

## SIMPLE LINKS IN LOCALLY COMPACT CONNECTED HAUSDORFF SPACES ARE NONDEGENERATE

DAVID JOHN

**1. Introduction.** The fact that simple links in locally compact connected metric spaces are nondegenerate was probably first established by C. Kuratowski and G. T. Whyburn in [2], where it is proved for Peano continua. J. L. Kelley in [3] established it for arbitrary metric continua, and A. D. Wallace extended the theorem to Hausdorff continua in [4]. In [1], B. Lehman proved this theorem for locally compact, locally connected Hausdorff spaces. We will show that the locally connected property is not necessary.

**2. Definitions.** A *continuum* is a compact connected Hausdorff space. For any two points  $a$  and  $b$  of a connected space  $M$ ,  $E(a, b)$  denotes the set of all points of  $M$  which separate  $a$  from  $b$  in  $M$ . The *interval*  $ab$  of  $M$  is the set  $E(a, b) \cup \{a, b\}$ .

The following theorem appears in [7], where it is proved only for the metric case. The proof of the non-metric case was established in [5].

**THEOREM 1.** *If  $M$  is a connected space,  $a$  and  $b$  are points of  $M$ ,  $p$  is a point of  $M$  not in the interval  $ab$  of  $M$ , and  $M$  is semi-locally connected at  $p$ , then there exists a closed connected subset  $N$  of  $M$  such that  $a$  and  $b$  are points in  $N$  and  $N$  is a subset of  $M - \{p\}$ .*

The following theorem appears in [6]; however, it is stated only for metric spaces and only a suggestion for the proof is given which does not generalize to non-metric spaces.

**THEOREM 2.** *If the connected space  $M$  is semi-locally connected at  $p$  and  $M - \{p\}$  has exactly  $k$  components, then for each open set  $U$  containing  $p$ , there exists an open set  $V$  containing  $p$  such that  $V \subset U$  and  $M - V$  has exactly  $k$  components.*

*Proof.* Let

$$M - \{p\} = \bigcup_{i=1}^k K_i,$$

where  $K_i$  is a component of  $M - \{p\}$  for  $i = 1, \dots, k$ . Let  $U$  be an open set containing  $p$  and let  $p_i$  be a point of  $K_i$  for  $i = 1, \dots, k$ . There exists

---

Received May 10, 1980 and in revised form October 7, 1981.

an open set  $W$  such that  $p \in W$ ,  $W \subset U$ ,  $p_i \notin W$  for  $i = 1, \dots, k$ , and

$$M - W = \bigcup_{j=1}^n C_j,$$

where  $C_j$  is a component of  $M - W$  for  $j = 1, \dots, n$ . Now  $n \geq k$ , and each  $C_j$  is a subset of some  $K_i$ . Let  $x_j$  be a point in  $C_j$  for  $j = 1, \dots, n$ , and let  $\{C_j | 1 \leq j \leq m\}$  be the collection of all components of  $M - W$  that are subsets of  $K_1$ . Since  $p$  is not in the interval  $x_1 x_j$  for  $j = 2, \dots, m$ , it follows from Theorem 1 that there exist closed connected sets  $A_j$  for  $j = 2, \dots, m$  such that  $x_1$  and  $x_j$  are points in  $A_j$  and  $p \notin A_j$ . Let

$$B_1 = \bigcup_{j=2}^m A_j.$$

Thus  $B_1$  is a closed connected set.

Now for each  $i = 1, \dots, k$ , there exists a closed connected set  $B_i$  such that if  $x_j \in K_i$ , then  $x_j \in B_i$  and  $p \notin B_i$ . There exists an open set  $G$  such that

$$p \in G, G \subset W, G \cap \bigcup_{i=1}^k B_i = \emptyset,$$

and  $M - G$  has only finitely many components,  $D_1, \dots, D_h$ . Clearly  $h \geq k$ . Since  $B_i$  is a connected subset of  $M - G$  for  $i = 1, \dots, k$ , let  $B_i$  be a subset of  $D_i$  for  $i = 1, \dots, k$ .

Let  $\{C_r | r = 1, \dots, l\}$  be the components of  $M - W$  such that  $C_r \cap B_i \neq \emptyset$  for a fixed  $i$ , where  $1 \leq i \leq k$ . Since  $C_r \subset M - W$  and  $\bigcup_{r=1}^l C_r \cup B_i$  is connected,

$$\bigcup_{r=1}^l C_r \cup B_i \subset D_i.$$

Let

$$V = W - \bigcup_{i=1}^k D_i.$$

$V$  is open and

$$M - V = M - W \cup \bigcup_{i=1}^k D_i.$$

Now

$$M - W = \bigcup_j^n C_j \quad \text{and}$$

$$\bigcup_j^n C_j \subset \bigcup_{i=1}^k D_i.$$

Hence

$$M - V = \bigcup_{i=1}^k D_i,$$

and it follows that  $M - V$  has exactly  $k$  components.

**THEOREM 3.** *If  $p$  is a non-cut point of the connected space  $M$ , and  $M$  is semi-locally connected at  $p$ , then for each open set  $U$  containing  $p$ , there exists an open subset  $V$  of  $U$  containing  $p$  such that  $M - V$  is connected.*

*Proof.* Since  $M - \{p\}$  has only one component, let  $k = 1$  in Theorem 2.

*Definitions.* If  $\{M_\alpha, \alpha \in \mathcal{A}\}$  is a net of sets, then  $\liminf M_\alpha$  is the set of all points  $p$  such that for each open set  $U$  containing  $p$ , there exists  $b \in \mathcal{A}$  such that for each  $\alpha > b, \alpha \in \mathcal{A}, M_\alpha$  intersects  $U$ . The  $\limsup M_\alpha$  is the set of all points  $p$  such that for each open set  $U$  containing  $p$  and for each  $b \in \mathcal{A}$ , there exists  $\alpha \in \mathcal{A}$  such that  $\alpha > b$  and  $M_\alpha$  intersects  $U$ . If

$$\liminf M_\alpha = \limsup M_\alpha = L,$$

then  $L$  is denoted by  $\lim M_\alpha$  and  $\{M_\alpha, \alpha \in \mathcal{A}\}$  is said to *converge* to  $L$ . A nondegenerate continuum  $K$  in a space  $M$  is a *continuum of convergence* if and only if there is a net  $\{K_\alpha, \alpha \in \mathcal{A}\}$  of continua such that for each  $\alpha$  in  $\mathcal{A}$ ,

$$K \cap K_\alpha = \emptyset \quad \text{and} \quad K = \lim K_\alpha.$$

**THEOREM 4.** *If  $M$  is a locally compact connected space, and  $M$  is not semi-locally connected at the point  $p$  in  $M$ , then there exists an open set  $U$  containing  $p$  such that if  $V$  is a proper open subset of  $U$  containing  $p$ , then  $M - V$  has infinitely many components that intersect both  $\partial U$  and  $\partial V$ .*

*Proof.* Since  $M$  is locally compact and not semi-locally connected at  $p$ , there exists a proper open subset  $U$  of  $M$  such that  $p \in U, \bar{U}$  is compact, and for each open set  $G$  with  $p \in G$  and  $G \subset U, M - G$  has infinitely many components. Let  $G$  be an open subset of  $U$  containing  $p$ . Assume there exist only finitely many components that intersect both  $\partial U$  and  $\partial G$ . Let  $\mathcal{C}$  be the collection of all components of  $M - G$ . Let

$$\mathcal{H} = \{C \in \mathcal{C} / C \cap \partial G = \emptyset\},$$

$$\mathcal{K} = \{C \in \mathcal{C} / C \cap \partial U = \emptyset \quad \text{and} \quad C \cap \partial G \neq \emptyset\}, \quad \text{and}$$

$$\mathcal{L} = \{C \in \mathcal{C} / C \cap \partial U \neq \emptyset \quad \text{and} \quad C \cap \partial G \neq \emptyset\}.$$

By assumption,  $\mathcal{L}$  is finite.

If  $H \in \mathcal{H}$ , then  $H$  does not contain a limit point of  $\cup \mathcal{H}$ . If  $K \in \mathcal{K}$ , then  $K$  does not contain a limit point of  $\cup \mathcal{H}$ . Suppose there exists a point  $x$  in  $\overline{\cup \mathcal{H}} \cap \cup \mathcal{H}$ . Let  $\mathcal{W}$  be the collection of all open sets containing  $x$ . For each  $W$  in  $\mathcal{W}$ , let  $x_w \in \cup \mathcal{H} \cap U \cap W$  and let  $C_w$  be the component

of  $\bar{U} - G$  containing  $x_w$ . Since  $C_w$  is a connected subset of  $M - G$ ,  $C_w$  lies in some element of  $\mathcal{H}$ . Now,  $C_w \cap \partial G = \emptyset$ , and hence

$$C_w \cap \partial U \neq \emptyset.$$

Consider the net  $\{C_w, w \in \mathcal{W}\}$ . Since  $x \in \lim \sup C_w$ , some subnet of  $\{C_w, w \in \mathcal{W}\}$  converges to a continuum  $C$  containing  $x$ . Now  $C \cap \partial U \neq \emptyset$ , but  $C$  lies in some element of  $\mathcal{H}$ , which is a contradiction. Hence

$$\overline{\cup \mathcal{H}} \cap \cup \mathcal{H} = \emptyset.$$

Suppose there exists a point  $y$  in  $\cup \mathcal{H} \cap \overline{\cup \mathcal{H}}$ . Let  $\mathcal{E}$  be the collection of all open sets containing  $y$ . For each  $E$  in  $\mathcal{E}$ , let  $y_E \in \cup \mathcal{H} \cap U \cap E$ , and let  $C_E$  be the component of  $\bar{U} - G$  containing  $y_E$ . Since  $C_E$  is a connected subset of  $M - G$ ,  $C_E$  lies in some element of  $\mathcal{H}$ . Now  $C_E \cap \partial U = \emptyset$ , and hence  $C_E \cap \partial G \neq \emptyset$ . Consider the net  $\{C_E, E \in \mathcal{E}\}$ . Since  $y \in \lim \sup C_E$ , some subnet of  $\{C_E, E \in \mathcal{E}\}$  converges to a continuum  $D$  containing  $y$ ,  $D \cap \partial G \neq \emptyset$ , but  $D$  lies in some element of  $\mathcal{H}$ , which is a contradiction. Hence  $\cup \mathcal{H} \cap \overline{\cup \mathcal{H}} = \emptyset$ . Therefore  $\cup \mathcal{H}$  is separated from  $\cup \mathcal{H}$ .

Suppose  $\mathcal{H}$  is infinite. Since  $\mathcal{L}$  is finite, there exist separated sets  $A$  and  $B$  such that

$$\cup \mathcal{H} \cup \cup \mathcal{L} = A \cup B \quad \text{and} \quad \cup \mathcal{L} \subset B.$$

Then  $M = A \cup \cup \mathcal{H} \cup B \cup G$  and  $A$  is separated from  $\cup \mathcal{H} \cup B \cup G$ , which is a contradiction. Hence  $\mathcal{H}$  is finite. Suppose  $\mathcal{H} \neq \emptyset$ . Then  $\cup \mathcal{H}$  is separated from  $\cup \mathcal{L}$ , and hence  $\cup \mathcal{H}$  is separated from  $\cup \mathcal{H} \cup \cup \mathcal{L} \cup G$ . However,

$$M = \cup \mathcal{H} \cup \cup \mathcal{H} \cup \cup \mathcal{L} \cup G,$$

which is a contradiction, and thus  $\mathcal{H} = \emptyset$ . Therefore

$$M = \cup \mathcal{H} \cup \cup \mathcal{L} \cup G.$$

Let

$$V = M - \cup \mathcal{L} = \cup \mathcal{H} \cup G.$$

Now  $V$  is the union of  $G$  and all components of  $M - G$  lying entirely in  $U$ . Since each element  $L$  in  $\mathcal{L}$  is closed,  $V$  is open, and  $p \in V$  and  $V \subset U$ . Now  $M - V = \cup \mathcal{L}$  has only a finite number of components, which implies  $M$  is semi-locally connected at  $p$ , but this is a contradiction. Hence the theorem is proved.

**THEOREM 5.** *Let  $M$  be a connected space, and let  $U$  be a proper open subset of  $M$  such that  $\bar{U}$  is compact. If  $V$  is an open subset of  $U$  and  $C$  is a component of  $M - V$  such that  $C \cap \partial V \neq \emptyset$  and  $C \cap \partial U \neq \emptyset$ , then there exists a component  $K$  of  $\bar{U} - V$  such that  $K \subset C$ ,  $K \cap \partial V \neq \emptyset$ , and  $K \cap \partial U \neq \emptyset$ .*

*Proof.* Let  $C$ ,  $U$ , and  $V$  be as described in the hypothesis. Assume no component of  $C \cap \bar{U}$  intersects both  $\partial U$  and  $\partial V$ . Suppose  $L$  is a component of  $C \cap \bar{U}$  such that  $L \cap \partial V = \emptyset$  and  $L \cap \partial U = \emptyset$ . Then  $L$  is a component of  $U - \bar{V}$ .  $U - \bar{V}$  is a proper open subset of  $M$ , and  $\overline{U - \bar{V}}$  is compact, which implies  $L$  has a limit point in  $\partial U - \bar{V}$ . Hence  $L$  has a limit point in  $\partial U$  or in  $\partial V$ . Since  $L$  is a closed subset of  $C \cap \bar{U}$ ,  $C \cap \partial U \neq \emptyset$  or  $C \cap \partial V \neq \emptyset$ , which is a contradiction. Thus each component of  $C \cap \bar{U}$  intersects  $\partial U$  or  $\partial V$ .

Let  $\mathcal{H}$  be the collection of all components of  $C \cap \bar{U}$  that intersect  $\partial U$ , and let  $\mathcal{K}$  be the collection of all components of  $C \cap \bar{U}$  that intersect  $\partial V$ . Suppose  $\mathcal{H} = \emptyset$ . If  $\mathcal{H}$  is finite, then  $\cup \mathcal{H}$  is separated from  $C - \bar{U}$  and  $\cup \mathcal{H} \cup (C - \bar{U}) = C$ , which is a contradiction. Hence  $\mathcal{H}$  is infinite. Since  $\cup \mathcal{H} \cup (C - \bar{U}) = C$  and  $\cup \mathcal{H}$  is not separated from  $C - \bar{U}$ ,  $\cup \mathcal{H}$  has a limit point  $p$  in  $\partial U$ . Since each element of  $\mathcal{H}$  is a continuum in  $\bar{U}$ , some net of elements of  $\mathcal{H}$  converges to a continuum  $A$  containing  $p$ . Each member of this net contains a point of  $\partial V$ . Hence  $A$  intersects both  $\partial U$  and  $\partial V$ .  $C \cap \bar{U}$  is closed, and therefore  $A \subset C \cap \bar{U}$ , which contradicts our assumption that  $\mathcal{H} = \emptyset$ . If  $\mathcal{H} = \emptyset$ , then  $C = \cup \mathcal{H} \cup (C - \bar{U})$  does not intersect  $\partial U$ . Hence  $\mathcal{H} \neq \emptyset$ .

Suppose  $\cup \mathcal{H}$  contains a limit point  $q$  of  $\cup \mathcal{H}$ . Then some net of elements of  $\mathcal{H}$  converges to a continuum  $B$  containing  $q$ . Since each element of this net contains a point in  $\partial U$ ,  $B \cap \partial U \neq \emptyset$ . However,  $B$  must be a subset of the element of  $\mathcal{H}$  that contains  $q$ , which implies some element of  $\mathcal{H}$  intersects  $\partial U$ , and this is a contradiction. Hence  $\overline{\cup \mathcal{H}} \cap \cup \mathcal{H} = \emptyset$ . Similarly,  $\overline{\cup \mathcal{K}} \cap \cup \mathcal{K} = \emptyset$ . Now  $\cup \mathcal{H}$  is separated from  $C - \bar{U}$ , and thus  $\cup \mathcal{H}$  is separated from  $\cup \mathcal{H} \cup (C - \bar{U})$ . However,

$$\cup \mathcal{H} \cup \cup \mathcal{K} \cup (C - \bar{U}) = C,$$

which is a contradiction. Hence some component of  $C \cap \bar{U}$  intersects both  $\partial U$  and  $\partial V$ .

Whyburn [6] established the following:

**THEOREM 6.** *If the locally compact connected metric space  $M$  is not semi-locally connected at a point  $p \in M$ , then  $p$  lies on a continuum of convergence of  $M$ .*

Theorem 6 need not be true for non-metric spaces. However, we do get the somewhat weaker result.

**THEOREM 7.** *If  $M$  is a locally compact space and  $M$  is not semi-locally connected at the point  $p$ , then there exists a net that converges to a nondegenerate continuum  $K$  containing  $p$  such that each member of the net is a continuum of convergence.*

*Proof.* By Theorem 4, there exists an open set  $U$  containing  $p$  such that  $\bar{U}$  is compact and if  $V$  is an open set with  $p \in V$  and  $\bar{V} \subset U$ , then

$M - V$  has infinitely many components that intersect both  $\partial U$  and  $\partial V$ . Let  $\mathcal{V}$  be the collection of all open subsets of  $U$  such that for each element  $V$  in  $\mathcal{V}$ ,  $p \in V$  and  $\bar{V} \subset U$ . Let  $V$  be a fixed element of  $\mathcal{V}$ , and let  $\mathcal{C}$  be the collection of all components of  $\bar{U} - V$  that intersect both  $\partial U$  and  $\partial V$ . By Theorem 5, each component of  $M - V$  contains at least one member of  $\mathcal{C}$ . Hence  $\mathcal{C}$  is infinite.  $\bar{U} - V$  is closed, and so each member of  $\mathcal{C}$  is a continuum in the compact space  $\bar{U}$ . Hence there exists a net of elements of  $\mathcal{C}$  that converges to a continuum  $K_v$ . Since each member of the net intersects both  $\partial U$  and  $\partial V$ ,  $K_v$  intersects both  $\partial U$  and  $\partial V$ . There exists at most one element of  $C$  of this net that intersects  $K_v$ , and therefore if we delete  $C$  from this net and denote the resulting net by  $N$ , then  $K_v$  is a continuum of convergence of  $N$  in  $\bar{U} - V$ .

Consider the net  $\{K_v, v \in \mathcal{V}\}$  of continua in the compact space  $\bar{U}$ . Some subset of  $\{K_v, v \in \mathcal{V}\}$  converges to a continuum  $K$  in  $\bar{U}$ . Since each  $K_v$  intersects  $\partial U$ ,  $K$  intersects  $\partial U$ . Now let  $W$  be an open set containing  $p$ . There exists an element  $V$  in  $\mathcal{V}$  such that  $p \in V$  and  $\bar{V} \subset W$ . Hence  $K_v \cap W \neq \emptyset$ . Therefore  $p \in \lim K_v = K$ ,  $p \notin \partial U$ , and thus  $K$  is nondegenerate.

*Definitions.* Two points  $a$  and  $b$  of a connected space  $M$  are said to be *conjugate* if no point of  $M$  separates  $a$  from  $b$  in  $M$ . If  $p$  is neither a cut point nor an end point of a connected space  $M$  and  $p \in M$ , then the set consisting of  $p$  and all points of  $M$  conjugate to  $p$  is called the *simple link of  $M$  generated by  $p$* .

Theorem 8 was established in [6] for metric spaces. In proving this theorem, Whyburn utilizes Theorem 6, which is proved using sequences. His proof does not generalize to non-metric spaces.

**THEOREM 8.** *If a point  $p$  of the locally compact connected space  $M$  is neither a cut point nor an end point of  $M$ , then there exists a point  $q$  of  $M$  such that  $p \neq q$  and  $p$  is conjugate to  $q$ .*

*Proof.* Let  $p$  be a non-cut point of  $M$ . Suppose  $p$  is not conjugate to any other point of  $M$ . Assume  $M$  is not semi-locally connected at  $p$ . Then by Theorem 7, there exists a net of continua  $\{K_\alpha, \alpha \in \mathcal{A}\}$  such that each  $K_\alpha$  is a continuum of convergence and  $\{K_\alpha, \alpha \in \mathcal{A}\}$  converges to a nondegenerate continuum  $K$  containing  $p$ . Let  $q$  be a point in  $K$  different from  $p$ . Since  $p$  is not conjugate to  $q$ , there exist a point  $x$  in  $M$  and two separated sets  $A$  and  $B$  such that  $M - \{x\} = A \cup B$ ,  $q \in A$ , and  $p \in B$ . Now  $x$  must be a point in  $K$ .  $A$  is an open set containing  $q$  and  $q \in \lim K_\alpha$ , and so there exists an  $\alpha$  in  $\mathcal{A}$  such that for all  $\alpha \geq \alpha_1$ ,  $K_\alpha \cap A \neq \emptyset$ . Similarly, there exists an  $\alpha_2$  in  $\mathcal{A}$  such that for all  $\alpha \geq \alpha_2$ ,  $K_\alpha \cap B \neq \emptyset$ . Let  $\beta \in \mathcal{A}$  such that  $\beta \geq \alpha_1$  and  $\beta \geq \alpha_2$ . Then

$$K_\beta \cap A \neq \emptyset \quad \text{and} \quad K_\beta \cap B \neq \emptyset.$$

Suppose  $x \notin K_b$ . Then  $K_b$  is a connected subset of  $M - \{x\}$  which implies  $K_b \subset A$  or  $K_b \subset B$ , but this is a contradiction. Hence  $x \in K_b$ . Now  $x$  separates two points in  $K_b$ , and  $K_b$  is a continuum of convergence, but this is impossible. Hence  $M$  is semi-locally connected at  $p$ .

Let  $U$  be an open set containing  $p$  such that  $\bar{U}$  is compact. By Theorem 3, there exists an open set  $V$  such that  $p \in V$ ,  $V \subset U$ , and  $M - V$  is connected. Also,  $\bar{V}$  is compact. Let  $C$  be the component of  $V$  containing  $p$ . Since  $\partial V \cap \bar{C} \neq \emptyset$ , there is a point  $z$  in  $\partial V \cap \bar{C}$ . Now since  $z$  is not conjugate to  $p$ , there exist a point  $y$  and two separated sets  $E$  and  $F$  such that  $M - \{y\} = E \cup F$ ,  $p \in E$ , and  $z \in F$ . If  $y \notin C$ , then  $C$  is a connected subset of  $M - \{y\}$ , and  $C \cup \{z\}$  is a connected subset of  $M - \{y\}$ , which is a contradiction. Hence  $y \in C$ , and therefore  $M - V \subset F$ , which implies  $E \subset V$ .  $E$  is open and  $\partial E = \{y\}$ . Thus  $p$  is an end point of  $M$ , and the theorem is proved.

**THEOREM 9.** *Every simple link of a locally compact connected space  $M$  is nondegenerate, and every point of  $M$  is a cut point, an end point, or a point of a simple link of  $M$ .*

*Proof.* Let  $L_p$  be the simple link of  $M$  generated by  $p$ . By Theorem 8,  $p$  is conjugate to some point  $q$  in  $M$  different from  $p$ . This implies  $q \in L_p$ , and hence  $L_p$  is nondegenerate. If  $p \in M$ , and  $p$  is not a cut point and not an end point of  $M$ , then there exists a point  $q$  in  $M$  such that  $p$  is conjugate to  $q$ . Hence  $p$  is a point in the simple link of  $M$  generated by  $q$ .

## REFERENCES

1. B. Lehman, *Cyclic element theory in connected and locally connected Hausdorff spaces*, Can. J. Math. 27 (1976), 1032–1050.
2. C. Kuratowski et G. T. Whyburn, *Sur les éléments cycliques et leurs applications*, Fundamenta Mathematicae 16 (1930), 305–331.
3. J. L. Kelley, *A decomposition of compact continua and related theorems on fixed sets under continuous transformations*, Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences 26 (1940), 192–194.
4. A. D. Wallace, *Monotone transformations*, Duke Mathematical Journal 9 (1942), 487–506.
5. L. E. Ward, Jr., *A general fixed point theorem*, Colloquium Mathematicum 15 (1966), 243–251.
6. G. T. Whyburn, *Analytic topology*, First Edition, American Mathematical Society Colloquium Publications 28 (American Mathematical Society, Providence, RI, 1942).
7. ———, *Semi locally connected sets*, American Journal of Mathematics 61 (1939), 733–749.

*Missouri Western State College,  
Saint Joseph, Missouri*