

# The JOURNAL of ECONOMIC HISTORY

VOLUME 53

DECEMBER 1993

NUMBER 4

PUBLISHED FOR  
THE ECONOMIC HISTORY ASSOCIATION  
IN COOPERATION WITH  
THE UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA-DAVIS

POPE AND WITHERS

*Do Migrants Rob Jobs? Lessons of Australian History, 1861–1991*

RAZZELL

*The Growth of Population in Eighteenth-Century England: A Critical Reappraisal*

BROADBERRY

*Manufacturing and the Convergence Hypothesis: What the Long-Run Data Show*

KIM AND FISHBACK

*Institutional Change, Compensating Differentials, and Accident Risk in American Railroading, 1892–1945*

LEWCHUK

*Men and Monotony: Fraternalism as a Managerial Strategy at the Ford Motor Company*

WHEELOCK

*Government Policy and Banking Market Structure in the 1920s*

EMMONS

*Franklin D. Roosevelt, Electric Utilities, and the Power of Competition*

NOTES AND DISCUSSION: THIES AND GERLOWSKI

REVIEW ARTICLE: BOYER

CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

# THE JOURNAL OF ECONOMIC HISTORY

ISSN 0022-0507

*Published for the Economic History Association in cooperation  
with the University of California, Davis, by Cambridge University Press*

## EDITORS

PETER H. LINDERT      NAOMI R. LAMOREAUX

## EDITORIAL STAFF

PAMELA EVANS AND LARRY S. CARNEY, *ASSISTANT EDITORS*  
WILLIAM H. BECKER, *ASSOCIATION BUSINESS MANAGER*

## EDITORIAL BOARD

Michael Bernstein, *California, San Diego*  
George R. Boyer, *Cornell*  
Judith C. Brown, *Stanford*  
Louis P. Cain, *Loyola*  
Ann Carlos, *Colorado, Boulder*  
Bernard Elbaum, *California, Santa Cruz*  
Price Fishback, *Arizona*  
Farley Grubb, *Delaware*  
Timothy Hatton, *Essex*  
Carol Heim, *Massachusetts, Amherst*

Philip T. Hoffman, *California Institute of Technology*  
Cormac Ó Gráda, *University College, Dublin*  
Edwin J. Perkins, *University of Southern California*  
Angela Redish, *British Columbia*  
Gary Saxonhouse, *Michigan*  
Carole Shammass, *California, Riverside*  
Kenneth Sokoloff, *California, Los Angeles*  
Richard H. Steckel, *Ohio State*  
John Wallis, *Maryland*  
Eugene N. White, *Rutgers*

**Aims and Scope:** *The Journal of Economic History* seeks to promote the scholarly study of economic aspects of the human past from a diversity of perspectives, notably those of economists and historians. By encouraging careful formulation of issues and clear exposition of methods, THE JOURNAL hopes to stimulate discourse among scholars with varied interests and modes of inquiry.

THE JOURNAL is abstracted in *The Journal of Economic Literature*, which is part of the DIALOG on-line data service.

**Instructions for Contributors:** Articles on economic history and related aspects of history or economics will be considered for publication by the Editors on the understanding that the articles have not previously been published and are not under consideration elsewhere. Papers should indicate the wider significance of detailed original research findings as well as the logic and limitations of specialized techniques of analysis. Comments and shorter notes are also welcome. THE JOURNAL does not accept unsolicited book reviews, nor can it honor requests to review particular works. Contributions should be kept within 35 double-spaced pages, inclusive of footnotes, references, figures, and tables. Three copies of each manuscript should be submitted. Prospective contributors may obtain a copy of the Style Sheet for THE JOURNAL from the Editorial Office. A submission fee of \$20.00 or a year's membership (fee schedule below) is required from nonmembers of the Association.

**Editorial Office Address:** The Editors, *The Journal of Economic History*, Agricultural History Center, 378 Voorhies Hall, University of California, Davis, CA 95616-8513, U.S.A. Telephone: (916) 752-5608.

**Association Office Address and Membership Information:** Individuals who are members of the Economic History Association receive THE JOURNAL as part of their annual dues. Membership rates (in U.S. dollars) are \$30.00 for those with income above \$30,000 a year; \$25.00 for those with income below \$30,000; \$15.00 for students and for professors emeriti who have been members of the Association for ten years; \$600.00 for life membership. Payment of an *additional* \$20.00 permits joint membership with the Economic History Society (UK). Applications and inquiries concerning membership should be addressed to the Economic History Association, Dept. of History, George Washington University, Washington, DC 20052, U.S.A.

**Subscription, Publishing, and Advertising Office Address:** Cambridge University Press, 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, U.S.A.; or Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 2RU, England.

**Subscription Information:** *The Journal of Economic History* is published quarterly in March, June, September, and December. Annual institutional subscription rate (1993) is US \$75.00 in the United States, Canada, and Mexico, UK £42.00 elsewhere. Individuals may subscribe by becoming a member of the Economic History Association (see above). Prices include surface postage and insurance.

## Copyright © 1993 The Economic History Association

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopying, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. *Photocopying information for users in the U.S.A.:* The Item-Fee Code for the publication (0022-0507/93 \$5.00 + .00) indicates that copying for internal or personal use beyond that permitted by Sec. 107 or 108 of the U.S. Copyright Law is authorized for users duly registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC) Transaction Reporting Service, provided that the appropriate remittance of \$5.00 per article is paid directly to CCC, 27 Congress Street, Salem, MA 01970. Specific written permission must be obtained for all other copying.

*The Journal of Economic History* (USPS 279-580) is published quarterly by Cambridge University Press. Second-class postage paid at New York, NY and additional mailing offices. Postmaster: Send address changes to *The Journal of Economic History*, Cambridge University Press, 110 Midland Avenue, Port Chester, NY 10573-9864.

Printed in the United States of America.

**THE JOURNAL  
OF ECONOMIC HISTORY**

---

Volume 53

December 1993

Number 4

**ARTICLES**

DAVID POPE AND GLENN WITHERS  
*Do Migrants Rob Jobs? Lessons of Australian History, 1861–1991* 719

PETER RAZZELL  
*The Growth of Population in Eighteenth-Century England: A  
Critical Reappraisal* 743

STEPHEN N. BROADBERRY  
*Manufacturing and the Convergence Hypothesis: What the Long-  
Run Data Show* 772

SEUNG-WOOK KIM AND PRICE V. FISHBACK  
*Institutional Change, Compensating Differentials, and Accident  
Risk in American Railroading, 1892–1945* 796

WAYNE A. LEWCHUK  
*Men and Monotony: Fraternalism as a Managerial Strategy at the  
Ford Motor Company* 824

DAVID C. WHEELOCK  
*Government Policy and Banking Market Structure in the 1920s* 857

WILLIAM M. EMMONS III  
*Franklin D. Roosevelt, Electric Utilities, and the Power of  
Competition* 880

**NOTES AND DISCUSSION**

CLIFFORD THIES AND DANIEL GERLOWSKI  
*Bank Capital and Bank Failure, 1921–1932: Testing the White  
Hypothesis* 908

**REVIEW ARTICLE**

GEORGE R. BOYER  
*England's Two Agricultural Revolutions* 915

**EDITORS' NOTES** 924

## REVIEWS OF BOOKS

### EARLY MODERN

- PRICE. *Perry of London: A Family and a Firm on the Seaborne Frontier, 1615–1753* M. Egnal 929
- WOOLF, Ed. *Domestic Strategies: Work and Family in France and Italy, 1600–1800* J. Coffin 930

### MODERN EUROPE

- CAMPBELL AND OVERTON, Eds. *Land, Labour and Livestock* P. Dillon 931
- THOMPSON, Ed. *The Cambridge Social History of Britain, 1750–1950: Vols. 1–3* G. Robb 932
- BROSE. *The Politics of Technological Change in Prussia: Out of the Shadow of Antiquity, 1809–1848* J. M. Brophy 934
- MAGRAW. *A History of the French Working Class: Vols. 1–2* G. Friedman 936
- DRIVER. *Power and Pauperism: The Workhouse System, 1834–1884* T. Guinnane 937
- GILBERT. *Class, Community, and Collective Action: Social Change in Two British Coalfields, 1850–1926* D. Greasley 938
- CINEL. *The National Integration of Italian Return Migration, 1870–1929* L. P. Mach 939
- DALY. *Industrial Development and Irish National Identity, 1922–1939* K. O'Rourke 940
- GIERSCH, PAQUÉ, AND SCHMIEDING. *The Fading Miracle: Four Decades of Market Economy in Germany* R. Tilly 942

### MIDDLE EAST AND ASIA

- HANSEN. *The Political Economy of Poverty, Equity, and Growth: Egypt and Turkey* A. Richards 943
- CHATTERJI. *Trade, Tariffs and Empire: Lancashire and British Policy in India 1919–1939* T. Sethia 946
- PRAKASH, Ed. *The World of the Rural Labourer in Colonial India* G. Clark 947
- WRIGHT, Ed. *The Chinese Economy in the Early Twentieth Century: Recent Chinese Studies* T. R. Gottschang 948

### LATIN AMERICA

- QUIROZ. *Domestic and Foreign Finance in Modern Peru, 1850–1950: Financing Visions of Development* A. J. Bauer 949
- EDELMAN. *The Logic of the Latifundio: The Large Estates of Northwestern Costa Rica Since the Late Nineteenth Century* P. Cantor 950
- GARNER, WITH STEFANO. *Economic Growth and Change in Bourbon Mexico* W. Borah 951

### UNITED STATES AND CANADA

- VAN WEST. *Capitalism on the Frontier: Billings and the Yellowstone Valley in the Nineteenth Century* P. Roberts 952

ODELL. <i>Capital Mobilization and Regional Financial Markets: The Pacific Coast States, 1850–1920</i>	H. Rogers	954
HITCH. <i>Islands in Transition: The Past, Present, and Future of Hawaii's Economy</i>	S. J. La Croix	955
DICK AND FLOYD. <i>Canada and the Gold Standard: Balance-of-Payments Adjustment Under Fixed Exchange Rates, 1871–1913</i>	G. Rich	956
FLAMMING. <i>Creating the Modern South: Millhands and Managers in Dalton, Georgia, 1884–1984</i>	P. Nickless	958
FRAGER. <i>Sweatshop Strife: Class, Ethnicity, and Gender in the Jewish Labour Movement of Toronto, 1900–1939</i>	F. J. Schryer	959
LICHTENSTEIN AND HARRIS, Eds. <i>Industrial Democracy in America: The Ambiguous Promise</i>	D. Witwer	960
GRANDY. <i>New Jersey and the Fiscal Origins of Modern American Corporation Law</i>	G. D. Libecap	962
ZELDEN. <i>Justice Lies in the District: The U.S. District Court, Southern District of Texas, 1902–1960</i>	J. B. Wahl	963
MEYER. "Stalin Over Wisconsin": <i>The Making and Unmaking of Militant Unionism, 1900–1950</i>	R. C. Haney	964
CORTADA. <i>Before the Computer: IBM, NCR, Burroughs, and Remington Rand and the Industry They Created, 1865–1956</i>	J. Yates	966
YATES. <i>Control Through Communication: The Rise of System in American Management</i>	E. Englander	967
LESLIE. <i>The Cold War and American Science: The Military-Industrial-Academic Complex at MIT and Stanford</i>	G. E. Bugos	968

#### ECONOMIC THOUGHT

TILMAN. <i>Thorstein Veblen and His Critics, 1891–1963: Conservative, Liberal, and Radical Perspectives</i>	T. K. McCraw	969
BOTTOMORE. <i>Between Marginalism and Marxism: The Economic Sociology of J. S. Schumpeter</i>	E. R. Canterbury	971
ALLAN, Ed. <i>A Critique of Keynesian Economics</i>	R. E. Prasch	972
EKINS AND MAX-NEEF, Eds. <i>Real-Life Economics: Understanding Wealth Creation</i>	M. Stack	973

#### GENERAL AND MISCELLANEOUS

BREWER AND PORTER, Eds. <i>Consumption and the World of Goods</i>	E. L. Jones	975
BERRY. <i>America's Utopian Experiments: Communal Havens from Long-Wave Crises</i>	C. J. Guarneri	976
MCCLOSKEY, Ed. <i>Second Thoughts: Myths and Morals of U.S. Economic History</i>	E. J. Perkins	977
ROGERS. <i>The Future of American Banking: Managing for Change</i>	B. J. Klebaner	978
KRUEGER. <i>Economic Policies at Cross-Purposes: The United States and Developing Countries</i>	M. Wilkins	979

**INDEX TO VOLUME 53** 982

**CONTRIBUTORS TO VOLUME 53** 991

# CONTENTS OF VOLUME 53

## *Number 1, March*

### ARTICLES

MOSHE BUCHINSKY AND BEN POLAK	The Emergence of a National Capital Market in England, 1710–1880 .....	1
STEFAN E. OPERS	The Interest Rate Effect of Dutch Money in Eighteenth- Century Britain .....	25
NATHAN SUSSMAN	Debasements, Royal Revenues, and Inflation in France During the Hundred Years' War, 1415–1422 .....	44
ARTHUR VAN RIEL AND ARTHUR SCHRAM	Weimar Economic Decline, Nazi Economic Recovery, and the Stabilization of Political Dictatorship .....	71
JOHN MAJEWSKI, CHRISTOPHER BAER, AND DANIEL B. KLEIN	Responding to Relative Decline: The Plank Road Boom of Antebellum New York .....	106
LEE A. CRAIG AND ROBERT M. FEARN	Wage Discrimination and Occupational Crowding in a Competitive Industry: Evidence from the American Whaling Industry .....	123
<b>NOTES AND DISCUSSION</b>		
SCOTT SUMNER	Colonial Currency and the Quantity Theory of Money: A Critique of Smith's Interpretation .....	139
DOUGLAS A. IRWIN	Free Trade and Protection in Nineteenth-Century Britain and France Revisited: A Comment on Nye .....	146
JOHN VINCENT NYE	Reply to Irwin on Free Trade .....	153
<b>EDITORS' NOTES</b>	.....	159
<b>REVIEWS OF BOOKS</b>	.....	163

---

## *Number 2, June*

### Papers Presented at the Fifty-Second Annual Meeting of the Economic History Association

MOSES ABRAMOVITZ (Presidential Address)	The Search for the Sources of Growth: Areas of Ignorance, Old and New .....	217
SUE BOWDEN AND PAUL TURNER	The Demand for Consumer Durables in the United Kingdom in the Interwar Period .....	244
DAVID R. WEIR	Parental Consumption Decisions and Child Health During the Early French Fertility Decline, 1790–1914 .....	259
NANCY FOLBRE AND BARNET WAGMAN	Counting Housework: New Estimates of Real Product in the United States, 1800–1860 .....	275
B. ZORINA KHAN AND KENNETH L. SOKOLOFF	“Schemes of Practical Utility”: Entrepreneurship and Innovation Among “Great Inventors” in the United States, 1790–1865 .....	289
ELEANOR VON ENDE AND THOMAS WEISS	Consumption of Farm Output and Economic Growth in the Old Northwest, 1800–1860 .....	308
METIN M. COŞGEL	Religious Culture and Economic Performance: Agricultural Productivity of the Amish, 1850–80 .....	319
MARY ESCHELBACH GREGSON	Rural Response to Increased Demand: Crop Choice in the Midwest, 1860–1880 .....	332
KRIS INWOOD AND PHYLLIS WAGG	The Survival of Handloom Weaving in Rural Canada Circa 1870 .....	346
CHRISTOPHER GRANDY	Original Intent and the Sherman Antitrust Act: A Re- examination of the Consumer-Welfare Hypothesis .....	359
JOAN NIX AND DAVID GABEL	AT&T's Strategic Response to Competition: Why Not Preempt Entry? .....	377
<b>DOCTORAL CANDIDATES</b>	Summaries of Doctoral Dissertations of Joseph P. Ferrie, Andrew R. Rutten, Margaret C. Levenstein, Alan Dye, Paul Huck, and Pierre Sicsic .....	388
	Discussion by Kenneth L. Sokoloff and Gregory Clark .....	404
<b>EDITORS' NOTES</b>	.....	411
<b>REVIEWS OF BOOKS</b>	.....	415

---

Number 3, September

ARTICLES

ANN M. CARLOS AND FRANK D. LEWIS	Indians, the Beaver, and the Bay: The Economics of Depletion in the Lands of the Hudson's Bay Company, 1700–1763 .....	465
JENNY BOURNE WAHL	The Bondsman's Burden: An Economic Analysis of the Jurisprudence of Slaves and Common Carriers .....	495
LEE A. CRAIG AND THOMAS WEISS	Agricultural Productivity Growth During the Decade of the Civil War .....	527
PETER RAPPOPORT AND EUGENE N. WHITE	Was There a Bubble in the 1929 Stock Market? .....	549
TIMOTHY J. HATTON AND JEFFREY G. WILLIAMSON	After the Famine: Emigration from Ireland, 1850–1913 .....	575
SUSAN WOLCOTT	Keynes Versus Churchill: Revaluation and British Unemployment in the 1920s .....	601
MITSUHIKO KIMURA	Standards of Living in Colonial Korea: Did the Masses Become Worse Off or Better Off Under Japanese Rule? ..	629

NOTES AND  
DISCUSSION

SUMNER J. LA CROIX AND CHRISTOPHER GRANDY	Financial Integration in Antebellum America: Strengthening Bodenhorn's Results .....	653
--	---	-----

EDITORS' NOTES	.....	659
----------------	-------	-----

REVIEWS OF BOOKS	.....	660
------------------	-------	-----

---

Number 4, December

ARTICLES

DAVID POPE AND GLENN WITHERS PETER RAZZELL	Do Migrants Rob Jobs? Lessons of Australian History, 1861–1991 .....	719
STEPHEN N. BROADBERRY	The Growth of Population in Eighteenth-Century England: A Critical Reappraisal .....	743
SEUNG-WOOK KIM AND PRICE V. FISHBACK	Manufacturing and the Convergence Hypothesis: What the Long-Run Data Show .....	772
WAYNE A. LEWCHUK	Institutional Change, Compensating Differentials, and Accident Risk in American Railroading, 1892–1945 .....	796
DAVID C. WHEELOCK	Men and Monotony: Fraternalism as a Managerial Strategy at the Ford Motor Company .....	824
WILLIAM M. EMMONS III	Government Policy and Banking Market Structure in the 1920s .....	857
	Franklin D. Roosevelt, Electric Utilities, and the Power of Competition .....	880

NOTES AND  
DISCUSSION

CLIFFORD THIES AND DANIEL GERLOWSKI	Bank Capital and Bank Failure, 1921–1932: Testing the White Hypothesis .....	908
--	---	-----

REVIEW ARTICLE

GEORGE R. BOYER	England's Two Agricultural Revolutions .....	915
-----------------	--	-----

EDITORS' NOTES	.....	924
----------------	-------	-----

REVIEWS OF BOOKS	.....	929
------------------	-------	-----