

## COMMUNICATIONS

Editor, *Journal of Asian Studies*

Dear Sir:

On p. 401 of the May 1959 (Vol. 18, No. 3) issue of the *Journal of Asian Studies* there appears a review by Professor Robert C. Bone Jr. of my paper *The West New Guinea Dispute* (New York, 1958). On one aspect of this review—a point of fact—I would briefly like to comment.

Professor Bone takes exception to a statement appearing on p. 23 of my paper, referring to a giant rally held on August 1, 1954, in Djakarta, during which both Masjumi and Communist speakers addressed the meeting. As source of this statement is given the August 19, 1954, issue of the Djakarta daily *Merdeka*. Professor Bone states that he has been unable to find any reference to this meeting in the issue of *Merdeka* cited, nor in the previous eighteen other issues of that month, and secondly that “1954 was not a year in which Masjumi and the Communists were holding joint meetings (if ever!). . .”

Professor Bone’s criticism of the first point is well taken. The August 1, 1954, date given

in my paper is a misprint. The correct date is August 18, 1954. My source for the meeting was not *Merdeka*, but the Djakarta daily *Nieuwsgier* for the same date (August 19, 1954). I regret this confusion.

On the second point, however, Professor Bone is incorrect. Permit me to quote the first few sentences of the article in *Nieuwsgier* for August 19, 1954, dealing with the rally: “In connection with the ninth 17–August celebration a mass meeting was held yesterday at 16.16 in Merdeka square at which an estimated 20,000 to 30,000 persons were in attendance. There were speeches by three speakers, Soemardi of the PKI [Communist Party—vdK], Yunan Nasution of Masjumi and Mayor Sudiro. The speakers emphasized the West-Irian question. . . .”

Professor Bone’s “if ever”—though a minor point—makes one wonder if he is fully informed upon the relative organizational unity of Masjumi and the Communists during the Indonesian Revolution.

Justus M. van der Kroef

Bridgeport, Conn.  
May 25, 1959