

## REVIEWS

The chapter on the Forest is particularly useful for the significance of the Forest is frequently overlooked.

In the Middle Ages the Welsh possessed an international reputation as a warlike race, firmly convinced that 'nobilitas cum pace perit.' Their light-armed spearmen and archers, conspicuous in scarlet and, later, in white and green, were prominent in all the Plantagenet wars and their speech and the ferocity of their fighting—no less than their love of plunder—were known from the Grampians to the Pyrenees and the Syrian desert. They appear in Professor Richard's pages without any of the adventitious aids of romanticism: badly paid, they took everything on which they could lay hands; as did their descendants at Badajoz and Ciudad Rodrigo.

The arrangement of a short bibliography at the end of each chapter is excellent and the numerous illustrations are really good—that is, they illustrate the reading matter instead of merely providing pictures. The system of short notes on the pictures at the end of the book is first-rate. The author's arrangement gives the book a unity which enables him to avoid the main danger of such a work—the appearance of being 'scrappy.'

There are one or two minor flaws, however. Mr. Richard's statement on p. 39, that Ireland was not affected by Roman influence is somewhat dubious and the uninstructed reader might be pardoned for supposing that the Albigensians (p. 416) were merely sophisticated adherents of a cultural revival. The statement (p. 295) that Poitiers provided a successful repetition of the tactics of Crecy is, to say the least, unfortunate. The book would have gained immensely by the inclusion of one or two maps. It is to be hoped that, when a second edition appears, this will be remedied. Something on the lines of Mr. Horrabin's maps—but drawing its inspiration from Professor Rees's magnificent map of S. Wales and the Border. Difficult, perhaps, but, one hopes, not impossible.

*Cymru'r Oesau Canol* will be a book of permanent importance—not only to Welsh but also to continental historians.

T.C-E.

WINSTON CHURCHILL AND JAMES II. By Malcolm V. Hay. (Harding & More; 2/6.)

Mr. Churchill's proneness to make reckless charges has recently got him into political hot water. In the field of history, an instance of the same propensity has brought him up against Major Hay, whose *Chain of Error in Scottish History* lately won him considerable recognition. In Mr. Churchill's in many ways

## BLACKFRIARS

admirable Life of his great ancestor Marlborough, so intent has he been upon defending the latter's desertion of James II at the Revolution, that he has led himself into great unfairness and injustice to the King. Major Hay outspokenly denounces him for this, and his rejoinder is a devastating one. He meets Mr. Churchill's argument point by point, and demolishes them by deadly logic and unassailable facts. He convicts him alike of error and prejudice, smites him hip and thigh, and accuses him of offending against British ideas of fair play. The little book is a powerful vindication of the character and many of the actions of James II, based on contemporary records and the evidence of friend and foe. After carefully reading and reflecting upon it, most readers will be inclined to consent to the author's contention that Mr. Churchill, at all events in the particular section of his work to which Major Hay takes exception, has not properly mastered his sources, is wanting in the science of criticism, and is a man whose historical judgment is not to be trusted. It will be interesting to see if Mr. Churchill is willing to make any *amende* for his unfairness to James II. For in his Life of Marlborough he declares himself 'awaiting with meekness the correction and contradiction which the knowledge of critics will supply.'

F.R.B.

**THE ECONOMIC MORALS OF THE JESUITS.** By J. Brodrick, S.J.  
(London: Oxford University Press, Humphrey Milford;  
5/-).

**GOLDEN YEARS ON THE PARAGUAY.** By George O'Neill, S.J.  
(Burns Oates & Washbourne; 5/-.)

Of these two books, Fr. Brodrick's needs a Summary, Fr. O'Neill's an Introduction. Fr. Brodrick, answering with admirable patience and scholarship some amazingly ill-founded charges made by Dr. H. M. Robertson in his treatise *Aspects of the Rise of Economic Individualism*, which attributes much of that individualism to Jesuit influence, would have laid us under a still greater debt if he could have summarized in a final chapter the points of his defence necessarily disconnected in dealing with a rambling attack. Fr. O'Neill, in recounting the glorious and tragic story of the Paraguayan reductions, leaves us without a map, with the result that most of the place-names and boundaries he mentions remain meaningless, and without an introduction outlining the history and organization of the Church in South America before the arrival of the Jesuits. We are plunged into an account and defence of the work of the Jesuit Fathers, quite well done, but written on the assumption that the reader already knows something about the Reductions