

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME 5 NUMBER 4 WINTER 1980

Antabuse: Medication in
Exchange for a Limited
Freedom—Is it Legal?

Corey H. Marco, M.D., J.D.
Joni Michel Marco, J.D. Candidate

Health Care Policy and Politics:
Does the Past Tell Us Anything
About the Future?

Stephen M. Weiner, LL.B.

Further Dialogue on Health Care
Regulation—(1) A Response to the
Kinzer-Norris Debate
—(2) A Response to the
Editor's Comments

Patricia Roberts Harris,
Secretary of Health, Education,
and Welfare
Henry W. Zaretsky, Ph.D.

A Response to Jay Alexander
Gold's Book Review of the
Encyclopedia of Bioethics

Angela R. Holder, LL.M.

Gold's Response to Holder

Jay Alexander Gold, J.D., M.P.H.

Selected Recent Court Decisions

John A. Norris, J.D., M.B.A.
Gail Garinger, J.D.
Nancy C. Kurtz, J.D.

Short Reviews of Selected Books
and Articles

Jay Alexander Gold, J.D., M.P.H.

Selected Book Releases,
Annotated

Elliot L. Sagall, M.D.
Denise Provost, B.A.

*Group Life & Health Insurance Co.
v. Royal Drug Co.*: The
McCarran-Ferguson Act and
Health Service Plans

David S. Szabo

Published by the American Society of Law & Medicine

Editorial support provided by Boston College Law School and Boston University School of Law

The AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE was founded in response to the need for a scholarly yet pragmatic publication encompassing all aspects of medico-legal relations. The JOURNAL seeks to provide a broad perspective on our complex health care system, to encourage interdisciplinary communication, and to stimulate creative solutions to the pressing medicolegal problems of our time.

In addition to serving as a forum for analyses and proposals in such areas as health law and policy, legal and insurance medicine, and bioethics, the JOURNAL offers a wide variety of pertinent reference materials in these and related areas.

The JOURNAL serves persons from a variety of fields who seek to understand and to influence medicolegal developments: physicians, other health care providers, and health administrators; lawyers; health analysts and planners; researchers and educators in health specialties; judges, legislators, and government administrators; insurance officials; consumer advocates; and concerned members of the general public.

The JOURNAL is published in the Spring, Summer, Fall, and Winter by the American Society of Law & Medicine. Editorial support is provided by Boston College Law School and Boston University School of Law. All decisions concerning the content of the JOURNAL are made by the Editor-in-Chief on behalf of the American Society of Law & Medicine. Statements of fact and opinion are the responsibility of the authors alone, and are not necessarily endorsed by the editors, the Society, or the law schools.

The Editors invite the submission of manuscripts on medicolegal topics. For details, see inside back cover. Editorial communications, including original manuscripts and requests for permission to reproduce JOURNAL material, should be addressed to Editor-in-Chief, American Journal of Law & Medicine, 520 Commonwealth Avenue, Boston, Massachusetts 02215. Editorial phone: (617) 969-0100, ext. 4301.

Business correspondence, including subscription and advertising correspondence, should be addressed to the Executive Director, American Society of Law & Medicine, 520 Commonwealth Avenue, Boston, Massachusetts 02215. Business phone: (617) 262-4992.

Missing copies of the JOURNAL will be sent free of charge to subscribers or members of the Society provided that notice of such claim is received at the Society's subscription office within one month of receipt of the next issue published. Requests made after this period will be billed at the regular single issue price of \$10.

Subscriptions: \$40.00 per year for institutions, and for individuals who are not members of the American Society of Law & Medicine. Foreign subscribers should remit, for a year's subscription, an additional \$15.00 for air mail postage or an additional \$5.00 for surface rate postage.

Members of the American Society of Law & Medicine receive a free subscription to the JOURNAL as part of their dues (\$60.00 for 1979). Information concerning membership is available from the Executive Director, American Society of Law & Medicine, 520 Commonwealth Avenue, Boston, Massachusetts 02215. Society phone: (617) 262-4992.

Copyright © 1979 by the American Society of Law & Medicine, Inc. All or any part of materials appearing in the JOURNAL may not be republished without the express written consent of the Editor-in-Chief.

Articles in the JOURNAL are indexed in *Index to Legal Periodicals*, *Contents of Current Legal Periodicals*, *Index Medicus*, *Social Sciences Citation Index*, *Current Contents: Social and Behavioral Sciences*, and *Biosciences Information Service of Biological Abstracts*.

Library of Congress Catalog Card Number: 75-645516 (Shelf No. K1.M445). ISSN 0098-8588.

U.S. postage paid at Boston, Massachusetts in accordance with Permit No. 55855 (Nonprofit Org.).

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME 5 NUMBER 4 WINTER 1980

BOARD of EDITORS

EDITOR-IN-CHIEF

John A. Norris, J.D., M.B.A.
Attorney & Consultant in Health Law
Tufts Univ. School of Dental Med.
Boston Coll. & Boston U. Law Schools

ASSOCIATE EDITOR

Jim McMahan, J.D.

EXECUTIVE EDITOR

A. Edward Doudera, J.D.

MANAGING EDITOR

Judith Lesser, J.D.

ASSISTANT MANAGING EDITOR

Thomas J. Lewis, J.D.

BOOK & PERIODICAL REVIEW EDITOR

Jay Alexander Gold, J.D., M.P.H.

CONTRIBUTING EDITOR

Stephen M. Weiner, LL.B.

Mark D. Altschule, M.D.

Harvard University

Donald B. Barkan, M.D., F.A.C.P.
Health Director, Lynn Hospital School
of Nursing

Charles H. Baron, LL.B., Ph.D.

Boston College Law School

Patrick Carroll, J.D.

Senior Vice Pres. & Legal Counsel,
Massachusetts Hospital Ass'n

Roger C. Cramton, J.D.

Dean, Cornell Law School

William J. Curran, LL.M., S.M. Hyg.

Harvard University

Douglas Danner, J.D.

Trial Attorney

Lee J. Dunn, Jr., J.D., LL.M.

General Counsel, Northwestern
Memorial Hospital

Richard F. Gibbs, M.D., J.D.

Attorney & Consultant in Health Law
Harvard Medical School

Clark C. Havighurst, J.D.

Duke University School of Law

Bernard D. Hirsh, J.D.

General Counsel, Am. Med. Ass'n

Richard G. Huber, J.D.

Dean, Boston College Law School

Alan K. Kaplan, LL.B., M. Sci.

Attorney & Consultant in Health Law
Georgetown Univ. Medical School

Jay Katz, M.D.

Yale University

Sylvia A. Law, J.D.

New York University School of Law

Frances H. Miller, J.D.

Boston University School of Law

Aubrey Milunsky, M.B.B.Ch.,

M.R.C.P., D.C.H.

Harvard Medical School

Irwin N. Perr, M.D., J.D.

Rutgers Medical School, College of
Medicine and Dentistry of New Jersey

Harvey E. Pies, J.D., M.P.H.

Attorney & Consultant in Health Law

Honorable Max Rosenn

United States Court of Appeals

Elliot L. Sagall, M.D.

Harvard Medical School

Boston College Law School

E. Donald Shapiro, J.D., LL.D.

Dean, New York Law School

Margery W. Shaw, M.D., J.D.

Director, Medical Genetics Center
University of Texas at Houston

Robert B. Shira, D.D.S.

Dean, Tufts Univ. School of
Dental Med.; Past Pres., ADA

Richard E. Speidel, J.D., LL.M.

Dean, Boston University School of Law

Cyril H. Wecht, M.D., J.D.

Director, Pittsburgh Inst. of Legal
Med.; Coroner, Allegheny County

RESEARCH ASSOCIATES

Pamela J. Anderson, J.D.

Gail Garinger, J.D.

Nancy C. Kurtz, J.D.

Denise Provost, B.A.

OFFICERS OF THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF LAW & MEDICINE

PRESIDENT

Elliot L. Sagall, M.D.
Boston College Law School
Harvard Medical School

FIRST VICE-PRESIDENT

John A. Norris, J.D., M.B.A.
Attorney and Consultant in Health Law, Boston, Massachusetts
Editor-in-Chief, *American Journal of Law & Medicine*

VICE-PRESIDENT

Sidney Scherlis, M.D.
University of Maryland Medical School

SECRETARY

Aubrey Milunsky, M.B.B.Ch., M.R.C.P., D.C.H.
Harvard Medical School
Director, Genetics Division, Shriver Center

TREASURER

Barry C. Reed, LL.B.
Trial Attorney

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR

A. Edward Doudera, J.D.
Managing Editor, *Medicolegal News*
Executive Editor, *American Journal of Law & Medicine*

GENERAL COUNSEL

Douglas Danner, J.D.
Trial Attorney

BACK ISSUES OF THE JOURNAL

A limited number of back issues through Volume 1 of the JOURNAL are available from the subscription office of the American Society of Law & Medicine, 520 Commonwealth Avenue, Boston, Massachusetts 02215, at the single issue price of \$10.00, or per volume as follows:

Vol. 1 (1975)	\$15 (2 issues)
Vol. 2 (1976)	\$15 (2 issues)
Vol. 3 (1977)	\$30 (4 issues)
Vol. 4 (1978)	\$30 (4 issues)
Vol. 5 (1979)	\$40 (4 issues)

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME 5 NUMBER 4 WINTER 1980

**BOSTON COLLEGE LAW
SCHOOL**

**BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL
OF LAW**

STUDENT BOARD of EDITORS

EDITOR-IN-CHIEF

Madeline S. Mirabito

MANAGING EDITOR

Mary M. Rudser

TOPICS EDITOR

Peter D. Goldstein

CASE and NOTE EDITOR

William A. Lowell

ARTICLES EDITOR

Linda Bucci

EDITOR

Diane Breslin

EDITOR-IN-CHIEF

Joanne P. Acford

EXECUTIVE EDITOR

David S. Szabo

MANAGING EDITOR

Nancy Elizabeth Jones

TOPICS EDITOR

Elizabeth D. Schrero

CASE and NOTE EDITORS

Scott E. Cooper

Eve T. Horwitz

Laurie A. Kamaiko

EDITORS

Emily Jane Donovan

Ellen P. Epps

Joanne G. Petrie

Shari B. Rubin

Genise W. Teich

Jay L. Zucker

STUDENT STAFF

William F. Grieco

Anna Hirai

Warren J. Hurwitz

Stephen M. Sheehy

Natalie A. Simon

Anne H. Sivek

Scott Sherman

Peter Silberstein

John A. Tarantino

Harriet Travilla

Mary E. Bowler

J. David Canarie, Jr.

Cynthia A. Feigin

Ronald Grosser

Denise Lachance

Judy K. Mencher

James E. Needell

Donald B. Shanin

Ellen B. Shankman

Laurence J. Shulman

Susan E. Silbersweig

Nina P. Silfen

Lawrence B. Slater

Michael Tabb

Linda V. Tiano

FACULTY ADVISERS

Charles H. Baron, LL.B., Ph.D.
Boston College Law School

Frances H. Miller, J.D.
Boston University School of Law

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME 5 NUMBER 4 WINTER 1980

ARTICLE

- Antabuse: Medication in Exchange for a Limited Freedom—Is it Legal? 295
Corey H. Marco, M.D., J.D.
Joni Michel Marco, J.D. Candidate

COMMENT

- Health Care Policy and Politics: Does the Past Tell Us Anything About the Future? 331
Stephen M. Weiner, LL.B.

CORRESPONDENCE

- Further Dialogue on Health Care Regulation—(1) A Response to the Kinzer-Norris Debate 343
Patricia Roberts Harris,
Secretary of Health, Education,
and Welfare
—(2) A Response to the Editor's Comments 344
Henry W. Zaretsky, Ph.D.
- A Response to Jay Alexander Gold's Book Review of the *Encyclopedia of Bioethics* 345
Angela R. Holder, LL.M.
- Gold's Response to Holder 347
Jay Alexander Gold, J.D., M.P.H.

MEDICOLEGAL REFERENCE LIBRARY

- Selected Recent Court Decisions 353
John A. Norris, J.D., M.B.A.
Gail Garinger, J.D.
Nancy C. Kurtz, J.D.
- Short Reviews of Selected Books and Articles 361
Jay Alexander Gold, J.D., M.P.H.
- Selected Book Releases, Annotated 377
Elliot L. Sagall, M.D.
Denise Provost, B.A.

NOTES

- Group Life & Health Insurance Co. v. Royal Drug Co.*: The McCarran-Ferguson Act and Health Service Plans 393
David S. Szabo