. In: G. Neuner (Ed.) <i>Zur Analyse fremdsprachlicher Lehrwerke</i> (pp. 118–166). Peter Lang.	Schulze analysed a (state authorised) comprehensive textbook series for English in East Germany (DDR). He pointed out the strong focus on working class life in the UK, the USA, DDR, and the Soviet Union (see also GRAY & BLOCK, 2014; BORI, 2018), as well as the focus on space research and the Moon landings.	A5 B2 C1 D1 E1
1984	Alptekin, C., & Alptekin, M. (1984). The question of culture: EFL teaching in non-English-speaking countries. <i>ELT Journal</i> , 38(1), 14–20.	Although this article is not about textbook analysis in particular, it has been a starting point for many subsequent analyses of culture in ELT materials (see ADASKOU ET AL., 1990). Alptekin & Alptekin discussed the dangers of English teaching becoming a tool of Anglo-American sociocultural domination, based on native-speaker norms and values.	A5 C3
1984	Porreca, K. L. (1984). Sexism in current ESL textbooks. <i>TESOL Quarterly</i> , 18(4), 705–724.	This is a very influential article on sexism in ESL textbooks (used in the USA). Porreca surveyed the field and proposed a framework for systematic, quantitative studies of sexism in learning materials, including omission of women, firstness (of males), occupational visibility in text and illustrations, masculine generic constructions and the use of adjectives. Porreca referred to HARTMAN & JUDD (1978), as well as the broader debates on sexism in the USA.	A5 B2 C2 D2 E1, E4

Year	Reference	Annotation	Category
1985	Auerbach, E. R., & Burgess D. (1985). The hidden curriculum of survival ESL. <i>TESOL Quarterly</i> , 19(3), 475–495.	Auerbach & Burgess analysed a range of ESL materials for adult refugees and immigrants in the USA. The analysis showed that materials were middle-class oriented and lacked communicative reality, and the authors argued that materials should encourage creative and critical thinking and be more empowering. They drew on critical pedagogy and sociology.	A5 B2 C2 D1 E1, E2
1985	Krauskopf, J. (1985). <i>Das Deutschland- und Frankreichbild in Schulbüchern</i> . Gunter Narr Verlag.	This is a comparative and historical analysis of textbooks for German in France and textbooks for French in West Germany (BRD) since the 1950s. Krauskopf looked at the mutual representations of the two countries in the textbooks and the increasing focus on contemporary everyday life with an emphasis on leisure and consumption, illustrated with more and more photos.	A7, A8 B5, B6 C1 E1
1988	Ammer, R. (1988). <i>Das Deutsch-landbild in den Lehrwerken für Deutsch als Fremdsprache</i> . Iudicium.	This is a comprehensive and influential <i>Landeskunde</i> study. Ammer analysed the image of West Germany (BRD) in a large number of textbooks written by West German authors and produced since 1955. He showed how the image was generally positive in the first decades and how problematic sides of society and everyday life became ever more present during the 1970s and 1980s. Ammer emphasised the difference between practically oriented textbook evaluation and (academic) textbook analysis. He referred to the German debate on <i>Landeskunde</i> .	A8 B2 C1 E1
1988	Hino, N. (1988). Nationalism and English as an international language: The history of English textbooks in Japan. <i>World Englishes</i> , 7(3), 309–314.	In this article, Hino traced the role of nationalism in relation to the cultural content of ELT materials in Japan during the past 120 years. She distinguished between five periods, showing that in periods when Anglo-American culture was greatly admired in Japan, textbooks dealt with British and American values, and when Japanese culture was greatly admired, the contents of textbooks reflected traditional Japanese values. See PAVLENKO (2003).	A5 B5 C1, C2
1988	Kramsch, C. (1988). The cultural discourse of foreign language textbooks. In: A. J. Singerman (Ed.) <i>Towards a new integration of language and culture</i> (pp. 63–88). Northeast Conference on the Teaching of Foreign Languages.	In this important book chapter, Kramsch presented a comprehensive discussion of (American) textbooks seen as cultural products characterised by specific conditions of production, reception, and learning. She emphasised the importance of teaching cultural meanings and raising the awareness of different voices, and she referred to the analysis of textbooks for German (focusing on the topic of ‘sports’) in Kramsch, C. (1987) Foreign language textbooks’ construction of foreign reality. <i>The Canadian Modern Language Review</i> 44(1), 95–119. See KRAMSCH & VINALL (2015).	A8 B2 C1, C3 E2, E4
1989	Dechert, C., & Kastner, P. (1989). Undergraduate student interests and the cultural content of textbooks for German. <i>Modern Language Journal</i> , 73(2), 178–191.	Dechert & Kastner made a quantitative analysis of textbooks for German in US high schools in the 1980s, based on an inventory of 99 cultural topics (religion, ethnic groups, biographies, etc.). They compared this with an investigation of students’ favourite topics and found a considerable difference between the two parts of the study. Students wanted more topics dealing with ordinary daily life. They referred to PORRECA (1984).	A8 B2 C1 E1

1989	Littlejohn, A., & Windeatt, S. (1989). Beyond language learning: Perspectives on materials design. In: R. K. Johnson (Ed.) <i>The second language curriculum</i> (pp. 155–175). Cambridge University Press.	In this article, Littlejohn & Windeatt focused on the importance of being aware of the hidden curriculum in language learning materials. They distinguished between six main areas, including general and subject knowledge, and values and attitudes presented in the materials. They mentioned examples of gender roles and stereotypes (here they referred to PORRECA (1984)), as well as racial stereotypes and under-representation of black people.	A5 C1 D2, D3
1990	Adaskou, K., Britten D., & Fahsi. B. (1990). Design decisions on the cultural content of a secondary English course for Morocco. <i>ELT Journal</i> , 44(1), 3–10.	Adaskou et al. described a large-scale textbook project in Morocco including questionnaires and discussions with teachers concerning their attitudes to English teaching. Based on this, it was suggested to focus on people in Morocco using English for various purposes – a kind of de-Anglo-Americanisation of ELT. They referred to ALPTEKIN & ALPTEKIN (1984).	A5 B1 C2
1990	Ramirez, A. & Hall, J. (1990). Language and culture in secondary level Spanish textbooks. <i>Modern Language Journal</i> , 74(1), 48–65.	This is one of the first analyses of cultural content in textbooks for Spanish in the US. Ramirez & Hall distinguished between five major themes, and noted among other things that topics like poverty, malnutrition, and political strife were absent. They were inspired by textbook analyses in Europe and referred to KRAMSCH (1987, 1988).	A14 B2 C1, C2 D1 E1
1991	Risager, K. (1991). Cultural references in European foreign language teaching textbooks: An evaluation of recent tendencies. In: D. Buttjes & M. Byram (Eds.) <i>Mediating languages and cultures</i> (pp. 181–192). Multilingual Matters.	This influential book chapter by Risager discussed the content of textbooks for English, German and French since the 1950s in Europe. It presented a model of textbook analysis that was inspired by the <i>Landeskunde</i> debate but also included issues regarding international and intercultural aspects such as mutual representations and questions of cultural power and dominance, co-operation, and conflict. In addition, it included point of view and style of the author(s). Risager referred to KRAUSKOPF (1984). See RISAGER (2018).	A5, A7, A8 B6 C1, C3 D1 E1
1991	Starkey, H. (1991). World studies and foreign language teaching: Converging approaches in textbook writing. In: D. Buttjes & M. Byram (Eds.) <i>Mediating languages and cultures</i> (pp. 209–221). Multilingual Matters.	This article contained a description of a textbook for French, produced in the UK (Aplin, R., et al. <i>Orientations</i> , 1985). Starkey was one of the authors, and that textbook stood out as being clearly transnationally and globally oriented, and not only limited to the French-speaking world. Starkey has taken a world perspective in all his work since the 1980s on human rights education and world studies.	A7 B1 C1, C3 E1
1992	Dendrinis, B. (1992). <i>The EFL textbook and ideology</i> . Grivas Publications.	This is the first monograph dealing explicitly with foreign language textbooks as ideological constructs, with illustrations taken from textbooks for English as a foreign language (e.g. in Greece). Dendrinis discussed the role of the institutionally authorised textbook in the positioning of pupils as learners and social subjects. She drew mainly on critical sociology and pedagogy, and PORRECA (1984).	A5 B2 C1, C3 D1, D3 E2, E4
1993	Byram, M. (1993). Criteria for textbook evaluation. In: M. Byram (Ed.) <i>Germany: Its representation in textbooks for teaching German in Great Britain</i> (pp. 31–40). Verlag Moritz Diesterweg.	Together with Doyé, Byram carried out a large textbook project, published in two volumes: the present one and P. Doyé (Ed.) (1991) <i>Großbritannien. Seine Darstellung in deutschen Schulbüchern für den Englischunterricht</i> . Frankfurt a.M.: Verlag Moritz Diesterweg. Byram proposed a list of criteria for textbook evaluation, focusing on the definition of minimum content related to target-language countries, such as social identity and social groups, socialisation, and the life-cycle, and national history. He referred to RISAGER (1991).	A5, A8 B6 C1, C4 D3 E1

Year	Reference	Annotation	Category
1993	Canagarajah, A.S. (1993). American textbooks and Tamil students: Discerning ideological tensions in the ESL classroom. <i>Language, Culture and Curriculum</i> , 6(2), 143–156.	The focus of this often-cited article is on the glosses that Tamil students had inscribed in their textbooks for ESL in Sri Lanka. Canagarajah described the various glosses: political, cultural, cinematic, and sexual glosses, and interrogated the ideological tensions they reflected. He interpreted the students' discourses as counter-discourses providing them with greater power in their social milieu.	A5 B2 C2 D1, D3 E2, E3
1999	Cortazzi, M., & Jin, L. (1999). Cultural mirrors. Materials and methods in the EFL classroom. In: E. Hinkel (Ed.) <i>Culture in second language teaching and learning</i> (pp. 196–219). Cambridge University Press.	Cortazzi & Jin created an influential model for discussing cultural content in EFL and ESL textbooks, noting that the content may relate to the learners' own culture (C1), the target culture(s) (C2), or any other culture ('international cultures') (C3, C4, C5, etc.). They also stressed that the teacher, the different students, and the textbook may not share the same culture. They referred to BYRAM (1993) and RISAGER (1991).	A5 C1, C2, C3
2000	Ilieva, R. (2000). Exploring culture in texts designed for use in adult ESL classrooms. <i>TESL Canada Journal</i> , 17(2), 50–63.	Ilieva made an exemplary critical discourse analysis of extracts from an ESL textbook used in Canada, dealing with the theme of department stores. She identified a range of discourses in the texts, such as colonial and capitalistic discourses, and class discourses favouring the middle class. The extracts did not provide sufficient possibilities for the experiences and reflections of the students as immigrants to come forward. Ilieva drew on critical approaches, CANAGARAJAH (1993) and CORTAZZI & JIN (1999).	A5 B1 C2 D1, D3 E2
2000	Sercu, L. (2000). <i>Acquiring intercultural communicative competence from textbooks. The case of Flemish adolescents learning German</i> . Leuven University Press.	In this book-length study, Sercu investigated textbooks for German in Belgium as well as students' perceptions of Germany and the cultural content of the textbooks. She distinguished between outsider-tourist and insider-family perspectives in textbook content and argued that intercultural competence was best supported if the textbook comprised many different perspectives, both from within and from without. She referred to AMMER (1988), BYRAM (1993), and RISAGER (1991).	A8 B2 C1 D1
2001	Elissondo, G. (2001). Representing Latino/a culture in introductory Spanish textbooks. <i>National Association of Hispanic and Latino Studies. Monograph Series, 1</i> , 71–99. ERIC478020.	Elissondo examined the cultural content of three textbooks for Spanish produced in the US, with special emphasis on the role of visuals in the representation of ethnicity, class, gender, age, and sexual inclination. She showed how visuals and verbal text legitimated certain versions of reality and certain interests, while making other possible versions and interests invisible or distorting them.	A14 B2 C1 D1, D2, D3, D5 E1, E3
2002	Dumont, P. (2002). Les manuels de FLS et la francophonie. <i>ELA, 2002(1)</i> (125), 111–121.	Dumont focused on approaches to the concept of francophonie in textbooks for French as a second language used in francophone countries in Africa, Southeast Asia, the Middle East, and the Caribbean. He found differences in their discourses on the francophonie: universalist discourses, discourses of linguistic and cultural diversity and of conflictual co-existence, discourses affirming that the French language belongs to all francophone people.	A7 B4 C3, C4 E1, E4

2002	González Casado, P. (2002). Contenidos culturales e imagen de España en manuales de E/LE de los años noventa. <i>Forma</i> , 4, 63–86.	In this analysis of textbooks for Spanish as a foreign language, published in Spain, González Casado identified a large number of lacunae in textbook images of Spain. For example, she noted that if the textbooks were the learners' only source of information on Spain, they would not know whether Spain is in Oceania or in Africa, or whether there are political parties in Spain.	A14 B2 C1 E1
2002	Gray, J. (2002). The global coursebook in English language teaching. In: D. Block & D. Cameron (Eds.) <i>Globalization and language teaching</i> . Routledge.	In this article, Gray described the commerce of the global ELT coursebook and its content – its vision of the world. He discussed the guidelines of ELT publishers, which tend to cover two areas, namely inclusivity (of women and their diverse jobs) and inappropriacy (of a range of topics referred to by the acronym PARSNIP, i.e. politics, alcohol, religion, sex, narcotics, isms, and pork). He referred to PORRECA (1984).	A5 C3
2003	Pavlenko, A. (2003). Language of the enemy. Foreign language education and national identity. <i>International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism</i> , 6(5), 313–331.	In an important article, Pavlenko argued for taking account of the wider geopolitical context of foreign language education. Is the target language the language of an ally? Is it the language of an enemy or oppressor? Is it the language of a former coloniser? Her examples focused on the changing status of German and other foreign languages in the USA and of Russian and other foreign languages in Hungary.	A8, A13 C3, C4 E2
2003	Pulverness, A. (2003). Materials for cultural awareness. In: B. Tomlinson (Ed.) <i>Developing materials for language teaching</i> (pp. 426–438). Continuum.	This is a chapter from the field of materials development centred on the production of global coursebooks for English with a focus on language and communication aspects. Pulverness was critical of the idea of language as a code. He called for greater attention to the language-culture relation, for more pluralistic representations of English-speaking cultures, and for a greater interest in the cultural identities of the learners. See GRAY (2010).	A5 B4 C3 E4
2004	Majjala, M. (2004). <i>Deutschland von außen gesehen</i> . Peter Lang.	In this monograph, Majjala investigated the representation of history in textbooks for German as a foreign language in five European countries. The textbooks, which had been produced in the countries in question, reflected very different traditions, perspectives, and historical experiences, both concerning the countries themselves and their historical relations with Germany. Majjala referred to AMMER (1988).	A8 B4 C1, C3, C4 E1
2004	Ndura, E. (2004). ESL and cultural bias: An analysis of elementary through high school textbooks in the Western United States of America. <i>Language, Culture and Curriculum</i> , 17(2), 143–153.	Ndura made an often-cited analysis of textbooks for ESL in the US with respect to stereotyping, invisibility, and unreality. She especially emphasised the invisibility of religious diversity and discussed the impact of this on students' perceptions and intercultural learning. In the end, she suggested five strategies for dealing with stereotypes in learning materials.	A5 B2 C2 D3, D4 E1, E2
2004	Shardakova, M., & Pavlenko, A. (2004). Identity options in Russian textbooks. <i>Journal of Language, Identity & Education</i> , 3(1), 25–46.	In this critical discourse analysis of two textbooks for Russian, produced in the US, Shardakova & Pavlenko focused on the representations of imagined learners (especially the main characters: young, white, middle-class males), and the representation of their Russian interlocutors. The authors stressed the need for more attention to racial, ethnic, and religious diversity in contemporary Russian life.	A13 B2 C1 D1, D3, D4 E2

Year	Reference	Annotation	Category
2006	Bateman, B., & Mattos, M. (2006). An analysis of the cultural content of six Portuguese textbooks. <i>Portuguese Language Journal</i> , 1, Fall 2006. https://www.portugueselanguagejournal.com/	This is an analysis of textbooks for the teaching of Portuguese in the US. They all deal with Brazil, and some of them were produced in the US, others in Brazil. Bateman & Mattos focused mainly on the topic of 'food' (see KRAMSCH (1988)), and noted the lack of voices, perspectives, and points of view of Brazilians representing different social classes, regions, races, ethnicities, and ages.	A12 B3 C1 D1, D3 E1
2007	Auger, N. (2007). <i>Constructions de l'interculturel dans les manuels de langues</i> . E.M.E.	This is a book-length study of textbooks for French produced in 13 different European countries. Auger used enunciation analysis (Fr. <i>énonciation</i>), looking at how (inter)cultural representations emerge in discourse: representations of the other (<i>l'autre</i>) and representations of the same/own (<i>le même</i>). She put special emphasis on the relations between author and students in time and place, including students' possible perceptions of the author's intentions and identity positions.	A7 B4 C1 E1, E4
2007	Leeman, J., & Martínez, G. (2007). From identity to commodity: Ideologies of Spanish in heritage language textbooks. <i>Critical Inquiry in Language Studies</i> , 4(1): 35–65.	Leeman & Martínez examined the titles and prefaces of textbooks for Spanish used in the US, published between 1970 and 2000, to see how ideologies of the Spanish language had changed during this period. The older textbooks celebrate the cultural heritage of Latino families in the US Southwest while the more recent textbooks also stress the economic value of Spanish as a world language.	A14 B5 C1, C2, C3 E2
2008	Curdt-Christiansen, X. L. (2008). Reading the world through words: Cultural themes in heritage Chinese language textbooks. <i>Language and Education</i> , 22(2), 95–113.	Curdt-Christiansen analysed Chinese-produced textbooks used at a Chinese heritage language school in Canada, showing how the textbooks were laden with cultural and moral (Confucian) values such as perseverance, seniority (respect for the elderly), interest in education, and modesty. She emphasised that becoming literate is not an ideologically neutral process.	A3 B2 C1, C2 E2, E4
2008	Pozzo, M. I., & Fernández, S. (2008). La cultura en la enseñanza de español LE: Argentina y Dinamarca, un estudio comparativo. <i>Diálogos Latinoamericanos</i> , 14, 99–128.	This is a comparative study of textbooks for Spanish as a foreign language in Argentina and Denmark. Pozzo & Fernández found very different worldviews in terms of geographical reference. The Argentinian-produced textbooks were nationally or locally oriented and did not deal with other parts of Latin America nor with Spain, while the textbooks used in Denmark privileged Spain to a high degree.	A14 B4 C1, C3 D1
2009	Camase, G. (2009). <i>The ideological construction of a second reality: A critical analysis of a Romanian EFL textbook</i> [MA thesis, Ontario Institute for Studies in Education, the University of Toronto]. https://www.bac-lac.gc.ca/eng/services/theses/Pages/item.aspx?idNumber=784285007	In this book-length study, Camase focused on discourses about the relationship between Romanians and non-Romanians in a textbook for English produced and used in Romania during communism in the 1980s. The discourses were patriotic and nationalistic, giving much more room for Romania than for English-speaking countries. Camase referred to PAVLENKO (2003) and PORRECA (1984).	A5 B1 C1, C3 E1, E2
2009	Chapelle, C. A. (2009). A hidden curriculum in language textbooks: Are beginning learners of French at U.S. universities taught about Canada? <i>Modern Language Journal</i> , 93(2), 139–152.	In this article, Chapelle analysed textbooks for French used in at Northern US universities in order to define and discuss the amount of content about Canada and Quebec. There was no special emphasis on Canada in these textbooks, which suggests a hidden curriculum about where French is spoken (mainly France) and who owns French.	A7 B2 C1 E1

2010	Chen, Y. (2010). Exploring dialogic engagement with readers in multimodal EFL textbooks in China. <i>Visual Communication</i> , 9(4), 485–506.	Chen was one of the first to introduce Bakhtinian dialogism in the study of multimodal resources in textbooks, in this case EFL textbooks produced and used in China. Distinguishing between ‘editor voice’, ‘character voice’, and ‘reader voice’, she showed how different types of relationships between image and text invite different levels of engagement on the part of the reader or learner. See also AUGER (2007).	A5 B2 C1, C3 E3, E4
2010	Gray, J. (2010). <i>The construction of English. Culture, consumerism and promotion in the ELT global coursebook</i> . Palgrave Macmillan.	In his monograph, Gray analysed ELT textbooks produced in Britain for the global market, showing how these textbooks (coursebooks) were marked by neoliberal ideologies favouring individualism, egalitarianism, cosmopolitanism, mobility, consumerism, and affluence, as well as native-speakerism. He also interviewed publishers and EFL teachers about global coursebook production and content. He referred to PULVERNESS (2003).	A5 B4 C3 D1, D2, D3, D5 E1, E2
2010	Gulliver, T. (2010). Immigrant success stories in ESL textbooks. <i>TESOL Quarterly</i> , 44(4), 725–745.	In this article, Gulliver examined strategies of legitimization of success in ESL textbooks for recent immigrants in Canada. The large majority of immigrant experience stories in textbooks had a positive outcome and very few a negative outcome. Thus, Canada is presented as a land of opportunity in which the hard-working almost invariably succeed. Gulliver referred to CANAGARAJAH (1993), NDURA (2004), and PORRECA (1984).	A5 B2 C2 D1, D3 E2
2010	Yamada, M. (2010). English as a multicultural language: Implications from a study of Japan’s junior high schools’ English language textbooks. <i>Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development</i> 31(5), 491–506.	Yamada analysed a number of textbooks for English in Japan from the 1980s to the 2000s, focusing on how they represented ethnic and racial diversity in Japan, and which other countries and continents were represented. She discussed how underrepresentation of Africa, Latin America and India reflected unequal power relations in the global economy.	A5 B5 C1, C2, C3 D3 E1
2012	Azimova, N., & Johnston, B. (2012). Invisibility and ownership of language: Problems of representation in Russian language textbooks. <i>Modern Language Journal</i> , 96(3), 337–349.	Azimova & Johnston examined textbooks for Russian, produced and used in the US (after 1991). They found that there was virtually no representation of non-ethnic Russian speakers of the Russian language, and they discussed this as an erasure linked to the postcolonial situation. They also noted that very few textbooks explained the distinction between ‘russkii’, referring the Russian ethnicity, and ‘rossiiskii’, referring to Russia as a (multi-ethnic) country. They drew on CHAPPELLE (2009) and SHARDAKOVA & PAVLENKO (2004).	A13 B2 C1 D3 E1, E2
2012	Eide, L. (2012). <i>Representasjoner av ‘målspråksområdet’ i fremmedspråksfaget. En studie av Latin-Amerika i lærebøker i spansk</i> [PhD dissertation, University of Bergen].	In this book, Eide examined the representation of Latin America in Norwegian textbooks for Spanish. She distinguished between three different discourses on the (Norwegian) encounter with Latin America: the orientalist ‘Columbus encounter’, the nationally descriptive ‘handbook encounter’, and the more experience-oriented and visual ‘tourist encounter’. She noted an almost total absence of Latin American voices. She referred to RISAGER (1991) and SERCU (2000).	A14 B2 C1, C3, C4 E1, E2

Year	Reference	Annotation	Category
2012	Tyrer, E. (2012). <i>The social-semiotic discourse of the visual element in UK-produced English as a foreign language coursebooks 1960–2009</i> [PhD thesis, University of Brighton]. https://cris.brighton.ac.uk/ws/portalfiles/portal/4754341/EdDApril+2013.pdf	This book-length study is an analysis of global coursebooks produced in the UK between 1960 and 2009, among them the <i>Headway</i> Series. Tyrer argued that there is a hidden curriculum in which texts and images promote the English language and the values of the Anglophone centre and privilege the native English-speaking teacher. Thus, the coursebooks can be seen as a form of cultural imperialism. He proposed a number of changes, among them the development of visual literacy skills. He drew on ALPTEKIN & ALPTEKIN (1984), GRAY (2010), and PORRECA (1984).	A5 B4, B5 C1, C3 E2, E3
2012	Vinall, K. (2012). ¿Un legado histórico? Symbolic competence and the construction of multiple histories. <i>L2 Journal</i> , 4(1), 102–123.	This is an article on how history, in particular ‘the Conquest of the Americas’, is constructed and represented in a lesson taken from a textbook for Spanish, produced and used in the US. Vinall discussed subject positions and ideologies involved and suggested how students’ symbolic competence could be developed through work with, for example, juxtapositions of texts, images, and discourse worlds.	A14 B1 C1, C4 D3 E2, E3, E4
2013	Coffey, S. (2013). Communicating constructions of Frenchness through language coursebooks: A comparison. In: J. Gray (Ed.) <i>Critical perspectives on language teaching materials</i> (pp. 137–160). Palgrave Macmillan.	Coffey compared two textbooks for French: one produced in the UK to be used in the UK, and one produced in France for more global use. Both were France-centric, representing predominantly white, middle-class, heterosexual, native speakers. Coffey noted that both textbooks lack challenging, inclusive content; for example, regarding gender identities.	A7 B4 C1 D1, D3, D5 E2
2013	Gray, J. (2013). LGBT invisibility and heteronormativity in ELT materials. In: J. Gray (Ed.) <i>Critical perspectives on language teaching materials</i> (pp. 40–63). Palgrave Macmillan.	In this book chapter, Gray discussed the very sparse representation of LGBT people in textbooks for English as a foreign or second language, especially global coursebooks. The content of the textbooks was constrained by heteronormativity and commercialism, particularly publishers’ decisions not to segment the market and adapt materials to local needs and discourses. He argued that this situation tended to silence some of the students.	A5 B4 C1, C3 D5 E2
2013	Ros i Solé, C. (2013). Spanish imagined: Political and subjective approaches to language textbooks. In: J. Gray (Ed.) <i>Critical perspectives on language teaching materials</i> (pp. 161–181). Palgrave Macmillan.	In this article, Ros i Solé studied a UK-produced textbook for Spanish. She noted how it avoided political events, such as the causes and aftermaths of war or revolution. Thus, it missed opportunities to address aspects of Hispanic cultures that invoke and challenge students’ own sense of self in multilingual and superdiverse societies. She referred to GRAY (2010).	A14 B1 C1 D3 E2
2013	Thompson, K. D. (2013). Representing language, culture and language users in textbooks: A critical approach to Swahili multiculturalism. <i>Modern Language Journal</i> , 97(4), 947–964.	This article explored the representation of Swahili users and their cultures in US-produced textbooks for Swahili. Thompson used a critical multiculturalism approach as compared to the conservative and liberal approaches found in the textbooks. Her analysis showed how the depiction of a homogenous community of standard Swahili speakers prevented the books from effectively teaching culture. She drew on AZIMOVA & JOHNSTON (2012) and KRAMSCH (1988).	A15 B2 C3 D3 E2

2013	Weninger, C., & Kiss, T. (2013). Culture in English as foreign language (EFL) textbooks: A semiotic approach. <i>TESOL Quarterly</i> , 47(4), 694–716.	This article focused on semiotic analysis with special regard to denotational and connotational meaning in two EFL textbooks produced and used in Hungary. Weninger & Kiss noticed that cultural connotation was very seldom touched upon, and argued that images need to be utilised as icons and symbols in their own right and dealt with as objects of critical discussion in the classroom. The authors referred to <i>CAMASE</i> (2009), <i>CORTAZZI & JIN</i> (1999), and <i>DENDRINOS</i> (1992).	A5 B2 C1, C3 E3
2014	Gray, J., & Block, D. (2014). All middle class now? Representations of the working class in the neoliberal era: The case of ELT textbooks. In: N. Harwood (Ed.) <i>English language teaching textbooks: Content, consumption, production</i> (pp. 45–71). Palgrave Macmillan.	Gray & Block studied the representation of the working class in EFL textbooks, produced for the global market. They argued that capitalist society is a class society and that the supposed demise of the working class in our time is a myth created by neoliberal ideology. In their analysis, they focused on the representation of employment and other topics, emphasising that the editing out of working-class life is a betrayal of working-class learners, who are denied recognition.	A5 B4 C1, C3 D1 E2
2014	Hall, M. (2014). Gender representation in current EFL textbooks in Iranian secondary schools. <i>Journal of Language Teaching and Research</i> , 5(2), 253–261.	Hall carried out an analysis of an EFL textbook produced in Iran in 2012. It was a re-analysis of the 1999 edition of the same textbook (<i>Ansary, H. & Babaii, E. (2003). Subliminal sexism in current ESL/EFL textbooks. Asian EFL Journal, 5(1), 200–241</i>). The study defined the degree of imbalance in gender representation with respect to such aspects as gender visibility, gender-linked occupation possibilities, distribution of spare time, and leisure activities. There were only small differences between the older and the new edition. Hall referred to <i>HARTMAN & JUDD</i> (1978), <i>NDURA</i> (2004), and <i>PORRECA</i> (1984).	A5 B1 C1 D2 E1
2014	Lee, J. F. K. (2014). A hidden curriculum in Japanese EFL textbooks: Gender representation. <i>Linguistics and Education</i> , 27, September, 39–53.	In this article, Lee analysed gender representation in two ELT textbooks used in Japan. She drew on computational analysis techniques (concordances, collocations, key words in context) to reveal subtle gender ideologies hidden in language use. Her study showed that although the textbooks exhibited some support of gender equality, gender bias against women was still prevalent. Lee referred to <i>HARTMAN & JUDD</i> (1978), <i>PORRECA</i> (1984), and <i>HINO</i> (1988).	A5 B2 D2 E1, E4
2015	Awayed-Bishara, M. (2015). Analyzing the cultural content of materials used for teaching English to high school speakers of Arabic in Israel. <i>Discourse & Society</i> , 26(5), 517–542.	Awayed-Bishara conducted a systematic text-oriented discourse analysis of six ELT textbooks used in Israel high schools, approved by the Ministry of Education. She found that the textbooks were marked by Western and basically American and Jewish cultural issues. They interpellated English learners as Western oriented Jewish-Zionist subjects and thereby reinforced the marginalisation of the Palestinian Arab minority in Israel.	A5 B2 C1, C2, C3 E2
2015	Hong, H., & He, X. (2015). Ideologies of monoculturalism in Confucius Institute textbooks. A corpus-based critical analysis. In: X. L. Curdt-Christiansen & C. Weninger (Eds.) <i>Language, ideology and education. The politics of textbooks in language education</i> (pp. 90–108). Routledge.	Hong & He studied three Chinese-produced textbook series for the teaching of Chinese as a foreign language worldwide. Focusing on the amount of representation of ethnic and cultural diversity, they found that the textbooks dealt with the Han majority while marginalising or silencing all ethnic minorities in China. The textbooks did not deal with the large Chinese diaspora either. Hong & He drew on <i>CORTAZZI & JIN</i> (1999) and <i>NDURA</i> (2004).	A3 B4 C1 D3 E1, E2

Year	Reference	Annotation	Category
2015	Kramsch, C., & Vinall, K. (2015). The cultural politics of language textbooks in the era of globalization. In: X. L. Curdt-Christiansen & C. Weninger (Eds.) <i>Language, ideology and education. The politics of textbooks in language education</i> (pp. 11–28). Routledge.	In this book chapter, Kramsch & Vinall explored a poststructuralist (Foucauldian) analysis in which the discourses of textbooks, in this case for Spanish in the US, are seen as echoing other dominant discourses. They discussed how textbooks can be used to explore new horizons outside the usual boundaries of Western logic and rationality. Thus, they argued for the importance of critical reading, including re-historising and re-framing textbook knowledge to show that it is a political and economic construction. See KRAMSCH (1988).	A14 B2 C1, C2, C3 E2, E4
2015	Mahboob, A. (2015). Identity management, language variation and English language textbooks: Focus on Pakistan. In: D. N. Djenar, A. Mahboob & K. Cruickshank (Eds.) <i>Language and identity across modes of communication</i> (pp. 153–177). Mouton de Gruyter.	Mahboob studied a textbook for English, used in the province of Sindh in Pakistan, and produced by the Sindh Textbook Board for government schools, that is, schools for students with a working-class background. He showed how the content of the book was dominated by Islamic views and by themes related to Pakistan, especially in the form of biographies of religious and military heroes. Thus, it could be said to manage students' identities in isolation from more globally oriented English language communication.	A5 B1 C2 D1, D4 E1
2015	McLelland, N. (2015). <i>German through English eyes. A history of language teaching and learning in Britain 1500–2000</i> . Harrassowitz Verlag.	In this comprehensive monograph, McLelland included a chapter on textbooks for German in Britain in the twentieth century. She discussed the changing nature of British–German relations, including their importance for textbook stereotypes about the Germans. She also surveyed and discussed the development of the topic of 'sport and fitness' in the textbooks, as well as the development of representations of gender roles. In conclusion, she emphasised the importance of taking 'the long view' to examine the changing representations of culture. She referred to KRAUSKOPF (1985). See also KRAMSCH (1988).	A8 B5 C1, C3 D2 E1
2015	Mohamed, M. A. S. (2015). The role of English language textbooks in the reproduction of racism. <i>International Journal of English Language & Translation Studies</i> , 3(1), 95–108.	In this article, Mohamed presented a critical discourse analysis of a sample (on South Africa) from a textbook for teaching Social Sciences in secondary school in Libya. He showed how language structures, and the image-text relationship, indicated a positive picture of white people and a negative picture of non-whites. He argued that it is important to examine textbooks with a postcolonial lens and become aware of discourses of racism. He referred to RISAGER (1991).	A5 B1 C2, C3 D3 E3, E4
2015	Weninger, C., & Kiss, T. (2015). Analysing culture in foreign/ second language textbooks. Methodological and conceptual issues. In: X. L. Curdt-Christiansen & C. Weninger (Eds.) <i>Language, ideology and education. The politics of textbooks in language education</i> (pp. 50–66). Routledge.	In a critical survey of the field of textbook analysis, Weninger & Kiss described the field as characterised by methodological eclecticism, with very little methodological awareness and reflection. Analyses generally do not build on one another. The authors suggested to distinguish between three main methodological approaches: content analysis, critical discourse analysis, and semiotic analysis. They drew on GRAY (2010), NOURA (2004), and SERCU (2000).	A16 E1, E2, E3

2016	Canale, G. (2016). (Re)Searching culture in foreign language textbooks, or the politics of hide and seek. <i>Language, Culture and Curriculum</i> , 29(2), 225–243.	Canale carried out a meta-analysis of nine different textbook analyses pertaining to the teaching of English, Italian, Russian, Spanish, and Swahili, and published after 2000. Looking at both text and visuals dealt with in the analyses, he defined underlying pedagogical discourses aiming at simplification, but also based on politics of exclusion (lack of cultural diversity within countries) as well as politics of inclusion (stress on cultural diversity among countries). Canale referred to AZIMOVA & JOHNSTON (2012), DENDRINOS (1992), ELISSONDO (2001), THOMPSON (2013), and WENINGER & KISS (2013).	A5, A9, A13, A14, A15 D1, D3 E1, E2, E3
2016	Chapelle, C. A. (2016). <i>Teaching culture in introductory foreign language textbooks</i> . Palgrave Macmillan.	In this monograph, Chapelle carried out a historical and thematic analysis of textbooks for French used in the US, with special reference to shifting cultural representations of Canada and Quebec. Her materials covered the years from 1960 to 2010, and the study focused on both texts and images. She emphasised the importance of basing beginners' language textbooks and teaching on cultural and historical knowledge, in this case about the history of Canada and of Quebec identity. She drew on KRAMSCH (1988), RAMIREZ & HALL (1990), RISAGER (1991), and WENINGER & KISS (2015).	A7 B2 C1, C4 E1, E3
2017	Lewicka, M., & Waszau, A. (2017). Analysis of textbooks for teaching Arabic as a foreign language in terms of the Cultural Curriculum. <i>Universal Journal of Educational Research</i> 5(1), 36–44.	This is a kind of <i>Landeskunde</i> study in which Lewicka & Waszau compared three textbooks for Arabic, published in the period 2006–2013: one produced in Poland, one in France, and one in the USA. All three dealt with culture and society in Arab countries, but they were also very different as to the amount and kinds of information given – where the US-produced book offered the most coherent, clear, and complex representation. The authors referred to the work of the Council of Europe on foreign language teaching.	A1 B4 C1, C3 D2, D4 E1
2017	Thomas, P. (2017). The portrayal of non-westerners in EFL textbooks in Norway. <i>Cogent Education</i> , 4(1). https://doi.org/10.1080/2331186X.2016.1275411	Thomas analysed short stories taken from an EFL textbook for upper secondary school in Norway. He took a decolonial point of departure and showed how the short stories (set in places like Jamaica, Sri Lanka, Ghana) were influenced by orientalist thinking. He emphasised the importance of developing a contrapuntal pedagogical approach that tries to read Eurocentric literature with a postcolonial lens.	A5 B1 C3, C4 D3 E1
2018	Bori, P. (2018). <i>Language textbooks in the era of neoliberalism</i> . Routledge.	This is a book-length study of textbooks for Catalan as a second language, published between 2005 and 2013. Bori took his point of departure in Marxist political economy and centred on dimensions of social class and on practices and values in the worlds of work and housing. He found that the textbooks were characterised by neoliberal fairytales of economic growth and the development of entrepreneurial identities. Among his references are DENDRINOS (1992) and NDURA (2004).	A2 B2 C2 D1 E1, E2, E3
2018	Copley, K. (2018). Neoliberalism and ELT coursebook content. <i>Critical Inquiry in Language Studies</i> , 15(1), 43–62.	Copley studied the rise of neoliberalism in UK-produced textbooks for English as a foreign/second language by comparing textbooks from two periods: 1975–1982 and 1998–2014. In the first period, there were topics related to collectively experienced problems like unemployment and the hardships of work, while in the second period, there was a clear focus on middle-class individuals and their development of life skills and employability. Copley referred to DENDRINOS (1992) and GRAY (2010).	A5 B5 C1 D1 E1, E2

Year	Reference	Annotation	Category
2018	Namatende-Sakwa, L. (2018). The construction of gender in Ugandan English textbooks: A focus on gendered discourses. <i>Pedagogy, Culture & Society</i> , 26(4), 609–629.	Namatende-Sakwa undertook a feminist poststructuralist analysis of English textbooks in Uganda. She stressed that while the visibility of women is important, it is also important to ask: How are women represented? In her analysis, she identified five gendered discourses: Women as emotional, women as preoccupied with physical beauty, women as vulnerable victims, women as in need of men, and men as breadwinners/providers. She referred to LEE (2014) and PORRECA (1984).	A5 B2 C2 D2 E1, E2
2018	Risager, K. (2018). <i>Representations of the world in language textbooks</i> . Multilingual Matters.	In this monograph, Risager made a critical historical survey of the field of language textbook analysis, distinguishing between five theoretical approaches in the analysis of cultural representations: national studies, citizenship education studies, cultural studies, postcolonial studies, and transnational studies. She applied these approaches to six textbooks (for English, German, French, Spanish, Danish, and Esperanto), used in Denmark. She referred to BYRAM (1993), CANAGARAJAH (1993), GRAY (2010), and KRAMSCH (1988).	A4, A5, A6, A7, A8, A14 B6 C1, C2, C3, C4 D1, D3, D4 E1, E2
2019	Han, J. (2019). How is culture represented in textbooks? ‘Marriage’ in Korean language textbooks used in English-speaking countries. <i>Cogent Education</i> , 6(1). https://doi.org/10.1080/2331186X.2019.1632015	Han studied a Korean language textbook produced (in Hawaii) for use in English-speaking countries. Her focus was Korean marriage culture, and her discourse analysis of texts and images identified two dominant ideologies of marriage: patriarchal ideology (Confucianism) and romantic love ideology. She found that the textbook interweaved these two ideologies within a frame of materialism linked to life in the elite and upper classes.	A10 B1 C1 D2 E2
2020	Abid, N., & Moalla, A. (2020). The promotion of the good intercultural speaker through intercultural contexts in a Tunisian ELF textbook. <i>Language and Intercultural Communication</i> , 20(1), 37–49.	In this article, Abid & Moalla analysed a locally produced Tunisian ELT textbook to see to what extent it prepared learners to successfully communicate with speakers of English. They identified the various types of intercultural contacts in the textbook and found that the predominant type of contact was addressing native English speakers in writing. There was no face-to-face interaction and no focus on how to cope with misunderstandings. Abid & Moalla referred to CORTAZZI & JIN (1999), RISAGER (1991), and SERCU (2000).	A5 B1 C2, C3 E1
2021	Dahmardeh, M., & Kim, S. (2021). An analysis of the representation of cultural content in English coursebooks. <i>Journal of Applied Research in Higher Education</i> 13(5). https://www.emerald.com/insight/content/doi/10.1108/JARHE-09-2020-0290/full/html	Dahmardeh & Kim conducted an analysis of two recently published textbooks produced by Iran’s Department of Education for the teaching of English to all 13–18-year-old pupils in the state school system. They found that the cultural content was overwhelmingly marked by perspectives, products, practices, and persons related to Iran, especially Tehran and some other major cities. On the other hand, there was very little representation of English-speaking countries or other countries in the world. They conclude that the textbooks fail to teach intercultural communicative competence although this is their stated aim. Dahmardeh & Kim referred to AZIMOVA & JOHNSON (2012), CANALE (2016), CORTAZZI & JIN (1999), and RISAGER (2021).	A5 B2 C1, C2, C3 E1

2021	Risager, K. (2021). Language textbooks: Windows to the world. <i>Language, Culture and Curriculum</i> 34(2), 119–132.	Risager argued for a global perspective in language textbook analysis, both as regards the target language and other languages, target-language countries and other countries, the production, use and analysis of textbooks, and their cultural representations. She illustrated this with reference to textbooks for English, German, French and Spanish, all of them used in Denmark. She referred to AMMER (1988), AUGER (2007), BYRAM (1993), CANALE (2016), DENDRINOS (1992), GRAY (2010), RISAGER (1991), and RISAGER (2018).	A5, A7, A8, A14 B6 C1, C2, C3, C4 E1, E2
2021	Weninger, C. (2021). Multimodality in critical language textbook analysis. <i>Language, Culture and Curriculum</i> 34(2), 133–146.	In this article, Weninger argued that multimodal analysis of language textbooks can be divided into two groups: One dealing with meaning as representation (about the world), one dealing with meaning as interaction (between text producers and readers). She stressed that importance of combining both approaches to demonstrate the ideological nature of multimodal meaning-making. She referred to KRAMSCH & VINALL (2015) and RISAGER (2018).	A5 B4 D1 E3, E4

Note. Authors' names are shown in small capitals when the study referred to appears in this timeline.