

VOLUME 33 NUMBER 4 DECEMBER 2021

Utilitas

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Editor

DALE E. MILLER, *Old Dominion University*

Associate Editors

EMMANUELLE DE CHAMPS, *University of Cergy-Pontoise*

ROGER CRISP, *St. Anne's College, Oxford*

BRAD HOOKER, *University of Reading*

PAUL KELLY, *London School of Economics*

PHILIP SCHOFIELD, *University College London*

HOLLY SMITH, *Rutgers University*

Consultant Editor

FRED ROSEN, *University College London*

Review Editor

DAVID WEINSTEIN, *Wake Forest University*

Managing Editor

HANI ABDELLATIF

Editorial Committee

DAVID BRINK, *University of California, San Diego*

KRISTER BYKVIST, *Stockholm University*

JULIA DRIVER, *Washington University in Saint Louis*

BEN EGLESTON, *University of Kansas*

FRED FELDMAN, *University of Massachusetts, Amherst*

ROSS HARRISON, *University College London*

DAN HAYBRON, *Saint Louis University*

NILS HOLTUG, *University of Copenhagen*

JAMES LENMAN, *University of Sheffield*

KASPER LIPPERT-RASMUSSEN, *University of Copenhagen*

D. G. LONG, *University of Western Ontario*

ELINOR MASON, *Edinburgh University*

DAVID MCNAUGHTON, *Florida State University*

MICHELE M. MOODY-ADAMS, *Cornell University*

ANDREW MOORE, *University of Otago*

TIM MULGAN, *University of Auckland*

SERENA OLSARETTI, *ICREA-University of Pompeu Fabra*

MICHAEL OTSUKA, *London School of Economics and
Political Science, UK*

INGMAR PERSSON, *University of Gothenburg*

GERALD J. POSTEMA, *University of North Carolina at
Chapel Hill*

THERON PUMMER, *University of Oxford*

STUART RACHELS, *University of Alabama*

JONATHAN RILEY, *Tulane University*

SAMUEL SCHEFFLER, *New York University*

BART SCHULTZ, *University of Chicago*

JOHN SKORUPSKI, *University of St. Andrews*

NICHOLAS STURGEON, *Cornell University*

ROBERT SUGDEN, *University of East Anglia*

L. W. SUMNER, *University of Toronto*

LARRY TEMKIN, *Rutgers, State University of New Jersey*

C. L. TEN, *National University of Singapore*

PETER VALLENTYNE, *University of Missouri*

GEORGIOS VAROUXAKIS, *Queen Mary, University of London*

ANDREW WILLIAMS, *Catalan Institute for Research and
Advanced Studies (ICREA), Spain*

JONATHAN WOLFF, *University College London*

Utilitas

Editorial Policy

Utilitas is a pioneering interdisciplinary journal of moral and political philosophy, economic theory, jurisprudence and intellectual history. It welcomes articles, discussions, debates, and reviews on contemporary themes in those disciplines in which utilitarianism has made a particular contribution and on all aspects of the development of utilitarian thought (including that of its opponents).

The Journal is supported by the International Society for Utilitarian Studies, which sponsors major conferences, seminars, and other meetings, and makes special offers on books at advantageous rates to members. Individual subscribers to the journal automatically become members of the Society.

Other features of *Utilitas* include special issues or parts of issues on particular themes and individuals.

International Society for Utilitarian Studies

Subscription to *Utilitas* includes membership of the International Society for Utilitarian Studies. The Society, administered from the Bentham Project at University College London, sponsors major conferences, seminars, and other meetings. It aims to provide a forum for scholarly debate and research in the history of utilitarian thought, and its present-day relevance in the fields of ethics, politics, law, economics, and public policy. Members are entitled to a discount on the fees for the Society's conferences and to discounts on volumes in the new authoritative edition of *The Collected Works of Jeremy Bentham*.

For further details visit the ISUS web site at www.ucl.ac.uk/bentham-project/info/isus.htm

For an up-to-date bibliography of writings on Jeremy Bentham visit www.ucl.ac.uk/Bentham-Project/info/bibliog.htm

Utilitas and all other Cambridge journals can be accessed via <http://www.cup.cam.ac.uk> and in North America via <http://www.cup.org>.

This journal issue has been printed on FSC-certified paper and cover board. FSC is an independent, non-governmental, not-for-profit organization established to promote the responsible management of the world's forests. Please see www.fsc.org for information.

© Cambridge University Press 2021

ISSN 0953-8208

Utilitas

Volume 33 Number 4 December 2021

CONTENTS

Articles

- What Should We Agree on about the Repugnant Conclusion?
STÉPHANE ZUBER, NIKHIL VENKATESH, TORBJÖRN TÄNNSJÖ, CHRISTIAN TARSNEY,
H. ORRI STEFÁNSSON, KATIE STEELE, DEAN SPEARS, JEFF SEBO, MARCUS PIVATO,
TOBY ORD, YEW-KWANG NG, MICHAL MASNY, WILLIAM MACASKILL, NICHOLAS
LAWSON, KEVIN KURUC, MICHELLE HUTCHINSON, JOHAN E. GUSTAFSSON,
HILARY GREAVES, LISA FORSBERG, MARC FLEURBAEY, DIANE COFFEY, SUSUMU
CATO, CLINTON CASTRO, TIM CAMPBELL, MARK BUDOLFSON, JOHN BROOME,
ALEXANDER BERGER, NICK BECKSTEAD AND GEIR B. ASHEIM 379
- Susanna Newcome and the Origins of Utilitarianism PATRICK J. CONNOLLY 384
- A New Argument Against Critical-Level Utilitarianism
PATRICK WILLIAMSON 399
- Negative Utility Monsters RICHARD YETTER CHAPPELL 417
- Thresholds in Distributive Justice DICK TIMMER 422
- Two Pessimisms in Mill JOSHUA ISAAC FOX 442
- I, Trolley: Self-Redirection and Hybrid Trolley Cases DUSTIN LOCKE 458

Replies

- Setiya on Consequentialism and Constraints RYAN COX AND
MATTHEW HAMMERTON 474
- Reply to Bykvist and Campbell on Possible Beings INGMAR PERSSON 480
- The Significance of Tiny Contributions: Barnett and Beyond
ERIK CARLSON, MAGNUS JEDENHEIM EDLING AND JENS JOHANSSON 488

Book Reviews

- Emmanuelle de Champs, *Enlightenment and Utility: Bentham in French,
Bentham in France* R. J. W. MILLS 497
- Matthew D. Adler, *Measuring Social Welfare: An Introduction*
CAMPBELL BROWN 500
- Eliot Michaelson and Andreas Stokke (eds.), *Lying: Language, Knowledge,
Ethics, and Politics* NERI MARSILI 502
- Guy Fletcher, *Dear Prudence* CHRISTOPHER FRUGÉ 505