

THE  
HISTORICAL  
JOURNAL



VOLUME 39, 4 DECEMBER 1996

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

EDITORS

J. S. MORRILL, Ph.D., F.B.A.

J. STEINBERG, Ph.D.

EDITORIAL COMMITTEE

*Cambridge members*

PROFESSOR C. M. ANDREW, Ph.D.

PROFESSOR C. A. BAYLY, Ph.D., F.B.A.

PROFESSOR D. E. D. BEALES, Litt.D., F.B.A.

PROFESSOR T. C. W. BLANNING, Ph.D., F.B.A.

PROFESSOR W. O. CHADWICK, O.M., K.B.E., D.D., F.B.A.

PROFESSOR P. F. CLARKE, Litt.D., F.B.A.

PROFESSOR PATRICK COLLINSON, M.A., F.B.A.

V. A. C. GATRELL, Ph.D.

M. A. GOLDIE, Ph.D.

A. J. B. HILTON, Ph.D.

PROFESSOR SIR HARRY HINSLEY, M.A., F.B.A.

PROFESSOR Q. R. D. SKINNER, M.A., F.B.A.

*American member*

PROFESSOR GEOFFREY PARKER (Yale University), M.A., Litt.D., F.B.A.

THE HISTORICAL JOURNAL (ISSN 0018-246x) is published quarterly in March, June, September and December. Four parts form a volume. The subscription price (excluding VAT) of volume 39, 1996 (which includes postage) is £102.00 (US\$198.00 in the USA, Canada and Mexico) for institutions, £55.00 (US\$86.00 in the USA, Canada and Mexico) for individuals ordering direct from the Press and certifying that the journal is for their personal use. Single parts cost £27.00 net (US\$50.00 in the USA, Canada and Mexico) plus postage.

Orders, which must be accompanied by payment, may be sent to a bookseller or to the publisher: Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 2RU or, in the USA, Canada and Mexico, Cambridge University Press, The Journals Department, 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211. EU subscribers (outside the UK) who are not registered for VAT should add VAT at their country's rate. VAT registered subscribers should provide their VAT registration number. Japanese prices for institutions (including ASP delivery) are available from Kinokuniya Company Ltd, P.O. Box 55, Chitose, Tokyo 156, Japan.

Copies of the journal for subscribers in the USA, Canada and Mexico are sent by air to New York to arrive with minimum delay. Periodicals postage paid at New York, NY and at additional mailing offices. POSTMASTER: send address changes in USA, Canada and Mexico to *The Historical Journal*, Cambridge University Press, 110 Midland Avenue, Port Chester, New York, NY 10573-4930.

Articles appearing in this journal are covered in major abstracting and indexing services including *America: History and Life*, *British Humanities Index*, *Current Contents*, *Historical Abstracts*, *Humanities Abstracts*, *Humanities Index*.

COPYING

This journal is registered with the Copying Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923. Organizations in the USA who are also registered with C.C.C. may therefore copy material (beyond the limits permitted by sections 107 and 108 of US copyright law) subject to payment to C.C.C. of the per-copy fee of \$7.50. This consent does not extend to multiple copying for promotional or commercial purposes. Code 0018-246x/96 \$7.50 + \$0.10. ISI Tear Sheet Service, 3501 Market Street, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19104, USA, is authorized to supply single copies of separate articles for private use only. Organizations authorized by the Copyright Licensing Agency may also copy material subject to the usual conditions. *For all other use*, permission should be sought from Cambridge or the American Branch of Cambridge University Press.

Information on *The Historical Journal* and all other Cambridge journals is available on <http://www.cup.cam.ac.uk/> and in North America on <http://www.cup.org/>.

# THE HISTORICAL JOURNAL

VOLUME 39, 4 DECEMBER 1996

## CONTENTS

### ARTICLES

- Richard Rex* The crisis of obedience: God's word and Henry's reformation . . . . . 863
- Robert Barrington* Two houses both alike in dignity: Reginald Pole and Edmund Harvell . . . . . 895
- Craig Muldrew* The culture of reconciliation: community and the settlement of economic disputes in early modern England. . . . . 915
- Michael Duffy* William Pitt and the origins of the Loyalist Association Movement of 1792 . . . . . 943
- Philip Harling* The Duke of York affair (1809) and the complexities of wartime patriotism . . . . . 963
- Christopher Clark* Confessional policy and the limits of state action: Frederick William III and the Prussian Church Union 1817–1840 . . . . . 985
- Frank Trentmann* The transformation of fiscal reform: reciprocity, modernization and the fiscal debate within the business community in early twentieth-century Britain. . . . . 1005
- Martin Thomas* Imperial backwater or strategic outpost? The British takeover of Vichy Madagascar, 1942 . . . . . 1049

### COMMUNICATION

- Patricia Springborg* Hobbes and Cluverius . . . . . 1075

### HISTORIOGRAPHICAL REVIEW

- Mark Francis* Who still has 'sweetness and light' in studies of Victorian culture and politics? . . . . . 1079

### REVIEW ARTICLES

- David Buisseret* State and nobility in early modern France . . . . . 1097
- Clarissa Campbell Orr* Psycho-biography, autobiography, intellectual archaeology: approaches to French liberalism . . . . . 1101
- Timothy J. Lockley* The changing South? From slavery to sunbelt . . . . . 1109
- Robert Tombs* Peasants, Frenchmen and cultural historians . . . . . 1117
- Edward M. Farmer* Backwards and forwards: a review of five recent works on Mexico . . . . . 1127

CONTENTS

OTHER REVIEWS

*Brendan Simms*

Johannes Hürter, *Wilhelm Groener. Reichswehrminister am Ende der Weimarer Republik (1928–1932)* . . . . . 1137

*Hugo Miller*

Philip Zelikow and Condolezza Rice, *Germany unified and Europe transformed* . . . . . 1138

Published by

The Press Syndicate of the University of Cambridge  
The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge, CB2 2RU, United Kingdom  
40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA  
10 Stamford Road, Oakleigh, Melbourne 3166, Australia

© Cambridge University Press, 1996