

CORRESPONDENCE

To the Editors of THE CLASSICAL REVIEW.

SIRS,—In Mr. J. Wight Duff's review of my book on the Latin dual (*C.R.* XXXIX., p. 37) I read: 'Professor Bell would find it difficult to cite any examples of initial *g* disappearing in Latin before *r*.' The example I had in mind in speaking of *grōma* was *ravus*, 'gray,' which seems to be for an older *gravus*. Mr. Duff will remember Plautus' *gravastellus*, 'the little grayish man,' clearly a diminutive from *grāvaster*, which in its turn is a pejorative of *gravus*. That this *gravus* is really an older form of *ravus* seems assured from the Ambrosian variation *ravistellus*. Walde in his *ravus*, 'grau, graugelb' = aisl. *grār*, ahd. *grāo*, *grāwer*, 'grau,' ags. *græg*, recognises this. I should feel more assured in adopting what Mr. Duff recommends as the better course should he, in his turn, favour me with a second example of a Roman borrowing from Greek where, as in *grōma* for the Greek γρῶμα, the initial γρ has passed to *gr*.

A. J. BELL.

To the Editors of THE CLASSICAL REVIEW.

SIRS,—I write not in any way to question the legitimacy of Mr. Gomme's criticism upon the second volume of *The Cambridge Ancient History* (*C.R.* XXXIX., p. 21), and still less with the object of starting a barren controversy. But it may help matters forward to define what seems to me the difficulty which is responsible for a fundamental divergence of attitude between my own views and those of some other contributors to that book.

First of all I would deprecate an eristic, and still more a dogmatic, approach to this difficult question. We are all groping in the dark with little more than working hypotheses to use as clues. It ill becomes us to treat our own views with complacency or those of others with contempt; nor is the very latest theory necessarily the most sound. Actually a complex problem

is being approached by a number of individual and special routes. Quite sound reasoning upon different sorts of evidence may lead to guesses which are diametrically opposed, because the evidence in no particular line of approach is satisfactory. But ultimately the theory which is to be generally acceptable must be harmonised in some way or other to satisfy all the conditions postulated by our various lines of approach.

Now there is obviously an attractive simplicity in equating the Homeric civilisation with the Mycenaean, and in working with a single (the Dorian) invasion. That there is much to be said for this position Mr. Wace and Professor Bury have shown. But if it makes some things easier, it raises a fundamental difficulty with regard to religion, which no amount of tact can conceal. Nor should the attempt be made, for that difficulty has got to be faced. No student of Homer, I venture to believe, who has also studied the religious art of Mycenae, or, indeed, who has even read Mr. Wace's masterly chapters in *The Cambridge Ancient History*, can doubt two things, facts not hypotheses: (1) That the religion of Mycenae in *L.H.* III. is of the same general character as that of Crete in *L.M.* II., and that its history is continuous from at least *M.M.* I., and possibly earlier; (2) that Homeric religion is in general characteristics something quite different. I do not see how it can be questioned by any fair-minded observer that in the sphere of religion some generically new cultural influence, whatever its precise nature, has been at work to produce the pantheon of Olympus.

These facts do seem to me to make it very difficult to suppose (*a*) that the Homeric poems are a literally accurate record of Mycenaean civilisation, and (*b*) that no considerable new racial influence affected Greek lands between the building of the Lion Gate at Mycenae and the composition of the *Iliad* and the *Odyssey*.

W. R. HALLIDAY.

BOOKS RECEIVED

All publications which have a bearing on Classical Studies will be entered in this list if they are sent for review. The price should in all cases be stated.

* * * *Excerpts or Extracts from Periodicals and Collections will not be included unless they are also published separately.*

Aly (W.) *Geschichte der griechischen Literatur*. Pp. xvii + 418. (Die Handbibliothek des Philologen.) Bielefeld and Leipzig: Velhagen and Klasing, 1925. Paper.

Bacon (J. R.) *The Voyage of the Argonauts*. Pp. viii + 187; 6 illustrations and 3 maps. London: Methuen, 1925. Cloth, 6s. net.

Bailey (C.) *Aristophanes, The Clouds*. Partly in the original and partly in translation, with notes and introduction. Pp. 133. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1921. Cloth, 3s. 6d. net.

Bayard (L. C.) *Saint Cyprien, Correspondance*. Tome I. (Collection des Universités de France.) Paris: Société d'Édition 'Les Belles Lettres,' 1925. Paper, 12 frs.

Bekker (I.) *Aristotelis de Republica Libri VIII. Ex recensione I.B.* Editionem alte-

ram phototypice excudebat Societas Mustoniana. Pp. 232. Oxford: Clarendon Press. Cloth.

Brooks (A. M.) *Architecture*. Pp. xix + 189. (Our Debt to Greece and Rome.) London, etc.: Harrap. Cloth, 5s. net.

Bulletin de l'Association Guillaume Budé. No. 6. Janvier, 1925.

Carcopino (J.) *La Louve du Capitole*. Pp. 90; planches. (Extrait du Bulletin de l'Association Guillaume Budé, juillet 1924, octobre 1924, janvier 1925.) Paris: Société d'Édition 'Les Belles Lettres,' 1925. Paper, 5 frs.

Clark (G. F.) *The Case-Construction after the Comparative in Pliny's Letters*. Pp. viii + 26. (Smith College Classical Studies. No. III., June, 1922.) Northampton, Mass. Paper.

- Classical Philology*. Vol. XX., No. 1. January, 1925.
- Coulon (V.) and Van Daele (H.)* Aristophane. Tome II. : Les Guèpes, La Paix. (Collection des Universités de France.) Paris : Société d'Édition 'Les Belles Lettres,' 1924. Paper, 18 frs.
- De Falco (V.)* L'Epiparodo nella Tragedia Greca. Pp. 96. Naples: G. Casella, 1925. Paper, L. 8.
- Diehl (E.)* Inscriptiones Latinae Christianae Veteres. Fasc. 5. Pp. 321-400. Berlin: Weidmann, 1925. Geheftet, 3.75 M.
- Donovan (J.)* Theory of Advanced Greek Prose Composition, with a Digest of Greek Idioms. Vol. III., Part III. : Minor Differences. Pp. iv+175. Oxford: Blackwell, 1924. Boards, 5s. net.
- Duckett (E. S.)* Hellenistic Influence on the Aeneid. Pp. xi+68. (Smith College Classical Studies. No. 1, June, 1920.) Northampton, Mass. Paper.
- Eustratiades (S.) and Arcadios.* Catalogue of the Greek Manuscripts in the Library of the Monastery of Vatopedi on Mt. Athos. Pp. iii+277. (Harvard Theological Studies. XI.) London: Milford (for Harvard University Press), 1924. Cloth and boards, 63s. net.
- Gaselee (S.)* An Anthology of Medieval Latin. Pp. xii+139. London: Macmillan, 1925. Cloth, 7s. 6d. net.
- Geden (A. S.)* Select Passages illustrating Mithraism. Translated, with an Introduction. (Translations of Early Documents.) Pp. vi+87. London: S.P.C.K., 1925. Cloth, 3s. 6d. net.
- Giarratano (C.)* Calpurnii et Nemesiani Bucolica iteratis curis edidit Einsidensia quae dicuntur carmina adiecit. Pp. xxv+96. (Corpus Scriptorum Latinorum Paravianum, No. 44.) Turin, etc.: Paravia. Paper, price outside Turin L. 12.80.
- Goldsmith (E. E.)* Life Symbols as related to Sex Symbolism. Pp. xxviii+455; more than 100 illustrations. New York and London: Putnam, 1924. Cloth and boards.
- Grant (M. A.)* The Ancient Rhetorical Theories of the Laughable. The Greek Rhetoricians and Cicero. Pp. 166. (University of Wisconsin Studies in Language and Literature, No. 21.) Madison, 1924. Paper, \$2.
- Hall (C. M.)* Nicolaus of Damascus' Life of Augustus. A historical commentary embodying a translation. Pp. iv+97. (Smith College Classical Studies, No. IV., May, 1923.) Northampton, Mass. Paper.
- Harrison (J. E.)* Mythology. Pp. xx+155. (Our Debt to Greece and Rome.) London, etc.: Harrap, 5s. net.
- Harvard Studies in Classical Philology*. Vol. XXXV. Pp. 176. Cambridge (U.S.A.): Harvard University Press (London: Milford), 1924. Boards, 6s. 6d. net.
- Howard (E. C.)* Où était Carthage? Pp. 36. Algiers: J. Carbonel, 1925. Paper.
- Hoyland (J. S.)* A Brief History of Civilisation. Pp. 288; illustrations. Oxford: Clarendon Press (London: Milford), 1925. Cloth, 3s. 6d. net.
- Kroll (W.)* Studien zum Verständnis der römischen Literatur. Pp. 390. Stuttgart: J. B. Metzler, 1924. Paper, 8.50 M.
- La Piana (M.)* Ricostruzione Metrica e Ritmica dei Canti Lirici nelle Tragedie Greche. Saggio dall' *Edipo Re* di Sofocle. Pp. 43. Turin: V. Bona, 1925. Paper, L. 8.
- Liddell and Scott.* A Greek-English Lexicon. A new edition revised and augmented throughout by H. S. Jones, with the assistance of R. McKenzie. Part 1.: A-Ἀποβαίω. Pp. xlv+192. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1925. Stiff paper, 10s. 6d. net.
- Meillet (A.) and Vendryes (J.)* Traité de Grammaire comparée des Langues Classiques. Pp. xiv+684. Paris: Champion, 1924. Paper.
- Monahan (F. J.)* The Early History of Bengal. Pp. xii+248; 6 plates. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1925. Cloth, 15s. net.
- O'Brien-Moore (A.)* Madness in Ancient Literature. Pp. 228. Weimar: R. Wagner Sohn, 1924. Stiff paper.
- Pernot (H.)* Pages choisies des Évangiles. Littéralement traduites de l'original et commentées à l'usage du public lettré avec le texte en regard. (Collection de l'Institut Néo-hellénique de l'Université de Paris, Fasc. 2.) Pp. 257. Paris: Société d'Édition 'Les Belles Lettres,' 1925. Paper, 12 frs.
- Ramsay (A. B.)* Ros Rosarum. Pp. vi+126. Cambridge: University Press, 1925. Cloth, 6s. 6d. net.
- The American Journal of Philology*. Vol. XLV. 4. Whole No. 180. October, November, December, 1924.
- The Journal of Roman Studies*. Vol. XIII., 1923, Parts 1 and 2 (1925).
- The Testimony of the Nations to the Value of Classical Studies*. Edited for the Classical Association by F. G. Kenyon. Pp. 24. London: Murray, 1925. Paper, 1s. net.
- Transactions and Proceedings of the American Philological Association*. Vol. LIV., 1923.
- Vogel (F.)* Bibliotheca Philologica Classica. Beiblatt zum Jahresbericht über die Fortschritte der klassischen Altertumswissenschaft. Band 48, 1921. Pp. vii+280. Leipzig: Reisland, 1925. Broschiert, 8 M.
- Wenley (R. M.)* Stoicism and its Influence. Pp. xi+194. (Our Debt to Greece and Rome.) London, etc.: Harrap. Cloth, 5s. net.
- Wilamowitz-Moellendorf (U. von)* Menander, Das Schiedsgericht (Epitepontos). Pp. viii+219. Berlin: Weidmann, 1925. Geheftet, 8.40 M. (Gebunden, 10.50 M.).
- Wilson (L. M.)* The Roman Toga. Pp. 132; 75 illustrations. Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins Press, 1924. Cloth, \$5.
- Wurz (E. and R.)* Die Entstehung der Säulenbasen des Altertums unter Berücksichtigung verwandter Kapitelle. Pp. 150; over 400 illustrations. (Zeitschrift für Geschichte der Architektur, Beiheft 15.) Heidelberg: Winter, 1925. Paper, 20 M.
- Zimmern (A.)* The Greek Commonwealth. Fourth edition, revised. Pp. 471. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1924. Cloth.