

## ON NONINNER AUTOMORPHISMS OF SOME FINITE $p$ -GROUPS

SANDEEP SINGH , ROHIT GARG  and HEMANT KALRA  

(Received 1 June 2024; accepted 14 June 2024)

### Abstract

We settle the noninner automorphism conjecture for finite  $p$ -groups ( $p > 2$ ) with certain conditions. Also, we give an elementary and short proof of the main result of Ghoraishi [‘On noninner automorphisms of finite nonabelian  $p$ -groups’, *Bull. Aust. Math. Soc.* **89**(2) (2014) 202–209].

2020 *Mathematics subject classification*: primary 20D15; secondary 20D45.

*Keywords and phrases*: finite  $p$ -group, noninner automorphism.

### 1. Introduction

There is a famous conjecture known as the noninner automorphism conjecture, listed in the book ‘Unsolved Problems in Group Theory: The Kourovka Notebook’, which states that *every finite nonabelian  $p$ -group admits an automorphism of order  $p$  which is not an inner automorphism* [11, Problem 4.13].

A sharpened version of the conjecture states that every finite nonabelian  $p$ -group  $G$  has a noninner automorphism of order  $p$  which fixes the Frattini subgroup  $\Phi(G)$  element-wise. This conjecture was first attacked by Liebeck [12]. He proved that for an odd prime  $p$ , every finite  $p$ -group  $G$  of nilpotency class 2 has a noninner automorphism of order  $p$  fixing  $\Phi(G)$  element-wise. For 2-groups of class 2, the conjecture was settled by Abdollahi [1] in 2007. In 2013, Abdollahi *et al.* [3, Theorem 4.4] proved that every finite  $p$ -group  $G$  of odd order and of nilpotency class 3 has a noninner automorphism of order  $p$  that fixes  $\Phi(G)$  element-wise. In 2013, Shabani-Attar [15] proved that if  $G$  is a finite nonabelian  $p$ -group of order  $p^m$  and exponent  $p^{m-2}$ , then  $G$  has a noninner automorphism of order  $p$ . In 2014, Abdollahi *et al.* [4] showed that every finite  $p$ -group  $G$  of co-class 2 has a noninner automorphism of order  $p$  leaving  $Z(G)$  element-wise fixed. For more such results, see [5–10].

If there is a maximal subgroup  $M$  of a finite  $p$ -group  $G$  with  $|G| > p$  and  $Z(M) \subseteq Z(G)$ , then there exists a noninner automorphism of  $G$  of order  $p$  (see [13, Lemma 9.108]). In 2002, Deaconescu and Silberberg [5] proved that if  $G$  is

---

The first author is grateful to SERB, Department of Science and Technology, for supporting the research under grant MTR/2022/000331.

© The Author(s), 2024. Published by Cambridge University Press on behalf of Australian Mathematical Publishing Association Inc.

a finite nonabelian  $p$ -group such that  $C_G(Z(\Phi(G))) \neq \Phi(G)$ , then  $G$  has a noninner automorphism of order  $p$  which fixes  $\Phi(G)$  element-wise. This reduces the verification of the conjecture to the special case in which  $C_G(Z(\Phi(G))) = \Phi(G)$ . If the conjecture is false for a finite  $p$ -group  $G$ , then it follows from [5, Remark 2] that  $Z(G) < Z(M)$  for all maximal subgroups  $M$  of  $G$ . This suggests the following natural question.

**QUESTION 1.1.** Given a finite  $p$ -group  $G$  with  $Z(G) < Z(M)$  for all maximal subgroups  $M$  of  $G$ , can the conjecture hold?

In Theorem 2.1, we prove that every finite  $p$ -group  $G$  ( $p > 2$ ) of nilpotency class  $n$  with  $\exp(\gamma_{n-1}(G)) = p$ ,  $|\gamma_n(G)| = p$  and  $Z(C_G(x)) \leq \gamma_{n-1}(G)$  for all  $x \in \gamma_{n-1}(G) \setminus Z(G)$ , has a noninner automorphism of order  $p$  which fixes  $\Phi(G)$  element-wise. As a consequence, in Corollaries 2.2 and 2.3, we give an affirmative answer to the above question under some conditions. In 2017, Ruscitti *et al.* [14] confirmed the conjecture for finite  $p$ -groups of co-class 3 with  $p \neq 3$ . We also validate the conjecture for some nonabelian finite 3-groups of co-class 3 in Corollary 2.4. In [8, Theorem 1.1], Ghoraishi improved the reduction given by Deaconescu and Silberberg [5] by proving that if a finite nonabelian  $p$ -group  $G$  fails to fulfil the condition  $Z_2^*(G) \leq C_G(Z_2^*(G)) = \Phi(G)$ , where  $Z_2^*(G)$  is the pre-image of  $\Omega_1(Z_2(G)/Z(G))$  in  $G$ , then  $G$  has a noninner automorphism of order  $p$  which fixes  $\Phi(G)$  element-wise. At the end of Section 2, we provide an elementary and short proof of this result.

Throughout,  $p$  denotes a prime number. For a group  $G$ , by  $Z_m(G)$ ,  $\gamma_m(G)$ ,  $d(G)$  and  $\Phi(G)$ , we denote the  $m$ th term of the *upper central series* of  $G$ , the  $m$ th term of the *lower central series* of  $G$ , the *minimum number of generators* of  $G$  and the *Fratini subgroup* of  $G$ , respectively. The *nilpotency class* and the *exponent* of a finite group  $G$  are denoted by  $\text{cl}(G)$  and  $\exp(G)$ , respectively. A finite  $p$ -group  $G$  of order  $p^n$  with  $\text{cl}(G) = n - c$  is said to be of *co-class*  $c$ . For a finite  $p$ -group  $G$ , we write  $\Omega_1(G) = \langle g \in G \mid g^p = 1 \rangle$ . All other unexplained notation, if any, are standard.

## 2. Main results

Since the conjecture is true for all finite  $p$ -groups  $G$  having nilpotency class 2 and 3, we consider only finite  $p$ -groups  $G$  with  $\text{cl}(G) \geq 4$ .

**THEOREM 2.1.** *Let  $G$  be a finite  $p$ -group ( $p > 2$ ) of class  $n$  such that  $|\gamma_n(G)| = \exp(\gamma_{n-1}(G)) = p$  and  $Z(C_G(x)) \leq \gamma_{n-1}(G)$  for all  $x \in \gamma_{n-1}(G) \setminus Z(G)$ . Then,  $G$  has a noninner automorphism of order  $p$  that fixes  $\Phi(G)$  element-wise.*

**PROOF.** Since  $n = \text{cl}(G) \geq 4$  and  $\exp(\gamma_{n-1}(G)) = p$ , there exists an element  $x \in \gamma_{n-1}(G) \setminus Z(G)$  of order  $p$ . Thus,  $[x, G] \subseteq \gamma_n(G)$  and, therefore, the order of the conjugacy class of  $x$  in  $G$  is  $p$ . It follows that  $M = C_G(x)$  is a maximal subgroup of  $G$ . Let  $g \in G \setminus M$ . Then,

$$(gx)^p = g^p x^p [x, g]^{p(p-1)/2} = g^p.$$

Consider the map  $\beta$  of  $G$  defined by  $\beta(g) = gx$  and  $\beta(m) = m$  for all  $m \in M$ . The map  $\beta$  can be extended to an automorphism of  $G$  fixing  $\Phi(G)$  element-wise and of order  $p$ . We claim that  $\beta$  is a noninner automorphism of  $G$ . For a contradiction, assume that  $\beta = \theta_y$ , the inner automorphism of  $G$  induced by some  $y \in G$ , which implies that  $y \in C_G(M)$ . If  $y \notin M$ , then  $G = M\langle y \rangle$ . It follows that  $y \in Z(G)$ , which is a contradiction. Therefore,  $y \in Z(M)$ . Since  $\beta = \theta_y$ , we have  $g^{-1}\theta_y(g) = [g, y] = x$ . Now, by the hypothesis that  $Z(C_G(x)) \leq \gamma_{n-1}(G)$  for all  $x \in \gamma_{n-1}(G) \setminus Z(G)$ , we have  $y \in \gamma_{n-1}(G)$ . Therefore,

$$x = [g, y] \in \gamma_n(G) \leq Z(G),$$

which contradicts our choice of  $x$  in  $G$ . Hence,  $G$  has a noninner automorphism of order  $p$  that fixes  $\Phi(G)$  element-wise.  $\square$

Let  $G$  be a finite  $p$ -group such that  $|Z(G)| = p$ . Let  $M$  be any maximal subgroup of  $G$ . Since  $Z(M)$  is a characteristic subgroup of  $M$  and  $M$  is a normal subgroup of  $G$ , it follows that  $Z(M)$  is a normal subgroup of  $G$ . Thus,  $Z(G) \leq Z(M)$  for all maximal subgroups  $M$  of  $G$ . We obtain the following corollary from Theorem 2.1.

**COROLLARY 2.2.** *Let  $G$  be a finite  $p$ -group ( $p > 2$ ) of class  $n$  such that  $|Z(G)| = \exp(\gamma_{n-1}(G)) = p$  and  $Z(C_G(x)) \leq \gamma_{n-1}(G)$  for all  $x \in \gamma_{n-1}(G) \setminus Z(G)$ . Then,  $G$  has a noninner automorphism of order  $p$  that fixes  $\Phi(G)$  element-wise.*

**COROLLARY 2.3.** *Let  $G$  be a finite  $p$ -group ( $p > 2$ ) of class  $n$  such that  $|Z(G)| = p$  and  $Z(M) = \gamma_{n-1}(G)$  is of exponent  $p$  for all maximal subgroups  $M$  of  $G$ . Then,  $G$  has a noninner automorphism of order  $p$  that fixes  $\Phi(G)$  element-wise.*

**PROOF.** Given that  $\text{cl}(G) = n$ . It follows that  $\gamma_n(G) \leq Z(G)$ . Consequently,  $|\gamma_n(G)| = p$ . Considering the hypothesis that  $Z(M) = \gamma_{n-1}(G)$  is of exponent  $p$  for all maximal subgroups  $M$  of  $G$  and the proof of Theorem 2.1, we deduce that  $Z(C_G(x)) \leq \gamma_{n-1}(G)$  for all  $x \in \gamma_{n-1}(G) \setminus Z(G)$ . Hence, it follows from Theorem 2.1 that  $G$  possesses a noninner automorphism of order  $p$  that fixes  $\Phi(G)$  element-wise.  $\square$

**COROLLARY 2.4.** *Let  $G$  be a finite 3-group of order  $3^n$  and of co-class 3 such that  $Z(M) = \gamma_{n-4}(G)$  is of exponent 3 for all maximal subgroups  $M$  of  $G$ . Then,  $G$  has a noninner automorphism of order 3.*

**PROOF.** Assume that  $G$  does not possess any noninner automorphism of order 3. Then, it follows from [2, Corollary 2.3] that

$$d(Z_2(G)/Z(G)) = d(Z(G))d(G). \quad (2.1)$$

Since  $G$  is of co-class 3, we have  $p^i \leq |Z_i(G)| \leq p^{i+2}$  for all  $1 \leq i \leq n-4$ . Thus, by (2.1),  $d(Z(G)) = 1$ . Now, if  $|Z(G)| = p^3$ , then  $|Z_2(G)| = p^4$ , which contradicts (2.1). Further,  $|Z(G)|$  cannot be  $p^2$  according to [14, Theorem 4.3]. Finally, assume that  $|Z(G)| = p$ . In this case, the conclusion follows from Corollary 2.3.  $\square$

The following example of a 3-group of order  $3^7$  supports Theorem 2.1.

**EXAMPLE 2.5.** Consider the group:  $G = \langle f_1, f_2, f_3, f_4, f_5, f_6, f_7 \rangle$  with relations:

$$\begin{aligned} f_3 &= [f_2, f_1], & f_4 &= f_1^3, & f_5 &= [f_3, f_1], & f_6 &= [f_3, f_2], & f_7 &= [f_5, f_1], & f_7^2 &= [f_4, f_2], \\ f_2^3 &= f_3^3 = f_4^3 = f_5^3 = f_6^3 = f_7^3 = [f_4, f_1] = [f_6, f_1] = [f_7, f_1] = [f_5, f_2] = [f_6, f_2] \\ &= [f_7, f_2] = [f_4, f_3] = [f_5, f_3] = [f_6, f_3] = [f_7, f_3] = [f_5, f_4] = [f_6, f_4] = [f_7, f_4] \\ &= [f_6, f_5] = [f_7, f_5] = [f_7, f_6] = 1. \end{aligned}$$

Then:

- $|G| = 3^7$ ;
- the nilpotency class of  $G$  is 4;
- $Z(G) = \langle f_6, f_7 \rangle$ ;
- $\Phi(G) = \langle f_3, f_4, f_5, f_6, f_7 \rangle$ ;
- $\gamma_3(G) = \langle f_5, f_6, f_7 \rangle$ ;
- $\gamma_4(G) = \langle f_7 \rangle$ .

Let  $x = f_5$  and  $M = C_G(x)$ . Then,  $x \in \gamma_3(G) \setminus Z(G)$  is of order 3 and  $Z(M) = \langle f_5, f_6, f_7 \rangle = \gamma_3(G)$ . Consider the automorphism defined by

$$\begin{aligned} \alpha(f_1 f_4^2 f_5 f_6^2 f_7^2) &= f_1 f_4^2 f_5^2 f_6^2 f_7^2, \\ \alpha(f_1 f_3 f_5 f_6^2) &= f_1 f_3 f_5^2 f_6^2, \\ \alpha(f_1^2 f_2^2 f_3 f_4^2 f_6) &= f_1^2 f_2^2 f_3 f_4^2 f_5^2 f_6 f_7. \end{aligned}$$

By using the relators of  $G$ , we find  $\alpha(f_i) = f_i$  for all  $i \in \{2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7\}$  and  $\alpha(f_1) = f_1 f_5$ . It is easy to verify that  $\alpha$  is a noninner automorphism of order 3 which fixes  $\Phi(G)$  element-wise.

We conclude the paper by giving an elementary and short proof of [8, Theorem 1.1].

**THEOREM 2.6.** *Let  $G$  be a finite nonabelian  $p$ -group. If  $G$  fails to fulfil the condition  $Z_2^*(G) \leq C_G(Z_2^*(G)) = \Phi(G)$ , where  $Z_2^*(G)/Z(G) = \Omega_1(Z_2(G)/Z(G))$ , then  $G$  has a noninner automorphism of order  $p$  leaving  $\Phi(G)$  element-wise fixed.*

**PROOF.** Let  $G$  be a finite nonabelian  $p$ -group such that at least one of the following holds:  $Z_2^*(G) \not\leq C_G(Z_2^*(G))$  or  $C_G(Z_2^*(G)) \neq \Phi(G)$ . Assume that  $G$  does not possess any noninner automorphism of order  $p$  that fixes  $\Phi(G)$  element-wise. Observe that  $Z_2^*(G) = \{z \in Z_2(G) \mid z^p \in Z(G)\}$ . Let  $x \in Z_2^*(G)$ ,  $y \in G'$  and  $z^p \in G^p$ . Then,  $[x, y] = 1$  and  $[x, z] \in Z(G)$ . Now,

$$[x, yz^p] = [x, z^p][x, y][x, y, z^p] = [x, z^p] = [x^p, z] = 1.$$

Therefore, it follows from [5, Theorem] that  $Z_2^*(G) \leq C_G(\Phi(G)) = Z(\Phi(G))$ . This implies that  $Z_2^*(G) \leq C_G(Z_2^*(G))$ .

Next, we prove that  $C_G(Z_2^*(G)) = \Phi(G)$ . Let  $M$  be a maximal subgroup of  $G$  and let  $g \in G - M$ . Let  $z \in Z(G) \cap M$  be of order  $p$ . Then, the map  $\alpha : G \rightarrow G$ , defined

by  $\alpha(mg^i) = mg^i z^i$  for all  $m \in M$ , is easily seen to be an automorphism of order  $p$  that fixes  $\Phi(G)$  element-wise. By assumption,  $\alpha = \theta_{a_M}$ , the inner automorphism induced by some  $a_M \in G$ . It is easy to check that  $a_M \in Z_2^*(G)$  and  $M = C_G(a_M)$ . Since  $[Z_2^*(G), \Phi(G)] = 1$ , we have  $\Phi(G) \leq C_G(Z_2^*(G))$ . It follows that

$$\Phi(G) \leq C_G(Z_2^*(G)) \leq \bigcap_M C_G(a_M) = \bigcap_M M = \Phi(G).$$

Hence,  $Z_2^*(G) \leq C_G(Z_2^*(G)) = \Phi(G)$ , which is a contradiction.  $\square$

### Acknowledgements

The first author is thankful to Dr. MSG for guidance. The second author expresses deep thanks to the National Institute of Science Education and Research, Bhubaneswar, India for supporting the post-doctoral research.

### References

- [1] A. Abdollahi, 'Finite  $p$ -groups of class 2 have noninner automorphisms of order  $p$ ', *J. Algebra* **312**(2) (2007), 876–879.
- [2] A. Abdollahi, 'Powerful  $p$ -groups have non-inner automorphisms of order  $p$  and some cohomology', *J. Algebra* **323**(3) (2010), 779–789.
- [3] A. Abdollahi, M. Ghoraiishi and B. Wilkens, 'Finite  $p$ -groups of class 3 have noninner automorphisms of order  $p$ ', *Beitr. Algebra Geom.* **54**(1) (2013), 363–381.
- [4] A. Abdollahi, S. M. Ghoraiishi, Y. Guerboussa, M. Reguiat and B. Wilkens, 'Noninner automorphisms of order  $p$  for finite  $p$ -groups of coclass 2', *J. Group Theory* **17**(2) (2014) 267–272.
- [5] M. Deaconescu and G. Silberberg, 'Noninner automorphisms of order  $p$  of finite  $p$ -groups', *J. Algebra* **250**(1) (2002), 283–287.
- [6] R. Garg and M. Singh, 'Finite  $p$ -groups with non-cyclic center have a non-inner automorphism of order  $p$ ', *Arch. Math. (Basel)* **117**(2) (2021), 129–132.
- [7] S. M. Ghoraiishi, 'A note on automorphisms of finite  $p$ -groups', *Bull. Aust. Math. Soc.* **87**(1) (2013), 24–26.
- [8] S. M. Ghoraiishi, 'On noninner automorphisms of finite nonabelian  $p$ -groups', *Bull. Aust. Math. Soc.* **89**(2) (2014), 202–209.
- [9] S. M. Ghoraiishi, 'On noninner automorphisms of finite  $p$ -groups that fix the Frattini subgroup elementwise', *J. Algebra Appl.* **17**(1) (2018), Article no. 1850137.
- [10] S. M. Ghoraiishi, 'Noninner automorphisms of order  $p$  for finite  $p$ -groups of restricted coclass', *Arch. Math. (Basel)* **117**(4) (2021), 361–368.
- [11] E. I. Khukhro and V. D. Mazurov, *Unsolved Problems in Group Theory: The Kourovka Notebook*, No. 20, Russian Academy of Sciences, Siberian Branch (Sobolev Institute of Mathematics, Novosibirsk, 2022).
- [12] H. Liebeck, 'Outer automorphisms in nilpotent  $p$ -groups of class 2', *J. Lond. Math. Soc. (2)* **40**(1) (1965), 268–275.
- [13] J. J. Rotman, *An Introduction to Homological Algebra*, 2nd edn, Universitext (Springer, New York, 2009).
- [14] M. Ruscitti, L. Legarreta and M. K. Yadav, 'Non-inner automorphisms of order  $p$  in finite  $p$ -groups of coclass 3', *Monatsh. Math.* **183**(4) (2017), 679–697.
- [15] M. Shabani-Attar, 'Existence of noninner automorphisms of order  $p$  in some finite  $p$ -groups', *Bull. Aust. Math. Soc.* **87**(2) (2013), 272–277.

SANDEEP SINGH, Department of Mathematics,  
Akal University, Talwandi Sabo, Punjab 151302, India  
e-mail: [sandeepinsan86@gmail.com](mailto:sandeepinsan86@gmail.com)

ROHIT GARG, Department of Mathematics,  
Government Ripudaman College, Nabha, Punjab 147201, India  
and  
School of Mathematical Sciences,  
National Institute of Science Education and Research,  
Bhubaneswar, HBNI, P.O. Jatni, Khurda, Odisha 752050, India  
e-mail: [rohitgarg289@gmail.com](mailto:rohitgarg289@gmail.com), [rohitgarg289@niser.ac.in](mailto:rohitgarg289@niser.ac.in)

HEMANT KALRA, Department of Mathematics,  
Guru Jambheshwar University of Science and Technology,  
Hisar, Haryana 125001, India  
e-mail: [happykalra26@gmail.com](mailto:happykalra26@gmail.com)