
The

An International Journal of Current Research
and Theory with Open Peer Commentary

Behavioral

and Brain

Sciences

VOLUME 8
NUMBER 1
MARCH 1985

Appearing in this issue, with Commentary . . .

Multiple book-review of *The modularity of mind* Jerry A. Fodor

Pain and behavior Howard Rachlin

The biology of bird-song dialects Myron Charles Baker and Michael A. Cunningham

The organization of human postural movements: A formal basis and experimental synthesis Lewis M. Nashner and Gin McCollum

Also, Continuing Commentary on "Anhedonia hypothesis" (Wise); "Animal and human play" (Smith); and "Goodbye to the icon" (Haber)

C A M B R I D G E U N I V E R S I T Y P R E S S

The Behavioral and Brain Sciences

Editor

Stevan Harnad
20 Nassau St., Suite 240
Princeton, NJ 08542

Assistant Editor

Helaine Randerson

Associate Editors

Behavioral Biology

Jack P. Hailman/U. Wisconsin
Hubert Markl/Universität Konstanz

Biosocial Behavior

Glendon Schubert/U. Hawaii, Manoa

Cognition and Artificial Intelligence

Zenon Pylyshyn/U. Western Ontario

Cognitive Development

Annette Karmiloff-Smith/MRC, London and MPI, Nijmegen

Cognitive Neuroscience

Lynn Nadel/U. California, Irvine

Developmental Psychology

Charles J. Brainerd/University of Alberta

Evolutionary Biology

Michael T. Ghiselin/California Academy of Sciences

Experimental Analysis of Behavior

A. Charles Catania/U. Maryland, Baltimore County

History and Systems

Julian Jaynes/Princeton

Language and Cognition

Peter Wason/University College, London

Language and Language Disorders

Max Coltheart/U. London

Neurobiology

Neuropharmacology

Susan D. Iversen/Merck Sharp and Dohme, Ltd.

Neuropsychology

Jeffrey A. Gray/Inst. Psychiatry, London

Neurophysiology

Sten Grillner/Karolinska Institutet

Paleoneurology

Stephen Jay Gould/Harvard

Philosophy

Daniel C. Dennett/Tufts

Psychobiology

Victor H. Denenberg/U. Connecticut

David S. Olton/Johns Hopkins

Quantitative Methods

Donald B. Rubin/U. Chicago

Vision and Artificial Intelligence

Stuart Sutherland/U. Sussex

Editorial Policy *The Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (BBS) is an international journal providing a special service called Open Peer Commentary* to researchers in any area of psychology, neuroscience, behavioral biology, or cognitive science who wish to solicit, from fellow specialists within and across these BBS disciplines, multiple responses to a particularly significant and controversial piece of work. (See *Instructions for Authors and Commentators*, inside back cover.) The purpose of this service is to contribute to the communication, criticism, stimulation, and particularly the unification of research in the behavioral and brain sciences, from molecular neurobiology to artificial intelligence and the philosophy of mind.

Papers judged by the editors and referees to be appropriate for Commentary are circulated to a large number of commentators selected by the editors, referees, and author to provide substantive criticism, interpretation, elaboration, and pertinent complementary and supplementary material from a full cross-disciplinary perspective. The article, accepted commentaries, and the author's response then appear simultaneously in BBS.

Commentary on BBS articles may be provided by any qualified professional in the behavioral and brain sciences, but much of it is drawn from a large body of BBS Associates who have become formally affiliated with the project.

Qualified professionals are eligible to become BBS Associates if they have (1) been nominated by a current BBS Associate, (2) refereed for BBS, or (3) had a commentary or article accepted for publication. A special subscription rate is available to Associates. Individuals interested in serving as BBS Associates are asked to write to the editor.

This publication was supported in part by NIH Grant LM 03539 from the National Library of Medicine.

*Modelled on the 'CA Comment' service of the journal *Current Anthropology*.

Copying This journal is registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (21 Congress St., Salem, MA 01970). Organizations in the U.S.A. who are also registered with the CCC may therefore copy material (beyond the limits permitted by sections 107 and 108 of U.S. Copyright Law) subject to payment to the CCC of the per-copy fee indicated in the code on the first page of the article. This consent does not extend to multiple copying for promotional or commercial purposes.

ISI Tear Sheet Service, 3501 Market Street, Philadelphia, PA 19104, is authorized to supply single copies of separate articles for private use only.

For all other use, permission should be sought from the Cambridge or New York offices of the Press.

Subscriptions *The Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (ISSN 0140-525X) is published quarterly in March, June, September and December. Four parts form a volume. The subscription price, which includes postage, of Volume 8 (1985) is US \$128.00 net in the U.S.A. and Canada (£72.00 in the U.K. and rest of the world) for institutions; US \$35.00 net (£57.00) for individuals; US \$32.00 net (£20.00) for BBS Associates; and US \$32.00 net for students (in the U.S.A. and Canada only) who provide proof of eligibility with order. Single parts cost US \$35.00 net (£20.00) plus postage. Institutional orders may be sent to a bookseller or, in the U.S.A. and Canada direct to: Cambridge University Press, 32 East 57 Street, New York, N.Y. 10022; in the U.K. and rest of the world to: Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 2RU, England. Individuals must order direct from the Press. Second class postage paid at New York, N.Y. and at additional mailing offices. Postmaster: send address changes in the U.S.A. and Canada to *The Brain and Behavioral Sciences*, Cambridge University Press, 32 East 57 Street, New York, N.Y. 10022.

Advertising Inquiries about advertising should be sent to the Journals Promotion Department of the Cambridge or New York Office of Cambridge University Press.

Contents Volume 8:1 March 1985

Fodor, J. A. Précis of <i>The modularity of mind</i>		1
Open Peer Commentary		
Caplan, D. A neo-Cartesian alternative	6	
Carroll, J. B. On Spearman's "problem of correlation"	7	
Fodor, J. D. Module or muddle?	7	
Forster, K. I. Special purpose computation: All is not one	9	
Gallistel, C. R. & Cheng, K. A modular sense of place?	11	
Gardner, H. The centrality of modules	12	
Glucksberg, S. Modularity: Contextual interactions and the tractability of nonmodular systems	14	
Glymour, C. Fodor's holism	15	
Gross, C. G. On Gall's reputation and some recent "new phrenology"	16	
Grossberg, S. Cognitive self-organization and neural modularity	18	
Hunt, E. Evidence for and against modularity	19	
Jusczyk, P. W. & Cohen, A. What constitutes a module?	20	
Kagan, J. The mind as a Necker Cube	21	
Killeen, P. R. The modularity of behavior	22	
Kinsbourne, M. Parallel processing explains modular informational encapsulation		23
Marshall, J. C. Combe's crucible and the music of the modules		23
Mattingly, I. G. & Liberman, A. M. Verticality unparallelled		24
Morton, J. Too little and latent		26
Rey, G. Quinity, isotropy, and Wagnerian rapture		27
Robinson, D. N. Faculties, modules, and computers		28
Scarr, S. A rapprochement of biology, psychology, and philosophy		29
Schank, R. & Hunter, L. Encapsulation and expectation		29
Schwartz, B. Organic insight into mental organs		30
Seidenberg, M. S. Lexicon as module		31
Sternberg, R. J. Controlled versus automatic processing		32
Author's Response		
Fodor, Jerry A. Reply module		33
Rachlin, H. Pain and behavior		43
Open Peer Commentary		
Ainslie, G. Behavior is what can be reinforced	53	
Atkinson, J. H., Jr. & Kremer, E. F. Behavioral definition of pain: Necessary but not sufficient	54	
Bernstein, D. J. Internal events as behavior, not causes	55	
Campbell, K. Pain is three-dimensional, inner, and occurrent	56	
Clark, W. C. Heuristically, "pain" is mainly in the brain	57	
Fordyce, W. E. On Rachlin's "Pain and Behavior": A lightening of the burden	58	
Foss, J. Radical behaviorism is a dead end	59	
Genest, M. On kicking the behaviorist; or, Pain is distressing	59	
Graham, G. Pain's composite wheel of woe	60	
Harman, G. Is pain overt behavior?	61	
Jaynes, J. Sensory pain and conscious pain	61	
Kitcher, P. Chronic sensory pain	63	
Lacey, H. Pain behavior: How to define the operant	64	
Loeser, J. D. Against dichotomizing pain	65	
Logue, A. W. Functional behaviorism: Where the pain is does not matter		66
Matson, W. I. One pain is enough		67
Melzack, R. Pain and parallel processing		67
Merskey, H. A mentalistic view of "Pain and Behavior"		68
Miles, T. R. Behavior, cognition, and physiology: Three horses or two?		68
Pepeu, G. Is there always a neurochemical link between pain and behavior?		69
Place, U. T. Semicovert behavior and the concept of pain		70
Shaver, K. G. & Herrman, J. J. Pain without behavior: Inhibition of reactions to sensation		71
Shimp, C. P. Molar behaviorism, positivism, and pain		71
Turk, C. D. & Salovey, P. The reign of pain falls mainly in the brain		72
Wall, P. D. Not "pain and behavior" but pain in behavior		73
Author's Response		
Rachlin, H. Ghostbusting		73
Baker, M. C. & Cunningham, M. A. The biology of bird-song dialects		85
Open Peer Commentary		
Andrew, R. J. Questions about the evolution of bird song	100	
Baptista, L. F. Bird-song dialects: Social adaptation or assortative mating?	100	
Brenowitz, E. A. Bird-song dialects: Filling the gaps	101	
Chambers, J. K. Social adaptiveness in human and songbird dialects	102	
Fasold, R. W. Bird-song dialects and human-language dialects: A common basis?		104
Gottlieb, G. The need to map auditory perception onto vocal production in bird song		104
Greenwood, P. J. Adaptation and the cause and effect of bird-song dialects		105
Grimshaw, A. D. Human and avian "dialects": A cautionary note		106

Hill, J. H. Human dialect and language differentiation	107	Petrinovich, L. An unbalanced survey of bird-song research: Smoke gets in your eyes	113
Jenkins, P. F. Song learning, competition, and dialects	108	Shields, W. M. Avian song dialects: Genetic adaptation and deceptive mimicry?	114
Kroodtsma, D. E. Limited dispersal between dialects?" Hypotheses testable in the field	108	Slater, P. J. B. White rats and general theories	115
Lemon, R. E. Functional studies in bird song	109	Snowdon, C. T. Dialects in primates?	116
McGregor, P. K. Song dialects: What has to be explained, and with what?	110	Waser, P. M. Are dialects epiphenomena?	117
Moulton, W. G. Bird-song dialects and human-language dialects	110	West, M. J. & King, A. P. Studying dialects in songbirds: Finding the common ground	117
Mundinger, P. C. Linguistic applications to avian dialect biology	111	Zink, R. M. Genetical population structure and song dialects in birds	118
Nottebohm, F. Sound transmission, signal salience, and song dialects	112	Authors' Response	
		Baker, M. C. & Cunningham, M. A. Comparative dialectology	119

Nashner, L. M. & McCollum, G. The organization of human postural movements: A formal basis and experimental synthesis 135

Open Peer Commentary

Boylls, C. C., Jr. Postural control analysis: Adopting a stance	150	Kuipers, B. Is this a theory of competence or performance?	159
Carello, C., Turvey, M. T., & Kugler, P. N. The informational support for upright stance	151	Peterson, B. W. Suggestions for extending the domain of the Nashner–McCollum theory	160
Chapple, W. D. Position space and motor synergies: A comparative perspective	152	Roberts, T. D. M. Torque and sway	160
Delcomyn, F. The control of sets of muscles: A general principle?	153	Saltzman, E. & Kelso, J. A. S. Synergies: Stabilities, instabilities, and modes	161
Goldberg, G. & Kwan, H. C. Bernsteinian physiology and computational modeling: East meets West at the "boundary"	153	Schmidt, R. A. Identifying units of motor behavior	163
Greene, P. H. Task analysis of a style of behavior	155	Stelmach, G. E. & Worringham, C. Anatomical asymmetry and boundary crossings in postural control	164
Grossberg, S. The role of learning in sensory-motor control	155	Thelen, E. Simplifying assumptions: Can development help?	165
Gurfinkel, V. S. & Popov, K. E. Constraints and some capabilities of the postural control system	157	Thom, R. Less cybernetics, more geometry . . .	166
Hollerbach, J. M. Dynamics in posture	157	Zajac, F. E. Postural control: A further look at neural control strategies set by boundaries in space	167
Jaeger, R. Standing posture: Qualitative versus quantitative perspectives	158	Authors' Response	
Kearney, R. E. & Hunter, I. W. Should dynamic and passive properties be considered in analyses of human postural control?	158	Nashner, L. M. & McCollum, G. Elements of a sensorimotor theory compatible with experiments	167

Continuing Commentary

On Wise, R. A. (1982) Neuroleptics and operant behavior: The anhedonia hypothesis. BBS 5:39–87.

Ahlenius, S. A functional consideration of anatomical connections between the basal ganglia and the thalamus suggests that antipsychotic drugs inhibit the initiation of movement	173	schizophrenic's head they may simply reduce motivational arousal	176
Crow, T. J. The anhedonia hypothesis for neuroleptics and operant behaviour	174	Kostarczyk, E. The role of arousal in hedonic evaluations	177
Fouriezos, G. Sedation-induced jumping?	174	Schallert, T. Brain stimulation and catecholaminergic drugs: A focus on self-selected response durations versus interresponse intervals	178
Greenshaw, A. J. Dopamine and circling, or <i>décalage</i> ?	175	Author's Response	
Kornetsky, C. Neuroleptic drugs may attenuate pleasure in the operant chamber, but in the		Wise, R. A. The anhedonia hypothesis: Mark III	178

On Smith, P. K. (1982) Does play matter? Functional and evolutionary aspects of animal and human play. BBS 5:139–184.

Moran, G. Behavioral description and its impact on functional inference	186	Author's Response	
		Smith, P. K. Functional hypotheses and their impact on behavioral description	187

On Haber, R. N. The impending demise of the icon: A critique of the concept of iconic storage in visual information processing. *BBS* 6:1–54.

Mustillo, P. Iconic memory: Problems of definition, assessment, and functional role

189

Author's Response

Haber, R. N. The icon as persistence of a brief stimulus—unnecessary and silly

190