

REVIEWS

of the *bande*—the devotion and humour of D'Indy. For the appreciation of men's music a little insight into their characters is often better than a multiplicity of technical disquisitions. These books do not profess to discuss the music of the school; they are studies of their lives; but there is just this insight in the intimate, sympathetic picture they give, relying as it does so much on unpublished letters, a picture which reveals at once humanity and mysticism, humour, patience, humility, disinterestedness.

The spirit of these men, which M. Oulmont so sensitively reveals, is the spirit which has preserved music from the degradation into which other arts have fallen: the stagnation of the academic. A breadth of mind in judging idioms not immediately congenial, a tireless quest for absolute beauty and enmity towards the mediocre and the meretricious. There is a phrase of Duparc's which all academicians should be made to wear as a phylactery: *Ne jamais travailler d'après le public mais au contraire, faire travailler le public.*

GERALD VANN, O.P.

MEDIÆVAL STUDIES

So far back as 1885, H. Denifle, O.P., in a masterly study, called the attention of scholars to the value of unpublished materials regarding the famous Joachim Abbot of Flore (1145-1202). Many have followed in the way shown by the great pioneer of Mediæval studies, and much progress has been achieved in this field. However, despite the many researches, Abbot Joachim's book *Contra Magistrum Petrum Lombardum*, in which he expounded his teaching on the Blessed Trinity condemned by the IV Council of the Lateran in 1215, has not yet been discovered. But MS. 296, at Balliol College, Oxford, of the early fourteenth century, contains, among other treasures, a *Liber contra Lombardum* (ff. 219r-235v), attributed in the MS. to Abbot Joachim. This MS., which is the only known copy of the work, has been scholarly edited by Prof. C. Ottaviano.¹

Now the question arises: Is this book identical with the work of the Abbot of Flore which was condemned by the Lateran Council? And if not, how far does it represent Joachim's teaching?

Dr. Ottaviano convincingly establishes that the work, as it is, cannot be attributed to the Abbot himself. In fact, it cannot be anterior to the publication of Pope Gregory IX's Decretal, September 5th, 1234, with a quotation from which it begins.

¹ C. OTTAVIANO: *Joachimi Abbatis Liber contra Lombardum* (Scuola di Gioacchino da Fiore). Roma, Reale Accademia d'Italia (Studi e Documenti 3), 1934-XII. pp. 310. Lire 50.

However, it is beyond doubt that it belongs to Joachim's school. The Abbot's own teaching on the Trinity has been preserved to us mainly through the decree of the Council of Lateran and in the *résumé* given by Aquinas in the *Summa Theologica* (I, q. 39, a. 5) and in the *Collatio in secundam Decretalem*. Dr. Ottaviano by comparing these two chief sources with the contents of the book, shows its conformity with Joachim's doctrine, and even that it follows him so closely that it gives the impression of being perhaps Joachim's lost book worked over by a faithful disciple.

The discussion by the Editor of these and other problems by no means exhausts the contents of the Introduction; and even if one does not accept *all* the views expressed, it contains however such a wealth of material and good things that one does not feel inclined to quarrel about trifles. The edition is a model of its kind. The text is transcribed with utmost fidelity; three critical apparatus follow: in the first are given paleographical notes; in the second, the quotations in full; and in the third, the references to Joachim's other works. Four detailed indexes, and a practically complete bibliography, comprising 255 items bearing on the subject-matter, enrich the volume. The schemes summarizing the whole work will prove of a very great service to all students.

Like all the publications of the *Reale Accademia d'Italia* this book is splendidly printed and produced.

Dr. Ottaviano also gives us a hitherto unpublished part of the philosophy of William of Conches. Curiously enough, the two principal philosophical works of William of Conches (1080-1154), although printed several times, have never appeared under his name. The *Dogmaticon philosophiae* was attributed to William Aneponymus in the edition of 1567, and has elsewhere been ascribed to other philosophers. The *Elementorum philosophiae Libri quattuor* is sometimes found among the writings of the Venerable Bede or attributed, under the title *De Philosophia Mundi*, to Honorius of Autun. At Basle in 1571 it was published as *Philosophicorum et astronomicorum Institutionum Libri tres* and ascribed to William of Hirschau.

Dr. Ottaviano now publishes a new part of this book according to three MSS., one of which was discovered by himself in the Ambrosian Library at Milan, the other two from the Stadtbibliothek at Munich. Prof. Saviano has accustomed us to excellent critical editions, and this one possesses all the good qualities of the others—the same richness of facts presented in most interesting fashion, the same meticulous care in the preparation of the

2 C. OTTAVIANO: *Un brano inedito della "Philosophia" de Guglielmo di Conches*. (Naples: Alberto Morano: Collezione di testi filosofici inediti e rari. pp. xiii-60; 6 lire.)

NOTICES

text. There is, however, one point which I should have liked to see more thoroughly discussed: the relation of this work to Hugh of St. Victor's *Eruditio Didascalica*. It seems to me that there is more than "qualche punto di contatto" between the two works. It seems unquestionable that there is a strict dependence of one upon the other, or perhaps of both upon a common source. I hope to return to this problem in connexion with Kilwardby's *De ortu et divisione scientiarum* of which a critical edition by the Very Rev. Fr. Bernard Delany and myself is forthcoming.

DANIEL A. CALLUS, O.P.

NOTICES

A CENTURY OF DETECTIVE STORIES. (Hutchinson; 3/6.)

This monster volume contains a variety of well-chosen thrillers and should be in the hands of all detective story lovers. Sufficient testimony to the remarkable value offered to the reader is the list of names of well-known writers from whose works the stories have been chosen.

G. L.

THE WORD INCARNATE. A Harmony of the Gospels. By the Most Rev. Alban Goodier, S.J., Archbishop of Hierapolis. Burns Oates; 5/-.)

A neat well-printed little book; a "harmony of the Gospels" in this sense, that it sets out the text of the Gospels in sections according to a system of chronology and collation which substantially is that of Tischendorf's *Synopsis*; when there are parallel accounts of the same event or doctrine, the texts being first put side by side and their data then co-ordinated by being worked into one narrative. The book certainly *should* "help many in prayer and meditation."

R. K.

THE ECONOMICS OF NATIONAL INDEPENDENCE. By Noel Tindal. (John Bale, Sons & Danielsson; 3/6.)

In his short book, written in dialogue form, Mr. Tindal makes a most necessary attack on the accepted Liberal Internationalist attitude to Trade. Mr. Tindal is not enthusiastic at the mere idea of Foreign Trade, holding with Adam Smith that it is the duty of Foreign Trade to supply a country with the exotic surplus of other countries. He is particularly severe on the worship of cheapness and the resurrection of Mercantilist theories under the new title of a "Favourable Balance of Trade." The main fault of his book is emphasized by his impartial use of many of our leading economists in support of both sides of his argument. Neither they nor Mr. Tindal know what to demand of an economic system. Mr. Tindal himself looks to the increase of