

THE BULLETIN OF SYMBOLIC LOGIC

Edited by

Frank Wagner, *Managing Editor*

Laurent Bienvenu

Deirdre Haskell

Patricia Blanchette

Menachem Kojman

Andrea Cantini

Leonid Libkin

Thierry Coquand

Reviews Editors

Ernest Schimmerling, *Managing Editor for Reviews*

Mark Colyvan

Bernard Linsky

Samuel Coskey

Colin McLarty

Anuj Dawar

Rahim Moosa

Michael Fourman

Henry Towsner

Steffen Lempp

Kai Wehmeier

VOLUME 22 • NUMBER 3 • SEPTEMBER 2016 • ISSN 1079-8986

Copyright © 2016 by the Association for Symbolic Logic. All rights reserved.
Reproduction by photostat, photo-print, microfilm, or like process by permission only.



PUBLISHED BY CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS FOR
AND ON BEHALF OF THE ASSOCIATION OF SYMBOLIC LOGIC.

The BULLETIN, the JOURNAL and the REVIEW OF SYMBOLIC LOGIC are the official organs of the Association for Symbolic Logic, an international organization for furthering research in logic and the exchange of ideas among mathematicians, computer scientists, linguists, and others interested in this field. The BULLETIN encourages submissions of *Articles* and *Communications* in all areas of logic, including mathematical or philosophical logic, logic in computer science or linguistics, the history or philosophy of logic, and applications of logic to other fields. The BULLETIN also publishes reviews of publications in logic.

Editors

Frank Wagner (Managing Editor), Institut Camille Jordan, UMR 5208, Bâtiment Braconnier, Université Lyon 1, 21, avenue Claude Bernard, 69622 Villeurbanne Cedex, France

wagner@math.univ-lyon1.fr

Laurent Bienvenu, LIAFA, Université Paris Diderot - Paris 7 - Case 7014, 75205 Paris Cedex 13, France

laurent.bienvenu@computability.fr

Patricia Blanchette, Department of Philosophy, University of Notre Dame, 100 Malloy Hall, Notre Dame, IN 46556, USA

blanchette.1@nd.edu

Andrea Cantini, Department of Philosophy Università degli Studi di Firenze, Via Bolognese 52, I-50139 Firenze, Italy

cantini@unifi.it

Thierry Coquand, University of Gothenburg, Department of Computer Science and Engineering, SE-4196 Gothenburg, Sweden

Thierry.Coquand@gu.se

Deirdre Haskell, Department of Mathematics and Statistics, McMaster University, 1280 Main St. W, Hamilton ON L8S 4K1, Canada

haskell@math.mcmaster.ca

Menachem Kojman, Department of Mathematics, Ben-Gurion University of the Negev, Beer-Sheva, Israel 84105

kojman@math.bgu.ac.il

Leonid Libkin, Laboratory for Foundations of Computer Science, University of Edinburgh, Informatics Forum, IF 5.33, Crichton Street, Edinburgh, EH8 9AB, UK

libkin@inf.ed.ac.uk

Reviews editors

Ernest Schimmerling (Managing Editor), Department of Mathematical Sciences, Carnegie Mellon University, Pittsburgh, PA 15213, USA, eschimme@andrew.cmu.edu

Mark Colyvan mcolyvan@usyd.edu, Samuel Coskey scoskey@boisestate.edu,

Anuj Dawar Anuj.Dawar@cl.cam.ac.uk, Michael Fourman Michael.Fourman@ed.ac.uk,

Steffen Lempert lemp@math.wisc.edu, Bernard Linsky bernard.linsky@ualberta.ca,

Colin McLarty colin.mclarty@case.edu, Rahim Moosa rmoosa@uwaterloo.ca,

Henry Towsner htowsner@math.upenn.edu, and Kai Wehmeier wehmeier@uci.edu.

Please follow the submission procedure described at

<http://www.asonline.org/journals-bulletin-guide.html>

It is recommended that papers be prepared in L^AT_EX using the ASL's class file, especially for manuscripts having extensive symbolic or mathematical notation. This style file is available from the ASL's website at <http://www.asonline.org>; links from that site provide further information about the BULLETIN and about submitting papers for publication.

No print offprints will be supplied but authors will receive a link to a freely accessible electronic pdf of their published article. Print offprints may be purchased if required.

Articles present topics of broad interest in a way that is accessible to a large audience. They can be purely expository, survey, or historical articles or they may contain, in addition, new ideas or results or new approaches to old ones.

Communications should be announcements of important new results and ideas in any aspect of logic; they may be short papers in their final form or preliminary announcements (extended abstracts, position papers) of longer, full papers that will be published elsewhere. In any case, they should include, in addition to a description of the new results or ideas, enough history, background, and explanation to make the significance of the work apparent to a wide audience. *Communications* will be quickly refereed and published within six months of the submission of final version.

Books for review in the BULLETIN should be sent to ASL, BOX 742, Vassar College, 124 Raymond Avenue, Poughkeepsie, NY 12604, USA.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ARTICLES

- Using almost-everywhere theorems from analysis to study randomness,
by KENSHI MIYABE, ANDRÉ NIES, AND JING ZHANG.305
- Relativizing operational set theory,
by GERHARD JÄGER332

REVIEWS

- K. Kunen, *Set Theory*,
Reviewed by DAVID MILOVICH353
- S. B. Cooper and A. Hodges (editors), *The Once and Future Turing:
Computing the World*,
Reviewed by ALASDAIR URQUHART354
- V. Capraro and M. Lupini, *Introduction to Sofic and
Hyperlinear Groups and Connes' Embedding Conjecture*,
Reviewed by LEWIS BOWEN.....356
- V. Kanovei, M. Sabok, and J. Zapletal, *Canonical Ramsey Theory on
Polish Spaces*,
Reviewed by CLINTON T. CONLEY.....358

IN MEMORIAM

- In Memoriam: Barry Cooper, 1943–2015.....361
-

- 2015 European Summer Meeting of the Association for Symbolic Logic,
Logic Colloquium '15, Helsinki, Finland, August 3–8, 2015366
- 22nd Workshop on Logic, Language, Information and Computation
(WoLLIC 2015), Bloomington, Indiana, July 20–23, 2015436
- Model Theory and Groups, Istanbul 5, Istanbul, Turkey,
October 8–10, 2015438
- Notices439