



and theology: truths of faith cannot be rigorously proved by history/philosophy, but neither can they be simply disproved by them.

Since Schleiermacher liberal theology has sought to overcome the arguments about development and/or corruption by relativizing doctrine itself. Levering sees this continuing up to the present day, even among Catholic theologians. Today Newman's approach is regarded as dated by some for whom rupture is as important as identity in the flow of tradition. Levering believes, however, that Newmanian doctrinal development has been affirmed by Vatican II and that it is a far better path forward for the Church than any postmodern relativization of doctrine.

In spite of the impressive academic apparatus and bibliography the book is not an extended study of Newman's doctrine of development in itself but rather a series of reflections, in Newman's company, upon the threat of doctrinal corruption. Did he succeed in what he set out to do? 'Yes and no' is Levering's conclusion, and he offers this neat summary: 'For both religious liberals and religious traditionalists (as distinct from those who recognize the historicity of doctrine without falling into a historicist view of doctrine), Newman's writings are suspect, even if occasionally useful' (p. 354). Doctrinal corruption would inevitably put people at the mercy of those in power, whether civil or ecclesiastical – Froude's insight remained with Newman – and his work, even if considered by some as having failed in its purpose, succeeds at least in keeping this warning before our eyes.

Vivian Boland OP 
San Clemente, Rome, Italy
Email: vivian.boland@dominicans.ie

doi:10.1017/nbf.2024.66

The Work of Inclusion: An Ethnography of Grace, Sin, and Intellectual Disabilities by Lorraine Cuddeback-Gedeon, T&T Clark, London, 2023, pp. xi + 183, £21.99, pbk

Ethnographical research in disability studies is growing in popularity. Ethnography allows researchers to immerse themselves in a particular culture in order to get to know people's experiences. This method appeals to the turn to lived experience, and it gives a place to researchers who might otherwise be excluded from critical disability studies on the grounds of not being disabled and therefore not in a position to speak on behalf of the disabled. Moreover, for those who regard disability as a social construct, ethnography enables researchers to reflect on the asymmetries of the power relationships involved in social structures and agency. Cuddeback-Gedeon's book and her adherence to liberation theology fit very much into this research context. Based on her doctoral research, *The Work of Inclusion* builds on fieldwork in the form of observation, and interviews with staff, clients, and family members. She conducted with the 'Payton' community, the author's pseudonym for a sheltered factory workshop, part of a centre offering paid work and recreation opportunities for people with intellectual

disabilities in the USA. Steeped in liberation theology, Cuddeback-Gedeon undertook her research by becoming embedded into the community as a volunteer, and by 'listening' with the aim of uncovering 'patterns of grace and sin' as seen and experienced by this specific disabled community. One of her goals is to fill the gap between theologies of disability written by caregivers and the 'muted' disabled voices of those with intellectual disabilities, and so she uses material from disability studies and ethnography to think theologically about Payton. Moreover, she regards this 'posture of listening' as a 'necessary task for our churches to become spaces that represent every part of the multifaceted Body of Christ'.

Cuddeback-Gedeon takes an unapologetically liberation theology approach to disability. Although at times the book gives the impression that liberation theology is the only fruitful form of discourse in theologies of disability, Cuddeback-Gedeon engages reflectively with the strengths and weaknesses of her approach. She acknowledges that her participants are 'high-functioning', yet states that this can 'open a space' for people with profound intellectual disabilities. She hints that her observational research and interview techniques may not fully protect her from being an outsider. She is aware of the inherent difficulty of wanting to engage with participants and hear their experiences when how to hear people with intellectual disabilities is complex and inevitably influenced by the researcher's own privilege and biases. To preserve her ethnographic research from becoming a 'pornographic' account or instrumentalizing people, Cuddeback-Gedeon reflects on her own presumption and bias, and on accountability to her participants as collaborators.

Still, there is a question over this collaboration. Moreover, her sense of accountability in telling the story of others where the nondisabled take a dominant role both in terms of the author as researcher and in terms of the staff, sits in tension with her interpretation of the 'structural sin' of ableism or normalcy, the belief that typical abilities are superior. Cuddeback-Gedeon is aware that liberation theologies ask for reflexivity and a raising of consciousness among people who are oppressed, and she appreciates the difficulty of this task with people with intellectual disabilities. To navigate this, Cuddeback-Gedeon reinterprets oppression, intentionality and agency. Linking oppression to the structural sin of normalcy, she identifies strategies to normalize activity as occasions of oppression. As an instance of normalcy she gives the example of 'passing', where 'clients who are closest to passing as nondisabled' have more leeway and privilege. In terms of intentionality and agency, Cuddeback-Gedeon interprets occasions where clients resist or cede to the structures that surround them as instances of resisting or being complicit in oppression. She finds implicit opposition to normalcy, but also complicity, through the manipulative strategies of some clients who take longer over breaks or take the long way round to their workstations to meet up with friends. She illustrates how the 'powerless' use the 'public script' against the powerful by, for instance, calling staff 'friends' or reminding staff to be nice to them.

For Cuddeback-Gedeon, agency for liberation also means agency that risks sin. Cuddeback-Gedeon points out that in some theologies people with intellectual disabilities are either blessed or damned: they are either likened to angels or their disability is connected to sin, though this is a rather dated polarization in disability studies. Nevertheless, for Cuddeback-Gedeon 'the primary form of sin which theologies of disability engage is the structural *sin* of ableism....that shapes the *sin* of clients and staff

alike'. Here the author dismisses Pope John Paul II's understanding that social sin is also personal on the grounds that his understanding fails to account for 'moral opacity'. In addition, she critiques instrumentalization of disabled people in the sense that 'they' teach nondisabled people how to be better people. This charge of instrumentalization, common in disability studies, seems to forget the theological point that it is everyone's task to help others become better and more truly human.

A significant weakness in the book is the disconnect between the main body of the book's reflection on the Payton community, and the concluding chapter which outlines discriminatory practices in the Catholic Church in the USA. Cuddeback-Gedeon states that one of her original goals was to improve the work of inclusion within faith communities. Specifically, she calls out the US Catholic Church's perceived lack of attention to discrimination legislation and failures in practices and policies in spite of its statements on inclusion and justice. In Cuddeback-Gedeon's view, due to a lack of training and education many faith community leaders are well-intentioned yet 'blithely unaware' of the way in which their churches and ministers fail to implement inclusion or to foster of a sense of belonging for people with intellectual disabilities. Moreover, they miss opportunities to understand inclusion better by failing to dialogue with social services. Church institutions may be willing to include, but Cuddeback-Gedeon claims that this is a reactive rather than a proactive stance. Barriers to inclusion range from physical access, to uncertain responses to the needs of people with intellectual disabilities, and attitudinal failures such as reluctance to engage with people or presumptions that people cannot connect in a meaningful way with the liturgy, coupled with a focus on deficits rather than gifts. Cuddeback-Gedeon further claims that 'inclusion is not possible without attention to the structures that enable it', specifically justice within relationships of dependency. Belonging, she argues, should not be 'coloured by normalcy', the assumption that 'integration is superior simply because of the presence of the nondisabled'.

Cuddeback-Gedeon's conclusion is a critique of practices in the Catholic Church plus warnings and possible remedies. Yet, this conclusion does not reflect her study in the rest of the text of the Payton community. Certainly, in her introduction, Cuddeback-Gedeon explains that by taking a theologically 'liberationist' approach to intellectual disability, she aims to change 'concrete, exclusionary practices' and to challenge 'bad theologies' that have perpetuated exclusion. Among these bad practices, the author lists 'bad Thomisms' and 'pure ableism preventing disabled people from taking ministerial roles'. References here would rescue the author from unnuanced generalization. However, it appears to be up to the reader to make the connections and apply Cuddeback-Gedeon's analysis of what happens in the Payton workplace to what happens in the ecclesial setting. Undoubtedly there are interesting connections to be made, which is possibly why Cuddeback-Gedeon speaks in theological language of moments of grace, personal and structural sin, and human flourishing in the Payton context. Nevertheless, one rationale behind ethnography developed from a standpoint of liberation theology is to speak from a position of situatedness, which is why Cuddeback-Gedeon engages in direct fieldwork research from within the Payton community. She also seeks to speak as a Catholic lay-minister in which case research explicitly from her church community would give weight to her method and conclusions. Situatedness does, however, give justification for the author's sole focus

on intellectual disability in the North American context from its history, schooling and advocacy to its social services and practices.

Even if at times she appears dismissive of theological understandings that are not coloured by liberation theology, *The Work of Inclusion* demonstrates Cuddeback-Gedeon's passion for creating just relationships in all areas of life, notably where good intentions seem to mask ableism and normalcy.

Pia Matthews 
St Mary's University, Twickenham, UK
Email: pia.matthews@talk21.com

doi:10.1017/nbf.2024.70

Walking with Father Vincent by Andrew McNabb, with an Introduction by Dale Ahlquist, Gracewing, Leominster, 2023, pp. vii+185, £12.99, pbk

This is a welcome book, but a hard book to pigeonhole for review. It is, in part or in passing, an engaging introduction to much of the life and thought of Fr Vincent McNabb (b. 1868, d. 1943), the Northern Irishman who became perhaps the most famous Dominican friar of the English Dominican Province in the first half of the 20th century, and whom the author, Andrew McNabb, is proud to name his 'great-granduncle'. It would be nearer the mark, though, to describe it as a series of reflections, mostly on family life, inspired by the plain-dealing life and plain-speaking writings of Fr Vincent from the pen of a contemporary American Catholic author on one side of the current culture wars.

We are presented in large part with the deep and lively faith Fr Vincent shared with his mother, Ann, as this has suffused and reverberated in Andrew McNabb's life; though, in addition to family recollections, the great-grandnephew relies heavily on the biography by Fr Ferdinand Valentine OP and on E. A. Siderman's *A Saint in Hyde Park*. Readers may be moved in particular by the faith with which mother and son faced family illnesses and death, and their practical charity towards the others outside the family who were poor, sick, or dying. However, Andrew also rightly highlights the importance of the papal encyclical *Rerum novarum* as an inspiration to his older relative, and a guide to a preacher's priorities, with its description of the plight of the working poor as the 'pressing question' of the hour. The author briefly sets out Fr Vincent's friendship and collaboration as a commentator on social issues with Hilaire Belloc and G. K. Chesterton. He also explores how their economic ideas influenced one of Andrew's own short stories, which is reproduced for the reader, and how it impacted on his career more generally.

If there is a price to pay for this highly personal approach, it is perhaps first in flattening out Fr Vincent's development as a thinker (there's no straight forward