

Ethics & International Affairs

VOLUME 26 • NUMBER 1 • SPRING 2012

SYMPOSIUM: In Search of a Global Ethic

*Michael Ignatieff, with responses from Christian Barry,
Nicholas Rengger, David Rodin, Cheyney Ryan, and
Michael Joseph Smith*

ROUNDTABLE: The Political Ethics of the International Criminal Court

*Antonio Franceschet, Kenneth A. Rodman,
Benjamin Schiff, and Michael J. Struett*

ESSAY

**Almost Saving Whales:
The Ambiguity of Success
at the International Whaling
Commission**

Ian Hurd

FEATURE

**After the MDGs: Citizen
Deliberation and the
Post-2015 Development
Framework**

Scott Wisor

RESPONSE

**In Defense of Smart
Sanctions: A Response to
Joy Gordon**

George A. Lopez

REVIEWS

**Morality and War: Can War
Be Just in the Twenty-First
Century?**

David Fisher

REVIEW BY MICHAEL L. GROSS

**Terror, Religion, and Liberal
Thought**

Richard B. Miller

REVIEW BY ANDREW F. MARCH

**The Offensive Internet:
Speech, Privacy, and
Reputation**

*Edited by Saul Levmore and
Martha Nussbaum*

REVIEW BY ANITA L. ALLEN

**Dilemmas and Connections:
Selected Essays**

Charles Taylor

REVIEW BY WILLIAM SCHWEIKER

CARNEGIE COUNCIL
*The Voice for Ethics
in International Affairs*

Ethics & International Affairs

VOLUME 26 · NUMBER 1 · SPRING 2012

CARNEGIE COUNCIL
*The Voice for Ethics
in International Affairs*

Ethics & International Affairs

THE JOURNAL OF THE CARNEGIE COUNCIL

EDITOR IN CHIEF	<i>Joel H. Rosenthal</i>	EDITORIAL ADVISORY BOARD	<i>Christian Barry</i>
EDITOR	<i>John Tessitore</i>		<i>Alex J. Bellamy</i>
MANAGING EDITOR	<i>Zornitsa Stoyanova-Yerburgh</i>		<i>Allen Buchanan</i>
ASSISTANT EDITOR	<i>Zach Dorfman</i>		<i>Robyn Eckersley</i>
EDITORIAL INTERN	<i>Brett Watson</i>		<i>Joy Gordon</i>
COPY EDITOR	<i>Bill Harris</i>		<i>Ian Hurd</i>
BUSINESS MANAGER	<i>Eva Becker</i>		<i>Anthony F. Lang, Jr.</i>
			<i>Anthony Langlois</i>
			<i>David Luban</i>
			<i>David R. Mapel</i>
			<i>Darrel Moellendorf</i>
			<i>Terry Nardin</i>
			<i>David Rodin</i>
			<i>S. Prakash Sethi</i>
			<i>Henry Shue</i>
			<i>Leif Wenar</i>

Carnegie Council for Ethics in International Affairs

The Carnegie Council for Ethics in International Affairs is an independent, nonpartisan, nonsectarian, tax-exempt organization founded in 1914 by Andrew Carnegie. Since its beginnings, the Carnegie Council has asserted its strong belief that ethics, as informed

by the world's principal moral and religious traditions, is an inevitable and integral component of all policy decisions, whether in the realm of economics, politics, or national security. The interrelationship of ethics and foreign policy is thus the

unifying theme of all Carnegie Council programs. By promoting a greater understanding of the values and conditions that ensure peaceful relations among nations, the Carnegie Council hopes to contribute to a better life for people everywhere.

BOARD OF TRUSTEES

<i>Joseph Amann</i>	<i>Jonathan Gage,</i>	<i>Amir Pasic</i>
<i>Ian Bremmer</i>	<i>Vice Chairman</i>	<i>Alexander H. Platt</i>
<i>Kathleen Cheek-Milby</i>	<i>Stephen D. Hibbard,</i>	<i>Joel Rosenthal, President</i>
<i>Jonathan E. Colby, Chairman</i>	<i>Treasurer</i>	<i>James H. Rowe</i>
<i>Phyllis D. Collins</i>	<i>David P. Hunt</i>	<i>Robert G. Shaw</i>
<i>Thomas Donaldson</i>	<i>Bruce W. Jentleson</i>	<i>Elisabeth Sifton</i>
<i>Richard A. Edlin</i>	<i>Zachary Karabell</i>	
<i>Anthony L. Faillace</i>	<i>Charles W. Kegley, Jr.</i>	

HONORARY TRUSTEES	<i>Charles M. Judd</i>	<i>Maurice S. Spanbock, Esq.</i>
INTERNATIONAL HONORARY TRUSTEE	<i>Eiji Uehiro</i>	
SECRETARY OF THE CORPORATION	<i>Robert G. Shaw</i>	

Contents

	Contributors	1
SYMPOSIUM: IN SEARCH OF A GLOBAL ETHIC	Editors' Note	5
	Reimagining a Global Ethic <i>Michael Ignatieff</i>	7
	Local Priorities, Universal Priorities, and Enabling Harm <i>Christian Barry</i>	21
	A Global Ethic and the Hybrid Character of the Moral World <i>Nicholas Rengger</i>	27
	Toward a Global Ethic <i>David Rodin</i>	33
	The Dialogue of Global Ethics <i>Cheyney Ryan</i>	43
	A Brief Response to Michael Ignatieff <i>Michael Joseph Smith</i>	49
ROUNDTABLE: THE POLITICAL ETHICS OF THE INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL COURT	Introduction <i>Antonio Franceschet</i>	53
	Why the ICC Should Operate Within Peace Processes <i>Kenneth A. Rodman</i>	59
	The ICC's Potential for Doing Bad When Pursuing Good <i>Benjamin Schiff</i>	73
	Why the International Criminal Court Must <i>Pretend</i> to Ignore Politics <i>Michael J. Struett</i>	83
	The International Criminal Court's Provisional Authority to Coerce <i>Antonio Franceschet</i>	93
ESSAY	Almost Saving Whales: The Ambiguity of Success at the International Whaling Commission <i>Ian Hurd</i>	103
FEATURE	After the MDGs: Citizen Deliberation and the Post-2015 Development Framework <i>Scott Wisor</i>	113
RESPONSE	In Defense of Smart Sanctions: A Response to Joy Gordon <i>George A. Lopez</i>	135

REVIEWS *Morality and War: Can War Be Just in the Twenty-First Century?*

David Fisher

REVIEW BY MICHAEL L. GROSS 147

Terror, Religion, and Liberal Thought

Richard B. Miller

REVIEW BY ANDREW F. MARCH 149

The Offensive Internet: Speech, Privacy, and Reputation

Edited by Saul Levmore and Martha Nussbaum

REVIEW BY ANITA L. ALLEN 152

Dilemmas and Connections: Selected Essays

Charles Taylor

REVIEW BY WILLIAM SCHWEIKER 155

SUBMISSIONS **Guidelines for Submission** 159

RESOURCES

For additional Carnegie Council resources on the topics addressed in these pages, please visit www.ethicsandinternationalaffairs.org.

ETHICS & INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS (ISSN 0892-6794 print; ISSN 1747-7093 online).

Publisher

Ethics & International Affairs is published quarterly by Cambridge University Press, 32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013.

Information for subscribers

Ethics & International Affairs is published in four issues per year. Institutional subscription prices for 2012 are: Print & Online: US \$408 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK £250 + VAT elsewhere. Institutions electronic only: US\$371 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK£226 + VAT elsewhere. Institutions print only: US\$390 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK£239 + VAT elsewhere. Individuals print only: US\$37 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK£26 + VAT elsewhere. Correspondence concerning subscriptions should be sent to: Cambridge University Press, 100 Brook Hill Drive, West Nyack, NY 10994, USA for customers in the USA, Canada, or Mexico. Customers elsewhere should contact: Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK. The price includes online access to the current and all online back files to January 1st 1997, where available.

Delivery Terms and Legal Title

Prices include delivery of print journals to the recipient's address. Delivery terms are Delivered Duty Unpaid (DDU); the recipient is responsible for paying any import duty or taxes. Legal title passes to the customer on despatch by our distributors.

Production Editor: Diane Davis (email: ddavis@cambridge.org).

Electronic Access Access to this journal is available free online within institutions in the developing world through the AGORA initiative with the FAO, the HINARI initiative with the WHO and the OARE initiative with UNEP. For information, visit www.aginternetwork.org, www.healthinternetwork.org, www.oarescience.org.

Abstracting and Indexing Services The Journal is indexed by Academic Search (EBSCO), Academic Search Premier (EBSCO), CSA Environmental Sciences & Pollution Management Database (CSA/CIG), CSA Sustainability Science Abstracts (CSA/CIG), Current Abstracts (EBSCO), Expanded Academic ASAP (Thomson Gale), IBSS: International Bibliography of the Social Sciences (LSE), InfoTrac, International Political Science Abstracts (IPSA), OMNIFILE Full Text Mega Edition (OMNIFILE), PAIS: Public Affairs Information Service (CSA/CIG), Proquest 5000 (ProQuest), Proquest Discovery (ProQuest), Proquest Platinum (ProQuest), Proquest Research Library (ProQuest), Proquest Social Science Journals (ProQuest), Social Sciences Index/Abstracts (HW Wilson), Student Resource Center College (w/ Academic ASAP), Wilson OMNIFILE Full Text Select (HW Wilson) and Worldwide Political Sciences Abstracts (CSA/CIG).

Disclaimer The Publisher, Carnegie Council, and Editors cannot be held responsible for errors or any consequences arising from the use of information contained in this journal; the views and opinions expressed do not necessarily reflect those of the Publisher, Council and Editors, neither does the publication of advertisements constitute any endorsement by the Publisher, Council and Editors of the products advertised.

Copyright and Photocopying Copyright © 2012 Carnegie Council for Ethics in International Affairs. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopying, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. Policies, request forms, and contacts are available at: <http://www.cambridge.org/rights/permissions/permission.htm> Permission to copy (for users in the U.S.A.) is available from Copyright Clearance Center, <http://www.copyright.com>, email: info@copyright.com.

Printed in USA by The Sheridan Press

View this journal online at journals.cambridge.org/EIA.

ISSN 0892-6794 (Print)

ISSN 1747-7093 (Online)

Ethics &
International
Affairs