

poor relief originating before the Reformation to portray such earlier poor relief reform as paving the way for later reforms" (9). Chung-Kim moves away from a strict bifurcation of the Reformation and the modern response to poor relief in order to allow more interplay between the two. Chung-Kim also argues that "Protestant reformers were not the first to promote centralized distribution of poor relief or anti-begging ordinances"; rather, Reformation leaders "became the public champions of poor relief reform by making it an essential part of their reform movement" (31). While I agree that the Reformation response to poor relief was unique, I would also argue that most attempts at poor relief in Europe are rooted in the biblical mandate to care for the poor, regardless of periodization. As Chung-Kim states in relation to Calvin's arguments, "to ignore the problem of poverty would be contradictory to the Christian calling" (153). This held true in the Middle Ages as it did during the Reformation, and just as Chung-Kim seeks to create less of a bifurcation between the Reformation and the modern era, so too should there be less of one between the Middle Ages and the Reformation.

This small critique does not take away from the fact that Esther Chung-Kim's *Economics of Faith* is a worthwhile and engaging read. She links economic transformations during the sixteenth century to vicissitudes in perceptions of faith, particularly by Reformation leaders and refugee communities. Through the support of these reformers, communal responsibility "replaced poverty as a religious ideal so that the truly poor would be cared for and able-bodied persons given work" (14). This simple but important phrase provides the summary for a truly remarkable monograph.

doi:10.1017/S0008938922001352

Tyranei und Teufel. Die Wahrnehmung der Inquisition in deutschsprachigen Druckmedien im 16. Jahrhundert

By Marie von Lüneburg. Vienna and Cologne: Böhlau, 2020. Pp. 234. Hardback \$57.00. ISBN: 978-3412516154.

Eugene Smelyansky

Washington State University

At the center of Marie von Lüneburg's engaging study is a paradox: even though the early modern Holy Roman Empire lacked an institutionalized inquisition (as opposed to Spain, Portugal, or Italy), such an institution is widely discussed in German Protestant print media published during the Reformation. This monograph, then, aims to explain how the inquisition was perceived by Reformation-era authors and to provide historical and political contexts for these perceptions. Covering the period from 1530 to 1600, this study demonstrates how the authors of Protestant propaganda popularized the view of an inquisition as a uniquely oppressive, violent, and tyrannical institution—an image the word "inquisition" continues to evoke to this day. Von Lüneburg convincingly demonstrates that the frightening image of the inquisition looming over the German Protestants was skillfully used in print as part of the anti-Catholic propaganda efforts: political and religious tensions within the empire as well as news of anti-Protestant repression from abroad influenced the inquisition's appearance in (or disappearance from) the discourse.

After introducing her argument and providing an overview of relevant literature, von Lüneburg begins her exploration of the inquisition discourse in early modern print in

Chapter 1. She examines the emergence of pamphlets as a key weapon of Protestant polemicists during the early decades of the Reformation and an important source of news for German Protestant communities across the empire. Reacting to political and religious uncertainty, pamphlets and broadsheets stressed the danger of repression for Protestants and, in particular, used examples of religious persecutions in the Spanish-ruled Netherlands. Von Lüneburg argues that the association of Spain with religious repression predated the beginning of the Eighty Years' War in 1568 (that is, the conventional origins of the Black Legend). Indeed, by the 1540s, pamphlets circulated rumors that the inquisition might be introduced in the Netherlands and, possibly, even in Germany itself. The latter scenario, with the inquisition standing in for imperial and papal persecution, might seem outlandish in hindsight but appeared very real given the unprecedented nature of the Reformation. Fears of religious persecution and the news of actual repressions outside of the Holy Roman Empire led to the inquisition emerging as a stand-in for anti-Protestant violence and remained firmly associated with the Catholic responses to the Reformation.

Chapter 2 focuses on the perceptions of the papacy and especially of Pope Paul IV (r. 1555–1559). As von Lüneburg observes, although the creation of the Roman Inquisition in 1542 remained relatively unnoticed by German Protestant authors, the election of Paul IV – previously in charge of this institution – and the experiences of Protestant refugees from Italy led to the transformation of how the papacy was perceived in contemporary print media. While earlier pamphlets portrayed the papal curia as sinful, corrupt, and indulgent, news of anti-Protestant repression firmly associated the papacy with violence, repression, and tyranny. While news from abroad provided ample rhetorical ammunition aimed at the papacy, events within the empire amplified persecution anxiety. Only with the Peace of Augsburg, settled in 1555, did fears of the inquisition and papal influence subside, as reflected in contemporary pamphlets. On the other hand, the arrival of Jesuits created a new sense of danger, with the reputation associated with the inquisition being transferred to the Jesuits in the works of German Protestant polemicists.

Chapters 3 and 4 observe the role of events outside of the empire on the perception of Catholicism and the inquisition in Protestant print media. While the provisions of the Peace of Augsburg formalized religious divisions within the Holy Roman Empire, German Protestants remained keenly interested in the ongoing religious conflicts abroad. Spain's invasion of the Netherlands and the Duke of Alba's brutal repression of Protestantism there launched a new wave of pamphlets reporting on the violence and using preexisting anti-Spanish tropes established during the earlier decades of Protestant propaganda. Von Lüneburg also argues that France, previously relatively absent from German popular print, became yet another subject of pamphlets during the Wars of Religion. Similarly, the election of Pope Pius V (r. 1566–1572) – previously the head of the Roman Inquisition – and his role in the creation of the Holy League provided for news coverage and enduring fears of a strong Catholic alliance and its possible implications for Protestants, both within the empire and abroad.

Amplified by print media, anxieties about a potential anti-Protestant alliance between Spain and France led to the radicalization of discourse. This process of radicalization also led to the blurring of lines between enemies old and new, in particular between the inquisition and the Jesuits. Notably, both groups appear side-by-side in pamphlet illustrations of the opposing Protestant and Catholic camps. Both were initially viewed as anti-Protestant agents of the papacy, but by the late sixteenth century the actual presence of the Jesuits in the empire overshadowed the fears of distant inquisitorial tribunals.

Von Lüneburg's monograph provides a valuable overview of how the perception of the inquisition changed and found new polemical use in Reformation-era Germany. The book, based on the author's dissertation, aims for breadth of coverage, with specific examples addressed relatively briefly. This is a useful approach, as the study charts an overall trajectory of how the specter of the inquisition made appearances in broadsheets and pamphlets; von Lüneburg contributes to the growing number of studies exploring the roles of

communication, print culture, and propaganda during the German Reformation. The study's contextualization of its sources will undoubtedly prove invaluable to future scholars working in this field, while the broad range of print media von Lüneburg uncovered will stimulate further research.

doi:10.1017/S0008938922001315

Metaphysics in the Reformation: The Case of Peter Martyr Vermigli

By Silvanne Aspray. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2021. Pp. 164 + xi. Hardback \$80.00. ISBN: 978-0197266939.

Vincent M. Evener

United Lutheran Seminary

Silvanne Aspray's book seeks to "forge a middle path between two largely independent discourses around the origins of modernity: on the one hand, debates around the importance of metaphysical shifts in the (Late) Middle Ages . . . , which tend to bypass the Reformation, and, on the other, genealogies of modernity, which tend to put the Reformation at center stage" (137). Aspray describes and deploys a methodology for examining the "implied metaphysics" of reformers, using Peter Martyr Vermigli (1499–1562) as a case study. Aspray rejects the objection that Protestant reformers wanted to "write a theology that was wholly exegetical" (4; quoting David C. Steinmetz) or wanted to discard metaphysics entirely, arguing with John Betz, Hans Boersma, and others that there is a "metaphysics implicit in all theology": "exegetical theologies which understand the Scriptures to be a source of revealed and universal truth always have a metaphysical bearing" (5–6). According to Aspray, only a study of the implied metaphysics of the Reformation can counter scholarship criticizing reformers for univocity or "nominalism"—a critique that connects the disparate accounts of the rise of modernity but posits an unduly monolithic view of Reformation metaphysics.

Across four rich chapters, Aspray examines whether Vermigli's work reflects "an ontological participatory scheme, in which the distinction between finite and infinite causality is not seen as a matter of mutual exclusion but as a 'grammatical' distinction which allows for infinite agency to operate through the mediation of causes" or a "univocal picture in which the finite and the infinite share the same neutral ground of being, such that divine action must in some sense replace the finite." These two models with their "respective understandings of being and causality" serve as "heuristic lenses through which to read Reformation sources" (12). Aspray concludes that "the metaphysical structures implied in [Vermigli's] theological work are complex. 'Being' is sometimes seen as a neutral category, whereas at other times, God's being is considered pre-eminent such that all other beings participate in it. Similarly, God's action is sometimes construed in ontological ways, working in and through other causes, but elsewhere divine agency is considered as merely general, and concurring 'specially' to the action of other causal actors." Vermigli "simultaneously inhabits and exhibits aspects of two metaphysical frameworks which would normally be considered mutually exclusive" (27); but, Aspray admits, few theologians will appear consistent when scrutinized according to these metaphysical ideal types.

This book contributes to scholarship on Vermigli, who is understudied, and Aspray concisely but effectively outlines his significance to Reformation history, as well as scholars'