

BBS

Behavioral & Brain Sciences

An International journal of current research and theory
with open peer commentary

Volume 37 | Issue 2 | April 2014 | ISSN: 0140-525X

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Behavioral and Brain Sciences

Editors

Paul Bloom
Barbara L. Finlay

URL: <http://www.editorialmanager.com/bbs>

E-mail: bbsjournal@cambridge.org

Behavioral and Brain Sciences
Journals Department
Cambridge University Press
32 Avenue of The Americas
New York, NY 10013-2473, U.S.A.

Managing Editor

Gennifer Levey

Chief Copy Editor

Sumitra Mukerji

Proofreaders

Sylvia Elvin
Rashidah Ismaili AbuBakr

Editorial Board

Affective Neuroscience

Stephanie D. Preston/U. of Michigan

Atypical Neurodevelopment

Simon Baron-Cohen/Cambridge U.

Behavioral Neurogenetics

Wim E. Crusio/CNRS UMR

Cognition and Artificial Intelligence

Zenon Pylyshyn/Rutgers U.

Cognitive and Decision Sciences

Nick Chater/University College London

Cognitive Development

Annette Karmiloff-Smith/Birbeck College

Cognitive Neuroscience

Moshe Bar/Gonda Multidisciplinary
Brain Research Center

Computational Neuroscience

Nestor A. Schmajuk/Duke U.

Evolution of Brain and Cognition

Dean Falk/Florida State U.

Evolution of Cognition

Celia Heyes/Oxford U.

Experimental Analysis of Behavior

A. Charles Catania/U. Maryland, Baltimore County

Language and Language Disorders

Max Coltheart/Macquarie U.

Linguistics

Robert A. Freidin/Princeton U.

Perception

Bruce Bridgeman/U. of California, Santa Cruz

Philosophy of Science

Massimo Piattelli-Palmarini/U. of Arizona

Primate Cognition

Laurie R. Santos/Yale U.

Social Cognition

Mahzarin R. Banaji/Harvard U.

Social Cognitive Neuroscience

Rebecca Saxe/MIT

Vision, Language and Computation

Shimon Edelman/Cornell U.

FOUNDING EDITOR (1978–2001)

Stevan Harnad

Editorial Policy *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (BBS) is an international journal providing a special service called Open Peer Commentary* to researchers in any area of psychology, neuroscience, behavioral biology, or cognitive science who wish to solicit, from fellow specialists within and across these BBS disciplines, multiple responses to a particularly significant and controversial piece of work. (See Instructions for Authors and Commentators, inside back cover and also at <http://journals.cambridge.org/BBSJournal/Inst>) The purpose of this service is to contribute to the communication, criticism, stimulation, and particularly the unification of research in the behavioral and brain sciences, from molecular neurobiology to artificial intelligence and the philosophy of mind.

Papers judged by the editors and referees to be appropriate for Commentary are circulated to a large number of commentators selected by the editors, referees, and author to provide substantive criticism, interpretation, elaboration, and pertinent complementary and supplementary material from a full cross-disciplinary perspective. The article, accepted commentaries, and the author's response then appear simultaneously in BBS.

Commentary on BBS articles may be provided by any qualified professional in the behavioral and brain sciences, but much of it is drawn from a large body of BBS Associates who have become formally affiliated with the project (see <http://journals.cambridge.org/BBSJournal/BBSAssoc>).

Qualified professionals are eligible to become BBS Associates if they have (1) been nominated by a current BBS Associate, (2) refereed for BBS, or (3) had a commentary or article accepted for publication. A special subscription rate is available to Associates. Individuals interested in serving as BBS Associates are asked to view the full instructions for joining at <http://journals.cambridge.org/BBSJournal/Inst/Assoc> and then email bbsjournal@cambridge.org.

© Cambridge University Press 2014. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopying, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. Policies, request forms, and contacts are available at: <http://www.cambridge.org/rights/permissions/permission.htm>.

Permission to copy (for users in the U.S.A.) is available from Copyright Clearance Center, <http://www.copyright.com>, email: info@copyright.com.

Subscriptions *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (ISSN 0140-525X) is published bimonthly in February, April, June, August, October, and December. The subscription price of Volume 37 (2014) for institutions is US \$1391.00 for print and online and US \$1118.00 for online only in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; and UK £820.00 for print and online and UK £661.00 for online only elsewhere. The subscription price for individuals is US \$392.00 for print and online and US \$353.00 for online only in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; and UK £229.00 for print and online and UK £208.00 for online only elsewhere. For BBS Associates, with proof of eligibility with order, US \$139.00 in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; and UK £87.00 elsewhere. For students, with proof of eligibility with order, \$116.00 in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; and UK £68.00 elsewhere. Subscription price includes surface postage. Single parts cost US \$263.00 (UK £131.00) plus postage. Institutional orders may be sent to a bookseller, or, in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico direct to: Cambridge University Press, 32 Avenue of The Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473 email: journals_subscriptions@cambridge.org; in the U.K. and rest of the world to: Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, England, e-mail: journals_subscriptions@cambridge.cam.ac.uk. Individuals must order direct from the Press. You may also subscribe through the Cambridge Journals website, <http://journals.cambridge.org/bbs>.

Postmaster: Send address changes in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico to *Behavioral and Brain Sciences*, Cambridge University Press, Journals Dept., 100 Brook Hill Drive, West Nyack, NY 10994-2133, U.S.A. Send address change elsewhere to *Behavioral and Brain Sciences*, Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, England.

Online availability *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* is part of the Cambridge Journals Online (CJO) service at <http://journals.cambridge.org>.

Institutional subscribers: Access to full-text articles online is currently included with the cost of the print subscription. Subscription must be activated; see <http://cambridge.journals.org>.

Advertising Inquiries about advertising should be sent to the Journals Advertising Department of the Cambridge or New York Office of Cambridge University Press.

*Modelled on the "CA Comment" service of the journal *Current Anthropology*.

Contents Volume 37:2 April 2014

Huang, J. Y. & Bargh, J. A. The Selfish Goal: Autonomously operating motivational structures as the proximate cause of human judgment and behavior	121
Open Peer Commentary	
Ainslie, G. Selfish goals must compete for the common currency of reward	135
Baumeister, R. F. & Winegard, B. M. Fashioning a selfish self amid selfish goals	136
Becker, D. V. & Kenrick, D. T. Selfish goals serve more fundamental social and biological goals	137
Bliss-Moreau, E. & Williams, L. A. Tag, you're it: Affect tagging promotes goal formation and selection	138
Carruthers, P. Unconsciously competing goals can collaborate or compromise as well as win or lose	139
Conroy-Beam, D. & Buss, D. M. A deeper integration of Selfish Goal Theory and modern evolutionary psychology	140
Cuzen, N. L., Fineberg, N. A. & Stein, D. J. Unconscious habit systems in compulsive and impulsive disorders	141
Eitam, B. & Higgins, E. T. What's in a goal? The role of motivational relevance in cognition and action	141
Fedyk, M. & Kushnir, T. Development links psychological causes to evolutionary explanations	142
Fishbach, A. The motivational self is more than the sum of its goals	143
Hirsh, J. B. Mapping the goal space: Personality integration and higher-order goals	144
Huebner, B. & Rupert, R. D. Massively representational minds are not always driven by goals, conscious or otherwise	145
Kay, A. C. & Jost, J. T. Theoretical integration in motivational science: System justification as one of many "autonomous motivational structures"	146
Kopetz, C., Hofmann, W. & Wiers, R. W. H. J. On the selection and balancing of multiple selfish goals	147
Mattei, T. A. The validity of Dawkins's selfish gene theory and the role of the unconscious in decision making	148
Mazzone, M. The effects of being conscious: Looking for the right evidence	149
Merker, B. Genes, hosts, goals: Disentangling causal dependencies	150
Moskowitz, G. B. & Balcetis, E. The conscious roots of selfless, unconscious goals	151
Müller, C. P. & Amato, D. Winner takes it all: Addiction as an example for selfish goal dominance	152
Nanay, B. Unconscious goals: Specific or unspecific? The potential harm of the goal/gene analogy	152
Neuberg, S. L. & Schaller, M. The selfish goal meets the selfish gene	153
Pezzulo, G. Goals reconfigure cognition by modulating predictive processes in the brain	154
Spurrett, D. Cui bono? Selfish goals need to pay their way	155
Sripada, C., Swain, J. D., Ho, S. S. & Swain, J. E. Automatic goals and conscious regulation in social cognitive affective neuroscience	156
von Hippel, W. & von Hippel, F. A. Goals are not selfish	157
Washington, N. & Kelly, D. Should an individual composed of selfish goals be held responsible for her actions?	158
Authors' Response	
Huang, J. Y. & Bargh, J. A. Multitudes of perspectives: Integrating the Selfish Goal model with views on scientific metaphors, goal systems, and society	159

Cook, R., Bird, G., Catmur, C., Press, C. & Heyes, C. Mirror neurons: From origin to function

177

Open Peer Commentary:

Behme, C. The role of mirror neurons in language acquisition and evolution	192	Khalil, E. L. Deciphering mirror neurons: Rational decision versus associative learning	206
Bertenthal, B. I. The insufficiency of associative learning for explaining development: Three challenges to the associative account	193	Kilner, J. M. & Friston, K. J. Relating the “mirrorness” of mirror neurons to their origins	207
Bonaiuto, J. Associative learning is necessary but not sufficient for mirror neuron development	194	Krogh-Jespersen, S., Filippi, C. & Woodward, A. L. A developmental perspective on action and social cognition	208
Brass, M. & Muhle-Karbe, P. S. More than associations: An ideomotor perspective on mirror neurons	195	Lingnau, A. & Caramazza, A. The origin and function of mirror neurons: The missing link	209
Brown, E. C. & Brüne, M. Reward in the mirror neuron system, social context, and the implications on psychopathology	196	Lotem, A. & Kolodny, O. Reconciling genetic evolution and the associative learning account of mirror neurons through data-acquisition mechanisms	210
de la Rosa, S. & Bühlhoff, H. H. Motor-visual neurons and action recognition in social interactions	197	Martin, A. & Santos, L. R. Understanding the role of mirror neurons in action understanding will require more than a domain-general account	211
Duran, N. D., Dale, R. & Richardson, D. C. A mass assembly of associative mechanisms: A dynamical systems account of natural social interaction	198	Newman, J. D. Vocal coordination and vocal imitation: A role for mirror neurons?	211
Fogassi, L. Mirror mechanism and dedicated circuits are the scaffold for mirroring processes	199	Oberman, L. M., Hubbard, E. M. & McCleery, J. P. Associative learning alone is insufficient for the evolution and maintenance of the human mirror neuron system	212
Gallese, V. & Sinigaglia, C. Understanding action with the motor system	199	Oosterhof, N. N., Wiggett, A. J. & Cross, E. S. Testing key predictions of the associative account of mirror neurons in humans using multivariate pattern analysis	213
Gervais, M. M. Evolution after mirror neurons: Tapping the shared manifold through secondary adaptation	200	Orban, G. A. The mirror system in human and nonhuman primates	215
Giese, M. A. Mirror representations innate versus determined by experience: A viewpoint from learning theory	201	Provine, R. R. Contagious behavior: An alternative approach to mirror-like phenomena	216
Heil, L., van Pelt, S., Kwisthout, J., van Rooij, I. & Bekkering, H. Higher-level processes in the formation and application of associations during action understanding	202	Reader, S. M. Experiential effects on mirror systems and social learning: Implications for social intelligence	217
Ho, S. S., MacDonald, A. & Swain, J. E. Associative and sensorimotor learning for parenting involves mirror neurons under the influence of oxytocin	203	Rizzolatti, G. Confounding the origin and function of mirror neurons	218
Holt, L. L. & Lotto, A. J. The alluring but misleading analogy between mirror neurons and the motor theory of speech	204	Saygin, A. P. & Dick, F. The emergence of mirror-like response properties from domain-general principles in vision and audition	219
Keysers, C., Perrett, D. I. & Gazzola, V. Hebbian Learning is about contingency, not contiguity, and explains the emergence of predictive mirror neurons	205	Simpson, E. A., Fox, N. A., Tramacere, A. & Ferrari, P. F. Neonatal imitation and an epigenetic account of mirror neuron development	220
		Authors’ Response:	
		Catmur, C., Press, C., Cook, R., Bird, G. & Heyes, C. Mirror neurons: Tests and testability	221