

# THE REVIEW OF SYMBOLIC LOGIC

## **Edited by**

Andrew Arana, *Coordinating Editor*

Wesley Holliday

Rosalie Iemhoff

Peter Koellner

Carsten Lutz

David Ripley

Robert van Rooij

Jamie Tappenden

Sara Uckelman

Charlotte Werndl

**VOLUME 9 • NUMBER 4 • DECEMBER 2016 • ISSN 1755-0203**

Copyright © 2016 by the Association for Symbolic Logic. All rights reserved.

Reproduction by photostat, photo-print, microfilm, or like process by permission only.

# **THE REVIEW OF SYMBOLIC LOGIC**

## **Coordinating Editor**

Andrew Arana

*Department of Philosophy, University of Paris 1 Panthéon-Sorbonne*

## **Editors**

Wesley Holliday  
*Department of Philosophy  
University of California, Berkeley*

Jamie Tappenden  
*Department of Philosophy  
University of Michigan*

Rosalie Iemhoff  
*Department of Philosophy  
Utrecht University*

Sara Uckelman  
*Department of Philosophy  
Durham University*

Peter Koellner  
*Department of Philosophy  
Harvard University*

Robert van Rooij  
*Department of Philosophy and  
Institute for Logic  
University of Amsterdam*

Carsten Lutz  
*Department of Computer Science  
University of Bremen*

David Ripley  
*Department of Philosophy  
University of Connecticut*

Charlotte Werndl  
*Department of Philosophy  
University of Salzburg*

## **Advisory Board**

Maria Aloni  
*Department of Philosophy and Institute  
for Logic, Language and Computation  
University of Amsterdam*

Penelope Maddy  
*Department of Logic and Philosophy  
of Science  
University of California, Irvine*

Roy Cook  
*Department of Philosophy and Minnesota  
Center for Philosophy of Science  
University of Minnesota*

Edwin Mares  
*School of History, Philosophy, Political  
Science & International Relations  
Victoria University of Wellington*

J. Michael Dunn  
*Departments of Computer Science  
and Philosophy  
Indiana University*

Rohit Parikh  
*Department of Computer  
and Information Science Brooklyn College,  
City University of New York*

Richard G. Heck  
*Department of Philosophy  
Brown University*

Greg Restall  
*Department of Philosophy  
University of Melbourne*

Geoffrey Hellman  
*Department of Philosophy  
University of Minnesota*

Stewart Shapiro  
*Department of Philosophy  
Ohio State University*

Juliette Kennedy  
*Department of Mathematics  
and Statistics  
University of Helsinki*

Gila Sher  
*Department of Philosophy  
University of California, San Diego*

Elaine Landry  
*Department of Philosophy  
University of California, Davis*

Achille C. Varzi  
*Department of Philosophy  
Columbia University*

Bernard Linsky  
*Department of Philosophy  
University of Alberta*

Rineke Verbrugge  
*Institute of Artificial Intelligence  
University of Groningen*

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

Preservation of Admissible Rules When Combining Logics JOÃO RASGA, CRISTINA SERNADAS, AND AMÍLCAR SERNADAS .....	641
Privative Negation in <i>The Port Royal Logic</i> JOHN N. MARTIN.....	664
The Logic of Leibniz's <i>Generales Inquisitiones de Analysi Notionum et Veritatum</i> MARKO MALINK AND ANUBAV VASUDEVAN.....	686
Realizability Semantics for Quantified Modal Logic: Generalizing Flagg's 1985 Construction BENJAMIN G. RIN AND SEAN WALSH .....	752
Trial and Error Mathematics II: Dialectical Sets and Quasidialectical Sets, Their Degrees, and their Distribution within the Class of Limit Sets JACOPO AMIDEI, DUCCIO PIANIGIANI, LUCA SAN MAURO, AND ANDREA SORBI .....	810
Surreal Time and Ultratasks HAIDAR AL-DHALIMY AND CHARLES J. GEYER .....	836

**Subscription Information:** *Review of Symbolic Logic* (ISSN 1755-0203) is published quarterly by Cambridge University Press for the Association for Symbolic Logic. Annual subscription rates for Volume 9 (2016): Institutional subscription rates, print and online: US \$1004.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK £630.00 + VAT elsewhere. Institutional subscription rates, online only: US \$861.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK £542.00 + VAT elsewhere. Institutional subscription rates, print only: US \$977.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK £609.00 + VAT elsewhere. Individual subscription rates, online only: US \$207.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK £129.00 + VAT elsewhere. Individual subscription rates, print only: US \$232.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK £129.00 + VAT elsewhere. Institutional subscription correspondence should be sent to: Cambridge University Press, One Liberty Plaza, New York, NY 10006, USA, for customers in the USA, Canada, or Mexico. Customers elsewhere should contact: Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK.

**Association for Symbolic Logic.** Individual Members of the Association for Symbolic Logic receive a print subscription to *The Review of Symbolic Logic* as a benefit of membership. Requests for information, applications for membership, orders for back volumes, business correspondence, and notices and announcements for publication in the *The Bulletin of Symbolic Logic* should be sent to the Secretary-Treasurer of the Association: **Charles Steinhorn, ASL, Box 742, Vassar College, 124 Raymond Avenue, Poughkeepsie, NY 12604, USA.** The email address of the Association's business office is [asl@vassar.edu](mailto:asl@vassar.edu). The ASL website is located at <http://www.aslonline.org>. Links from that site provide further information on the *Review* and on submitting papers for publication.

**Coordinating Editor:** Andrew Arana, University Paris 1 Panthéon-Sorbonne, UFR 10 Philosophy, Institut d'histoire et de philosophie des sciences et des techniques (IHPST), 13 rue de Four, 75006 Paris, France. Email: [andrew.arana@univ-paris1.fr](mailto:andrew.arana@univ-paris1.fr).

**Copyright:** All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopy, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. Photocopying information for users in the U.S.A.: Copying for internal or personal use beyond that permitted by Sec. 107 or 108 of the U.S. Copyright Law is authorized for users duly registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC) Transaction Reporting Service, provided that the appropriate remittance per article is paid directly to CCC, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923, USA. Specific written permission must be obtained for all other copying. General enquiries from the USA, Mexico, and Canada should be addressed to the New York office of Cambridge University Press <http://www.cambridge.org/us/information/rights/contacts/newyork.htm>; general enquiries from elsewhere should be addressed to the Cambridge office <http://www.cambridge.org/uk/information/rights/contacts/cambridge.htm>; permission enquiries from Australia and New Zealand should be addressed to the Melbourne office [http://www.cambridge.org/aus/information/contacts\\_melbourne.htm](http://www.cambridge.org/aus/information/contacts_melbourne.htm); enquiries regarding Spanish-language translation rights (only) should be addressed to the Madrid office <http://www.cambridge.org/uk/information/rights/contacts/madrid.htm>

Copyright © Association for Symbolic Logic, 2016