

appears in Richard Jones's *Contemporary Educational Psychology* which sets side by side the work on the curriculum and cognitive growth centring round Jerome Bruner, and Laurence Kubie's *Forgotten Man in Education*, a line of thought in the Freudian tradition.

As might be expected, the currently popular notion of creativity figures largely in the debate. It is to this theme that Professor Hudson devotes the most interesting paper in the second half of the book. His title is 'Lieben und Arbeiten—a case of cake and eat it'. He discusses the relationship between divergent thinking and originality and does not find it a strong one. The source of originality, he thinks, is to be found in non-intellective factors, 'the channelling of powerful impulses away from

the sphere of personal relationships and into that of work'. Social scientists tend to value personal relationships highly and build their paradigm of normality round them. But perhaps any tactic or 'life-style' is as valid as any other, provided it works. Perhaps a life where the energy is channelled into 'arbeiten' is as healthy as one where it is devoted to 'lieben' or precariously distributed between the two. Perhaps one can produce brain-workers or contented children but not both. Perhaps. . . .

The dilemma is unresolved and Professor Hudson's thesis can bring little comfort to either party. But the book illuminates one's educational thinking in almost every direction.

KEVIN NICHOLS

**PERSONNEL MANAGEMENT IN CONTEXT**, by Anne Crichton. *Batsford*, London, 1968. 360 pp. 84s.

The contribution of effective personnel management to the development of good industrial relations both within the plant and industry at large has been widely recognized by numerous commentators (*v.* Allan Flanders, 'The Future of Personnel Management', *Personnel Management*, Dec. 1964; and Tom Lupton, 'Industrial Behaviour and Personnel Management', I.P.M., 1964). The Report of the Royal Commission on Trade Union and Employers' Associations (the Donovan Commission) and the Government's White Paper *In Place of Strife* have all assumed that the personnel manager should be able to play his role within the organization even if this has not been the case in the past: 'If companies have their own personnel specialists, why have they not introduced effective personnel policies to control methods of negotiation and pay structures within their firm? . . . Many firms have no such policy, and perhaps no conception of it' (*Report of the Royal Commission on Trade Union and Employers' Associations*, London, H.M.S.O. Cmd. 3623, 1968, para. 94-95).

This book was written and will now be read during a period of public discussion about the quality of British Industrial Relations. Miss Crichton is to be congratulated for providing a book which should help to focus this public debate upon the problems rather than the pseudo-issues of the national press. Personnel management is placed firmly within its organizational context and the work organization is effectively linked to the society 'outside the gate'.

In the first section of her book the author examines the place of personnel management

within management generally. She deftly combines a historical awareness with a grasp of the realities of organizational behaviour. Occasionally her historical account leaves the reader with a few doubts. 'There has been a tendency since the early 1950s to argue that the best form of participation is stronger and more constructive opposition by the Union' (p. 18). This may have been the view of the official trade union leadership but it did not reflect the reality of workplace industrial relations. Within the plant, power and control have shifted nearer the shop floor and it is now likely to remain there. From this base the unions have successfully pursued the policy of 'encroaching control'. The description of management ideologies and the wish of management 'to delegate the ritual of bargaining' is much more successful. The importation of transatlantic management ideologies is recognized and accepted with resignation because of the failure of the British ideology, which still regards the firm as a unitary system. In posing the question 'What is Personnel Management?', Miss Crichton neatly presents the problem in two words: 'Efficiency and Justice.' That these two terms are meaningful to all persons at work is obvious. The notion of justice in social relations has been more fully developed by George Homans in his notion of 'distributive justice' (*Social Behaviour: Its Elementary Forms*. Routledge & Kegan Paul, London, 1961. Chapter 12). It is a pity that the influence of this member of the Human Relations school is not more clearly described. The problem presented by evaluation in personnel management is then briefly sketched

out. The reader, however, searches in vain for a commitment on this topic.

In the second section of this book entitled 'Organizations: what do we know about them?' we find a lucid summary of the existing literature. If all lecture notes were published in this form we would be grateful. This is one of the clearest accounts of organizational theory which has been published to date. The chapter on the 'Application of Behavioural Science to Personnel Management Practice' seems, however, to be an afterthought. Its inclusion is to be welcomed because it brings us 'up to date' with the existing organizational jargon. The conclusion that 'There has been an over-emphasis upon financial incentives and upon ideological appeals' is justified, but this statement is made casually so that we are not really aware of its importance. The section ends with a plea which lacks impact. We are told 'managers generally need to be made aware not only of the existence of this thinking but of the necessity to take it into consideration when making decisions' (p. 124). The consequences of failure are only hinted at; they should have been spelt out more forcefully.

Miss Crichton then describes the 'Social Context of Work Organizations'. Here we can clearly see the broad perspective which seems characteristic of the book. The first chapter on 'Industrial Distribution and Industrial Change' is followed by an account of the 'Changing Social Context' in which the enterprise functions. The implications of this for Personnel Management are carefully developed. Of one issue, overmanning, she writes '(it) will not be tackled properly while there is insufficient recognition of the investment which men have put into their working lives' (p. 195). One could not agree more, but is this not the 'voice from the wilderness'? Subsequently she writes: 'Much can be done . . . by taking a social interest as well as a purely contractual one' (p. 196). This is a noble sentiment which indicates the existence of conflicting value systems but does nothing to suggest how to resolve the problem.

The fourth section of the book, 'Struggles for Control in Work Organizations', would deserve a volume to itself. Within the limit of this book Miss Crichton continues to develop her main argument clearly and forcefully; namely, the personnel function within the organizational framework. The union challenge to management control is treated in essentially descriptive terms. The relationship of social power to

technical control is clearly presented and its effect on workplace relations is analysed. That the notion of managerial prerogative requires considerable reformulation is obvious. In engineering, for example, managements claim the right to 'manage their establishments'. The failure to recognize the consequences of technological change upon this notion may well result in the formulation of the counter-claim: 'Unions have the right to control their establishment and management the duty to advise.' This may be an over-simplification of the demand for workers' control but its espousal will become more likely now that plant productivity bargaining has developed. That co-partnership and profit sharing do not stir up any excitement among organized workers is not surprising. The suggestion made that workpeople are now more interested in security is not very convincing. 'Security' involves having a degree of control within the organization and planning in the economy at large which does not exist at present. Productivity bargaining will not result in increased 'security' for individuals; its much more likely outcome is a reassertion of a narrow form of managerial control. The problem of controlling labour costs and efficiency is unfortunately seen only within the framework of the individual undertaking. The result of this is the impression that the external environment of the organization does not really count for much. Can any manager afford to ignore the present siege economy and the resultant Prices and Incomes Policy?

The book concludes with a section on the 'Theory and Practice in Personnel Management'. The personnel specialist is 'a part manager of the whole organization, manager of a part, liaison officer between other parts and a public relations officer' (p. 3). This may seem a cynical description yet it describes the situation of many personnel specialists with great accuracy. The contribution he can make will depend on the willingness of the rest of the management team to give him scope. He, like many other specialists, is involved in a struggle for power within the organization. For those who are involved in such work, a close reading of this book may lead to a greater chance of success. For the general reader Miss Crichton has performed a valuable and worthwhile task. She has successfully described the personnel function within its true background, the organization.

ANDREW GOTTSCHALK