

argument in favour of the biblical view can be found in the universal practice of value-judgments among men. The biblical view implies that man is created free to choose. While the book shows evidence of wide reading and considerable learning, the precise reasons why the author's conclusions should be regarded as representing adequately the biblical view of man and reality is never made clear.

The second work, *Doing the Truth*, by James A. Pike, is a helpful analysis of Christian ethics and behaviour in terms of the biblical idea of vocation.

In the third book, Professor Jenkins speaks of the Church as the point at which God challenges man in history. Professor Jenkins's writing is always stimulating and his recent work is no exception. It may be doubted, sometimes, whether he really appreciates the position of the Catholic Church and whether his theological writing would not be improved if he liberated himself from certain prejudices which are only too common in neo-Protestant writing. These three books, which all belong to Messrs Gollancz's 'Christian Faith' series, illustrate a tendency in modern Protestant theology to return to a consideration of fundamental biblical ideas and in terms of these ideas to criticize and evaluate systems of philosophy and theories of culture. The Catholic theologian must welcome this movement as it has brought back the thought of contemporary Protestant writers to those fundamental themes which are common to all who regard the Bible as an inspired work.

A fourth book, *The New Being*, by Paul Tillich, is an excellent example of how this new movement has affected the preaching of Protestant ministers. Dr Tillich is a distinguished American minister and in this new collection of sermons he shows how powerful a weapon biblical theology can be for the preacher. Dr Tillich, with great skill, provides a series of sermons which would repay study by the parish priest. In spite of a certain amount of material which a Catholic would have to reject, the way in which Dr Tillich expresses himself and the ease with which he uses his biblical references should prove helpful as a model to those who have to preach every Sunday.

IAN HISLOP, O.P.

ERANOS JAHRBUCH, 1955, Band XXIV. Herausgegeben von Olga Fröbe-Kapteyn. (Zürich: Rhein-Verlag; S. Fr. 31.20.)

This volume of the Eranos annuals is devoted to 'Der Mensch und die Sympathie aller Dinge'. But, as John Layard warns the English reader, 'this word *Sympathie* has not the same meaning as our "sympathy"'. . . . In German it indicates the existence or establishment of a subtle bond or relationship, a mutual understanding.' Layard's own

contribution, on 'Identification with the Sacrificial Animal' as he has observed it in Malekula, is outstanding as a sample of the employment of such *Sympathie* in anthropological fieldwork. It is no less so for the remarkable light it sheds on many religious, cultural and psychological phenomena among many besides the Malekulan, 'for whom the sacrificial animal is a transforming symbol, affecting every aspect of his life'.

The only strictly theological contribution is that of Ernst Benz on 'Man and the *Sympathie* of All Things at the End of Time'. He sets in sharpest contrast the dualism implicit in traditional Christian doctrine about the eternity of hell with the universalism of Origen and Jakob Boehme. He finds the former logically inadmissible for implying two final eternities, mutually and irreconcilably opposed; morally intolerable for setting final and insuperable restrictions to the universality of Christian love and compassion (as witnessed by the utterances of Fathers and Schoolmen on the joy of the blessed in the torments of the damned)—if not also to the power and mercy of God. He quotes St Thomas's *Supplementum* liberally on the subject; but makes no mention of such doctrines of the saint's mature thought which might blur the sharpness of the contrast: the doctrines that while the *poena damni* (the loss of God which arises from the rejection of God through sin) must indeed be infinite, the *poenae sensus* (the positive penal consequences of the sinner's adherence to temporal goods) are and must be finite; that 'eternal' cannot have the same sense when applied to God (and those who enjoy his eternal life) and to hell; that the essential opposition of heaven and hell is not that of two positive contraries, but that of a positive and its privation. Benz's assertion that Western (unlike Eastern) theology has always maintained the primacy of justice at the expense of everything else, even of God's love, is belied by St Thomas's insistence on the primacy of God's mercy, and his teaching that Divine justice is itself the product of his mercy and love. The doctrine of hell, and still more some presentations of it, are not without difficulties, but Benz ignores the far more serious problems presented by his own: the highly selective reading of Scripture which it involves, and the fact that a necessarily hell-less *apokatastasis* implies the inability of man to choose against it, and the inevitability, sooner or later, of a freedom-destroying compulsion to ensure it.

Louis Massignon offers (in French) an untidy but fascinating paper on universal compassion in Islam, especially as manifested in devotion to Fatima, the daughter of the Prophet, 'cette âme méconnue, méprisée, annonciatrice du triomphe final des malheureux; de la venue du Mahdi, "fils du Fâtima", du retour de Jésus "fils du Maryam".'

Other contributions are Erich Neumann's 'keynote speech';

Gershom Scholem's study of the subject in Jewish mysticism; Henry Corbin's (in French) on 'sympathie et théopathie' in Islam; Walter Otto's on the place of *Sympathie* in the formation of primitive myth. Finally we have two more 'scientific' papers: one by Max Knoll on endogenous rhythms and biological time, which ties together some recent scientific discoveries and hypotheses with some ancient symbols and myths; the other, by Adolf Portmann, expounds some marvels of biological adaptation which suggest the astonishing *Sympathie* which exists between certain animals and their spatio-temporal environment. The volume is as handsomely produced as its predecessors, and includes a number of fine plates and illustrations. All the contents are in German unless otherwise stated.

VICTOR WHITE, O.P.

ÉLIE LE PROPHÈTE, 2 vols. (Les Études Carmélitaines, chez Desclée de Brouwer; 200 B. Fr each.)

Two volumes, six hundred pages, all about Elias: it hardly seems possible, certainly not readable, however distinguished the numerous contributors. Even the magnificent pictures, both from nature and from art, can hardly entice us to face the copious letterpress.

Unless of course we have already fallen under the Prophet's spell. And some powerful spell he has certainly exercised, and over devotees of several faiths. His 'spirit and power' (Luke 1, 17) are not yet extinguished; and Jung is here, with letters to the Editor, to explain how and why he 'constellates an archetype'. Elias in his fiery chariot has somehow got mixed up with Helios, and we are shown ancient pictures which could represent the Prophet or the Sun-god or both.

So there is no lack of subject-matter, and no need for padding. We have, first of all, the topographical background: then the Old Testament and New Testament texts which concern Elias, followed by studies of each. Then Elias in the Greek Fathers, in the Latin Fathers, in the Syriac Fathers. The cult of Elias in the Eastern Churches and the Western: the iconography of Elias.

Then, in the second volume, Elias as an archetypal figure; Elias as the legendary founder of the Carmelites (very honestly and sensibly treated, with full documentation), their model and patron. This is followed logically by an important theological article on prophecy in the Church and its relationship to the contemplative life. Then, Elias in Jewry, Elias in the Koran, and Elias elsewhere in Islam. Finally an appendix on some bizarre Elias-cults in Paris and London in the last century. Altogether one of the best of *Études Carmélitaines*, and, after all, eminently readable.

VICTOR WHITE, O.P.