

March 1971

PMILA

*Publications of the
Modern Language Association of America*

Volume 86

Number 2

PUBLISHED SIX TIMES A YEAR BY THE ASSOCIATION

The Modern Language Association of America

ORGANIZED 1883

INCORPORATED 1900

OFFICERS FOR THE YEAR 1971

President: LOUIS KAMPF, *Massachusetts Institute of Technology*
First Vice President: STUART ATKINS, *University of California, Santa Barbara*
Second Vice President: FLORENCE HOWE, *Goucher College*
Executive Secretary: JOHN HURT FISHER, *New York University*
Treasurer and Deputy Executive Secretary: KENNETH W. MILDENBERGER, *Modern Language Association*

EXECUTIVE COUNCIL

For the term ending 31 December 1971

O. B. HARDISON, *Folger Shakespeare Library*
FRANK G. RYDER, *Indiana Univ.*
W. FREEMAN TWADDELL, *Brown Univ.*

For the term ending 31 December 1973

J. HILLIS MILLER, *Johns Hopkins Univ.*
WALTER B. RIDEOUT, *Univ. of Wisconsin*
PAUL SCHACH, *Univ. of Nebraska*

For the term ending 31 December 1972

RENÉ GIRARD, *State Univ. of New York, Buffalo*
JEAN HAGSTRUM, *Northwestern Univ.*
FRANCIS LEE UTLEY, *Ohio State Univ.*

For the term ending 31 December 1974

CLAUDIO GUILLÉN, *Univ. of California, San Diego*
MARGARET MCKENZIE, *Vassar Coll.*
ROBERTA SALPER, *San Diego State Coll.*

TRUSTEES OF INVESTED FUNDS

GORDON N. RAY, *Guggenheim Foundation,*
Managing Trustee

C. WALLER BARRETT, *Charlottesville, Va.*
FREDERICK BURKHARDT, *American Council of Learned Societies*

PMLA is issued six times a year, in January, March, May, September, October, and November, by the Modern Language Association of America, 62 Fifth Avenue, New York, New York 10011. Annual dues for membership in the Association, which includes subscription to *PMLA*, are \$25 except for the following special categories: (a) student membership at \$7, open for a maximum of four years to those who are engaged primarily in a course of study leading to a degree and who do not hold full-time teaching appointments; (b) joint husband-and-wife membership at \$35 with only one subscription to *PMLA*; (c) foreign membership at \$18, open to resident citizens of countries other than the United States and Canada.

The subscription price of *PMLA* for libraries and other institutions is \$20. Agents deduct \$2 as their fee. A subscription including a bound volume at the end of the year is \$35, domestic and foreign. Single copies of the January, March, May, October, and November Program issues may be obtained for \$4 each; the September Directory for \$5.

Issues for the current year are available from the MLA Materials Center. Claims for undelivered issues will be honored if they are received within one year of the publication date; thereafter the single issue price will be charged.

For information about the availability of back issues, inquire of Kraus Reprint Co., 16 East 46th St., New York 10017. Early and current volumes may be obtained on microfilm from University Microfilms, Ann Arbor, Mich. 48106. Purchase of current volumes on film is restricted to subscribers of the journal.

OFFICE OF PUBLICATION AND EDITORIAL OFFICES

62 Fifth Avenue, New York, N. Y. 10011 Tel.: 212 691-3200

All communications, including notices of changes of address, should be sent to the Membership Office of the Association at 62 Fifth Avenue, New York 10011. If a change of address also involves a change of institutional affiliation, the Membership Office should be informed of this fact at the same time.

Second-class postage paid at New York, N. Y., and at additional mailing office.
Copyright © 1971 by The Modern Language Association of America.
Library of Congress Catalog Card Number 12-32040.

PRINTED IN THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA BY THE GEORGE BANTA COMPANY, INC., MENASHA, WISCONSIN

Contents · March

The Medieval Theater of the Absurd. ALAN E. KNIGHT . . . 183

Abstract. The *sottie* is a popular dramatic genre of the late Middle Ages which seems to have developed from the comic debates that players often used to gather an audience. In its developed form it resembles the contemporary Theater of the Absurd. The most meaningful approach to a comparison of the two theaters is by way of the thought embodied in the plays. They are both to a certain extent didactic, though they represent different outlooks and value systems. Both theaters utilize clowns and clowning techniques, and both are closely linked to the dream. The two historical periods concerned are presented in the plays as times when cultural ideals have become illusions out of tune with reality, and the accompanying alienation is expressed in powerful images of waiting. One of the most suggestive areas of resemblance is language, which has been cut from its rational moorings. The language of the *sottie* still has a creative vigor, while that of the Theater of the Absurd is moribund. Both, however, are languages of protest. Each theater creates a new norm against which to judge its society, thereby exposing those who would mask their venality with pretense. (AEK)

English *very*, French *très*, and Spanish *muy*: A Structural Comparison and Its Significance for Bilingual Lexicography. NORMAN P. SACKS . . . 190

Abstract. The traditional treatment of the adverb has posed problems of classification in the three languages under consideration. English *very* has traditionally been classified as an adverb, and the efforts of structural linguists to reclassify it as an intensifier may be extended to French *très* and Spanish *muy* as well. However, the three intensifiers do not pattern in the same way, for *very* patterns with adjectives and adverbs, but not with verbs or nouns; *très* and *muy* pattern with adjectives, adverbs, nouns, and with the past participle of verbs. The patterning of *très* and *muy* with nouns raises the question of the basis for differentiating adjectives from nouns. While the distinction between these two form classes in English is sometimes arbitrary, the line separating them is even less clear-cut in French and Spanish, languages in which nominalization is more widespread than in English. The unsatisfactory treatment of the three intensifiers in bilingual dictionaries of the French-English and Spanish-English type is due to the failure of lexicographers to link illustrative phrases and sentences to relevant structural features of the languages concerned, a practice all too common in dictionaries not compiled in accordance with scientific principles of lexicography. (NPS)

Fortune in Marston's *The Malcontent*. GEORGE L. GECKLE . . . 202

Abstract. No previous study of John Marston's *The Malcontent* (1602–03) has focused upon the play's central structural and thematic symbol, the traditional Wheel of Fortune. Structurally, *The Malcontent* uses a rising and falling pattern that reflects the medieval "formula of four." Both Pietro and Mendoza seem to be *Regno* at different points in the action, but fall from Fortune's Wheel and become *Regnavi*. The deposed Duke Altfronto (alias Malevole) is at first *Sum sine Regno*, but soon becomes *Regnabo*, and finally *Regno* by Act v. *The Malcontent* concludes with this "happy reversal" because it is a tragicomedy according to the definition in Guarini's *Il compendio della poesia tragicomica* (1601). The play's basic themes and main characters also support a tragicomic vision, as Mendoza and Malevole demonstrate. Mendoza, like his master Machiavelli, believes in the proverb *Audaces fortuna juvat*. Malevole triumphs because he combats Fortune not with fortitude but with prudent Stoic resignation and Christian spiritual devotion. The inevitability of "heaven's impos'd conditions" leads to the restoration of order and either the spiritual regeneration of the sinners or their rejection from the new society. (GLG)

Text and Possible Occasion for Swift's "Day of Judgement." MAURICE JOHNSON . . . 210

Abstract. No modern commentary on this changelessly relevant poem identifies its specific occasion as that of a new attempt by dissenters in 1732 and 1733 to repeal the Sacra-

mental Test Act in Ireland. Such an occasion is, however, suggested or explicitly stated by eighteenth-century transcribers of the poem, including William Collins, William Shenstone, Ralph Griffiths, and the anonymous author of *The Friends* (1773), a rare novel in which "The Day of Judgement" first appeared in print. Substantive variants in the early transcriptions, often intensifying the criticism of dissenters, are significant in understanding how the poem was read in the eighteenth century. Jonathan Swift's authorship is corroborated by similarities in other works by him on the same subject in 1732–33, a somewhat later date than that usually assigned for the poem's composition. (MJ)

Two Letters from Giuseppe Baretti to Samuel Johnson. ALAN T. MCKENZIE 218

Abstract. An annotated transcription, with commentary, of the texts of two letters (21 July 1762 and 3 October 1765) in Baretti's recently discovered commonplace book. The letters offer autobiographical insight into Baretti's various disappointments and persecutions on the continent. The first one provides the original to which Johnson's letter of 21 December 1762 (Chapman, No. 147), one of his best known, is the reply. (ATM)

Carlyle, Arnold, and Literary Justice. D. R. M. WILKINSON 225

Abstract. The tendency in modern literary specialization for all authors to be boosted, sometimes at the expense of the truly great, is a serious threat to literary standards already undermined by scholarly mass production. One must therefore protest when a Carlyle is raised above a Matthew Arnold by responsible people, as he seems to have been raised by David J. DeLaura in "Arnold and Carlyle" (*PMLA*, 79, 1964, 104–29). Carlyle's crude, propagandist message is not the same as a cool scholarly abstract of his ideas. The manner colors all the matter. Carlyle's main weaknesses are that he exaggerates, that he oversimplifies life, is aggressive, egotistical, that he blurs religion (epitomizing a decay in faith), uses the rhetorical tricks of the advertiser, and in imposing upon his readers (whom he scorns and bullies) is insincere. To complain that Arnold accepted Carlyle's influence and yet rejected the man and the manner is to complain about what had to be. Scholars should beware of mistaking our common cultural inheritance for specific borrowing. No doubt Arnold partly concealed his debt, and was ungenerous, but his not being a saint does not canonize Carlyle. Literary justice requires the placing of writers in true critical and historical perspective. (DRMW)

Gaslight and Magic Lamp in *Sister Carrie*. HUGH WITEMEYER 236

Abstract. Dreiser drew heavily upon his youthful experience of the theater in creating his first novel. His characters are as foolishly enamored of the false glamor and factitious realities of the stage as he himself had once been. By the time he wrote *Sister Carrie*, however, he had achieved a mature perspective and control which allowed him to use the theater for his own artistic purposes. He characterizes his heroine's fantasy life by showing how she constantly associates the stage (gaslight) with Aladdin's treasure cave (magic lamp). At the same time he emphasizes the inadequacy of these fantasies by creating a network of ironic parallels between the plays his characters attend or act in, and their actual situations in his story. The most elaborate of these ironies involves Augustin Daly's *Under the Gaslight*, the play-within-the-play which gives Carrie her first taste of acting. The reactions of Dreiser's three principal characters to Daly's play offer a suggestive paradigm of their general psychology throughout the novel—a sadly immature, almost infantile, psychology. (HHW)

La Cousine Bette and Allegorical Realism. FREDRIC JAMESON 241

Abstract. *La Cousine Bette* was written at a time when the classification scheme of *La Comédie humaine* no longer seemed adequate for its raw materials and was marked by a prodigious expansion in the length of Balzac's customary exposition. The ending of that exposition (desire gratified, desire frustrated) hints at the thematic unity of the work. Thus Bette embodies frustration, negativity, and ultimately the death wish itself: this drive is then parceled out among the other destructive women characters as well. Hulot in contrast expresses the force of Eros. Not only are both characters allegorical: they are shown in the process of *becoming* allegorical, and the deeper subject of the book is the very history

of obsession itself. Balzac is able to record this instinctual system because his work is pre-individualistic: at the same time, the very symmetry of the instincts requires a third character, Madame Hulot, to function as consciousness or ego, and it is from this third pole that Balzac's sentimentalism (and his political ideology) derive, as necessary and inherent structural distortions. (FJ)

“The Personal System”—Samuel Beckett’s *Watt*. JOHN J. MOOD. 255

Abstract. Beckett’s novel *Watt* portrays the titular protagonist in the midst of a world which has crumbled. Watt attempts to solace and comfort himself by constructing logically complete and correct mental systems. These systems are the famous lists, series, combinations, and permutations which constitute a third of the novel. Little attention has been paid to this major feature of *Watt*. A close examination, however, uncovers enough unobtrusive but real flaws (omissions, incorrect items) in these series and combinations to support the conclusion that these mistakes are deliberate. Thus, Watt’s attempts at an internal personal system, and the personal systems themselves, are as unreliable as the external world. (JJM)

Notes, Documents, and Critical Comment: 1. A Fact Which Should Have Been Included in “Whitman’s Earliest Known Notebook: A Clarification” by John C. Broderick. ESTHER SHEPHARD 266

Abstract. That Whitman materials were by official directive for a time “sequestered from public use” ought to have been included in the part of Broderick’s note (*PMLA*, 84, 1969, 1657) which deals with the availability of the Harned Collection for public consultation. (ES)

2. “Gothic versus Romantic”: A Rejoinder. ROBERT L. PLATZNER AND ROBERT D. HUME. 266

Forum 275

Forthcoming Meetings and Conferences of General Interest 283

Professional Notes and Comment 284

London Stage Index and Information Bank. GEO. WINCHESTER STONE, JR. 284

PMLA

PUBLICATIONS OF THE MODERN LANGUAGE ASSOCIATION OF AMERICA

Published Six Times a Year

Indices: Vols. 1–50, 1935; 51–60, 1945; 51–79, 1964

EDITORIAL COMMITTEE

DAVID M. BEVINGTON, 1974
University of Chicago

EDWARD E. BOSTETTER, 1971
University of Washington

A. DWIGHT CULLER, 1974
Yale University

HUGH M. DAVIDSON, 1973
Ohio State University

E. TALBOT DONALDSON, 1971
Yale University

RICHARD ELLMANN, 1973
Oxford University

VICTOR ERLICH, 1974
Yale University

DONALD J. GREENE, 1973
University of Southern California

CECIL Y. LANG, 1973
University of Virginia

JAMES E. MILLER, JR., 1973
University of Chicago

J. MITCHELL MORSE, 1974
Temple University

WILLIAM G. MOULTON, 1975
Princeton University

STEPHEN G. NICHOLS, JR., 1974
Dartmouth College

GEORGE NORDMEYER, 1972
Hunter College

PAUL R. OLSON, 1974
Johns Hopkins University

HENRY H. H. REMAK, 1971
Indiana University

HALLETT D. SMITH, 1971
*California Institute of Technology
and Huntington Library*

NATHALIA WRIGHT, 1975
University of Tennessee

Editor: JOHN HURT FISHER

Editorial Assistant: JUDY GOULDING

Managing Editor: WILLIAM PELL

Advertising Coordinator: JUDITH FELDMAN

A STATEMENT OF EDITORIAL POLICY

PMLA endeavors to present distinguished contemporary scholarship and criticism in all fields of the modern languages and literatures. The distribution of papers should reflect the work actually being done from year to year, regardless of periods or languages. Members who feel their interests neglected by this policy are urged to write and to encourage others to write publishable articles.

PMLA welcomes either new or traditional approaches by either young or established scholars. It urges authors to bear in mind that their audience is the entire membership of the Association and to strive to communicate the broader implications as well as the precise substance of their research. Articles should be written in a clear, concise, and attractive style, with documentation held to a minimum. *PMLA* does not encourage notes or long articles; it does not review books.

Any member of the Association may submit papers to *PMLA*. Each paper submitted will be sent to at least one consultant reader and one member of the Editorial Committee. An abstract in English on the standard form must accompany every article submitted. Abstract forms and guidelines may be obtained from the Editor.

Manuscripts, prepared in conformity with the second edition of the *MLA Style Sheet*, should be addressed to the Editor of *PMLA*, 62 Fifth Avenue, New York, N. Y. 10011. Copies are not needed, but should be made and retained by the author. Pamphlets *On the Publication of Research* and on *The Publication of Academic Writing* may be purchased from the MLA Materials Center.