

to a young Galilean rabbi who lacked all support from the people who counted (save John the Baptist), who was entirely without money, who had not been educated in the Temple, who taught a doctrine of detachment from wealth and from power ('let he who rules be as he who serves'), and who courageously showed no hesitation in expressing his entire disapproval of the means by which the priesthood kept its economic power (e.g. the cleansing of the Temple)—how could these Jerusalem authorities bring themselves to hand over the future ordering of their way of life to this rabbi, however eloquent, however sincere, however committed to the purity of Judaism?

Although their own ranks were not entirely unanimous in opposition (e.g. Nicodemus, Joseph of Arimathea), yet they had only to wait patiently until they could undermine his popular support, and they would be able to destroy him without trace. This in fact they did quite easily, but they had reckoned without his resurrection from the dead, and the fulfilment of his prediction of the doom of the City that did not understand its hour of destiny.

I hope sufficient description has been given to show that this work is an indispensable aid for serious Bible study, and that it should be in every library.

J. B. ORCHARD, O.S.B.

**A HISTORY OF CHRISTIAN SPIRITUALITY, II: The Spirituality of the Middle Ages**, by J. Leclercq, F. Vandebroucke and L. Bouyer. Translated by the Benedictines of Holme Eden Abbey, Carlisle. Burns & Oates Ltd, London, 1968. x + 602 pp. 115s.

**THE CAMBRIDGE HISTORY OF THE BIBLE, II: The West from the Fathers to the Reformation**, edited by G. W. H. Lampe. Cambridge University Press, 1969. ix + 566 pp. 70s.

In the first volume of the *History of Christian Spirituality* (1960; English translation 1963) Père Bouyer defined the history of spirituality as the study of the reactions which the objects of belief arouse in the religious consciousness of men in general and especially of those human actions which have explicit and immediate reference to God. Whereas fifty years ago P. Pourrat in his *Spiritualité chrétienne* concentrated upon the most notable of religious writers, now in this new history the canvas is more crowded and there is greater emphasis upon spirituality as both the nourishment and the creation of civilization as a whole. Thus broadly defined, the spirituality of the period from the sixth to the sixteenth century is now skilfully condensed, although at times with excessive compression of style and with too single-minded an attachment to literary evidence, into some six hundred pages by Dom Leclercq and Dom Vandebroucke and also by Père Bouyer in an evocative appendix on Byzantine developments. Pourrat's survey is now replaced by a more refined and detailed set of historical interpretations which may have the effect of deterring an affective reader without a scholar's energy or at least his *otium*. For him Pourrat should continue to be available, while for others the present volume will prove an invaluable mine of information if they are prepared to overcome the handicap of the lack of an index of topics. The English translators—whose proofs have not been well read—might have been better advised to prepare such an index and thus to

help the seeker of information on, for example, Books of Hours or frequent communion, than try patchily to improve for English readers the basically French bibliographical indications.

Dom Leclercq spans the ages from Gregory the Great to Bernard of Clairvaux, portraying first Gregory's simple, unspeculative synthesis of the treasures of the Bible, the liturgy, the Latin and some Greek Fathers, a source out of which flowed streams which developed and differentiated themselves in the barbarian west. I doubt whether anywhere else can be found a more satisfactory single account of the development in the barbarian age of the now familiar distinctions between the states of life—clerical, monastic and lay—and then of the development of what we call the Gregorian reform in terms of the continuing and competing evolution of the spiritualities proper not only to each of these states of life but also and more particularly to the new forms which sprang so prolifically from within these states. Underneath Dom Leclercq's account can be seen, as in a palimpsest, the viewpoints of the author's beautiful initiation to monastic literature, *L'amour des lettres et le désir de Dieu* (Paris 1957), for, according to Dom Leclercq, the culmination of centuries of gathering appreciation is the flowering of monastic spirituality, contemplation and theology in the age of John of Fécamp and Anselm of Canterbury, of Bernard of Clairvaux and William of St Thierry. With the appearance of the present volume Dom Leclercq's own contributions to the under-

standing of medieval monastic thought and writing will reach the wider audience which they deserve.

Dom Vandembroucke takes over from Dom Leclercq in a cautionary spirit. He notes that the emergent scholasticism of the twelfth century threatened to separate the churchman from the Gospel and 'scientific' theology from the spiritual life. The Victorines attempted to combine the two kinds of requirement but they gave so large a place to the 'unknowings' of the Pseudo-Denis that in the future it was all the more possible for religious sentiment to reject the intellectual foundations on which it should rest. Here, suggests Vandembroucke, is a turning-point more crucial than that growth of devotion to the humanity of Christ which was encouraged by Bernard of Clairvaux and by Francis of Assisi. Much of the survey of spirituality from the twelfth to the sixteenth century is polarized around this problem of the changing relationship between piety and theology, the divorce between sentimentality and the intellect, between mysticism and dogma, but also around the no less fundamental problems of agonizing conflict between the ideals of poverty and of obedience and the later substitution of contemplation for poverty as the critical issue of debate, the drift from the 'objective' contemplation of Christ's mysteries to 'subjective' devotion, the continuing anxiety, felt particularly among Seculars and Mendicants, to define rightly the states of life and of perfection, the unceasing protests against theocracy and sacramentalism and the persistent slipping away of unofficial spiritual groups from the wider community. As century follows century Dom Vandembroucke's indictments grow ever more grave, for with the *Devotio moderna* 'the spiritual life became a fact of experience, valid as such—no longer the experience of a fact valid in itself . . . its influence on modern spirituality was prodigious'. If Dom Vandembroucke's heart seems to belong to the monastic centuries from Gregory to Bernard, his tract is for our times.

Like the *History of Christian Spirituality*, the *Cambridge History of the Bible* is to be a trilogy and the medieval volumes of the two series also share two contributors in common, Dom Leclercq and Père Bouyer. In order of publication the present volume of the *Cambridge History of the Bible*, which has been long in preparation, succeeds the third volume (1963) devoted to the modern period and precedes the first or pre-Jeromian volume which is expected

this year. Almost dramatically, with the publication of the present volume a vast world of highly specialized and continually changing scholarship is rendered widely accessible. The study of medieval Bibles, like that of medieval liturgies or of manuscript art, has been very intensively cultivated among connoisseurs, but unlike, say, the study of medieval philosophy or of the medieval religious orders, the main outlines of the subject have not hitherto been generally presented in a way that is suitable for the sizeable body of interested enquirers who need reliable information and guidance. Professor Lampe's well-edited volume lays emphasis throughout upon the Bible as scripture, as a series of (mostly manuscript) texts which were continually copied, used in prayer, explained, translated, illustrated and otherwise represented through art. With the Bible as a source of piety and morality, as the title-deed of the Church or as the foundation of cosmology or chronology or as an inspiration for imaginative literature and drama, this volume is less concerned. Even within these understandable and proper limitations the subject can by no means be wholly covered. Thus Greek Bibles in the medieval west, monastic exegesis after St Bernard or biblical interpretations by the canonists are passed over.

The book falls roughly into three main parts and into several sub-sections as well where there are essays by, for example, Professor Wormald on manuscript illustration and Père Bouyer on Erasmus. The first main part is generally concerned with the emergence in the late fourth century of what was, but only after at least nine hundred years, to become the Latin Vulgate. Here Professor Roberts affirms for the Hebrew text of the Old Testament the greater significance of medieval Spanish manuscripts than of the Dead Sea Scrolls; Jerome is detailed and the transmission of his 'Vulgate' through the early medieval centuries is summarized, with unprecedented comprehensiveness in English, by Mr R. Loewe.

The second main part consists of a series of short solo performances on the theme of Scriptural exposition and exegesis: Professor Lampe on the period to Gregory, Dom Leclercq down to St Bernard, Fr van Dijk showing his awareness of the weight of the hand of the past upon the liturgy of the present, Dr Rosenthal on the Jews whose brains were so constantly tapped in the Middle Ages, as other contributors also show, and Miss

Smalley in an essay of great freshness and vividness on the medieval Christian schools.

The third main part also consists of a set of solo discussions of particular vernacular traditions with, for example, Fr Kenelm Foster on Italian Bibles both Judaic and Christian, and Dr C. A. Robson on French Bibles. It is surely possible only for a few to read this set

of essays without being *bouleversé* by the achievement, the range and even the frequency of medieval vernacular undertakings. Almost fifty well-described plates complete the volume. The *Cambridge History of the Bible* is surely set fair to become one of the most successful and important of the Cambridge Histories.

DAVID LUSCOMBE

**LA CHARGE PASTORALE DES EVEQUES.** Texte, traduction et commentaires. Collection 'Unam Sanctam': *Les Editions du Cerf*, 1969. 466 pp.

This is the twelfth volume produced by Les Editions du Cerf under the direction of Yves Congar, O.P., with specific reference to Vatican II and the post-conciliar period. Concerned entirely with the Decree 'Christus Dominus', it first provides the Latin text with a parallel French translation. These are followed by a series of commentaries. Mgr W. Onclin of Louvain, a member of the preparatory Commission, gives a general introduction on the origin, title and structure of the Decree: and then considers in detail the rôle of bishops in the universal Church and their relationship with the Holy See. Obviously his treatment cannot be fully up to date because it does not include the recent Synod wherein the pattern of collegial relationships has developed so considerably. All the same, his assessment is of importance up to the Summer of 1969.

Father H. M. Legrand, O.P., of Saulchoir then has a commentary of more than one hundred pages on the nature of the local Church, the pastoral image of the bishop under the traditional three-fold classification, his relationship with the civil authority, the topical question of episcopal appointment and retirement, and finally the problems connected with the revision of boundaries. This is followed by an interesting documentary of the re-arrangement of the Parisian province.

Mgr R. Bézac, Bishop of Dax, then comments on the section of the Decree dealing with coadjutors and auxiliaries, and Père Boulard does the same for the diocesan curia and councils. He also has a good section on the diocesan clergy. Mgr N. Jubany, Bishop of Gerona in Spain, completes this picture regarding religious working in the pastoral field. Professor C. Munier of Strasbourg contributes an important section on national episcopal conferences and Mgr Badré, ordinary of the Forces, speaks of his own particular pastorate.

Professor Bernhard of Strasbourg gives a

most valuable commentary on the norms of implementation which have already been issued regarding four of the conciliar decrees in so far as they concern bishops and the motu proprio *De Episcoporum Muneribus*

Altogether, this is a remarkable volume and covers the whole historical, theological and canonical fields far more thoroughly than anything else we have seen. It seems to me both fuller and better arranged than, for example, the Commentary edited by Herbert Vorgrimmler which has been translated from the original German and published in this country. On the other hand, all works of the calibre of these are greatly to be welcomed and in one way there cannot be too many of them if, as in this case, they restore a balance of expert and legitimate theological pondering on the great conciliar decrees. Until now, our libraries were flabby with paper-backs and although there is a need to popularize contemporary theological thought this can rarely be done with any dependability until the great commentaries have become available and been fully pondered themselves.

It is fascinating for one who is also a bishop, and who has by virtue of his office to be implementing the conciliar decrees, at any rate experimentally, in the purely pastoral field. Theory generally precedes practice. In this case, however, there is a continual existential reciprocation which is playing its part in the development of both and we should be unrealistic if we did not face the fact that mistakes are likely to be made in both categories. Indeed, one of the great advantages of the Editions du Cerf series is that the close interaction of theory and practice is fairly constantly exemplified.

Clearly, one could ruminate at great length on the many different aspects of the Decree and the commentaries which have followed. I find in doing so—and to keep issues really clear—one has constantly to be returning to the great and lengthy chapter three of *Lumen Gentium* of which *Christus Dominus* is the