

the things that are objects of passion, 'women, money, gifts, and so on'. We should remember the early monastic setting, and the desert monk who would not embrace even his mother lest the hard-won tranquillity of passion might be disturbed.

The translations are clear and readable, and the introduction interesting, though not always clear. 'Supernal' is not a pleasant adjective in modern English, nor 'laudative' or 'ensuant'. *Enchoreasis gnomike* perhaps defies translation, but 'gnomic emigration' conjures up quite the wrong picture; a fantasy from Walt Disney possibly?

J.S.

THEY STAND APART. Edited by Judge Tudor Rees and Harley V. Usill.
(Heinemann; 21s.)

It may be accounted for righteousness to this generation that whatever their moral shortcomings, they are deeply concerned about the justice of criminal laws, and the effect of penalties inflicted on law-breakers. Inevitably, acute searchings of conscience have been caused for some time by the increasing number of prosecutions for homosexual offences, of which seven times as many are now known to the police as was the case twenty years ago. Are these unfortunates really responsible for what they do? Should they be given medical treatment instead of punishment? If they must be punished, are they being punished in the best way? Before these subjects can be discussed intelligently, a great deal has to be learnt about a subject until recently under a rigid taboo, and there is a real danger of rushing from one set of errors into another. This symposium, comprising contributions from experts on the legal, theological, medical and statistical aspects, should prove invaluable for removing misconceptions and indicating lines of advance. If it has few solutions to offer that is not the editor's fault.

The full and able summary on the law in other countries prepared by Mr Hammelmann is, I believe, the best available in English. He shows that with one obsolescent exception (Norway) no attempt is made to restrict the private activities of adults, but considerable pains are taken to protect juveniles up to twenty-one. An illuminating chapter on homosexuality and Christian morals (very necessary for a public unaccustomed to consider the rational foundations of Christian rules of conduct!) is contributed by Dr D. S. Bailey, author of a learned work on *Homosexuality and the Western Christian Tradition*. All that he says will not be accepted even by the members of his own communion, but his conclusions in respect of the unnatural and essentially sinful nature of homosexual practices, and of the moral responsibility of the invert, are unimpeachable. Like many people nowadays he does not consider that the state is morally justified in making homosexual acts between

adults a crime. This proposition D. Lindesay Neustatter also strongly supports in his long and informative essay on the medical aspects of the problem. Unexpectedly the two legal contributors, Judge Tudor Rees and Viscount Hailsham, confess to serious doubts whether this much-advocated change in the law would be wise or workable. Lord Hailsham in particular is fearful of an increase in the corruption of youth, admittedly the most dangerous by-product of adult homosexuality.

'I can see', he says, 'the gravest objection to a provision of the law which would inevitably give rise to the belief, however erroneous, that homosexual practices were fully permissible for an adult, and therefore in the class of vice (?) to which smoking and drinking belong, or even comparable to a fortune which a young man inherits when he is of age to dispose of it prudently.' Lord Hailsham has been accused of harshness in this essay, but he is completely unemotional and says a number of things which badly need saying. How many people are aware, for example, that at the present time prosecutions for acts committed between adults in private are very rare, and that the great majority of cases brought into English courts would also be offences against the laws of continental countries? In a district specially investigated by the Cambridge Department of Criminal Science, out of 986 persons convicted of homosexual offences only one case was between adults in private. This hardly suggests that inverts are a tragically 'persecuted minority'.

The popular view that the matter can be settled by the humane formula, 'These people are mentally sick and need treatment not punishment', will find little support in Dr Neustatter's forthright essay, sympathetic as it is to the invert. He is indeed inclined to treat the offence too lightly and even suggests that public importuning should not be penalized. It is shown clearly that in the vast majority of cases the homosexual is not suffering from any identifiable mental disease or neurosis. The condition is more analogous to a drug addiction than to a true obsession in the psychiatric sense. Dr Neustatter is far from hopeful about treatment, and is driven to recommend that where the public must be protected there should be provision for 'compulsory medical detention' in place of imprisonment. Something of the sort is to be tried by the Home Office, but I doubt if conscientious judges or the homosexuals themselves will find a new kind of Broadmoor a good solution. Judge Tudor Rees points out further, that the plea that homosexual offenders should be treated as patients not criminals, on the ground that their impulses are irresistible, could not be confined to them alone but would logically have to be extended to anyone who committed a criminal offence, even murder under the influence of a

strong appetite. We have not got near the solution of this dilemma.

It is, I think, important to understand the real challenge which the homosexual offers to the community today. If we turn to the mass of literature now being poured out by inverts and their protagonists we find that neither a slight alteration in the law, nor the adoption of a more charitable attitude by society, would be received with much enthusiasm. What is demanded is a complete abandonment of the distinction between 'natural' and 'unnatural' acts in the sphere of sex, and the acceptance of homosexuality as an alternative—and honourable—way of life. Inverts are no longer to be insulted by useless suggestions of cure or sublimation of their tendencies. Parents are not expected to interfere if their son is passing into this minority world, but only to show 'understanding'. Among the customs to be tolerated without protest are dreadful travesties of the sacrament of marriage, such as marriage with a Lesbian, marriage with an 'understanding' woman who is willing to bear children but agrees beforehand to permit affairs with other men. Childhood would, one gathers, still be protected, but one can only speculate grimly on the fate of adolescents in such a regime. They are an irresistible lure to the homosexual man; and the earning of easy money is also a lure to many footloose youngsters. It is hard to see how the corruption of youth could be stopped, once public opinion on the *essential wrongfulness* of homosexual practice goes. This is some indication of the problems on which the Catholic citizen would need guidance. In the meantime he can gain much help from this excellent symposium.

LETITIA FAIRFIELD

MARTYR IN SCOTLAND: BLESSED JOHN OGILVIE, HIS LIFE AND TIMES.

By Thomas Collins. (Burns, Oates; 21s.)

It is good to see a new life of Ogilvie, and one wishes one could recommend it unreservedly. Mr Collins' life has virtues, but it opens with such a spate of journalese that some readers will be put off.

The narrative as it concerns the martyr himself raises few doubts: except that a coat of whitewash hangs unconvincingly on Archbishop Spottiswood, and the genealogy of Ogilvie from Sir Walter of Findlater will not do. It is odd too that the writer does not question the reference to Ogilvie being tempted by the offer of the provostry of Moffat; there was no provostry, either civil or ecclesiastical, at that time; merely the prebend, a minor one at that, of Glasgow cathedral.

But Mr Collins gives a good deal of space to the Times. He has a good grip of the essential course of events from the Reformation till the date of his narrative. While Scots Catholicism of the period, however, still awaits excavation, a notable start has been made by Messrs