

# Law and History Review

## Law and History Review

---

*Law and History Review* (ISSN 0738-2480) is published three times a year, in spring, summer, and fall, by the University of Illinois Press for the American Society for Legal History. The purpose of the *Review* is to further research and writing in the fields of the social history of law and the history of legal ideas and institutions. The *Review* is sent to all members of the American Society for Legal History. Information about membership in the Society appears on the inside back cover of this issue.

Address all business inquiries (subscriptions, membership applications, back-issue orders, advertisements, and change-of-address notices) to the Journals Department, University of Illinois Press, 1325 South Oak Street, Champaign, Illinois 61820-6975. Requests for replacement of damaged or undelivered issues will be honored for up to six months after publication of the issue.

For authorization to photocopy from *Law and History Review* for uses exceeding those permitted by Sections 107 and 108 of the U.S. Copyright Law, contact the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC), 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923. The CCC will send an invoice for permissions fees. Permissions given above do not extend to copying for advertising or promotional purposes or to creating new collective works.

---

### Note to Contributors

The editors welcome unsolicited manuscripts and books for review. Address manuscripts and all general editorial correspondence to Christopher Tomlins, The American Bar Foundation, 750 North Lake Shore Drive, Chicago, IL 60611 (tel 312 988 6553; fax 312 988 6579; e-m <clt@abfn.org>). Address books for review and correspondence regarding book reviews and reviewing to Alfred L. Brophy, University of Alabama, 101 Bryant Drive East, Box 870382, Tuscaloosa, AL 35487-0382 (tel 205 348 0841; fax 205 348 5829; e-m <abrophy@law.ua.edu>). Manuscripts must be double-spaced typescript throughout, with citations prepared according to the *Chicago Manual of Style*, 14th ed. The *Review's* style guides for articles and book reviews are available on the *LHR* web page <[www.press.uillinois.edu/journals/lhr.html](http://www.press.uillinois.edu/journals/lhr.html)>. Please use word processing. Submission of manuscripts by file attachment is welcome. Submitted manuscripts are subject to double-blind peer review; authors should therefore identify themselves on the title page only. Accepted manuscripts are copy-edited for style but not substance; authors remain responsible for citation accuracy and for all statements of fact or opinion. The *Law and History Review* will not consider any manuscript concurrently submitted for publication elsewhere. Submission of a manuscript is understood to commit its author to publish the manuscript in the *Law and History Review* if accepted by the editor.

---

© 2004 by the Board of Trustees of the University of Illinois. Manufactured in the United States of America.

*This journal is printed on acid-free paper.*

# Law and History Review

---

Volume 22, Number 2

Summer 2004

---

*Published three times a year by the University of Illinois Press  
for the American Society for Legal History*

**Editor**

Christopher L. Tomlins  
*American Bar Foundation*  
750 North Lake Shore Drive  
Chicago, IL 60611  
312.988.6553  
FAX: 312.988.6579  
E-Mail: clt@abfn.org

**Associate Editor  
(Book Reviews)**

Alfred L. Brophy  
*University of Alabama*  
101 Bryant Drive East,  
Box 870382  
Tuscaloosa, AL 35487-0382  
205.348.0841  
FAX: 205.348.5829  
E-Mail: abrophy@law.ua.edu

---

**Editorial Board**

David Abraham  
*University of Miami*

Jeremy I. Adelman  
*Princeton University*

David A. Bell  
*The Johns Hopkins University*

Mary Frances Berry  
*University of Pennsylvania*

Mary Sarah Bilder  
*Boston College*

Bettina Bradbury  
*York University, Toronto*

Elizabeth R. Dale  
*University of Florida*

Adrienne Dale Davis  
*University of North Carolina*

Martha F. Davis  
*NOW Legal Defense*  
New York

Thomas J. Davis  
*Arizona State University*

Cornelia Hughes Dayton  
*University of Connecticut*

Christine A. Desan  
*Harvard University*

Charles R. Donahue  
*Harvard University*

Markus Dirk Dubber  
*SUNY, Buffalo*

Laura Engelstein  
*Princeton University*

Daniel R. Ernst  
*Georgetown University*

William E. Forbath  
*University of Texas at Austin*

Judy Fudge  
*York University, Toronto*

Stephen Garton  
*University of Sydney*

Paul Hyams  
*Cornell University*

Nancy Isenberg  
*University of Tulsa*

Bruce Kercher  
*Macquarie University*

Diane Kirkby  
*La Trobe University, Melbourne*

Michael Klarman  
*University of Virginia*

Louis A. Knafla  
*University of Calgary*

Mindie Lazarus-Black  
*University of Illinois, Chicago*

Kenneth F. Ledford  
*Case Western Reserve University*

Brian P. Levack  
*University of Texas at Austin*

Sanford V. Levinson  
*University of Texas at Austin*

Jeanette M. Neeson  
*York University, Toronto*

William J. Novak  
*University of Chicago*

James P. Oakes  
*CUNY Graduate Center*

James Oldham  
*Georgetown University*

Ruth Paley  
*History of Parliament, Wedgwood House, London*

Pablo Piccato  
*Columbia University*

W. Wesley Pue  
*University of British Columbia*

Gerry R. Rubin  
*University of Kent, Canterbury*

Lucy E. Salyer  
*University of New Hampshire*

Reva B. Siegel  
*Yale University*

Robin Chapman Stacey  
*University of Washington*

Robert J. Steinfeld  
*SUNY, Buffalo*

Carolyn Strange  
*University of Toronto*

Emily Z. Tabuteau  
*Michigan State University*

Kendall Thomas  
*Columbia University*

Barbara Y. Welke  
*University of Minnesota*

James Q. Whitman  
*Yale University*

Martin J. Wiener  
*Rice University*

Andrew Wood  
*University of East Anglia*

# Contents

Law and History Review

Vol. 22, No. 2, Summer 2004

Full text available at [www.historycooperative.org/home/html](http://www.historycooperative.org/home/html)

*LHR* home page at [www.press.uillinois.edu/journals/lhr.html](http://www.press.uillinois.edu/journals/lhr.html)

## **In This Issue**

v

### **Articles**

Sir Francis Forbes and the Earliest Australian Public Law Cases

Ian Holloway

209

Roman Judges, Case Law, and Principles of Procedure

Ernest Metzger

243

The Langdell Problem: Historicizing the Century of Historiography,  
1906–2000s

Bruce A. Kimball

277

### **Forum: What Can Frank Tannenbaum Still Teach Us about the Law of Slavery?**

Slave Law and Claims-Making in Cuba: The Tannenbaum  
Debate Revisited

Alejandro de la Fuente

339

#### **Comment**

Beyond Tannenbaum

María Elena Díaz

371

Still Continents (and an Island) with Two Histories?

Christopher Schmidt-Nowara

377

#### **Response**

Slavery and the Law: A Reply

Alejandro de la Fuente

383

### **Forum Article: Reforming Chancery**

Preparing for Fusion: Reforming the Nineteenth-Century  
Court of Chancery, Part I

Michael Lobban

389

## Book Reviews

- Law and Colonial Cultures: Legal Regimes in World History, 1400–1900*—Lauren Benton  
reviewed by Albert J. Schmidt 429
- P. A. Stolypin: The Search for Stability in Late Imperial Russia*—  
Abraham Ascher  
reviewed by David Kerans 431
- Slave Patrols: Law and Violence in Virginia and the Carolinas*—  
Sally E. Hadden  
reviewed by Paul D. Quigley 433
- “Miscegenation”: Making Race in America*—Elise Virginia Lemire  
reviewed by James J. Allegro 434
- The Transformation of American Abolitionism: Fighting Slavery  
in the Early Republic*—Richard S. Newman  
reviewed by Michael D. Pierson 436
- Antitrust and the Formation of the Postwar World*—Wyatt Wells  
reviewed by Herbert Hovenkamp 438
- Between Law and Custom: “High” and “Low” Legal Cultures  
in the Lands of the British Diaspora—The United States, Canada,  
Australia, and New Zealand, 1600–1900*—Peter Karsten  
reviewed by Richard Connors 440
- Sexual Blackmail: A Modern History*—Angus McLaren  
reviewed by Lisa Lindquist Dorr 443