

this must be added) having that understanding of the writer's language, symbols, etc., we shall have, for the most part, and in the first place, better equipment for the grasp of the literal (or literary) sense of Scripture. The typical, spiritual, mystical, 'real' (whatever we call it) sense is of another order. However, this is not the place for a treatise on the senses of Scripture; and there is no need for it, as the basic principles are succinctly and clearly set out by Fr Sebastian Bullough in his article on 'The Spiritual Sense of Scripture' (pp. 343-353).

The word 'spiritual' is the villain in all discussions of this sort. It may mean (i) spiritually nourishing. This is true of Scripture whenever read or interpreted in *any* legitimate sense. (ii) It may be used as a synonym for 'typical' or 'mystical' (the sense conveyed by the *res* in St Thomas's treatment).

ROLAND POTTER, O.P.



STUDIES IN THE LITURGY

SEBASTIAN BULLOUGH, O.P.

HERE ARE four books,¹ published last year, all giving evidence of the considerable wave of deep study and interest in the history of the liturgy, which is characteristic of the present time. After the first pioneers like Abbot Guéranger and Dr Daniel Rock, we find modern studies taking a definite form about sixty years ago with the publication of Mgr Louis Duchesne's *Origines du Culte Chrétien*, first published in English under the title *Christian Worship* in 1903. This book is a landmark of its period. About the same time there was Edmund Bishop's *The Genius of the Roman Rite* (1902), followed by the work of Dom Cabrol, Dom Leclercq (the

¹ THE DEVELOPMENT OF CHRISTIAN WORSHIP. An Outline of Liturgical History. By Dom Benedict Steuart. (Longmans; 30s.)

L'ORDINAIRE DE LA MESSE. Texte critique, traduction et études. By Dom Bernard Botte, o.s.b., and Christine Mohrmann. (Cerf, Blackfriars.)

LE SACRIFICE DE LOUANGE. By Dom Jean Juglar, o.s.b. (Cerf, Blackfriars.)

HOLY MASS. Notes on the Liturgy. By Dom Eugene Vandeur. 5th and Revised Edition. (Burns Oates; 15s.)

big liturgical *Dictionnaire*) and Adrian Fortescue, until the discovery and publication by Dom Hugh Conolly in 1916 of the liturgical text of Hippolytus, which pushed back the concrete evidence to an earlier age than the great Sacramentaries. The large work of Dom Ildephonsus Schuster, begun in 1919, shows the subsequent development of studies, together with the beginning of the work of Dr Pius Parsch, the Augustinian. By 1930 Archdale King's *Notes on the Catholic Liturgies* became a standard work, making readily available the principal conclusions. It is only a few years since Archdale King developed and brought up to date his studies in his two volumes on the *Rites of Eastern and of Western Christendom*. During this time Dom Odo Casel, who died in 1952, was beginning his study of liturgical symbolism, with his *Mysteriengedächtnis der Messliturgie* in 1926. After the interruption of so much publication by the second world war, we find the two most complete works in the volumes of the Austrian Jesuit Andreas Jungmann, *Missarum Solemnia, eine genetische Erklärung der Römischen Messe* of 1948, and (especially for the earlier period of development) *The Shape of the Liturgy* by the Anglican monk Dom Gregory Dix in 1945.

It is rather important, when noticing books on the history of liturgy, to understand their place in modern studies. The important pamphlet (63 pages) by the German scholar Theodor Klauser, originally published in Germany in 1944, and in English as *The Western Liturgy and its History* is devoted precisely to the observation of developments since the time of Duchesne. New evidence is all the time coming to light, new interpretations of it are being tried, accepted or superseded.

Hence the importance of Dom Benedict Stuart's *Development of Christian Worship*, written after both Jungmann's 'genetic history' and Dix's study. He calls the book a 'text-book', and his object is simply to present and discuss the available evidence and offer a balanced interpretation. He does so admirably and most readably, and throughout with a delicate humility and deference towards the 'authors', perhaps especially noticeable towards Dix. Lest anyone should be misled by the title, it should be explained that the 'development' is studied up to the end of the period of the Sacramentaries, i.e. the eighth century and no further, since by that time all the older elements of the liturgy as we now know it had emerged. Medieval and subsequent modifications and accretions are not investigated. Since, however, it is with regard to the earlier (and in particular the earliest) period that recent studies have made the most notable advances, it is to cover this department of research that a book like this was especially needed. It is very attractively produced and well indexed, though the bibliography is awkwardly arranged by titles instead of authors and gives no dates of publication, which would be useful to the ordinary student in this branch of learning.

Dom Botte's *Ordinaire de la Messe* is a more specialized study. The full text of the Roman Mass, as it stands now (i.e., Pius V's Missal of 1570) is given, with the variants of the pre-Pian *editio princeps* of 1474 and the Curial Missal according to a MS of the thirteenth century and the edition of 1502. In other words, it is a study of the 'local' Roman Rite after it had achieved a fixed form, but before it became universal. Where there is evidence of antiquity traceable to Sacramentaries (sixth-eighth centuries), this is also noted. The text is printed (with translation opposite) in large type, with an apparatus criticus for variants below, and occasional notes. There are several valuable excursus on difficult formulae, including a history of the understanding of the words *Ite, missa est*, where the view that *missa* originally meant 'dismissal' is strongly argued. The book is handsomely produced.

Dom Juglar's title, *Sacrifice de Louange*, is equated with the word *Eucharist*, in the sense of a Sacrifice. The ancient formulae themselves, and the reflections of them in the writings of the Fathers as far as Augustine, particularly as regards the sacrificial aspect, occupies the first part of the book, while the second part goes through the text of the Mass, reviewing the same material as it were from the other end, finding the old formulae and teaching of Christian antiquity in the present-day text. Thus, when speaking of the preparatory prayers, it is noted that they are later, private prayers of the priest, and not public prayers, whence the author commends the (rare enough) practice of *not* reciting them chorally at a dialogue Mass (p. 165 n.).

Dom Vandeur's book belongs originally to an earlier period. It first appeared in 1911 as *The Holy Mass Popularly Explained*, but the French edition was extensively revised at Maredsous in 1946, and this new English edition is based on that. The book has long been a well-tryed favourite and provides a wealth of historical fact and detail: the whole text of the Mass, with the accompanying actions, is studied in order as it now stands, and simple popular historical explanations are provided, interspersed with occasional remarks on the deeper significance of the words. Intricate historical questions are not pursued, though matters such as the *fermentum* are not omitted. The introduction is an appeal for a deeper understanding of the Mass and a conscious participation in its mysteries, and this was indeed pioneer work in 1911, but we cannot say that such preaching is no longer needed, even though it has become so familiar. The lay-out, the printing (Irish), and the paper are a little inelegant, and the translation is sometimes clumsy or unctuous, but these do not prevent the book from being a mine of information or impede our gratitude to the publishers for making it available to us in its revised form.