Contents

Acknowledgments	<i>page</i> ix
Introduction	I
I.1 A Puzzle	Ι
I.2 Underdetermination: From Science to Ethics	3
I.3 Demarcating the Main Idea	6
I.4 The Plan for the Book	8
PART I SCIENTIFIC UNDERDETERMINATION AND The Analogy to Ethics	
I Underdetermination in Science	13
1.1 Introducing the Idea and Its Earliest Forerunners	13
1.2 Three Paths to Underdetermination	23
1.3 Varieties of Underdetermination	29
2 The Analogy to the Moral Realm	35
2.1 The Underlying Picture of Moral Theories	36
2.2 The Evidence of Moral Theories	53
2.3 Complications	61
PART II UNDERDETERMINATION IN NORMATIVE ETHICS	
3 Parfit and the Case Study of Case Studies	73
3.1 Doubting the Dogma	74
3.2 Climbing the Mountain	77
3.3 Failed Conciliation and Moral Underdetermination	80
4 Going Algorithmic	89
4.1 Consequentializing: A Simple Recipe and a Two-Step Procedure	90
4.2 Deontologizing: Leveling the Playing Field	98
4.3 Algorithms and Underdetermination	107

Contents	
Contents	

 The Big Picture in Normative Ethics The Roads to Moral Underdetermination Varieties of the Phenomenon Where to Go from Here 	120 120 133 151
PART III SKEPTICISM AND A NEW METAETHICAL POSITION	
 6 Skeptical Repercussions 6.1 Duhem and Quine Again 6.2 From a Semantic to an Epistemic Challenge 6.3 Adapting the Skeptical Argument to the Realm of Ethics 6.4 In Defense of the Argument 	161 161 165 169 174
 A New Position in Metaethics 7.1 Constructive Empiricism and Constructive Deonticism 7.2 Classifying the New View 7.3 Two Worries 	185 186 196 206
 8 Looking Back and Ahead 8.1 How We Got Here 8.2 The Puzzle Solved? 	212 212 220
Bibliography Index	223 234

viii