

PHILOSOPHY

The Journal of the Royal Institute of Philosophy

volume **94** number **370** October 2019



Edited by Anthony O'Hear

Contributions by

IAN RUMFITT

DAVID CARR

SHOAIB AHMED MALIK

CAMILLA KRONQVIST

ANDREW LAVIN

SUSAN E NOTESS

HANS-JOHANN GLOCK

WILLIAM CHARLTON

ISSN: 0031-8191

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

The Royal Institute of Philosophy

Founded in 1925

Chairman of the Council Professor John Haldane

Vice Chair Lucy O'Brien

Hon. Director Professor Julian Baggini

Hon. Editor of 'Philosophy' Professor Anthony O'Hear

Secretary Dr James Garvey *Treasurer* G. A. Philip

International Advisory Board Simon Blackburn, Cambridge University; Jerry Fodor, Rutgers University; Frank Jackson, Australian National University; Graham Priest, University of Melbourne; John Searle, University of California

Editorial Board of 'Philosophy' Maria Rosa Antognazza, Kings College London; Alexander Bird, Kings College London; Paul Coates, University of Hertfordshire; John Haldane, University of St Andrews; Katherine Hawley, University of St Andrews; Ted Honderich, University College London; Kevin Magill, University of Wolverhampton; Lucy O'Brien, University College London; Thomas Pink, Kings College London; Sarah Sawyer, University of Sussex; Barry C. Smith, School of Advanced Study, University of London

Membership

The Institute welcomes as members any who are interested in philosophy. There are branches of the Institute in many regional centres, details of which are on the Institute's website. In these branches, and at the London headquarters, an annual programme of lectures is arranged. Members receive copies of *Philosophy* but not the Supplements (see under Subscriptions below), but these are available to members at a 20% discount.

The annual subscription is £25.00, \$45.00 in the USA and Canada. For full-time students and those registered as unemployed the subscription is £10.00 or \$22.00. Applications should be made to THE SECRETARY, ROYAL INSTITUTE OF PHILOSOPHY, 14 GORDON SQUARE, LONDON, WC1H 0AR or via the Institute's website <http://www.royalinstitutephilosophy.org>.

Permission

This journal is registered with the Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923, USA. Organizations in the USA who are registered with the CCC may therefore copy material (beyond the limits permitted by sections 107 and 108 of USA copyright law) subject to payment to the CCC of the per copy fee of \$12.00. This consent does not extend to multiple copying for promotional or commercial purposes. Code 0031-8191/2015/\$12.00.

Organizations authorized by the Copyright Licensing Agency may also copy material subject to the usual conditions. ISI Tear Sheet Service, 3501 Market Street, Philadelphia, PA 19104, USA, is authorized to supply single copies of separate articles for private use only. For all other use, permission must be sought from Cambridge or the American Branch of Cambridge University Press.

Subscriptions

Philosophy (ISSN 0031-8191) is published quarterly in January, April, July and October. The well-established RIP Lecture Series and collections of the papers delivered at the annual conference organized by the Royal Institute of Philosophy are published as Supplements to *Philosophy* and included in the institutional subscription price. Two supplementary volumes are published annually. An institutional subscription to *Philosophy* includes three issues of *Think*. The subscription price (excluding VAT) of volume 94 (2019), which includes print and electronic access, is £554.00 (US \$999.00 in the USA, Canada and Mexico). The electronic-only price available to institutional subscribers is £476.00 (US \$847 in the US, Canada and Mexico). Prices include delivery by air. EU subscribers (outside the UK) who are not registered for VAT should add VAT at their country's rate. VAT registered subscribers should provide their VAT registration number. Orders, which must be accompanied by payment, may be sent to any bookseller or subscription agent or direct to the publisher: Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, UPH, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8BS, UK; or in the USA, Canada and Mexico, Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, Journals Fulfillment Department, 1 Liberty Plaza, Floor 20, New York, NY, 10006, USA. Japanese prices for institutions are available from Kinokuniya Company Ltd, P.O. Box 55, Chitose, Tokyo 156, Japan.

Periodicals postage is paid at New York, NY and at additional mailing offices. POSTMASTER: send address changes in USA, Canada and Mexico to Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, 1 Liberty Plaza, Floor 20, New York, NY, 10006, USA. © The Royal Institute of Philosophy 2019

Typeset by Techset Composition Ltd, Salisbury, UK

Printed in the United Kingdom at Bell & Bain Ltd, Glasgow