

# *Automatic Language Translation*

*By Antony G. Oettinger  
with a foreword by Joshua Whatmough*

Concerned primarily with certain fundamental lexical and technical problems of automatic language translation, this book attempts to provide a firm foundation not only for the solution of these problems but also for a more profound investigation of automatic language translation and for the study of mathematical linguistics in general.

***Among the subjects covered are:***

The essential features of automatic machines of the kinds now employed in experimental work on automatic translation and the problems facing designers and users of these machines.

The fundamental properties of certain classes of signs used in discourse, and the various methods for coping with them.

The possible contributions of linguistics and mathematical logic to coding techniques and flow charting, as well as the interesting possibilities for the applications of recently developed descriptive methods to other problems of linguistics and logic.

What is expected of translation and what can be accomplished. The compilation and operation of the Harvard Automatic Dictionary and the proposed transition from automatic dictionary to automatic translator. \$10.00



**THREE OF THE LATEST  
PRINCETON BOOKS ON  
MATHEMATICS**

**No. 25 Princeton Mathematical Series  
CONTINUOUS GEOMETRY**

By JOHN VON NEUMANN *296 pages.* \$ 7.50

**No. 44 Annals of Mathematics Studies  
STATIONARY PROCESSES AND  
PREDICTION THEORY**

By HARRY FURSTENBERG *296 pages.* \$ 5.00

**No. 47 Annals of Mathematics Studies  
THEORY OF FORMAL SYSTEMS**

By RAYMOND M. SMULLYAN *175 pages.* \$ 4.00



*Order from your bookstore, or*  
**PRINCETON UNIVERSITY PRESS**  
Princeton, New Jersey, U.S.A.

THE  
JOURNAL  
OF  
SYMBOLIC LOGIC

EDITED BY

ALONZO CHURCH  
S. C. KLEENE

ALICE A. LAZEROWITZ

ARTHUR N. PRIOR  
JULIA ROBINSON

*Managing Editor:* ALFONS BORGERS

*Consulting Editors:*

W. ACKERMANN  
ALAN ROSS ANDERSON  
C. A. BAYLIS  
JONATHAN F. BENNETT  
PAUL BERNAYS  
MARTIN DAVIS  
ANDRZEJ EHRENFEUCHT  
ROBERT FEYS  
FREDERIC B. FITCH  
G. HASENJAEGER

CARL G. HEMPEL  
LEON HENKIN  
HANS HERMES  
JOHN G. KEMENY  
E. J. LEMMON  
RICHARD MONTAGUE  
ANDRZEJ MOSTOWSKI  
GERT H. MÜLLER  
STEVEN OREY

RÓZSA PÉTER  
ABRAHAM ROBINSON  
GENE F. ROSE  
BARKLEY ROSSER  
H. ARNOLD SCHMIDT  
KURT SCHÜTTE  
THORALF SKOLEM  
CLIFFORD SPECTOR  
J. F. THOMSON  
A. R. TURQUETTE

VOLUME 24  
1959

PUBLISHED QUARTERLY BY THE ASSOCIATION FOR SYMBOLIC LOGIC, INC.  
WITH SUPPORT FROM UNESCO THROUGH ICSU AND FROM INSTITUTIONAL  
MEMBERS

The four numbers of Volume 24 were issued at the following dates:

Number 1, pages 1–96, November 26, 1959.

Number 2, pages 97–192, February 4, 1960.

Number 3, pages 192–286, August 12, 1960.

Number 4, pages 287–374, Maart 24, 1961.

All numbers of this volume are copyrighted by the Association for Symbolic Logic, Inc. Reproduction of copyrighted numbers of the Journal by photostat, photo-print, microfilm, or like process is forbidden, except by written permission of the Managing Editor.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

A completeness theorem in modal logic. By SAUL A. KRIPKE . . . . .	1
A counterexample to a conjecture of Scott and Suppes. By W. W. TAIT	15
The problem of simplifying logical expressions. By B. DUNHAM and R. FRIDSHAL . . . . .	17
On intermediate propositional logics. By TOSHIO UMEZAWA . . . . .	20
Constructive definition of certain analytic sets of numbers. By P. LO- RENZEN and J. MYHILL . . . . .	37
Reviews . . . . .	50
Notice on the 1960 International Congress for Logic, Methodology and Philosophy of Science . . . . .	96
A propositional calculus with denumerable matrix. By MICHAEL DUMMETT . . . . .	97
Modalities in Ackermann's "rigorous implication". By ALAN ROSS AN- DERSON and NUEL D. BELNAP, Jr. . . . .	107
Der Prädikatenkalkül mit limitierten Variablen. Grundlegung einer natürlichen exakten Logik. By HEINRICH BEHMANN . . . . .	112
On logics intermediate between intuitionistic and classical predicate logic. By TOSHIO UMEZAWA . . . . .	141
On Ackermann's set theory. By AZRIEL LÉVY . . . . .	154
Reviews . . . . .	167
Notice of a symposium on problems in the structure of language . . .	192
Extendible sentential calculus. By H. HIZ . . . . .	193
Reviews . . . . .	203
Summer meeting of the Association for Symbolic Logic. By HUGO RIBEIRO . . . . .	281
Abstracts of papers . . . . .	281
On the axiom of extensionality, Part II. By R. O. GANDY . . . . .	287
A simple treatment of truth functions. By ALAN ROSS ANDERSON and NUEL D. BELNAP, Jr. . . . .	301
On the construction of Venn diagrams. By TRENCHARD MORE, Jr. . .	303
Axioms for the "Gergonne"-relations. By IVO THOMAS and DON ORTH	305
Horn sentences in identity theory. By K. I. APPEL . . . . .	306

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Enumeration of recursive sets. By YOSHINDO SUZUKI . . . . . 311  
Twenty-fourth annual meeting of the Association for Symbolic Logic.  
By ALAN ROSS ANDERSON . . . . . 312  
Abstracts of papers . . . . . 312  
Notice of a decision of the Executive Committee . . . . . 326  
Notice of a meeting of the Association for Symbolic Logic . . . . . 326  
Notice of a symposium on recursive functions . . . . . 326  
List of officers and members of the Association for Symbolic Logic . . 327  
Index of reviews . . . . . 345

## ERRATA

### VOLUME 22

Page 329, line 8. For the third occurrence of the word «true», read «false».

### VOLUME 23

Page 358. The fifth word in line 10, the fifth word in line 11, the sixth word in line 12, and the first word in line 17 should be «to», «of», «not», and «a» respectively.

The defect appears in some copies of this number and not in others.

Page 363, line 17 from below. The partly obliterated word at the end of the line is «error».

Page 368, line 18. For XXII 378(3), read XXII 378(1). But in line 20 on the same page, XXII 378(3) should stand.

Page 447, lines 25, 30, 32 (two places). For  $\mathfrak{E}'$ , read  $\mathbf{E}'$ .

Page 448, line 18. For «pp. 430–470», read «p. 430–470».

Page 469, line 29. Delete middle initial **O.** from name of Trenchard More, Jr.

### VOLUME 24

Page 55, line 26. For  $O_i(a_1^{\sigma}, \dots, a_{n_i}^{\sigma})$ , read  $O_i(a_1, \dots, a_{n_i})$ ; and, in the same line, for  $\mathbf{F}_i(a_1, \dots, a_{n_i}, R_1, R_2, \dots)$ , read  $\mathbf{F}_i(a_1^{\sigma}, \dots, a_{n_i}^{\sigma}, R_1, R_2, \dots)$ .

Page 69, line 2. For  $P_{*}^m$ , read  $P_0^m$ .

Page 69, lines 9–10. For «*Sels-kabs*», read «*Sel-skab*».

Page 81, lines 8–9. For «*Roc-zniki*», read «*Rocz-niki*».

Pages 112–138. Vertical arrow-symbols showing traces of filed-off left halves of arrow-heads (e.g. bottom line p. 117) are to be read as half-arrows.

Page 169, line 22 from below. For «*explicit*», read «*explicit*».

Page 176, line 4. For « $\mathbf{C} \cdot \cdot$ », read « $\mathbf{C} \cdot \cdot$ ».

Page 186, line 22 from below. Omit period after «pp. 225–245».

Page 187. Delete the space between lines 13 and 14.

Page 188, line 19. For #, read  $\neq$ .

Page 188, line 23. For «*schemas*», read «*schémas*».

Page 189. Insert space between lines 11 and 12, and delete space between lines 12 and 13.

Page 192, line 20. For «ANONYMOUS», read «Anonymous».

Page 224, line 23. Insert a comma at the end of the line.

Page 224, line 24. Delete the comma after «Mendelson» and insert a comma immediately before the word «and».

Page 226, lines 11–13. The heading of the review is incorrect, and should be replaced by the following:

AZRIEL LÉVY. *Comparison of subtheories*. *Proceedings of the American Mathematical Society*, vol. 9 (1958), pp. 942–945.

## ERRATA

Page 244, lines 13–8 from below. To remedy an ambiguity, the words «if and only if any two models . . . . in their interpretations of  $R$ » must be moved back from their present position to follow the word «Then» at the beginning of the sentence, and a comma inserted after them.

Page 244, line 8 from below. For «generalize», read «generalizes».

Page 259, line 7, For «circuit», read «circuit».

Page 266, line 34, For «THOMPSON», read «THOMSON».



# **AN INTRODUCTION TO MODERN LOGIC**

**An Elementary Textbook of Symbolic Logic**

**WILLIAM H. HALBERSTADT**

Neither superficial nor needlessly complex, this text presents the essentials of a system like that of Whitehead and Russell (using, in the main, their basic notation). Included are a propositional calculus and a functional calculus of the first order. There are more than six hundred exercises + both practical and theoretical – all of which are given in linguistic form, since the book stresses the *practical* value of symbolic logic. For one-semester courses, or as a supplementary text in longer courses. 221 pages.

**HARPER & BROTHERS, 49 E. 33d St., New York 16**

# THE BRITISH JOURNAL FOR THE PHILOSOPHY OF SCIENCE

*Contents for February 1960*

*Articles*

- ESP. AND MEMORY: A PHYSICAL THEORY. . . . . Ninian Marshall  
WHEN ARE STATEMENTS EMPIRICAL?. . . . . J. W. N. Watkins

*Discussions*

- NEW ARGUMENT FOR INDUCTION: REPLY TO  
PROFESSOR POPPER . . . . . Sir Roy Harrod  
SO-CALLED DEGREES OF CONFIRMATION. . . . . Hugues Leblanc  
PROBABILITY AND CONFIRMATION OR COR-  
ROBORATION . . . . . K. R. Popper  
CONFIRMATION WITHOUT BACKGROUND  
KNOWLEDGE . . . . . J. W. N. Watkins

*Annual Subscription 42s  
single copies 10s 6d plus postage;*

**THOMAS NELSON & SONS LTD.**  
**Parkside Works, Edinburgh 9**

## *Proceedings of Symposia in Applied Mathematics*

These symposia were held under the auspices of the American  
Mathematical Society and other interested organizations.

**VOLUME 6**

**NUMERICAL ANALYSIS, 1956.**  
vi + 303 pp. \$9.75

**VOLUME 7**

**APPLIED PROBABILITY, 1957.**  
v + 104 pp. \$5.00

**VOLUME 10**

**COMBINATORIAL ANALYSIS,  
1960.**  
vii + 311 pp. \$7.70

**VOLUME 12**

**THE STRUCTURE OF LANGUAGE  
AND ITS MATHEMATICAL ASPECTS**

(This symposium was co-sponsored by the As-  
sociation for Symbolic Logic)  
to be published in January 1961; approximately  
300 pp.  
by Roman Jakobson, W. V. Quine, Noam Chom-  
sky, Hilary Putnam, Henry Hiz, Nelson Goodman,  
H. B. Curry, Y. R. Chao, Murray Eden, Morris  
Halle, Robert Abernathy, A. G. Oettinger, Hans  
Herzberger, V. H. Yngve, Frank Harary, G. E.  
Peterson, Joachim Lambek, H. A. Gleason, Jr.,  
Benoit Mandelbrot, C. F. Hockett, R. S. Wells

Members of the American Mathematical Society are entitled to  
25% discount on all volumes

*Order from*  
**American Mathematical Society**  
190 Hope Street, Providence, Rhode Islands