neurophysiological states that deviate from quotidian levels of sentience'. He then explores how such deviations could have been primed and induced in the contexts of the Mithras cults, further imbuing and being memorialised in the material culture of the cult, and particularly in the scene of tauroctony and the mithraea.

In Chapter 10, Anders Klostergaard Petersen grounds his study on the conceptual distinction between emotions and feelings, and explores the ways in which culturally specific representations of feelings in ancient texts could elicit universal human emotional responses to contemporary audiences. Through the study of a Pauline text (I *Cor.* 6, 1–11) which refers to the use of water for cleansing ritualistic purposes, the author highlights the close connection between representations of conscious feelings and the unconscious emotional reactions caused by these representations, which would have informed the religious experience of baptism and its subsequent effects on baptised Christians.

In Chapter 11, Isabella Sandwell examines the language used by Gregory of Nyssa in *Against Eunomius* in his attempt to make the Trinity and immaterial begetting of the Son more cognisable by his contemporaries. Employing cognitive theories about mental representations of religious concepts, Sandwell supports the idea that Gregory of Nyssa managed to appeal both to people's implicit/intuitive and explicit/reflective ways of thinking, making otherwise inconceivable concepts fit with human cognition and thereby helping to disseminate them among the people of the Roman Empire.

All the papers in this volume rely upon an embodied conception of human cognition and point out the interrelation of human cognitive, emotional and physiological processes with the specific contexts in which they are embedded and evolve. They highlight how historical studies may broaden neurocognitive research, revealing how specific historical contexts may interact with and modulate universal cognitive processes. On the other hand, the papers show how cognitive theories can provide valuable means to historians to understand historical agents better. However, with some exceptions (e.g. Chapters 8 and 9), cognitive theories and historical evidence are barely interwoven, with historians mainly focusing on ancient testimony and just referring to neurocognitive research findings. What we might expect in the future is that historians will cooperate more closely with neurocognitive researchers to achieve an in-depth analysis of past religious experiences and support historical hypotheses, providing new evidence for cognitive theories.

Aristotle University of Thessaloniki OLYMPIA PANAGIOTIDOU
olympia.pana@gmail.com
doi:10.1017/S0075435823000886

© *The Author(s), 2023. Published by Cambridge University Press on behalf of The Society for the Promotion of Roman Studies.*

ANNELIES CAZEMIER and STELLA SKALTSA (EDS), *ASSOCIATIONS AND RELIGION IN CONTEXT: THE HELLENISTIC AND ROMAN EASTERN MEDITERRANEAN* (Kernos Supplément 39). Liège: Centre international d'étude de la religion grecque antique; Presses universitaires de Liège, 2022. Pp. 381, illus. (some colour), map, plans. ISBN 9782875623041 (pbk). €40.00.

The resurgence of scholarly interest in Greek and Roman associations in the past few decades has led to rich explorations of their structural organisation, social locations within their urban communities and links to broader contemporary cultural trends. One debated element is the proper taxonomy to use in identifying associations, with a common division between 'professional' and 'religious' functions as the default for two broad etic categories in scholarly discussions. This edited collection of fourteen essays uses inscriptions and archaeological remains in order better to understand the 'religious' element in all its complexity. In the Introduction (9–20), S. Skaltsa and A. Cazemier delineate the two-fold approach used in the essays: an examination of the wide range of cultic and other activities of associations that have been classified as 'religious' and an assessment of the religious actives of associations that have fallen outside the formal designation 'religious'.

The essays cover diverse geographic and temporal boundaries but are arranged for ease of access for those who want to concentrate on a particular place. The first two essays focus on Athens, with

S. Wijma contrasting the *orgeones* of Bendis in Classical and Hellenistic times with other *orgeones* whose cult was linked to local heroes and deities, with the former developing a mediating role in religion in the Athenian *polis* (21–44). C. Thomsen looks at the role of honour in the same period, noting how associations used sanctuaries for honorific display (e.g. decrees and public crownings), giving the associations both a public presence and a place in competition for recognition both in and beyond the boundaries of their sanctuaries (45–58).

P. Paschidis turns attention to associations in Roman Macedonia (59–78), arguing that the division between 'civic' cults and 'religious' associations is moribund. He convincingly argues that there are two religious strands in the evidence that cross these artificial distinctions. In the first strand groups form their collective identities by drawing on local histories, while in the other strand groups focused on mythical and ritual narratives linked to the area.

Delos is the focus of the following two essays, with C. Hasenohr looking at Italian associations on the island in the second through first centuries B.C.E. (79–92). Despite variations in names and activities, Hasenohr argues that there was a single association of *Italici*, comprised ostensibly of people of Italian origin, that manifests in various sub-groups. While economic and political connections to Rome gave this large association its prominence and power, the religious elements gave its members a sense of cohesion, even for those who were not of direct Italian descent (e.g. foreigners, slaves). M. Trümper uses features of the archaeological remains of the clubhouse of the 'Poseidoniastes' to identify two other possible club buildings on the island, with particular attention to sacred elements such as altars and especially *nymphaia* (93–124). While not secure in such identification, this is a methodologically important way forward for understanding the cultic and social purposes of buildings where we have no direct evidence of an associational connection. Much less is known about associations on Thera, although Skaltsa assesses five inscriptions from the third to second centuries B.C.E. to demonstrate that associations of foreigners coexisted with those of locals during the thriving period of the Ptolemaic presence there (125–48). Although there was a clear separation in terms of membership, the associations resemble one another in worshipping the same gods and undertaking similar cult and social practices.

Death and burial are the themes that link the next three essays even as they retain a geographic focus. S. Maillot looks broadly at the funerary activities of Hellenistic associations known through boundary stones and decrees, particularly on Rhodes and Kos (149–68). Rightly eschewing the categorisation of such groups as *collegium funeraticum*, she nevertheless shows how central were burial and commemoration to the self-understanding of the associations. There was a practicality to it — bodies need burying — but this was ritualised in religious and symbolic ways. J.-M. Carbon gives more attention to tomb markers and boundary stones set up by associations on Kos in the Hellenistic and Roman periods, drawing from them an impressive amount of information concerning the membership profile and organisational structure of the groups and pointing to their focus on local and foreign cults (169–206). While it is not possible to suggest a single model for understanding the groups on Kos as they varied in structure, that there were cult groups on the island is clear. Turning to more practical matters, P. Venticinque examines the economic dimensions of association burials in Ptolemaic and Roman Egypt (207–26). This fits into broader discussions of the economic dimensions of associational life — e.g. membership dues, economic situation of members, the role of patronage — and given the near ubiquity of member burial, Venticinque's paper provides an important starting point for probing the financial implications of the promise of a decent burial that proved attractive in recruitment and the subsequent network links that are forged through membership.

M. Paganini provides a detailed examination of *I.Prose* 40, an honorific inscription set up by an association of landowners for a benefactor, highlighting the distinction clear in many other associations between religious focus (here the cult of the king) and networking and social connections (227–48). These two elements should not be treated as separate since they work together in bonding group members. The scholarly binary between 'religious' and 'professional' associations is addressed directly in the next two essays. I. Arnaoutoglou rightly demonstrates the crucial element of cult in occupational associations as it is expressed both directly and indirectly (249–70). Such associations did not always worship a deity directly linked to their craft but often did participate in cult activities that were linked to panhellenic deities with no occupational connections. M. Gibbs similarly looks at religious activities of trade associations but with a specific focus on Roman Egypt as evidenced in papyri (271–86), demonstrating that religious activities such as sacrifices, pilgrimages and celebrations were central to the identity of group members. Finally, M. Gawlikowski looks at the epigraphic and archaeological evidence for

associations in Palmyra, where convivial activity (*marzeḥa*) was central to forging bonds and a sense of identity among members (287–301).

Overall, the essays herein broaden the scope of how scholars can talk about associations as 'religious', providing much detail and nuance about various cultic and social activities that gave associations their public presence and identity. Perhaps understandably, but also somewhat frustratingly, the essays deploy implicit presumptions about what is 'religion' without ever problematising or interrogating that category. Skaltsa and Cazemir note early on that it is 'omnipresent' and 'intertwined' with other elements of societies, 'which requires a careful and nuanced understanding distinct from modern perceptions of religion' (16), yet this is not pursued in full here or in other essays. Nevertheless, the essays in this volume provide the promised complex and versatile picture of associational life that includes but is not limited to elements that get classified as 'religious'.

Queen's University at Kingston RICHARD S. ASCOUGH
rsa@queensu.ca
doi:10.1017/S0075435823000795

© The Author(s), 2023. Published by Cambridge University Press on behalf of The Society for the Promotion of Roman Studies.

ANDREW CONNOR, *CONFISCATION OR COEXISTENCE: EGYPTIAN TEMPLES IN THE AGE OF AUGUSTUS* (New Texts from Ancient Cultures). Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 2022. Pp. xiii + 224: illus., facs., map, plan. ISBN 9780472133222 (hbk), 9780472220656 (ebook). £71.00/$75.00.

Andrew Connor investigates the historical narrative concerning Roman treatment of Egyptian religion in the years following Octavian's conquest of Egypt. This narrative centres on the alleged confiscation of property belonging to the Egyptian temples by the Roman authorities. The author argues convincingly that no such confiscation happened and that temples were not made compliant by removing their land holdings, a procedure that supposedly contributed to the collapse of Egyptian religion.

After the introduction, the book is structured in two parts. Part I, ch. 2 comprises the examination of the available texts said to reference the confiscation of scared land. Ch. 3 looks at how the priests phrased the rhetoric of loss and chaos. Ch. 4 offers an interpretation of the references in priestly petitions to conflict between the temples and the Romans regarding sacred land. In Part II, the author turns to the wider context of Roman behaviour: ch. 5 considers the possible Roman motivation for confiscation. Ch. 6 investigates how confiscation could have worked in practice. Ch. 7 explores the question of why the confiscation narrative made such inherent sense to the scholars who established and accepted it in the early twentieth century.

Temple building was the most monumental, and thus visible, expression of the authorities' commitment in Egypt. If the Romans had indeed confiscated temple property, it would have had serious, far-reaching implications, which, according to C., cannot be observed in the documents. He therefore refutes the confiscation theory. His book is based mainly on a new interpretation of *P.Tebt.* 2.302 (71–72 C.E.), the key document for the confiscation theory. It was excavated by Grenfell and Hunt at Tebtunis during their 1899–1900 season and published by them in 1907. In an appendix, C. presents the Greek transcript as well as Grenfell and Hunt's English translation. He shows that, from this one fragmentary document, they extrapolated a country-wide confiscation of temple land. He explains that the British historians were affected by their own colonial perspective towards Egypt. If examined without imposing the views of the early twentieth century, the papyrus shows a localised property dispute, not an attestation of a province-wide policy. To describe the relationships between the Egyptian priests and the Roman state, C. explores the linguistic and socio-cultural contexts through a range of further documents, mostly Greek and some Demotic. His logical arguments offer an insight into the negotiations of Egyptian priests with the Roman administration concerning their property.

The book takes a welcome interdisciplinary approach, considering both Roman understanding and priestly expectations. It does not, however, look at the temples themselves, which would have