

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME XIV NUMBERS 2 & 3 1988

ANTITRUST ISSUES IN HEALTH CARE

Jonathan B. Baker **Theodore N. McDowell, Jr.**

J. Marbury Rainer **Debra A. Gilmore**

PUBLISHED BY THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF LAW & MEDICINE AND THE
BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW

The AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE is published in the Spring, Summer, Fall, and Winter by the American Society of Law & Medicine and the Boston University School of Law. All decisions concerning the content of the JOURNAL are made by a joint American Society of Law & Medicine/Boston University School of Law Editorial Policy Committee. Statements of fact and opinion are the responsibility of the authors alone, and are not necessarily endorsed by the editors, the Society, or the law school.

The Editors invite the submission of manuscripts on medicolegal topics. For details, see inside back cover. Editorial communications, including original manuscripts and requests for permission to reproduce JOURNAL material, should be addressed to Editor-in-Chief, AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE, 765 Commonwealth Ave., Boston, Massachusetts 02215. Editorial phone: (617) 353-2912.

Business correspondence, including subscription correspondence, should be addressed to the Membership Director, American Society of Law & Medicine, 765 Commonwealth Avenue, 16th Floor, Boston, Massachusetts 02215. Business phone: (617) 262-4990.

Subscriptions: \$45.00 per year for institutions, and for individuals who are not members of the American Society of Law & Medicine. Foreign subscribers should remit, for a year's subscription, an additional \$25.00 for air mail postage.

Missing copies of the JOURNAL will be sent free of charge to subscribers or members of the Society provided that notice of such claim is received at the Society's subscription office within one month of receipt of the next issue published. Requests made after this period will be billed at the regular issue price of \$10 (plus \$3 for postage and handling).

Members of the American Society of Law & Medicine receive a free subscription to the JOURNAL as part of their dues (\$95.00 for 1988). Information concerning membership is available from the Membership Director, American Society of Law & Medicine, 765 Commonwealth Avenue, 16th Floor, Boston, Massachusetts 02215. Society phone: (617) 262-4990.

Articles in the JOURNAL are indexed in *Index to Legal Periodicals*, *Legal Contents*, *Index Medicus*, *Social Sciences Citation Index*, *Current Contents: Social and Behavioral Sciences*, and *Biosciences Information Service of Biological Abstracts*.

Library of Congress Catalog Number: 75-645516 (Shelf No. K1.M445). ISSN 0098-8588.

U.S. postage paid at Lincoln, Nebraska, in accordance with Permit No. 264 (Nonprofit Org.).

ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICERS OF BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW

JOHN R. SILBER, B.A., M.A., PH.D., LL.D., (hon.), LH.D., (hon.), *President*,

University Professor and Professor of Philosophy and Law

COLIN S. DIVER, B.A., LL.B., *Dean and Professor of Law*

LARRY W. YACKLE, B.A., J.D., LL.M., *Associate Dean*

BARBARA LAUREN, B.A., J.D., PH.D., *Assistant Dean*

CHRISTINE A. MARX, B.S., J.D., *Assistant Dean for Student Affairs*

DANIEL FREEHLING, B.A., M.S., *Director, Law Library*

MARGARET D. HAGOPIAN, A.C.S., *Executive Assistant to the Dean*

OFFICERS OF THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF LAW & MEDICINE

ALEXANDER M. CAPRON, LL.B., *President*

ROBERT J. LEVINE, M.D., *President-Elect*

BERNARD M. DICKENS, Ph.D., LL.D., *Secretary*

WILLIAM J. CURRAN, LL.M., S.M. Hyg., *Treasurer*

ELLIOT L. SAGALL, M.D., *Founder and First President*

RONALD E. CRANFORD, M.D., *Immediate Past President*

LAWRENCE O. GOSTIN, J.D., *Executive Director*

**STAY
ON THE
CUTTING
EDGE
OF YOUR
PROFESSION**



The American Society of Law & Medicine

THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF LAW & MEDICINE

The Medicolegal Tradition

Since its inception fifteen years ago, the American Society of Law and Medicine (ASLM) has grown from a small group of Massachusetts physicians and attorneys with a vision to one of the largest and most prestigious professional societies in America.

ASLM brings together professionals — attorneys, physicians, health care administrators, educators, nurses, judges, insurers — who are concerned with the interrelationships of law, medicine and health care. Members are bound by their desire to learn, to better serve their clients or patients and to progress in their careers.

ASLM promotes the finest in continuing education and professional recognition in the fields of law and medicine. It continues to accomplish this by tackling the major issues of the day — malpractice, risk management, AIDS, drug testing and drug dependency, health care financing, death and dying and new medical technologies. ASLM provides leadership in these critical societal issues and needs your support to fulfill its vision.

Through the initiation of projects, sponsorship of conferences, and the publication of two major journals, ASLM can keep you on the cutting edge of your profession.

Law, Medicine and Health Care and the *American Journal of Law and Medicine* are the journals published by the Society. *LMHC* is edited by prestigious board members, including Larry Gostin (editor-in-chief, Harvard), Jay Katz (medical editor, Yale), and Bernard Dickens (legal editor, University of Toronto).

Forthcoming in the *American Journal of Law and Medicine* is a commemorative edition for Harry Blackmun, U.S. Supreme Court Justice.

BENEFITS OF ASLM MEMBERSHIP

- Become a part of the largest and most prestigious medicolegal society in America.
- Stay at the top of your profession by receiving up-to-date information about today's vital legal and medical issues.
- Annual subscription to *Law, Medicine and Health Care* (four issues).
- Annual subscription to the *American Journal of Law & Medicine* (four issues).
- Periodic editions of ASLM's newsletter, *ASLM Briefings*.
- Invitations to Society sponsored conferences including:
 - registration fee discounts.
 - continuing education credit.
- Price discounts on Society Books.
- ASLM Book Purchase Service.
- ASLM Photocopy Service.
- Participate in ASLM Speakers' Bureau.
- Receive an elegant Membership Certificate suitable for framing. This certificate exemplifies your stature as a member of the law and medical profession.
- And much, much more . . .



AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

BOARD of EDITORS

FACULTY EDITOR-IN-CHIEF

Frances H. Miller, J.D.
Boston University School of Law

EXECUTIVE EDITOR

Lawrence O. Gostin, J.D.

DIRECTOR OF PUBLICATIONS

American Society of Law & Medicine
Merrill Kaitz

CIRCULATION MANAGER

Susan Reddy

EDITORS

Michael Baram, J.D.

Boston University Schools of Law
and Public Health

Charles H. Baron, LL.B., Ph.D.

Boston College Law School

Henry Beyer, J.D.

Boston University School of Law

Patrick R. Carroll, J.D.

Senior Vice Pres. & Legal Counsel
Massachusetts Hospital Association

William J. Curran, LL.M., S.M. Hyg.

Harvard University School of
Public Health

Lee J. Dunn, Jr., J.D., LL.M.

Powers & Hall
Boston, Massachusetts

Richard F. Gibbs, M.D., J.D.

Harvard Medical School

Jay Alexander Gold, M.D., J.D., M.P.H.

Department of Preventive Medicine
Medical College of Wisconsin

Clark C. Havighurst, J.D.

Duke University School of Law

Nathan Hershey, J.D.

University of Pittsburgh
Graduate School of Public Health

Bernard D. Hirsh, J.D.

General Counsel
American Medical Association

Edward E. Hollowell, J.D.

Hollowell & Silverstein
Raleigh, North Carolina

Richard G. Huber, J.D.

Boston College Law School

Jay Katz, M.D.

Yale University Law School

Sylvia A. Law, J.D.

New York University School of Law

Peter Martin, J.D.

Dean, Cornell Law School

Aubrey Milunsky, MB.B.Ch., D.Sc.,

F.R.C.P., D.C.H.

Boston University School of Medicine

Irwin N. Perr, M.D., J.D.

University of Medicine and Dentistry
of New Jersey

Harvey E. Pies, J.D., M.P.H.

Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Florida
Jacksonville, Florida

Honorable Max Rosenn

United States Court of Appeals for the
Third Circuit

Elliot L. Sagall, M.D.

Founder, American Society of
Law & Medicine

Harvard Medical School

William Schwartz, J.D., M.A.

Dean, Boston University School of Law

E. Donald Shapiro, J.D., LL.D.

New York Law School

Margery W. Shaw, M.D., J.D.

Director, Medical Genetics Center
University of Texas at Houston

Robert B. Shira, D.D.S.

Dean, Tufts University School of
Dental Medicine

Arthur F. Southwick, J.D., M.B.A.

Grad. Sch. of Business Administration
University of Michigan

David G. Warren, J.D.

Duke University

Cyril H. Wecht, M.D., J.D.

Director, Pittsburgh Institute of Legal
Medicine

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

INTERNATIONAL BOARD of EDITORS

Dr. M.A.M. Wachter
Director
Institute of Bioethics
The Netherlands

Dr. S.S. Fluss
Chief, Health Legislation
World Health Organization
Switzerland

Prof. Dr. Erwin Deutsch
Institute for Pharmaceutical and
Medical Law
University of Gottingen
Federal Republic of Germany

Bernard M. Dickens, Ph.D., LL.D.
Professor
Faculty of Law & Faculty of Medicine
University of Toronto
Canada

Prof. Dr. H.J.J. Leenen
Instituut voor Sociale Geneeskunde
Universiteit van Amsterdam
The Netherlands

**The Honorable Justice
Michael J. Kirby**
President, Court of Appeals
Supreme Court
Australia

Koichi Bai
Professor of Law
Director of Institute of Medical
Humanities
School of Medicine
Kitasato University
Japan

P.D.G. Skegg
Faculty of Law
University of Otago
New Zealand

Prof. Dr. Iur. Dieter Giesen
Institute for International, Foreign
and Comparative Law
Director,
Working Centre for International
Studies in Medical Malpractice Law
The Free University of Berlin
Federal Republic of Germany

Professor Amos Shapira
Lubowski Professor of Law &
Biomedical Ethics
Faculty of Law
Tel Aviv University
Israel

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME XIV NUMBERS 2 & 3 1988

**BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW
STUDENT BOARD OF EDITORS
1988-1989**

EDITOR-IN-CHIEF

Sara Lou Lander

EXECUTIVE EDITOR

Shep A. Rosenman

SYMPOSIUM EDITOR

Elizabeth A. Reingold

MANAGING EDITOR

Maureen A. MacFarlane

PROJECTS EDITOR

Donna M. Praiss

ARTICLES EDITORS

Aileen C. Denne Bolton

Joseph P. Kelly

Robert D. Webb

Michelle S. Wolf

ASST. SYMPOSIUM EDITOR

Ellen Wright

CASE & NOTE EDITORS

Diane M. Crawford

Jeffrey A. Dollinger

Stephen G. Hamel

Karen Laufer

Kathleen M. Norton

Joseph C. Stanko, Jr.

David Van Speybroeck

Jonathan Wilk

THIRD YEAR EDITORS

David Babner

Tracy Daugherty

Michael DeVito

James R. Eddy

Mary L. Gallant

Steven N. Jacobs

Todd Kirsch

Frances Lynch

Steven H. Meyer

Todd L. Safon

Richard I. Shakter

Stacey H. Snyder

Constance N. Stratton

Edward Tumavicus

Ann M. VanDeventer

Eric E. Wolf

STAFF MEMBERS

Joan Andres

Robert Bannish

David Baum

David J. Breen

Astrid W. Calderon

Mark Cheffo

Liane Cohen

Andrea de Gorgey

Karyn Finamore

Rachel Fishman

Wayne S. Flick

Michael C. Fondo

Stephen Freeland

Daniel Gindes

Allen Glass

Pamela D. Harvey

Anne Marie Jennings

Miriam Kelliher

Stephen Kelly

William A. Kraus

Marie Lavalleye

Joan A. Lieberman

Allison Linneman

Leopold J. Luberecki, Jr.

Barbara A. Masterson

Linda Mesler

Laurie E. Meyers

Stephen B. Monick

James Nealon

Deborah Savarese

Meredith Skinner

Pamela L. Taylor

James W. Tegtmeier

Susan Tribble

AMERICAN JOURNAL OF LAW & MEDICINE

VOLUME XIV NUMBERS 2 & 3 1988

ANTITRUST ISSUES IN HEALTH CARE

ARTICLES

- | | | |
|--|--|-----|
| VERTICAL RESTRAINTS AMONG
HOSPITALS, PHYSICIANS AND
HEALTH INSURERS THAT RAISE
RIVALS' COSTS | Jonathan B. Baker | 147 |
| THE STATE ACTION DOCTRINE AND
THE LOCAL GOVERNMENT
ANTITRUST ACT: THE
RESTRUCTURED HOSPITAL MODEL | Theodore N. McDowell, Jr.
J. Marbury Rainer | 171 |
| THE ANTITRUST IMPLICATIONS OF
BOYCOTTS BY HEALTH CARE
PROFESSIONALS: PROFESSIONAL
STANDARDS, PROFESSIONAL ETHICS
AND THE FIRST AMENDMENT | Debra A. Gilmore | 221 |

NOTES AND COMMENTS

- BALL MEMORIAL HOSPITAL:*
SECTION 2 SHERMAN ACT
ANALYSIS IN THE ALTERNATIVE
HEALTH CARE DELIVERY MARKET 249

MEDICOLEGAL REFERENCE LIBRARY

- | | |
|---------------------------------|-----|
| SELECTED RECENT COURT DECISIONS | 281 |
| SELECTED BOOK RELEASE | 305 |

Copyright 1988 by the American Society of Law & Medicine, Inc. and the Boston University School of Law. All or any part of materials appearing in the Journal may not be republished without the express written consent of the Editor-in-Chief.

