

MULLEN, P. (1988) Violence and mental disorder. *British Journal of Hospital Medicine*, **40**, 460–463.

HALLER, R. & DELUTY, R. (1988) Assaults on staff by psychiatric in-patients. A critical review. *British Review of Psychiatry*, **152**, 174–179.

CARMEL, H. & HUNTER, M. (1989) Staff injuries from inpatient violence. *Hospital and Community Psychiatry*, **40**, 41–46.

Asian patients and the HAD scale

SIR: Salim Nayani (*Journal*, October 1989, **155**, 545–547) has been a victim of a common misunderstanding in using an instrument for a purpose other than for which it was devised or intended. Somehow, a number of researchers in transcultural psychiatry have the impression that mere translation of an instrument is sufficient to make it applicable for use in populations from different ethnic or linguistic backgrounds. This leads to unjustified interpretations of the data.

For use of an instrument like the HADS in an Asian sample, it is necessary to suitably modify and adapt the scale for the Asian subjects, not just translate or backtranslate it. The adapted version then needs to be validated and standardised before it can be put into use. The modification should take into consideration the content of items, number of items, or the necessity for some other items to be included. The items in the HADS are far from constituting a 'suitable interrogation' to elicit depression in Asian subjects. A number of items in the HADS are not reported by Asians, at least in the form in which they have been presented in the scale. Similarly, there are a number of items which are reported by depressed Asian patients which are obviously not included in the HADS but would be of more discriminatory value. Dr Nayani's findings in fact confirm that the HADS in its present form is not really applicable to Asian subjects. The poor correlation between somatic symptoms and HADS depression is quite expected, since the items may not be measuring depression. Studying correlation between somatic symptoms and another measure of depression standardised for Asian subjects would confirm this.

Researchers on transcultural aspects should refrain from reporting data based on plain translated instruments. My criticisms are not directed towards the HADS, but towards the inappropriate method by which its utility has been investigated on Asian subjects, amounting to its abuse.

S. K. CHATURVEDI

Christie Hospital
Wilmslow Road
Withington
Manchester M20 9BX

Jarman indices and 'new chronic' in-patients

SIR: McCreadie & McCannell (*Journal*, September 1989, **155**, 348–351) found a wide variation in the numbers of 'new chronic' in-patients between hospitals relative to catchment area size. This was in keeping with the findings of their previous survey (McCreadie *et al*, 1983) and has been attributed in part to staff attitudes. The adequacy of rehabilitation services in the hospitals concerned did not account for the variation in the in-patient numbers of chronic patients (McCreadie *et al*, 1985). The catchment areas have been described as urban, rural or mixed, but no detailed evaluation of their sociodemographic characteristics has been made.

There is a strong association between indices of social deprivation and both psychiatric morbidity and demand for psychiatric services (Royal College of Psychiatrists, 1988). The accumulation of 'new chronic' in-patients would also appear to vary in accordance with this factor (Inter-Register Technical Committee, 1984).

It may be the case that the division of catchment areas into urban, rural, or mixed is insufficient to show the influence of social deprivation. The Jarman data on indices of social deprivation in the health districts of England and Wales shows that prosperous urban areas such as Oxford and Worcester have low scores on these indices in comparison with relatively underprivileged semi-rural areas such as some districts of Lancashire (Jarman, 1984). Some indices of social deprivation may be high in agricultural areas, such as high rates of unemployment, unskilled workers, and the elderly.

A more detailed analysis of the sociodemographic characteristics of the catchment areas in the Scottish studies may reveal that social deprivation is a factor contributing towards the wide variation in numbers of 'new chronic' in-patients.

P. M. ABBOTT

Rainhill Hospital
Prescot
Merseyside

References

- INTER-REGISTER TECHNICAL COMMITTEE (1984) *Psychiatric Care in Eight Case Register Areas. Statistics from Eight Psychiatric Case Registers in Great Britain, 1976–81*. Southampton: University of Southampton Press.
- JARMAN, B. (1984) Underprivileged areas: validation and distribution of scores. *British Medical Journal*, **289**, 1585–1588.
- MCCREADIE, R. G., AFFLECK, J. W. & ROBINSON, A. D. (1985) The Scottish survey of psychiatric rehabilitation and support services. *British Journal of Psychiatry*, **147**, 289–294.
- MCCREADIE, R. G., WILSON, A. O. A. & BURTON, L. L. (1983) The Scottish survey of 'new chronic' in-patients *British Journal of Psychiatry*, **143**, 564–571.
- ROYAL COLLEGE OF PSYCHIATRISTS (1988) *Psychiatric Beds and Resources: Factors Influencing Bed Use and Service Planning*.