

their English identity. English common law conveyed certain rights and privileges on English subjects, and in the Pale discriminatory legislation against ‘the king’s Irish enemies’ was systematically enforced. There were differences (and there were walls) separating these two worlds. They were captured, too, in the pervading rhetoric of difference used in English governing circles. This insisted that to be English was to be free and civilised; that to fall short of accepted English standards, adopting instead Irish customs and culture, was to ‘degenerate’ (not ‘gaelicize’); and that Irish identity was synonymous with servitude and savagery. Tudor terminology may seem offensive to modern ears, but it underpinned the Pale’s status as an English frontier. As its new description — ‘the English Pale’ — implied, acculturation and the influx of Irish had not undermined the English identity of the king’s subjects there ‘whatever ... about modern aspirations to [Irish] unity’ (p. 10).

Ellis is unhappy that some historians are ‘almost fixated’ with the idea that some English settlers became assimilated with the Irish to varying degrees, but have ‘much less to say about the latter’s assimilation of English culture and identity’ (p. 9). Cultural exchange, he points out, was ‘an entirely normal feature of early modern frontiers ... but studies of Irish immigration and customs’ have focused on what has been misleadingly termed ‘gaelicisation’ while marginalising what one might no less misleadingly term ‘anglicisation’ (p. 171). I would make two observations on that score. First, the emphasis on ‘gaelicisation’ reflects the historical records: Anglophone writers regularly expressed their concerns about the Irish character of the people of the Pale, and the ‘systematic’ enforcement of ‘discriminatory legislation’ which Ellis refers to would hardly have been necessary if no problem was perceived to exist.

Second, the repeated use of the term ‘immigrants’ to characterise the indigenous Irish who moved into the Pale strikes a discordant note: it brings to mind the Afrikaners’ use of the term to characterise the indigenous Africans in South Africa. In fact, most of the people who lived in the Pale were Irish, just as most of the people under English rule in Wales were Welsh. The English who settled in Ireland from the late twelfth century had not exterminated the indigenous Irish population from the region that came to be called the Pale: there had been no genocide, though the indigenous population had suffered dispossession, degradation and discrimination at the hands of a colonial community which considered itself to be superior to the indigenous community.

In fact, this study of English colonialism in early Tudor Ireland is rich in implications for wider studies of English/British colonialism because it was the same colonialist mindset of supposed superiority and entitlement that was subsequently visited by the English on the indigenous peoples of North America, southern Asia, Africa and Oceania. In many ways Ireland’s experiences in the Tudor era pre-figured the experiences of other indigenous peoples who came under English/British control around the globe: maltreatment justified by the English conviction of their inherent superiority compared with the indigenous peoples whose lands and resources they acquired/stole, whose cultures they denigrated and set out to destroy, and whose lives they terminated with impunity if they stood in the way of English ambitions. The repeated use of the term ‘chief’ to denote Irish leaders — they are called ‘lords’ only once in the book — echoes the common use of the same term for the leaders of victims of English colonialism in North America and Africa. Ironically, following the re-definition of Englishness to include Protestantism in the reign of Elizabeth Tudor the ‘New English’ Protestants came to regard the ‘Old English’ Catholics in Ireland as being as Irish as the Irish themselves, and in the seventeenth century treated them accordingly.

doi:10.1017/ihs.2023.12

HENRY A. JEFFERIES

BRITISH AND IRISH RELIGIOUS ORDERS IN EUROPE, 1560–1800: CONVENTUALS, MENDICANTS AND MONASTICS IN MOTION. Edited by Cormac Begadon and James E. Kelly. Pp 276. Woodbridge: Boydell Press. 2022. £75.

There is burgeoning historiographical attention to the early modern Catholic experience. Noteworthy is the adoption of a three-kingdom approach in the case of the Tudor and

Stuart realms. This is reflected in the current collection of twelve essays: one deals with Scotland, three with Ireland, and the remaining eight with the English Catholic community. The focus is largely on the seventeenth century, with three contributions devoted to the eighteenth century, a period which hitherto has received less scholarly attention.

Regarding Catholic migration to the continent, considerable attention has been given to studying the various national colleges established from the later sixteenth century. However, with the exception of the Irish Franciscans, religious communities, especially for women, have until recently suffered neglect. In the volume under review, four essays treat of dimensions of convent life for Englishwomen (there were over twenty English convents). Jaime Goodrich explores the Stuart allegiance of English Benedictine convents in the long seventeenth century, showing how links were forged with the Stuarts under Queen Henrietta Maria, a relationship intensified under the Catholic James II and his wife Mary of Modena, especially when the Stuart court was established at Saint-Germain near Paris after 1690. The convents' Stuart identity was expressed in commemoration integrated into prayer life, in serving as centres of information for recent arrivals, and in facilitating convent entry of women from the extended Stuart family. In return the royal family offered financial support, but limited in light of their straitened circumstances.

Essays by Laurence Lux-Sterritt and Caroline Bowden show how the convents also actively reinforced English Catholic identity by closely following developments at home, both on the political scene and by sharing vicariously in the sufferings of their co-religionists, through maintaining correspondence with family members in England. These women were separated geographically from their homeland, but through ongoing links with kinfolk they saw themselves at the heart of the English recusant community, an identity intensified in their new overseas setting. Far from being cut off from family origins, religious communities depended for their survival on support networks based on kinship in England, in addition to forging new relationships in the host country. Drawing creatively on one convent's records which included accounts of various mystical experiences, Jessica McCandless explores the mystic and affective layers accruing to spaces within the convent premises; the essay contributes to the study of Catholic material culture.

The leadership cadre of Irish religious had lengthy exposure to continental Catholicism through years of study, and, in some cases, of teaching and administrative experience, before coming back to Ireland. Some, chiefly Franciscans and Dominicans, were chosen to become bishops on their return. For the first half of the seventeenth century, Tadhg Ó hAnnracháin explores the relationship between bishops and regulars in Ireland, less acrimonious than in England, due to bishops who themselves were religious, and because Jesuits were a small minority among Irish religious more generally. Diocesan clergy, and their colleges, predominated in the Irish ecclesiastical community in early modern Paris. To complement this focus, Liam Chambers provides an overview of the presence of Irish regular clergy in the city, generally as students at the university. John McCafferty explores Irish Franciscan efforts at reshaping their order's history for the global Catholicism which was emerging from the sixteenth century.

A further strand is the contribution of English and Scottish Benedictine monasteries on the Continent. English monks established houses at Douai, Paris and in Lorraine. A fundamental tension emerged between the stability characteristic of the monastic vocation and the group's commitment to serving pastorally the scattered Catholic laity in England. James Kelly uses the writings of Augustine Baker O.S.B. to explore his English confreres' place within the wider early modern Benedictine movement — attention to the continental context is a welcome feature of the essay collection as a whole. Geoffrey Scott in his essay makes the case that Benedictine commitment to creating and developing gardens in their continental monasteries contributed to the evolution of horticulture in England, largely through the influence of their schools. In eighteenth-century intellectual history, historian Ulrich Lehner has drawn attention to the Catholic Enlightenment, and in this collection Thomas McNally explores the scientific and educational contribution of the Scottish Benedictines in the German-speaking lands (through their three monasteries).

For the decades prior to the collapse of the monastic system on the continent in the revolutionary 1790s, Cormac Begadon presents a positive assessment of the English and Scottish

monks' efforts to modernise their schools by adapting to new state-imposed systems. As Shaun Blanchard relates in his essay, a more combative approach to the emerging world at the end of the eighteenth century was that of Charles Walmsley, a Benedictine who served as one of the four vicars apostolic in England. Arising from his interest in the New Testament Book of Revelation, he composed a broad historical survey, suffused with a negative view of Enlightenment and Protestantism. The book became widely popular (echoes are found in the Irish agrarian disturbances of the 1820s); the author had experienced the fury of a Protestant mob who wrecked his house during the anti-Catholic Gordon riots of 1780.

Drawing comprehensively on specialised archival research, these essays help illuminate the world of British and Irish men and women who lived in religious communities on the continent down to the collapse of the *ancien régime* in the 1790s. Given the geographical spread of the themes covered, the absence of maps is regrettable. By noting ongoing links with the Catholic community in England, and engagement with broader intellectual and cultural trends in the host countries, together with a focus on communities of women, the collection expands our understanding of the Catholic presence from England, Scotland and Ireland on the continent in the early modern era.

doi:10.1017/ihs.2023.13

BRIAN MAC CUARTA  
*Campion Hall, University of Oxford*

THE DEVIL FROM OVER THE SEA: REMEMBERING AND FORGETTING OLIVER CROMWELL IN IRELAND. By Sarah Covington. Pp x, 409. Oxford: Oxford University Press. £25.

Despite the short period he spent in a relatively small part of the island, Oliver Cromwell has made a distinct impact on Irish history and society. His time in Ireland saw two notorious urban massacres, in excess of twenty other towns surrendering before bombardment could begin, and one significant blow to the reputation of Cromwell as a commander at Clonmel. The period named after him saw large-scale expropriation of estates, and massive loss of life through conventional violence, famine (frequently caused by intentional scorched-earth tactics), and disease. Whilst interest in Cromwell and the mid-seventeenth century generally has waxed and waned across generations of historians, Irish collective and cultural memories have held him in sharp focus for a considerable length of time.

Sarah Covington's excellent work is a study of how this man's time in Ireland was remembered and, as we are sometimes inclined to fail to consider, how he was occasionally forgotten. It is, thus, a cultural, historiographical and folkloric history of the centuries that followed the lord general's time in Ireland. As she is at pains to point out, this is not an attempt to identify and 'explode the 'myths' ... Such an endeavor would result in little more than a patronizing parlor-game exercise.' For although such a book might well make a considerable volume, it would not be a particularly useful one. In particular, Covington makes a point of approaching her topic in a manner similar to that of Guy Beiner's pioneering work on 1798. In undertaking this study, she has been eminently successful.

The scene is set with 'the aftermath', considering the more immediate rendering of Cromwell's reputation by many contemporaries and near contemporaries from Broghill in his plays, through an *Dúna*, *Ó Rathaille* and *Ó Bruadair* in poetry, to Clarendon and Ludlow in memoirs. What follows then are six chapters dealing with Cromwell and the development of his reputation in Ireland under a number of themes. The first of these is that of religion. Whilst we might immediately think of his attitude and actions toward the Catholics of Ireland, he also had a more than fraught relationship with the Episcopalians, Presbyterians and other dissenters that are discussed in fascinating detail.

The chapter about the political Cromwell makes for a particularly interesting read. Not only does it deal with somewhat obvious remembrances of Cromwell and his negative reputation at monster meetings in the 1840s and with increasing venom by the Young Irelanders: perhaps more interesting are the intentional efforts by some to forget. Many of the United Irishmen, for example, made an intentional effort to avoid references to him for fear that it