

and in an appendix. On the *virginitas in partu* it is remarked that 'an increasing number of theologians hold today that this doctrine is not *de fide*'. Other appendices contain a historical survey of the writings of St Thomas on our Lady and an account of recent studies on our Lady in the New Testament; both of these will be really useful to students.

This is an inspiring volume by an inspiring scholar. On the principle that Mary cannot be studied in isolation, Fr Heath asserts that St Thomas's 'insistence on that principle may very well be his contribution to our age of ecumenical dialogue and search for unity among all Christians' and that 'the opportunity this book gives for seeing him work out that principle in his Marian studies might be the best justification for this book today'. The remarkable success of the Ecumenical Society

of the Blessed Virgin Mary would seem to confirm this judgment, and we may recall that Vatican II, albeit by a small margin, decided not to expound its Mariology in isolation but to place it firmly in the context of the Church. Two small points of dispute. On page 11, line 17, *non potest intelligi* should surely be rendered by 'must not be understood as', not as 'is unintelligible'. And on page 39, lines 28ff, is not the argument that the Hebrew equivalent of *mulier* includes, but is not simply interchangeable with, 'virgin'? But here is a lovely passage to end with: 'The "doubt of discussion" is behind every article of the *Summa*; the "doubt of wonder" is, of course, behind the whole vast enterprise of theology. Theology, as well as philosophy, begins in wonder' (p. 24, n. 22).

E. L. MASCALL

**ST THOMAS AQUINAS: SUMMA THEOLOGIAE.** Latin Text and English Translation. Introduction, Text, Appendices and Glossaries. Vol. XVI: Purpose and Happiness (I-II, i-v), Thomas Gilby, O.P. xvi + 170 pp. 42s. Vol. XXIII: Virtue (I-II, iv-lxvii), W. D. Hughes, O.P. xxii + 258 pp. 50s. Vol. XXV: Sin (I-II, lxxi-lxxx), John Fearon, O.P. xviii + 268 pp. 32s. *Blackfriars*. London: *Eyre and Spottiswoode*. New York *McGraw-Hill*.

These are three key volumes of the *Prima Secundae* and it is good to have them together. The treatise on the end of man (happily and contemporarily rendered by Fr Gilby as 'purpose in life'), with which the Second Part of the *Summa* opens, sets the key for everything that follows, and indeed it is only if its overarching assumption is kept in mind that the fully Christian character of St Thomas's moral theory can be clearly discerned and its contrast with the purely secularist Aristotelianism be appreciated. The problem which has exercised so many subsequent theologians and on which in recent years Fr de Lubac has thrown so much light, of reconciling the truth that only in the vision of God can man find perfect bliss with the truth that the vision of God is a gift of pure

grace which man's nature can, of itself, neither demand nor attain, is not discussed in detail, but a very useful appendix is devoted to its statement. Fr Gilby's notes to this volume are as sprightly and illuminating as we should expect them to be. From this starting-point the other two volumes appropriately follow, for virtue is the means by which man's end is to be achieved and sin is the obstacle which impedes it. The plodding and somewhat complacent exposition of the Stagyrite receives at the hands of the Angelic Doctor flashes of theological illumination and of psychological insight which altogether transform it, and to these the translators and commentators of the present edition have given full expression.

E. L. MASCALL

**THE CHURCH AT PRAYER: Introduction to the Liturgy**, ed. A. G. Martimort; ed. of the English edition, Austin Flannery, O.P., and Vincent Ryan, O.S.B. *Irish University Press*, 1968. Vol. I, xvi-246 pp. 42s.

Many Eastern Orthodox Christians and even some not-too-high Anglican friends—not to mention a sizable number of those Roman Catholics who do bother to reflect on what they are about on Sunday mornings or evenings—are shocked at the speed and direction of liturgical reforms and experimentation in the Catholic Church today. Some tend to see the entire movement as a massive sell-out to the spirit of the age. Nor does this criticism arise from peevish conservatism but from a concern

for theology and faith. They feel safer with revitalizing traditional forms of worship while relegating experimentation with new forms to the harmless tinkering with accidentals. Even a Dutch Protestant renewal-theologian such as Albert H. van den Heuvel, in writing on worship in a secularized world, says: 'We whose minds work differently, should never try to walk with our heavy Western shoes through the rosebeds of the Eastern tradition. Maybe it is there that the tree, the leaves of

which will heal the worship life of the nations, grows.' (*The Humiliation of the Church*, SCM Press, 1967, p. 81.) As for the eastern liturgy, one could say the same for the western liturgy. Hence arises the concern.

But in fact the official reforms of the liturgy in the Church today are not as drastic or unorthodox as many would be led to believe. A widespread ignorance of the history and nature of the liturgy among English-speaking Catholics is partly to blame for the rather slow acceptance of changes in the liturgy. Though admittedly, and for different reasons, some pretty sharp and pointed criticism of the reforms can come from those who do know something about liturgy and liturgical history. Now here at last is a boon for both sides. *The Church at Prayer* places before the English-speaking reader an extremely rich source of information about the liturgy. Without reflection upon the present editors and translators of the English edition, it is nothing less than scandalous that so important a work has only now been translated—after having already appeared even in Portuguese and Polish!

The original, one-volume edition of *L'Eglise en prière: introduction à la liturgie*, published in 1961 (xv + 916 pp.) under the editorship of Canon A. G. Martimort, included contributions of the most eminent French and Belgian consultants at work on preparations for the Second Vatican Council and who are now consultants to the post-conciliar commission for the reform of the liturgy, scholars like: Dom B. Botte, Dom B. Capellef, A. Chavasse, I. H. Dalmais, P.-M. Gy, P. Journel, A. Nocent, A. M. Roguet, O. Rousseau, P. Salmon, and Martimort himself. Its purpose was not serve any partisan causes whether intégriste or progressive, but to present the liturgy in a serene and objectively scientific fashion.

The English editors Austin Flannery, O.P., and Vincent Ryan, O.S.B., have directed a translation from the up-dated, post-conciliar third edition of 1965 which incorporated the revisions demanded by Vatican II's Constitution on the Liturgy. In addition to these they have added further changes in texts, footnotes and bibliography. Their work will appear in several volumes, probably three, which might seem a financial tactic of the publishers had it not been quite plausibly argued in the preface that the multivolume edition will insure that 'its publication can follow more closely with work of the liturgical Consilium'. The first volume deals with the

fundamentals of the liturgy. The subsequent ones will treat in great detail and bibliographical amplitude of the Eucharist and the other sacraments and sacramentals including the Divine Office and liturgical year.

In the present volume we are given a brief review of fundamental concepts, some false, about the liturgy; a concise presentation of the various liturgical groups in Eastern and Western Churches, followed by a survey of the history of the liturgy (pp. 1-54). The second part (pp. 55-234), entitled 'Fundamentals of the Liturgy', discusses the structures, laws and theology of liturgical celebration. Here, among other things, is a refreshingly broad-minded and pastoral approach to liturgical legislation—this is no book for rubricists. I. H. Dalmais' treatment, in chapter nine, of the now famous insights of Dom Odo Casel on the liturgy and its relation to the Mystery of Salvation is profound, positive and thorough in its documentation. It is undoubtedly one of the best, most concise and well documented expositions of this difficult concept and its problems, a concept which has found its way into the theological heart of Vatican II's Constitution on the Liturgy. Canon Martimort's chapters (5, 6) on the Assembly and the Dialogue between God and his People are almost mystical in their theological depth. These together with A. M. Roguet's chapter eleven on Pastoral-Liturgical Action are an inspiring and useful guide for those responsible for the formation of Christian liturgical communities. Here especially is the need for more bibliographical material to meet the requirements of the English-speaking world most keenly felt. Nor is it entirely the fault of the editors; materials are simply not as plentiful as in France, Belgium and Holland. But one should expect more mention of pertinent English books and articles that are already available.

Concerning the bibliographical elements, one would like to see the standards of scientific thoroughness found in the original better respected here. This first volume wants more books and articles published since 1965 as well as more material in English. One particularly grave omission, at least for the serious student, in the chapter on Rites and Liturgical Groups, the section on the Coptic rite, page 22, is that of another work by O. Burmester, *The Egyptian or Coptic Church: a detailed description of her Liturgical Services*, Cairo 1967. Even though his articles are cited there, this more complete and definitive work should not be left out.

There are other oversights of articles mentioned in the original: M. Rajji's 'De la Liturgie maronite' in *Proche-Orient chrétien* i (1951) 71-85; L. Brou's 'Bulletin de liturgie mozarabe' in *Hispana sacra* ii (1949) 459-484, and his 'Études sur le missel et le bréviaire "mozarabes" imprimés' in *Hispana sacra* xi (1958), 349-398 on page 29. On page 33 note 8 mention should be made of Professor Henry Chadwick's reissuing of Dom Gregory Dix's edition of *The Treatise on the Apostolic Tradition of St Hippolytus of Rome*. The Oxford scholar has in this little volume (S.P.C.K. 1968) made corrections and added material; and Professor Chadwick's preface alone is worth the citation because of his discussion of Hippolytus' anaphora and its epiklesis. The serious student can always remedy these bibliographical deficiencies by regularly consulting such reviews and annuals as *Yearbook of Liturgical Studies*, Notre Dame, U.S.A. (especially good for periodical literature); *Les questions liturgiques et paroissiales*, its 'Bulletin de littérature liturgique' (one of the best), Louvain, Mont César; *Archiv für Liturgiewissenschaft*, Abtei Maria Laach, Regensburg.

Aside from these shortcomings, the bibliography, as in the original French edition, is lavish indeed. Each chapter, practically every section and subsection as well as footnotes are furnished with the most thorough bibliographical documentation. Dom Botte's contri-

butions are, as usual, gems of concise scientific presentation giving all the references needed for the serious student to pursue his own further investigations. Though *The Church at Prayer* is one of the best introductions to the field in any language, it is not, however, only a scientific textbook for liturgiologists. The educated lay reader will find it rewardingly informative. In fact one would not hesitate to say that the volumes of *The Church at Prayer*, as a happy example of scientific 'team work' at its best, should be on the 'required' list for every priest's or pastor's reference shelf—that of bishops included.

In spite of its shortcomings, imposed, perhaps, by the urgency which the appearance of the English edition called for, the editors and translators are to be gratefully commended for making such a masterpiece available to the English-speaking reader. Pope St Pius X, who is considered to have inaugurated the modern Catholic liturgical reform with his *motu proprio* on Church music and frequent communion, said one day that it would take at least thirty years to reform the Roman liturgy. Almost thirty years to the very day of his *motu proprio* the Second Vatican Council promulgated the Constitution on the Liturgy. Let us hope that we will not have to wait another thirty years to see the rest of *L'Eglise en prière* reach the eyes of English readers.

BERNARD GRANOR, O.P.

**FAITH AND SPIRITUAL LIFE**, by Yves Congar. *Darton, Longman and Todd*, London, 1969. 234 pp. 32s. 6d.

'There is a general feeling that what we need is an authentic and enlightened spirituality in which the absolute is seen to be all the more absolute because of its insertion in the relativity of history and life.' These words of Yves Congar were written in 1935. The book under review, which is a translation of *Les Voies du Dieu Vivant*, published in France in 1961, is a theologian's work on these lines to provide spiritual reading for his contemporaries. All the papers and lectures in it preceded Vatican II, and are an indication of the freshness of approach that was to be found in France between 1935 and 1961, waiting to find expression at the Council. Perhaps we in England are at last feeling its influence. There is nothing non-traditional in these essays, and very little that seeks to destroy, but there is certainly an effort to correct by fresh inspira-

The first part ('In the Communion of

Saints') contains studies of St Peter, St Francis, St Thomas Aquinas and others, and three papers on Fr Dominic Lacordaire, along with essays on the Assumption, the Holy Angels and the Communion of Saints. It is bracing to be told that St Francis did not kiss the leper because he was granted an overflowing plenitude of the divine love, but because he knew that if he really loved God he must do this thing that he loathed. In the panegyric on St Thomas, 'servant of truth', we are given penetrating insights on the science of theology, the nature of its service, its limitations before the mystery of faith, and the need for a poverty and purity such as St Thomas showed in approaching his great task. But it is a pity that this spoken address could not have been reduced, and some of the repetitions avoided, for the purposes of print. Books are becoming more and more expensive; could they not sometimes be more economically concise?