



JOURNAL OF Law and Religion

VOLUME XXVI NUMBER 1 2010-11

ARTICLES

The Morality of Human Rights: A Secular Ground
Dohrman W. Byers

Can There be a Religion of Reasons? A Response to Leiter's
Circular Conception of Religious Belief
Jeffrey M. Lipshaw

A Plurality of Discontent: Legal Pluralism, Religious
Adjudication and the State
Adam S. Hofri-Winogradow

What is Truth? Setting the Bounds of Justiciability in
Religiously-Inflected Fact Disputes
Caleb E. Mason

"I am one of the People": A Survey and Analysis of Legal
Arguments on Woman-Led Prayer in Islam
Ahmed Elewa and Laury Silvers

The Paradox of the Global and the Local in the Financial
Crisis of 2008: Applying the Lessons of *Caritas in Veritate* to
the Regulation of Consumer Credit in the United States and
the European Union
Elizabeth R. Schiltz

Introducing Religious Reparations: Repairing the
Perceptions of African Religions through Expansions in
Education
Danielle Boaz

Sponsored by: Hamline University School of Law

Published by: Hamline University School of Law
ISSN: 0748-0814

JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION

VOLUME XXVI

2010-2011

NUMBER 1

EDITORIAL STAFF

Editor in Chief

MARIE A. FAILINGER, Hamline University School of Law

Associate Editor

HOWARD J. VOGEL, Hamline University School of Law

Technical Editors

MARY L. DUNNEWOLD, Hamline University School of Law

STEPHEN LIEBO, Hamline University School of Law

GRACE MILLS, Hamline University School of Law

Production/Subscription Manager

LINDA BERGLIN, Hamline University School of Law

EDITORIAL ASSISTANTS

CASEY BERNDT

JOSHUA MELGAARD

BENJAMIN SORENSON

LYNDSAY STEUSSY

EDITORIAL BOARD

JOSÉ ROBERTO JUÁREZ, University of Denver, Sturm College of Law, Chair

FRANK S. ALEXANDER, Emory University School of Law

DEBORAH CANTRELL, University of Colorado Law School

PAULA COOEY, Macalester College

ANVER M. EMON, University of Toronto

MARIE A. FAILINGER, Hamline University School of Law

Ex Officio

EMILY ALBRINK HARTIGAN, Saint Mary's University of San Antonio School of Law

AFRA JALABI, Islamic Scholar, Beaconsfield, Quebec

HOWARD LESNICK, University of Pennsylvania Law School

DONALD LEWIS, Hamline University School of Law

Ex Officio

ROBIN LOVIN, Perkins School of Theology, Southern Methodist University

NANCY MILLER-HERRON, Attorney at Law, Dresden, Tennessee, Secretary

RUSSELL PEARCE, Fordham University School of Law

MICHAEL PERRY, Emory University School of Law

THOMAS PORTER, JUSTPEACE Center for Mediation & Conflict Transformation

ASIFA QURAIISHI, University of Wisconsin Law School

KATHLEEN SANDS, University of Massachusetts Boston

STEVEN D. SMITH, University of San Diego School of Law
EARL SCHWARTZ, Hamline University
DARRYL TRIMIEW, Medgar Evers College
AMELIA UELMEN, Fordham University School of Law
HOWARD J. VOGEL, Hamline University School of Law, Treasurer

ADVISORY COMMITTEE

- RICHARD HIERS, University of Florida, Chair*
TAHA JABER AL-ALWANI, Graduate School of Social and Islamic Sciences
AZIZAH AL-HIBRI, T.C. Williams School of Law, University of Richmond
ABDULLAHI AN-NA'IM, Emory University School of Law
ZAFAR ISHAQ ANSARI, Islamic Research Institute, International Islamic University, Pakistan
MILNER BALL, University of Georgia School of Law
GERARD BRADLEY, Notre Dame University Law School
MICHAEL J. BROYDE, Emory University School of Law
LYNN BUZZARD, Campbell University School of Law
Southern Methodist University
STEPHEN L. CARTER, Yale Law School
ROBERT F. COCHRAN, JR., Pepperdine University School of Law
MOHAMED S. EL-AWA, Islamic Scholar, Egypt
CARL ESBECK, University of Missouri-Columbia School of Law
EDWARD MCGLYNN GAFFNEY, JR., Valparaiso University School of Law
M. CATHLEEN KAVENY, Notre Dame University Law School
PATRICK R. KEIFERT, Luther Theological Seminary
DAMIEN KEOWN, University of London, Goldsmiths
MICHAEL KESSLER, Georgetown University
SANFORD LEVINSON, University of Texas School of Law
DAVID LITTLE, Harvard University Divinity School
ELIZABETH MENSCH, State University of New York at Buffalo, School of Law
EBRAHIM MOOSA, Duke University
SEYYED HOSSEIN NASR, George Washington University
LOUIS NEWMAN, Carleton College
KAY PRANIS, Saint Paul, Minnesota
JAWDAT SAID, Muslim Scholar and Activist, Syria
ELISABETH SCHÜSSLER FIORENZA, Harvard University Divinity School
THOMAS L. SHAFFER, Notre Dame University Law School
DONALD W. SHRIVER, Union Theological Seminary in New York
DANIEL SINCLAIR, Tel Aviv Law School
DOUGLAS STURM, Professor Emeritus, Bucknell University
PETER N. THOMPSON, Hamline University School of Law
CHARLES VILLA-VICENCIO, Institute for Justice and Reconciliation, South Africa
MICHAEL WELKER, University of Heidelberg, Germany
JOHN WITTE, Jr., Emory University School of Law
WILSON YATES, United Theological Seminary of the Twin Cities
STEPHEN B. YOUNG, Attorney at Law, Saint Paul, Minnesota

The JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION is sponsored by the Hamline University School of Law and is a interdisciplinary, interfaith academic and professional publication devoted to investigating the interaction of religion and law.

Subscriptions to the JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION, which is published twice annually, are \$25.00 per two-issue volume for individuals, \$35.00 for institutions, and \$12.00 for students. Add an additional \$10.00 for foreign postage. Subscription requests, manuscripts, and general correspondence should be addressed to:

JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION
1536 Hewitt Avenue
Saint Paul, Minnesota 55104
lberglin@hamline.edu

The JOURNAL currently follows the Blue Book citation format. Citations to Jewish/Christian Biblical sources conform to the SBL Handbook of Style and the Jewish Law Annual. Unsolicited manuscripts will be returned only upon request.

Individual and back issues and complete sets of the JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION may be ordered directly from William S. Hein & Co., 1285 Main Street, Buffalo, New York 14209. Back issues can also be found in electronic format for all your research needs on HeinOnline, <http://heinonline.org>

The views and opinions expressed in the JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the editorial staff, the editorial board, the advisory board, or the sponsors of the JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION.

Articles are indexed in the *Index to Legal Periodicals* published by the H.W. Wilson Co. (Bronx, New York), and in the *Legal Resource Index* available on-line on a variety of computer database services.

This periodical is also indexed in the *ATLA Religion Database*®, published by the American Theological Library Association, 300 S. Wacker Dr., Suite 2100, Chicago, IL 60606, E-mail: atla@atla.com, [www.http://www.atla.com](http://www.atla.com).

Internet access to information about the JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION, including an index to past issues, is available at <http://www.hamline.edu/law/jlr>

All copyrights are reserved.

Cite as: 26 J.L. & RELIGION (2010-11)

JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION

STATEMENT OF PERSPECTIVE

The JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION was initiated in 1982 as a collaborative effort of the Council on Religion and Law and the Hamline University School of Law. It was born of a sense of historical malaise. The modern age with its strong propensity toward the secularization of all areas of life, while not without merit in its liberating effects, nonetheless has its dark side.

We live, some say, in a time of profound historical crisis. Domestically and globally, we confront massive issues which force us to reconsider, in fundamental ways, the shape and quality of our common life. Yet many of the disciplines of thought and practice that should be a rich resource in such a time are found wanting—among them, law and religion. Law, a discipline presumably devoted to the ways of justice, has all too often become a set of complex, technical tools without concern for higher purpose. Religion, presumably given to the all-embracing promises and prescriptions implied in the sense of the sacred, has all too often become privatized and neglectful of our public life.

The JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION is dedicated to a fundamental reappraisal of the disciplines of law and religion as they impinge on each other, might instruct each other, and taken in their conjunction, might offer a constructive response to the major issues of our times. As such its concerns are sixfold.

Historical The JOURNAL intends to encourage the examination of historical developments, movements, thinkers, and issues to enrich our understanding of how law and religion have, in various ways, been mutually influential.

Theoretical The JOURNAL intends to promote constructive work in religious and legal thought about fundamental theological and jurisprudential questions pertaining to professional practice and the structures of our public life.

Ethical The JOURNAL intends to support explorations into the foundations of ethical judgment and normative critiques of our social life, particularly as they draw upon resources from the life of law and religion.

Global The JOURNAL intends to be encompassing in its reach, seeking out voices from all the religious and legal traditions throughout the world and bringing them into conversations with each other.

Professional The JOURNAL intends to stimulate collaboration between jurists and religious leaders given their respective commitments, as professionals, to the common good of all peoples.

Spiritual The JOURNAL recognizes that human existence is grounded in the spiritual, which is represented in many forms and expressions.

The JOURNAL is thus a forum within which the disciplines of law and religion might together consider with utmost seriousness their joint responsibility for the creation of a civilization of genuine peace and justice. Within the compass of that purpose, the JOURNAL intends to be open-minded and non-prejudicial; it is receptive to submissions from all persuasions and perspectives.

**HAMLIN
UNIVERSITY
SCHOOL OF LAW**

A subscription to the
**JOURNAL OF LAW AND
RELIGION**

Cost per volume (two issues):

\$25.00 individual (U.S.)
\$35.00 individual (foreign)
\$35.00 institution (U.S.)
\$45.00 institution (foreign)
\$12.00 student

Print and send to:

Circulation Manager
JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION
Hamline University School of Law
1536 Hewitt Avenue
St. Paul, MN 55104
U.S.

Please Enclose Payment made out to:
JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION

Name: _____

Address: _____

City: _____ State: _____ Zip: _____

Country: _____

Phone: _____ Fax: _____ E-Mail: _____

Check out our website!

Journal of Law & Religion

<http://www.hamline.edu/law/jlr>



Books of Interest



Contemporary Conversations



Indexes



How to become a Subscriber



Lifetime Achievement Awards



Table of U.S. Supreme Court Decisions
Relating to Religious Liberty



ANNOUNCEMENT

We have acquired the entire
back stock, reprint and
microform rights to the

JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION

Complete sets to date
are now available.
We can also furnish
single volumes and issues.

WILLIAM S. HEIN & COMPANY, INC.
1285 Main Street
Buffalo, New York 14209-1987

Orders may also be placed by calling Hein at 800.828.7571;
via fax 716.883.8100; or found in electronic format for all your research
needs on HeinOnline <http://heinonline.org/>

THE JOURNAL OF LAW AND RELIGION

VOLUME XXVI

2010-2011

NUMBER 1

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Editor's Preface	xiii
------------------------	------

For current & upcoming article abstracts, visit our website at
http://www.hamline.edu/law/jlr/index_of_issues.html

ARTICLES

Dohrman W. Byers	<i>The Morality of Human Rights: A Secular Ground</i>	1
Jeffrey M. Lipshaw	<i>Can There be a Religion of Reasons? A Response to Leiter's Circular Conception of Religious Belief.....</i>	43
Adam S. Hofri- Winogradow	<i>A Plurality of Discontent: Legal Pluralism, Religious Adjudication and the State.....</i>	57
Caleb E. Mason	<i>What is Truth? Setting the Bounds of Justicia- bility in Religiously-Inflected Fact Disputes.....</i>	91
Ahmed Elewa and Laury Silvers	<i>"I am one of the People": A Survey and Analysis of Legal Arguments on Woman-Led Prayer in Islam</i>	141
Elizabeth R. Schiltz	<i>The Paradox of the Global and the Local in the Financial Crisis of 2008: Applying the Lessons of Caritas in Veritate to the Regulation</i>	

JOURNAL OF LAW & RELIGION

	<i>of Consumer Credit in the United States and the European Union</i>	173
Danielle Boaz	<i>Introducing Religious Reparations: Repairing the Perceptions of African Religions through Expansions in Education</i>	213

AALS SYMPOSIUM

Brett G. Scharffs	<i>Symposium Introduction: The Freedom of Religion and Belief Jurisprudence of the European Court of Human Rights: Legal, Moral, Political and Religious Perspectives</i>	249
Zachary R. Calo	<i>Pluralism, Secularism and the European Court of Human Rights</i>	261
Gerhard Robbers	<i>Church Autonomy in the European Court of Human Rights—Recent Developments in Germany</i>	281
Carolyn Evans	<i>Individual and Group Religious Freedom in the European Court of Human Rights: Cracks in the Intellectual Architecture</i>	321
Malcolm D. Evans	<i>From Cartoons to Crucifixes: Current Controversies Concerning the Freedom of Religion and the Freedom of Expression before the European Court of Human Rights</i> ...	345

For current and upcoming book reviews, visit our website at
http://www.hamline.edu/law/jlr/upcoming_reviews_essays.html

REVIEW ESSAY

Bryan K. Fair	<i>The Excessive Entanglement of Politics, Law and Religion</i>	371
---------------	---	-----

JOURNAL OF LAW & RELIGION

BOOK REVIEWS

- Abdullahi A. Gallab *The Fall and Rise of the Islamic State,*
by Noah Feldman..... 381
- Haider Ala Hamoudi *Islam and Liberal Citizenship: The Search
for an Overlapping Consensus,*
by Andrew F. March..... 387
- Syed Adnan Hussain *State Law as Islamic Law in Modern Egypt:
The Incorporation of the Shari'a into
Egyptian Constitutional Law,*
by Clark B. Lombardi 403
- Afra Jalabi *A Call for Heresy: Why Dissent is Vital
to Islam and America,*
by Anouar Majid..... 407
- Donald W. Shriver *Making Sense of Mass Atrocity,*
by Mark Osiel 411

BOOKSHELF

- Global Issues in Freedom of Speech and Religion: Cases and Materials,*
by Alan E. Brownstein & Leslie Gielow Jacobs
- The Ethics of Citizenship: Liberal Democracy and Religious Convictions,*
edited by J. Caleb Clanton
- Religious Intolerance in America: A Documentary History,*
edited by John Corrigan & Lynn S. Neal
- The Sacred Rights of Conscience: Selected Readings on Religious
Liberty and Church-State Relations in the
American Founding,*
edited by Daniel L. Dreisbach & Mark David Hall
- Law and Religion: National, International and Comparative Perspectives,*
by W. Cole Durham, Jr. & Brett G. Scharffs
- Religion and Politics in America: Faith, Culture, and Strategic Choices,*
by Robert Booth Fowler, Allen D. Hertzke, Laura
R. Olson & Kevin R. den Dulk
- Lex Charitatis: A Juristic Disquisition on Law in the Theology of
Martin Luther,*
by Johannes Heckel,
edited by Martin Heckel 421