

The Behavioral and Brain Sciences

An International Journal of Current Research
and Theory with Open Peer Commentary

VOLUME 7
NUMBER 1
MARCH 1984

Appearing in this issue, with Commentary . . .

Does electroconvulsive therapy cause brain damage? Richard D. Weiner

The Maltese cross: A new simplistic model for memory

Donald E. Broadbent

Game theory and the evolution of behaviour J. Maynard Smith

Security of infantile attachment as assessed in the "strange situation" Michael E. Lamb, Ross A. Thompson, William P. Gardner, Eric L. Charnov, and David Estes

C A M B R I D G E U N I V E R S I T Y P R E S S

The Behavioral and Brain Sciences

Editor

Stevan Harnad
20 Nassau St., Suite 240
Princeton, NJ 08542

Assistant Editor

Helaine Randerson

Associate Editors

Behavioral Biology

Jack P. Hailman/U. Wisconsin
Hubert Markl/Universität Konstanz

Biosocial Behavior

Glendon Schubert/U. Hawaii, Manoa

Cognition and Artificial Intelligence

Zenon Pylyshyn/U. Western Ontario

Cognitive Development

Annette Karmiloff-Smith/MRC, London and MPI, Nijmegen

Cognitive Neuroscience

Lynn Nadel/U. California, Irvine

Developmental Psychology

Charles J. Brainerd/University of Alberta

Evolutionary Biology

Michael T. Ghiselin/California Academy of Sciences

Experimental Analysis of Behavior

A. Charles Catania/U. Maryland, Baltimore County

History and Systems

Julian Jaynes/Princeton

Language and Cognition

Peter Wason/University College, London

Language and Language Disorders

Max Coltheart/U. London

Neurobiology

Graham Hoyle/U. Oregon

Neuropharmacology

Susan D. Iversen/Merck Sharp and Dohme, Ltd.

Neuropsychology

Jeffrey A. Gray/Inst. Psychiatry, London

Neurophysiology

Sten Grillner/Karolinska Institutet

Paleoneurology

Stephen Jay Gould/Harvard

Philosophy

Daniel C. Dennett/Tufts

Psychobiology

Victor H. Denenberg/U. Connecticut

David S. Olton/Johns Hopkins

Quantitative Methods

Donald B. Rubin/U. Chicago

Vision and Artificial Intelligence

Stuart Sutherland/U. Sussex

Editorial Policy *The Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (BBS) is an international journal providing a special service called Open Peer Commentary* to researchers in any area of psychology, neuroscience, behavioral biology, or cognitive science who wish to solicit, from fellow specialists within and across these BBS disciplines, multiple responses to a particularly significant and controversial piece of work. (See *Instructions for Authors and Commentators*, inside back cover.) The purpose of this service is to contribute to the communication, criticism, stimulation, and particularly the unification of research in the behavioral and brain sciences, from molecular neurobiology to artificial intelligence and the philosophy of mind.

Papers judged by the editors and referees to be appropriate for Commentary are circulated to a large number of commentators selected by the editors, referees, and author to provide substantive criticism, interpretation, elaboration, and pertinent complementary and supplementary material from a full cross-disciplinary perspective. The article, accepted commentaries, and the author's response then appear simultaneously in BBS.

Commentary on BBS articles may be provided by any qualified professional in the behavioral and brain sciences, but much of it is drawn from a large body of BBS Associates who have become formally affiliated with the project.

Qualified professionals are eligible to become BBS Associates if they have (1) been nominated by a current BBS Associate, (2) refereed for BBS, or (3) had a commentary or article accepted for publication. A special subscription rate is available to Associates. Individuals interested in serving as BBS Associates are asked to write to the editor.

This publication was supported in part by NIH Grant LM 03539 from the National Library of Medicine.

*Modelled on the 'CA Comment' service of the journal *Current Anthropology*.

Copying This journal is registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (21 Congress St., Salem, MA 01970). Organizations in the U.S.A. who are also registered with the CCC may therefore copy material (beyond the limits permitted by sections 107 and 108 of U.S. Copyright Law) subject to payment to the CCC of the per-copy fee indicated in the code on the first page of the article. This consent does not extend to multiple copying for promotional or commercial purposes.

ISI Tear Sheet Service, 3501 Market Street, Philadelphia, PA 19104, is authorized to supply single copies of separate articles for private use only.

For all other use, permission should be sought from the Cambridge or New York offices of the Press.

Subscriptions *The Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (ISSN 0140-525X) is published quarterly in March, June, September and December. Four parts form a volume. The subscription price, which includes postage, of Volume 7 (1984) is US \$120.00 net in the U.S.A. and Canada (£66.00 in the U.K. and rest of the world) for institutions; US \$55.00 net (£33.00) for individuals; US \$32.00 net (£20.00) for BBS Associates; and US \$32.00 net for students (in the U.S.A. and Canada only) who provide proof of eligibility with order. Single parts cost US \$33.00 net (£19.00) plus postage. Institutional orders may be sent to a bookseller or, in the U.S.A. and Canada direct to: Cambridge University Press, 32 East 57 Street, New York, N.Y. 10022; in the U.K. and rest of the world to: Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 2RU, England. Individuals must order direct from the Press. Second class postage paid at New York, N.Y. and at additional mailing offices. Postmaster: send address changes in the U.S.A. and Canada to BBS, Cambridge University Press, 32 East 57 Street, New York, N.Y. 10022.

Advertising Inquiries about advertising should be sent to the Journals Promotion Department of the Cambridge or New York office of Cambridge University Press.

Contents Volume 7:1 March 1984

Weiner, R. D. Does electroconvulsive therapy cause brain damage? 1

Open Peer Commentary

Bidder, T. G. Some perspectives on electroconvulsive therapy	22
Bolwig, T. G. ECT: Wanted and unwanted effects	23
Breggin, P. R. Electroshock therapy and brain damage: The acute organic brain syndrome as treatment	24
Cherkin, A. Possible brain damage by electroconvulsive therapy: Memory impairment and cultural resistance	25
Dam, A. M. Brain damage from spontaneous but not from induced seizures in animals	26
Fink, M. ECT – verdict: Not guilty	26
Heath, R. G. An overdue comprehensive look at a maligned treatment: Electroconvulsive therapy	27
Kalinowsky, L. B. Problems in research on electroconvulsive therapy	28
Lerer, B. & Stanley M. ECT-induced memory impairment – a cholinergic mechanism?	29
Pinel, J. P. J. After forty-five years ECT is still controversial	30
Price, T. R. P. Modern ECT: Effective and safe	31
Sackeim, H. A. Not all seizures are created equal: The importance of ECT dose–response variables	32

Salzman, L. Electroconvulsive therapy, pharmacotherapy, and psychotherapy	33
Small, J. G. & Small, I. F. Current issues in ECT practice and research	33
Squire, L. R. Opinion and facts about ECT: Can science help?	34
Sugerman, A. A. ECT: A clinician's viewpoint	37
Swartz, C. M. The justification for electroconvulsive therapy	37
Taylor, J. R. ECT: The controversy continues	38
Templer, D. I. ECT and brain damage: How much risk is acceptable?	39
Weaver, L. A., Jr. ECT damage: Are there more pressing problems?	39
Zornetzer, S. F. ECT: Out of the shadows and into the light	41
Zubin, J. Loss of familiarity as an explanation of autobiographical memory loss	41

Author's Response

Weiner, R. D. ECT: Facts, affects, and ambiguities	42
----------------------------------------------------	----

Broadbent, D. E. The Maltese cross: A new simplistic model for memory 55

Open Peer Commentary

Callaway, E. Models of mind: Hidden plumbing	68
Carr, T. H. & Brown, T. L. The Maltese cross: Simplistic yes, new no	69
Cohen, G. Modular mind or unitary system: A duck–rabbit effect	71
Crowder, R. G. Broadbent's Maltese cross memory model: Wisdom, but not especially unconventional	72
Hirst, W. Practice and divided attention	72
Loftus, E. F., Loftus, G. R. & Hunt, E. B. Broadbent's Maltese cross memory model: Something old, something new, something borrowed, something missing	73
Mackworth, A. K. The homunculus as bureaucrat	74
Martin, M. Memory and mood	75
Morton, J. What kind of a framework?	75
Murray, D. J. The usefulness for memory theory of the word "store"	76

Rabbitt, P. Simplistic heuristics and Maltese acrostics	77
Roediger, H. L. The use of interference paradigms as a criterion for separating memory stores	78
Sayre, K. M. Information-flow diagrams as scientific models	79
Schneider, W. Practice, attention, and the processing system	80
Seamon, J. G. Pipelines, processing models, and the mind–body problem	81
Sternberg, S. Stage models of mental processing and the additive-factor method	82
Wasserman, G. S. How do representations get processed in real nerve cells?	85
Watkins, M. J. Models as toothbrushes	86

Author's Response

Broadbent, D. E. Modules in models of memory	86
----------------------------------------------	----

Maynard Smith, J. Game theory and the evolution of behaviour 95

Open Peer Commentary

Barlow, G. W. & Rowell, T. E. The contribution of game theory to animal behavior	101
Blanchard, D. C., Blanchard, R. J. & Flannelly, K. J. Cost-benefit analysis: An emotional calculus	103
Einhorn, H. J. Random strategies and "ran-dumb" behavior	104
Fararo, T. J. Evolutionary game theory and human social structures	104

Gilbert, M. Coordination problems and the evolution of behavior	106
Herrnstein, R. J. & Vaughan, W., Jr. Evolutionary and behavioral stability	107
Johnston, T. D. Development and the origin of behavioral strategies	108
Krebs, J. R. & Kacelnik, A. Optimal learning rules	109
Lea, S. E. G. & Dow, S. M. Optimization and flexibility	110

Logue, A. W. Is it possible to be optimal?	111	Staddon, J. E. R. It's all a game	116
Malone, J. C., Jr. Evolutionary game theory: Suddenly it's 1960! (or is it 1860?)	112	Thaler, R. H. Asymmetric games and the endowment effect	117
Mazur, J. E. Is matching behavior an evolutionary inevitability?	112	Williams, G. C. When does game theory model reality?	117
Rachlin, H. Learning rules and learning rules	113		
Rapoport, A. Game theory without rationality	114		
Selten, R. & Hammerstein, P. Gaps in Harley's argument on evolutionarily stable learning rules and in the logic of "tit for tat"	115	Author's Response	
		Maynard Smith, J. Game theory without rationality	117

**Lamb, M. E., Thompson, R. A., Gardner, W. P., Charnov, E. L.
& Estes, D.** Security of infantile attachment as assessed in the "strange
situation": Its study and biological interpretation **127**

Open Peer Commentary

Brown, R. T. Ever since Hippocrates . . .	147	Klopper, P. H. Caveats on the use of evolutionary concepts	156
Chess, S. What do we learn from the Strange Situation?	148	Kovach, J. K. & Kovach, M. E. Infantile attachment: The forest and the trees	157
Cicchetti, D. V. On a model for assessing the security of infantile attachment: Issues of observer reliability and validity	149	Masters, J. C. Reification and "stafification" in attachment theory and research	158
Denenberg, V. H. Stranger in a strange situation: Comments by a comparative psychologist	150	Mills, C. J. & Eiserer, L. A. Security of infantile attachment: The person-situation debate revisited	159
Feinman, S. Correlations in search of a theory: Interpreting the predictive validity of security of attachment	152	Petrovich, S. B. & Gewirtz, J. L. Learning in the context of evolutionary biology: In search of synthesis	160
Freedman, D. G. Asking the right questions	153	Rajecki, D. W. On inferring evolutionary adaptation	161
Ghiselin, M. T. How to think about the evolution of behavioral development	153	Salzen, E. A. Bonding behaviours, behavioural binds, and biological bases	162
Grossmann, K. E. & Grossmann, K. Discovery and proof in attachment research	154	Authors' Response	
Hay, D. F. The evolution of ethological attachment theory	155	Lamb, M. E., Gardner, W. P., Charnov, E. L., Thompson, R. A. & Estes, D. Studying the security of infant-adult attachment: A reprise	163