

# JOURNAL of Law and Religion

Volume XII

Number 2

1995-96

- 
- Secular Fundamentalism, Religious Fundamentalism, and  
the Search for Truth in Contemporary America *Daniel O. Conkle*
- Ecclesial Freedom and Federal Order:  
Reflections on the Pacific Homes Case *William Johnson Everett*
- The English Religious Establishment *James W. Torke*
- Minority Religions in a Democratic Republic *Ze'ev W. Falk*
- Separation of Church and State *Frank Pommersheim*
- “over and above . . . there broods a portentous shadow,  
—the shadow of *law*”: Harriet Beecher Stowe’s  
Critique of Slave Law in *Uncle Tom’s Cabin* *Alfred L. Brophy*
- Beneath the Robe: The Role of Personal Values  
in Judicial Ethics *Louis E. Newman*
- An Overview of the Scholarship in Law and  
Religion of Judge John T. Noonan, Jr. *Robert E. Rodes, Jr.*
- John T. Noonan as Judge: What Can Empathic  
Judging Mean for Women? *Sophie H. Pirie*
- The Standard (of Review) in Judge Noonan’s Judging *Patrick M. Brennan*
- Religious Freedom, Modern Democracy, and  
the Common Good: Conference Papers *Philip E. Devenish*
- Gamwell’s Geometry *George L. Goodwin*
- Religion, Politics, and the Claims of Reason *Steven D. Smith*
- Comments on Religious Freedom *Glenn Tinder*
- Educational Implications of Gamwell’s Argument *Robert R. Sherman*
-

**Sponsored by:**

**Hamline University School of Law**

**Published by:**

**Hamline University School of Law**

**ISSN: 0748-0814**

# THE JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION

VOLUME XII

1995-96

NUMBER 2

## EDITORIAL STAFF

### *Editors*

MARIE FAILINGER, Hamline University School of Law  
PATRICK KEIFERT, Luther Seminary

### *Managing & Book Editor*

HOWARD J. VOGEL, Hamline University School of Law

### *Production Managers*

JO ANNE MATSON

KATHRYN MARRON

### *Editorial Assistants*

*Technical Assistant:* LORI FERRIS

PATRICIA CARTER

AMY FEDDEMA

MICHAEL K. HERRIGES

DANIEL KOES

VALERIE MCLEOD

ALLISON EKLUND

BRIAN HODGKISS

ANNETTE MARTHALER

CAROLINE S. PALMER

JASON W. SCHULLER

DANIEL TOLLEFSON

## EDITORIAL BOARD

THOMAS PORTER, Attorney at Law, Boston, Chair

FRANK ALEXANDER, Emory University School of Law

AZIZAH Y. AL-HIBRI, T.C. Williams School of Law

STEPHEN CARTER, Yale Law School

MARIE FAILINGER, Hamline University School of Law

ZE'EV FALK, Jerusalem, Israel

EDWARD MCGLYNN GAFFNEY, JR., Valparaiso University School of Law

EMILY HARTIGAN, St. Mary's University of San Antonio School of Law

CATHLEEN KAVENY, Notre Dame University Law School

PATRICK KEIFERT, Luther Seminary, St. Paul

RAYMOND R. KRAUSE, Hamline University School of Law

ROBIN LOVIN, Southern Methodist University

ELIZABETH MENSCH, State University of New York at Buffalo, School of Law

NANCY MILLER-HERRON, Attorney at Law, Dresden, Tennessee

MICHAEL J. PERRY, Northwestern University School of Law

MICHAEL SCHERSCHLIGT, Hamline University School of Law

EARL SCHWARTZ, St. Paul, Minnesota

DOUGLAS STURM, Bucknell University

AMINA WADUD, Virginia Commonwealth University

HOWARD J. VOGEL, Hamline University School of Law

WILSON YATES, United Theological Seminary of the Twin Cities

## **ADVISORY COMMITTEE**

RICHARD BAEPLER, Valparaiso University  
HAROLD BERMAN, Emory University School of Law  
JAMES BRESNAHAN, Northwestern University Medical School  
LYNN BUZZARD, Campbell University School of Law  
FRED CARNEY, Southern Methodist University  
ROGER CRAMTON, Cornell University School of Law  
CARL ESBECK, University of Missouri-Columbia School of Law  
DAMIEN KEOWN, University of London, Goldsmiths  
MILTON KONVITZ, Professor Emeritus, Cornell University of New York  
LEIGH LERNER, Rabbi, Montreal  
SANFORD LEVINSON, University of Texas School of Law  
DAVID LITTLE, U.S. Institute of Peace  
MARTIN MARTY, University of Chicago Divinity School  
NOOR MOHAMMAD, University of Baltimore School of Law  
ELIZABETH SCHUESSLER-FIORENZA, Harvard University Divinity School  
THOMAS SHAFFER, Notre Dame University Law School  
PETER N. THOMPSON, Hamline University School of Law  
ROSALIE WAHL, Associate Justice, Minnesota Supreme Court  
MICHAEL WELKER, Germany  
JOHN WITTE, JR., Emory University School of Law  
STEPHEN B. YOUNG, Attorney at Law, St. Paul

*The Journal of Law and Religion* is sponsored by the Hamline University School of Law and is a nonprofit, nonpartisan publication devoted to investigating the interaction of religion and law.

Subscriptions to *The Journal of Law and Religion*, which is published twice annually, are \$15 per two-issue volume for individuals, \$25 for institutions and \$10 for students. Add \$10 for foreign airmail service. Subscription requests, manuscripts and general correspondence should be addressed to:

Kathryn Marron  
Production Manager  
The Journal of Law and Religion  
1536 Hewitt Avenue  
St. Paul, MN 55104

Book review manuscripts and books to be reviewed should be sent to:

Howard J. Vogel  
Book Review Editor  
Hamline University School of Law  
1536 Hewitt Avenue  
St. Paul, MN 55104

Commencing with Volume X, citations will conform to: *The University of Chicago Manual of Legal Citation* (1989) copyright by the University of Chicago. Unsolicited manuscripts will be returned only upon request.

Individual back issues and complete sets of *The Journal of Law and Religion* may be ordered directly from William S. Hein & Co., 1285 Main Street, Buffalo, NY 14209.

The views and opinions expressed in *The Journal of Law and Religion* are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the editorial staff, the editorial board, the advisory board, or the sponsors of *The Journal of Law and Religion*.

Articles are indexed in the *Index to Legal Periodicals* published by The H.W. Wilson Co. (Bronx, New York), and in the *Legal Resource Index* available on line on a variety of computer data base services.

Articles are also indexed in *Religion Index One: Periodicals*; book reviews are indexed in *Index to Book Reviews in Religion*. Both indexes are published by the American Theological Library Association, Chicago, and are available online through BRS Information Technologies (Latham, New York) and DIALOG Information Services (Palo Alto, California).

Internet access to *The Journal of Law and Religion* is available at <http://www.hamline.edu/law/jlr>

All copyrights are reserved.

Cite as: 12 J LAW & RELIG

# JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION

## STATEMENT OF PERSPECTIVE

*The Journal of Law and Religion* was initiated in 1982 as a collaborative effort of the Council on Religion and Law and the Hamline University School of Law. It was born of a sense of historical malaise. The modern age with its strong propensity toward the secularization of all areas of life, while not without merit in its liberating effects, nonetheless has its dark side.

We live, some say, in a time of profound historical crisis. Domestically and globally, we confront massive issues which force us to reconsider, in fundamental ways, the shape and quality of our common life. Yet many of the disciplines of thought and practice that should be a rich resource in such a time are found wanting—among them, law and religion. Law, a discipline presumably devoted to the ways of justice, has all too often become a set of complex, technical tools without concern for higher purpose. Religion, presumably given to the all-embracing promises and prescriptions implied in the sense of the sacred, has all too often become privatized and neglectful of our public life.

*The Journal of Law and Religion* is dedicated to a fundamental reappraisal of the disciplines of law and religion as they impinge on each other, might instruct each other, and taken in their conjunction, might offer a constructive response to the major issues of our times. As such its concerns are sixfold.

1. *Historical*: The *Journal* intends to encourage the examination of historical developments, movements, thinkers, and issues to enrich our understanding of how law and religion have, in various ways, been mutually influential.

2. *Theoretical*: The *Journal* intends to promote constructive work in religious and legal thought about fundamental theological and jurisprudential questions pertaining to professional practice and the structures of our public life.

3. *Ethical*: The *Journal* intends to support explorations into the foundations of ethical judgment and normative critiques of our social life, particularly as they draw upon resources from the life of law and religion.

4. *Global*: The *Journal* intends to be encompassing in its reach, seeking out voices from all the religious and legal traditions throughout the world and bringing them into conversations with each other.

5. *Professional*: The *Journal* intends to stimulate collaboration between jurists and religious leaders given their respective commitments, as professionals, to the common good of all peoples.

6. *Spiritual*: The *Journal* recognizes that human existence is grounded in the spiritual, which is represented in many forms and expressions.

The *Journal* is thus a forum within which the disciplines of law and religion might together consider with utmost seriousness their joint responsibility for the creation of a civilization of genuine peace and justice. Within the compass of that purpose, the *Journal* intends to be open-minded and non-prejudicial; it is receptive to submissions from all persuasions and perspectives.

**HAMLIN**  
**UNIVERSITY**  
**SCHOOL OF LAW**

A Subscription to the  
**JOURNAL OF LAW AND  
RELIGION**

Cost per volume (two issues):

- \$15.00 individual (USA & foreign surface mail)
- \$25.00 individual (foreign air mail)
- \$25.00 institution (USA & foreign surface mail)
- \$35.00 institution (foreign air mail)
- \$10.00 student

Production Manager  
Journal of Law and Religion  
Hamline University School of Law  
1536 Hewitt Avenue  
St. Paul, Minnesota 55104

- Payment enclosed.
- Please bill me.
- Begin my subscription with vol. \_\_\_\_\_, number \_\_\_\_\_.

Name: \_\_\_\_\_

Street Address: \_\_\_\_\_

City & State: \_\_\_\_\_ Zip code: \_\_\_\_\_

*Check out our Website!*

***JOURNAL OF LAW & RELIGION***

**<http://www.hamline.edu/law/jlr>**

**On line you will find:**

**Cumulative Index by  
Subject and Author**

**Survey of Trends and Developments on  
Religious Liberty in the Courts**

**Table of US Supreme Court Decisions  
Relating to Religious Liberty**

**Soon to be Added:  
Article Abstracts of  
Past and Current Issues**

**Announcements of Coming Events**



Eleventh Annual Symposium on Law, Religion & Ethics



# RESTORATIVE JUSTICE AND RELIGIOUS TRADITIONS

**October 22-23, 1998**

Hamline University School of Law  
and United Theological Seminary of the Twin Cities

This symposium will explore the roots of restorative justice, interpret and critique its basic principles and values from a variety of religious traditions, and consider its application in education, policing, criminal justice, and international disputes to enrich and extend the dialogue about the values and processes of justice.

## **Featured Speakers:**

**Howard Zehr**, Professor, Eastern Mennonite University and a founder of the restorative justice movement in the United States

**Mark Umbreit**, Director, Center for Restorative Justice & Mediation, School of Social Work, University of Minnesota

**Donald Shriver**, former president of Union Theological Seminary and author of *An Ethic for Enemies: Forgiveness in Politics*

**B. Edmon Martin**, Professor of Contextual & Historical Studies, United Theological Seminary

**Virginia Mackey**, UCC pastor, author of *Punishment: In the Scripture and Tradition of Judaism, Christianity and Islam*

**Daniel Van Ness**, Justice Fellowship, co-author of *Restoring Justice*

**Kay Pranis**, State of Minnesota Restorative Justice Planner

For more information or to be added to mailing list, contact Kathryn Marron, Hamline University School of Law, Saint Paul, Minnesota (612) 523-2082 or [kmarron@gw.hamline.edu](mailto:kmarron@gw.hamline.edu).

**In cooperation with the  
Department of Corrections Restorative Justice Initiative and Center for  
Restorative Justice and Mediation,  
University of Minnesota School of Social Work.**

## **ANNOUNCEMENT**

We have acquired the entire  
back stock, reprint and  
microform rights to the

### **JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION**

---

Complete sets to date  
are now available. We  
can also furnish single  
volumes and issues.

---

**WILLIAM S. HEIN & CO., INC.**  
**1285 Main Street**  
**Buffalo, New York 14209**

# THE JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION

VOLUME XII

1995-96

NUMBER 2

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>Editor's Preface</b> .....	xi
-------------------------------	----

### Articles

Daniel O. Conkle	Secular Fundamentalism, Religious Fundamentalism, and the Search for Truth in Contemporary America.....	337
William Johnson Everett	Ecclesial Freedom and Federal Order: Reflections on the Pacific Homes Case ..	371
James W. Torke	The English Religious Establishment ....	399
Ze'ev W. Falk	Minority Religions in a Democratic Republic .....	447
Frank Pommersheim	Separation of Church and State .....	455
Alfred L. Brophy	"over and above . . . there broods a portentous shadow, —the shadow of <i>law</i> ": Harriet Beecher Stowe's Critique of Slave Law in <i>Uncle Tom's Cabin</i> .....	457
Louis E. Newman	Beneath the Robe: The Role of Personal Values in Judicial Ethics.....	507

### In Honor of John T. Noonan, Jr. Journal of Law and Religion Achievement Award

Robert E. Rodes, Jr.	An Overview of the Scholarship in Law and Religion of Judge John T. Noonan, Jr.....	533
Sophie H. Pirie	John T. Noonan as Judge: What Can Empathic Judging Mean for Women?..	541
Patrick M. Brennan	The Standard (of Review) in Judge Noonan's Judging.....	553

**Religious Freedom, Modern Democracy, and the Common Good:  
Conference Papers**

Philip E. Devenish	Religious Freedom, Modern Democracy, and the Common Good: Conference Papers .....	565
George L. Goodwin	Gamwell's Geometry .....	567
Steven D. Smith	Religion, Politics, and the Claims of Reason .....	573
Glenn Tinder	Comments on Religious Freedom.....	583
Robert R. Sherman	Educational Implications of Gamwell's Argument .....	589