

THE REVIEW OF POLITICS

Dworkin's "Originalism"
Keith E. Whittington

The Spirit of Separate Powers in Montesquieu
Sharon Krause

The Reluctant Pluralism of J.G. Herder
Damon Linker

Hegel's Concept of Patriotism
Rupert H. Gordon

Gadamer's 100th Birthday and *The Enigma of Health*
Fred Dallmayr

Review Essay: Nietzsche's Friends and Enemies
Joshua Fao Dienstag

Books reviewers include—

Doris Bergen on Peter Gay

Nicholas Wolterstorff on Michael Perry

Mark Roelofs on Nancy Rosenblum

Paul Rahe on Quentin Skinner

Bradley Lewis on Josiah Ober

Spring, 2000

THE REVIEW OF POLITICS

Editor

WALTER NICGORSKI

Managing Editor

DENNIS WM MORAN

Book Review Editor

PETER R. MOODY, JR.

Assistant Book Review Editor

James Paul Old

Editorial Intern: Jodi Cockerill

Associate Editors

E. A. Goerner

Fred R. Dallmayr
Philip Gleason

Thomas Werge
Catherine Zuckert

Former Editors

Waldemar Gurian

M. A. Fitzsimons
Thomas Stritch

Frederick J. Crosson
Donald P. Kommers

Editorial Advisory Board

Henry J. Abraham

University of Virginia

Charles W. Anderson

University of Wisconsin-Madison

Shlomo Avineri

Hebrew University of Jerusalem

Jean Bethke Elshtain

University of Chicago

Ernest L. Fortin

Boston College

Gerald Garvey

Princeton University

James T. Kloppenberg

Harvard University

Arend Lijphart

University of

California-San Diego

Alasdair MacIntyre

Duke University

Harvey C. Mansfield

Harvard University

Mary Nichols

Fordham University

Doris Marie Provine

Syracuse University

Arlene Saxonhouse

University of Michigan

Kenneth W. Thompson

University of Virginia

Glenn Tinder

University of Massachusetts-

Boston

Jean M. Yarbrough

Bowdoin College

Administrative Assistant: Nancy Benjamin

Production Managers: Casey A. Waldron, Stephen D. Sabrio, and
Monica P. Wisner

THE REVIEW OF POLITICS, without neglecting the analysis of institutions and techniques, is primarily interested in the philosophical and historical approach to politics.

THE REVIEW OF POLITICS

Published Quarterly by the University of Notre Dame, Indiana

Vol. 62

Spring 2000

No. 2

Keith E. Whittington

Dworkin's "Originalism": The Role of Intentions in
Constitutional Interpretation 197

Sharon Krause

The Spirit of Separate Powers in Montesquieu 231

Damon Linker

The Reluctant Pluralism of J. G. Herder 267

Rupert H. Gordon

Modernity, Freedom, and the State: Hegel's
Concept of Patriotism 295

Fred Dallmayr

The Enigma of Health: Hans-Georg Gadamer
at 100 327

Review Essay

Joshua Foa Dienstag: Nietzsche's
Friends and Enemies 351

Reviews:

Doris L. Bergen: POISONINGS
Review of Peter Gay's *My German Question:
Growing Up in Nazi Berlin* 365

George K. Romoser: PHYSICS, POLITICS AND CULTURE
Review of Paul Lawrence Rose's *Heisenberg
and the Nazi Atomic Bomb Project:
A Study in German Culture* 367

Shiraz Dossa: BANALITY TRIVIALIZED
Review of Bernard J. Bergen's *The Banality of Evil:
Hannah Arendt and "The Final Solution."* 370

Kaz Ross: POPULAR MISCONCEPTIONS
Review of Frank Dikötter's *Imperfect Conceptions:
Medical Knowledge, Birth Defects and Eugenics in China* 373

J. Wesley Robbins: ETHICS AS SCIENCE
Review of Larry Arnhart's *Darwinian Natural Right:
The Biological Ethics of Human Nature* 376

Nicholas Wolterstorff: SACRED AND INVIOABLE	
Review of Michael J. Perry's <i>The Idea of Human Rights: Four Inquiries</i>	378
Richard S. Myers: WHAT IT REALLY MEANT	
Review of David Lowenthal's <i>No Liberty for License: The Forgotten Logic of the First Amendment</i>	382
H. Mark Roelofs: JOINING UP	
Review of Nancy L. Rosenblum's <i>Membership and Morals: The Personal Uses of Pluralism in America</i>	385
Robert H. Birkby: A TRIUMPH OF QUALITY	
Review of Andrew L. Kaufman's <i>Cardoza</i>	388
Richard G. Sheehan: GAME THEORY	
Review of Roger I. Abrams's <i>Legal Bases: Baseball and the Law</i>	390
Peter Augustine Lawler: DOGMATIC BORE	
Review of David Fott's <i>John Dewey: America's Philosopher of Democracy</i>	392
Paul A. Rahe: QUENTIN SKINNER'S "THIRD WAY"	
Review of Quentin Skinner's <i>Liberty Before Liberalism</i>	395
James E. Alvey: WHO SHOULD RULE IN ARISTOCRATIC SOCIETY?	
Review of Susan E. Gallagher's <i>The Rule of the Rich: Adam Smith's Argument Against Political Power</i>	398
V. Bradley Lewis: WHAT'S WRONG WITH DEMOCRACY?	
Review of Josiah Ober's <i>Political Dissent in Democratic Athens: Intellectual Critics of Popular Rule</i>	401
Gary Shiffman: A PLATO JUST LIKE US	
Review of Gerald M. Mara's <i>Socrates' Discursive Democracy: Logos and Ergon in Platonic Political Philosophy</i>	405
Paul E. Kirkland: MASKS OF SILENT SOCRATES	
Review of Alexander Nehamas's <i>The Art of Living: Socratic Reflections from Plato to Foucault</i>	407
Thomas A. Baylis: SCHOLARLY TRANSITIONS	
Review of Richard Rose, William Mishler, and Christian Haerpfer's <i>Democracy and Its Alternatives: Understanding Post-Communist Societies</i>	409
Alvin Y. So: EUROPE DE-CENTERED	
Review of Andre Gunder Frank's <i>ReOrient: Global Economy in the Asian Age</i>	412
David B. Burrell: JUST ANOTHER WORD FOR NOTHING LEFT TO LOSE	
Review of Richard K. Khuri's <i>Freedom, Modernity, and Islam: Towards a Creative Synthesis</i>	414

Contributors To This Issue

KEITH E. WHITTINGTON is Assistant Professor of Politics in Princeton University and author of *Constitutional Construction and Constitutional Interpretation*. **SHARON KRAUSE** is Assistant Professor of Government in Wesleyan University. **DAMON LINKER** is currently Visiting Professor of Political Science in Brigham Young University. **RUPERT H. GORDON** is a post-doctoral fellow in the University of Toronto's Department of Political Science. **FRED DALLMAYR** is the Packey J. Dee Professor of Government in the University of Notre Dame. **JOSHUA FOA DIENSTAG**, author of *Dancing in Chains: Narrative and Memory in Political Theory*, is Associate Professor of Government and Foreign Affairs in the University of Virginia.

DORIS L. BERGEN is Associate Professor of History in the University of Notre Dame. **GEORGE K. ROMOSER** is Director of the Technology, Society, and Values Program and Professor Emeritus of Political Science in the University of New Hampshire. **SHIRAZ DOSSA**, Professor of Political Science in St. Francis Xavier University, Canada, is author of *The Public Realm and the Public Self: The Political Theory of Hannah Arendt*. **KAZ ROSS** teaches political science in the University of Melbourne; her research is on planned reproduction in China. **J. WESLEY ROBBINS** is Professor of Philosophy in Indiana University at South Bend. **NICHOLAS WOLTERSTORFF** is the Noah Porter Professor of Philosophical Theology in Yale University. **RICHARD S. MYERS** is Professor of Law in Ave Maria School of Law. **H. MARK ROELOFS**, author of *The Poverty of American Politics*, is Professor of Politics in New York University. **ROBERT H. BIRKBY** is a member of the political science faculty in Vanderbilt University. **RICHARD G. SHEEHAN** is Professor of Finance in the University of Notre Dame's College of Business. **PETER AUGUSTINE LAWLER** is Professor of Government in Berry College, Georgia. **PAUL A. RAHE**, author of *Republics Ancient and Modern*, is the Jay P. Walker Professor of American History in the University of Tulsa.

JAMES E. ALVEY is Professor of Economics in the Department of Applied and International Economics in Massey University, New Zealand. **V. BRADLEY LEWIS** is Assistant Professor of Political Philosophy in the Catholic University of America. **GARY SHIFFMAN** is Assistant Professor of Political Science in the University of California, San Diego. **PAUL E. KIRKLAND** teaches politics in Fordham University. **THOMAS A. BAYLIS** is Visiting Professor of Political Science in the University of Texas, Austin. **ALVIN Y. SO** is Associate Dean of Humanities and Social Science in the Hong Kong University of Science and Technology. **DAVID B. BURRELL, C.S.C.**, is the Theodore M. Hesburgh Professor of Theology and Fellow of the Kroc Institute for Peace in the University of Notre Dame.

INSTRUCTIONS TO CONTRIBUTORS

All manuscripts should be submitted in **QUADRUPPLICATE** to *The Review of Politics*, Box B, Notre Dame, IN 46556. If the return of the manuscript is desired, a stamped, self-addressed envelope should be enclosed. All typewritten material should be double-spaced, including notes and quotations; photocopies of a good quality are acceptable. *The Review* follows the *Chicago Manual of Style* for standards of citation, punctuation and other editorial considerations. The normal length of manuscripts published is 8,000–11,000 words. Since manuscripts are evaluated anonymously they should not bear the author's name or institutional affiliation. Submissions should be sent with an **ABSTRACT** of 100–150 words. We assume, in accordance with APSA policies, that you have not submitted your essay to another journal. All correspondence regarding book reviews should be sent to Professor Peter R. Moody, Jr. at the above address.

The articles in **THE REVIEW OF POLITICS** are indexed in the International Index to Periodicals and the Catholic Periodicals and Literature Index and abstracted in the International Political Science Abstracts, and abstracted and indexed in ABC POL. SCI., HISTORICAL ABSTRACTS, SOCIAL SCIENCES INDEX (also available in the electronic versions), BOOK REVIEW INDEX, INTERNATIONAL BIBLIOGRAPHY OF THE SOCIAL SCIENCES.

THE REVIEW OF POLITICS (ISSN 0034–6705) is published quarterly for \$25.00 per year in the United States (institutional \$50.00); foreign individual, \$40.00 (institutional, \$56.00); single copies, \$12.00 (domestic) and \$15.00 (foreign) by The University of Notre Dame, P.O. BOX B, Notre Dame, IN 46556. Periodicals postage paid at Notre Dame, IN and Nappanee, IN. **POSTMASTER:** Send address changes to **THE REVIEW OF POLITICS**, P.O. BOX B, Notre Dame, IN 46556. Visa and MasterCard accepted.

Abstracts, subscription, advertising and submission information can also be found on our World Wide Web Homepage at <http://www.nd.edu/~rop>.