

prone to variation, a result that contradicts existing studies of formulaic evolution (chiefly C. Bozzone's 2014 UCLA dissertation), where higher productivity is associated with the earlier, 'healthier' life a formula. E. Minchin goes in the opposite direction, applying the concept of 'storyrealm' in oral performance studies to the use of repetition in Alice Oswald's *Memorial*. Repetition offers both a cognitive advantage in performance and marks poetic speech as 'special speech', à la Bakker.

Merton College, Oxford

MARTINA ASTRID RODDA
martinaastrid.rodde@classics.ox.ac.uk

CONNECTIONS BETWEEN LITERATURE AND RELIGION

PAPAIOANNOU (S.), SERAFIM (A.), DEMETRIOU (K.) (edd.)
*Rhetoric and Religion in Ancient Greece and Rome. (Trends in Classics
Supplementary Volume 106.)* Pp. x+304. Berlin and Boston: De
Gruyter, 2021. Cased, £91, €99.95, US\$114.99. ISBN: 978-3-11-069916-6.
doi:10.1017/S0009840X22002311

This volume explores the close intertwining of rhetoric and religion in antiquity, mainly focusing on Graeco-Roman literary texts, but with insights into other fields, such as Egyptian 'magic' texts and Christian literature. The book opens with a valuable introduction by the editors, which outlines its purposes and theoretical background. The study responds to recent interest in the issue, but the editors rightly note a lack thus far 'of a single and updated examination of the use of ... forms of religious discourse across genres and times, focusing specifically on how, where, why and to what effect, this wide and diverse use of religious discourse helps define a typology thereof' (p. 6). Hence the need for this book, which ambitiously aims to examine, under a broader perspective, the nexus between rhetoric and religion through the centuries, from the classical age to the Christian era. The introduction also summarises the twelve chapters of the book. These are divided into five thematically organised sections of three articles each (except for the second and last parts), which, according to the editors' intention, should provide 'an incisive examination of some of the most intriguing aspects' (p. 7) of the subject. But there is no elucidation of the choice and relevance of these themes for the purposes of the volume.

Part 1, 'Religion, Rhetoric and Law', considers the place of religious rhetoric in the legal/political dimension of the Greek *polis*. In its first chapter E.M. Harris questions the rule of the law-religion dichotomy still ascribed to the Greek world by some scholarship, highlighting how these two aspects were intimately interrelated and drew legitimacy from each other. This is corroborated through a perceptive examination of literary and epigraphical sources, among which the reconsideration of Sophocles' *Antigone* 450–7 is particularly remarkable. The contribution is almost a valuable theoretical framework for the whole section, whose remaining two chapters both deal with judicial procedures. J. Filonik sheds light on an overlooked aspect of Athenian legal history, namely that of involving ordinary informers (including free non-citizens and slaves) in denunciations of religiously inappropriate behaviour. The focus is on

Athenian procedural flexibility, but the chapter also discusses the oft-neglected legal vocabulary of general acts of ‘denouncing’ (*phrazein*, *phainein* and *mēnyeîn*) through literary and epigraphic comparisons spanning different periods and areas in the Greek world. The analysis is fascinating, though the chapter occasionally drifts slightly from the matter of religion. In the last chapter of this section W. Furley interprets the ‘religious material’ that Antiphon of Rhamnous strategically employs in his extant speeches as a rhetorical means of persuasion, especially in homicide cases. Furley uses F. Solmsen’s, M. Gagarin’s and C. Eucken’s ideas as theoretical backdrop, illuminating the quality of Antiphon’s work by pointing out the new sophistic reasoning underlying his treatment of religious motifs.

The two chapters of Part 2, ‘Magic and Religion’, focus on the synergy between rhetoric and religion within the realm of ‘magic’. A clear methodological definition of the category of ‘magic’ is lacking. This makes readers wonder what ‘magic’ and ‘religion’ are, and whether it would not have been better to use more specific categories in this regard. In the first chapter D. Keramida discusses Ovid’s inclusion of ‘magical practices’ (such as the art of *carmina* and the fabrication of *simulacra*) as crucial rhetorical-performative means in selected passages from the *Epistulae Heroidum* and the *Metamorphoses*. By comparing the ‘rhetoric of magic’ as displayed by female letter writing and by male artistry, Keramida argues that ‘magic ritual’ plays a key role for the poet’s gendered rhetoric, elucidating his perception of the polarity between male bias and female agency. This is an inspiring and well-developed contribution, although Keramida uses the labels of ‘magic’ and ‘magical ritual’ rather superficially, without commenting on them further. Keramida’s reading could have benefited from R. Gordon’s fundamental analysis of the rhetorical dimension of the discourse of magic in Augustan poetry (*ARG* 11 [2009]). In the second chapter P. Sarischouli dwells on the various (Greek, Egyptian, Jewish) symbols and mythical patterns offered by two ‘magical’ recipes from a Greek/Demotic Theban handbook (mid-late second century CE), an engaging transcultural exploration in Late Egyptian (private) ritual texts. The emphasis on the multicultural influences disclosed by the Theban ritual *praxis* is clear and instructive, though the topic is quite familiar, and the ‘rhetoric of magic’ in these texts is not adequately developed.

Part 3, ‘Religion and Rhetorical Performance’, sets its sight on the performative dimension of religious discourse, with a focus on Roman culture. In its first chapter M. Patzelt reconsiders Roman public prayers by emphasising their expressive and performative aspect. In response to the persistent scholarly logological approach, Patzelt shifts attention ‘from the *orality* of prayer to its *vocality*’ (p. 136), arguing that public prayer was not a mere language carrier, but a performative expression of the physical abilities of the praying agent, including voice and gestures. This is corroborated through an illuminating examination of certain crucial elements, such as the ‘clear voice’ (*clara vox*) and the ‘double speech’ (due to prompting, *preire*). The chapter also reveals a close correspondence between religious and legal discourse, as well as parallels between trends in public discourse (*eloquentia popularis*) and forms of public prayer that resulted from such trends. These engaging considerations should stimulate further studies on the subject. In the second chapter C. Degelmann addresses the relationship between rhetoric and mourning in Roman society and its evolution from the Republican to the early Imperial ages. Degelmann points to the aristocratic appropriation of a spectrum of signs (verbal and physical) denoting grief for political purposes, showing how the *laudatio funebris* was effective in captivating listeners even beyond the funerary sphere. This proves that funeral ritual was more a social than a religious phenomenon and that the ‘deep religiosity of the Romans ... played little, if any, part’ (p. 167) in it. The interpretation

is of interest, although it deviates from the expected horizon of the book. The last chapter of this part shifts to early Christian themes, a welcome inclusion in the overall framework of the volume. G. Holland examines the writings of Paul of Tarsus and illustrates how his letters supplied a 'rhetorical matrix' by which the apostle's theological ideas and behavioural patterns were understood and spread as normative references far beyond their original audience. Instead of Paul's direct missionary action, Holland stresses the importance of the *re*-performance of his letters, as well as the creation of the deutero-Pauline letters, as the main vectors of his authoritative influence on the entire Christian movement. This perspective is stimulating and worthy of discussion.

Part 4, 'The Rulers' Religion', considers the use of religious patterns in Graeco-Roman works with respect to political rulers. In its first chapter V. Liotsakis compares Plutarch's, Arrian's and Curtius Rufus' accounts of Alexander the Great's rhetoric of religion, through three *topoi*: (a) divine favour; (b) divine origins; (c) Alexander's rivalry with Heracles and Dionysus. Liotsakis outlines analogies and divergences among the authors and provides key clues on the narrative techniques and attitudes by which the king is portrayed using (or abusing) religion for self-fashioning purposes or political/military propaganda. The comparative approach is thought-provoking and sheds light on a less explored topic in a useful and original way. In the second chapter K.E. Shannon-Henderson presents an insightful discussion of the various strategies Pliny deploys in the *Panegyricus* to lay the groundwork for the future official deification of Trajan. Shannon-Henderson reads the speech as an example of 'pseudo-deification', stressing the overlapping of human qualities with Trajan's divine merits not as a conflict, but as fundamentally intertwined aspects in Pliny's glorification of his reign. The chapter ties in with other treatments of the *Panegyricus* (especially those of D.S. Levene), but provides a new and enriched understanding of it through attention to developments in research on the emperor cult since the work of S.R.F. Price. In the last chapter of this section, along the lines of his 2002 *Roman Religion* volume, H.-F. Mueller reviews several passages of Valerius Maximus' work, assessing his rhetorical style in describing his own experiences and feelings through religious self-(re)presentation. By emphasising the pivotal role played by religious elements in this construction, Mueller points to Valerius' religious enthusiasm and argues that his charged religious self-fashioning promotes a moral paradigm that emulates religious patterns of the republican past and embraces the new devotion to the Caesars, including the living Tiberius. Against the scholarly view that emotional content played no part in Roman religion, this contribution's focus on religious subjectivity is valuable and will provoke further scholarly debate concerning Roman religion in the early principate.

The last section of the volume, Part 5, 'Rhetoric and Religion in Verse Style', regrettably contains only one chapter, which investigates late ancient verse literary texts. K. Melidis compares the surviving hexametric paraphrases of Psalm 136 (137), Ps.-Apollinaris' (Greek) *Metaphrasis Psalmorum* and Paulinus' (Latin) *Carmen IX*, which are roughly coeval, focusing on the paraphrastic rhetorical tools they adopted to strengthen the religious messages conveyed by the original text. Melidis mainly dwells on the strategy of 'addition' (*auxēsis*, *amplificatio*) and clearly demonstrates that several paraphrastic passages emphatically embellish or explain (sometimes deliberately interpret) the *Vorlage*, often reflecting early Christian theological and exegetical texts and contexts. The contribution is original and constitutes a positive addition to a less discussed subject as well as an enriching exploration with respect to the core theme of the book.

This collection of articles is perceptive and well crafted, providing readers with a useful overview, against the backdrop of somewhat compartmentalised studies on the connections between rhetoric and religion in antiquity. It is a well-written volume, with no glaring mistakes. The chapters are clearly elaborated and concise, with helpful notes, and they are of

reasonable length. The miscellany of historical periods and genres covered (from Greek oratory to history, from Latin poetry to Christian works) is undoubtedly the primary value of the book. However, as with most wide-ranging examinations of this kind, the approaches sometimes seem fragmentary, and it can be challenging to forge connections among them. Specifically, one regrets that the volume lacks conclusions or at least introductions to the sections, which could have provided adequate methodological frameworks and clearer explanations of the significance of the various themes. For the most part, the interpretations are innovative, although some are less original than others. In some cases, the focus on the main theme of the volume seems slightly weak. In general, this is a fruitful contribution on the relationship between rhetoric and religion as manifested in ancient literature, and it will certainly inspire further research on the matter.

Collège de France

GINEVRA BENEDETTI
ginevrabenedetti2404@gmail.com

ON GREEK AND ROMAN LOVE POETRY

THORSEN (T.S.), BRECKE (I.), HARRISON (S.) (edd.)
Greek and Latin Love. The Poetic Connection. Pp. viii + 267. Berlin and Boston: De Gruyter, 2021. Cased, £91, €99.95, US\$114.99. ISBN: 978-3-11-063059-6.

doi:10.1017/S0009840X22002207

This volume contains papers presented at a conference entitled *Greek and Roman Literature: the Erotic Connection*, held at Corpus Christi College, Oxford, in 2016, and papers that were subsequently commissioned. It is a rich collection dealing with various forms of love in Greek and Latin literature. The contributions challenge traditional views on love in the Graeco-Roman world, shed new light on much-debated issues and encourage novel and original readings on topics that are relatively under-researched or widely accepted.

The volume challenges the view that ‘romantic/true’ love did not exist in the ancient world and focuses on poetry – rather than prose, which is the dominant tendency in scholarship – in which stories of this kind of love abound. The chapters cover both major Greek and Roman poets (Homer, Sappho, Terence, Catullus, Virgil, Horace and Ovid) and minor poetic figures (the anonymous poet of *The Lament for Bion*, Philodemus and Sulpicia). The chapters demonstrate that ‘romantic’ or ‘true’ love is relevant for both heteroerotic and homoerotic couples throughout mainstream Graeco-Roman poetry and that the conceptions of love in Greek and Latin literature are interconnected. It is also important to note that the volume challenges much of the existing scholarship that traditionally privileges sex over love.

The volume opens with a brief introduction, ‘Introducing Greek and Latin Love: the Poetic Connection’, in which the three editors outline the content of each chapter. The chapters follow an approximate chronological order.

In the first chapter, ‘Love: Ancient and Later Representations’, an excellent beginning to the main body of the book, Thorsen addresses the apparent discrepancy between the sources and academic research on Greek and Latin love. She investigates the gaps in our understanding of notions of true love in ancient literature, both within and outside