

# INTERNATIONAL LABOR AND WORKING-CLASS HISTORY



# INTERNATIONAL LABOR AND WORKING-CLASS HISTORY

Founded by  
Robert F. Wheeler

## EDITORS

David Montgomery  
*Yale University*  
Helmut Gruber  
*Polytechnic University*

## ASSISTANT EDITOR

Leslie Frane  
*Yale University*

## REPORTS EDITOR

Michael Hanagan  
*Columbia University*

## EDITORIAL BOARD

James Cronin  
*University of Wisconsin, Milwaukee*  
Emilia Viotti daCosta  
*Yale University*  
John F. C. Harrison  
*University of Sussex*  
Gregory S. Kealey  
*Memorial University of Newfoundland*  
John H. M. Laslett  
*University of California, Los Angeles*  
Yves Lequin  
*Université de Lyon*  
Vernon Lidtke  
*The Johns Hopkins University*  
Martin Miller  
*Duke University*

Anson Rabinbach  
*The Cooper Union*  
Steven Ross  
*University of Southern California*  
Nick Salvatore  
*NYSSILR/Cornell University*  
Michael Schneider  
*Friedrich-Ebert-Stiftung*  
Joan Wallach Scott  
*Institute for Advanced Study, Princeton*  
Louise A. Tilly  
*The New School for Social Research*  
Joseph Weidenholzer  
*Johannes Kepler Universität, Linz*  
Sean Wilentz  
*Princeton University*

*International Labor and Working-Class History* (ISSN 0147-5479) is published twice yearly, in spring and fall, by the University of Illinois Press for the Study Group on International Labor and Working Class History. Additional support is provided by Yale University.

Subscription rates: \$20.00 for institutions (\$26.00 foreign), \$12.00 for individuals (\$18.00 foreign), and \$7.00 for students (\$13.00 foreign). Single copies \$10.50 to institutions, \$6.50 to individuals. All business inquiries (subscriptions, advertisements, and change of address notices) and requests for back numbers should be addressed to the University of Illinois Press, 54 E. Gregory Dr., Champaign, IL 61820.

Manuscripts, editorial correspondence, and books for review should be addressed to Editor, *ILWCH*, Department of History, Hall of Graduate Studies, Yale University, New Haven, CT 06520. Directions for contributors are on the inside back cover of this issue.

© 1988 by the Board of Trustees of the University of Illinois.

Manufactured in the United States of America.

This journal is printed on acid-free paper.

All cover photographs are from the Carnegie Library, Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania.

*Postmaster:* Send change-of-address notices to the University of Illinois Press, 54 E. Gregory Dr., Champaign, IL 61820.

Editors' Remarks	1
------------------	---

### SCHOLARLY CONTROVERSY

A New View of Industrialization: "Protoindustry" or the Role of Small-Scale, Labor-Intensive Manufacture in the Capitalist Environment	3
<i>Jean H. Quataert</i>	
Response by <i>Jonathan Prude</i>	22
Response by <i>Charles F. Sabel</i>	30

### ESSAY

Foreign Workers in Soviet Russia, 1920-40: Their Experience and Their Legacy	
<i>Andrea Graziosi</i>	38

### REVIEW ESSAYS

Workers and Politics in Wilhelmine and Weimar Germany	
<i>Mary Nolan</i>	60
Marx, Russia, and Soviet History	
<i>Ronald Grigor Suny</i>	68

### REPORTS AND CORRESPONDENCE

New York State Labor History Association Conference on Women, Work, and Community	
<i>Sue Cobble</i>	80
The Organization of American Historians	
<i>Patricia A. Cooper</i>	84
Fourth Latin American Labor History Conference	
<i>John D. French</i>	87

Class, Community, and the Labor Movement in Wales and Canada, 1890–1930 <i>Deian Hopkin</i>	90
Fourteenth Annual Conference on the Western Society for French History <i>Leslie Derfler, Marjorie M. Farrar, Judith Wishnia, Herman Lebovics</i>	94
Labor and the State in the Twentieth Century <i>Doug Reynolds</i>	96
Seventh Berkshire Conference on the History of Women <i>Carole Turbin and Sonya O. Rose</i>	99
Fifteenth Annual National Association of Chicano Studies Conference <i>Zaragosa Vargas</i>	102

### BOOK REVIEWS

<i>A History of British Trade Unions Since 1889</i> , vol. 2, 1911–1913, by Hugh Armstrong Clegg Reviewed by Richard Price	106
<i>The Growth of Working-Class Reformism in Mid-Victorian England</i> , by Neville Kirk Reviewed by Joseph White	108
<i>The Nottingham Labour Movement, 1880–1939</i> , by Peter Wyncoll Reviewed by Geoffrey Field	112
<i>Spinners and Weavers of Auffay: Rural Industry and the Sexual Division of Labor in a French Village, 1750–1850</i> , by Gay L. Gullickson Reviewed by Robert S. DuPlessis	116
<i>Social Change and the Laboring Poor: Antwerp, 1770–1860</i> , by Catharina Lis Reviewed by Michael Hanagan	118
<i>Workers in Imperial Germany: The Miners of the Ruhr</i> , by S. H. F. Hickey Reviewed by Michael Schneider	120
<i>Rethinking the Soviet Experience: Politics and History Since 1917</i> , by Stephen F. Cohen Reviewed by Morris Slavin	122

<i>Social Mobility in the Nineteenth and Twentieth Centuries: Europe and America in Comparative Perspective</i> , by Hartmut Kaelble Reviewed by Ileen DeVault	125
<i>The Practice of Solidarity: American Hat Finishers in the Nineteenth Century</i> , by David Bensman Reviewed by Patricia A. Cooper	128
<i>“Struggle a Hard Battle”</i> : <i>Essays on Working-Class Immigrants</i> , edited by Dirk Hoerder Reviewed by Rudolph J. Vecoli	131
<i>Out of Work: The First Century of Unemployment in Massachusetts</i> , by Alexander Keyssar Reviewed by Bruce Laurie	136
<i>Tinker, Tailor, and Textile Worker: Class and Politics in Egypt, 1930–1952</i> , by Ellis Goldberg Reviewed by Fred H. Lawson	138
<i>Industrialization and Trade Union Organization in South Africa, 1924–55: The Rise and Fall of the South African Trades and Labour Council</i> , by Jon Lewis Reviewed by William Worger	141
<i>Work and Community in the Jungle: Chicago’s Packinghouse Workers, 1894–1922</i> , by James R. Barrett Reviewed by Peter Rachleff	144
<b>ARCHIVES AND ARTIFACTS</b>	147

*Correction:* James A. Schmiechen is the author of *Sweated Industries and Sweated Labor: The London Clothing Trades, 1860-1914* (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1984; London: Croom-Helm, 1984). The author's name was given incorrectly in the review of his book in the Fall 1987 issue (no. 32) of this journal.