

SLAVIC REVIEW

FALL 2004

American Quarterly of Russian, Eurasian, and East European Studies

DISCUSSION

- Stephen F. Cohen** *Was the Soviet System Reformable?*
- Archie Brown** *The Soviet Union: Reform of the System or Systemic Transformation?*
- Mark Kramer** *The Reform of the Soviet System and the Demise of the Soviet State*
- Karen Dawisha** *The Question of Questions: Was the Soviet Union Worth Saving?*
- Stephen E. Hanson** *Reform and Revolution in the Late Soviet Context*
- Georgi M. Derlugian** *Alternative Pasts, Future Alternatives*
- Stephen F. Cohen** *A Reply*

ARTICLES

- Irina Paert** *Regulating Old Believer Marriage: Ritual, Legality, and Conversion in Nicholas I's Russia*
- Lilya Kaganovsky** *How the Soviet Man Was (Un)Made*
- Ann Komaromi** *The Material Existence of Soviet Samizdat*

EDITOR

DIANE P. KOENKER

ASSOCIATE EDITOR, JANE T. HEDGES

EDITORIAL ASSISTANTS

MARGARETHE ADAMS

SHARYL CORRADO

MICHAEL G. FINDLEY

EDITORIAL BOARD

History

Padraic Kenney, *University of Colorado* • Valerie Kivelson, *University of Michigan* • David R. Marples, *University of Alberta* • Louise McReynolds, *University of Hawai'i* • Donald J. Raleigh, *University of North Carolina* • Elise Kimerling Wirtschafter, *California State Polytechnic University, Pomona*

Literature

Eliot Borenstein, *New York University* • Edith W. Clowes, *University of Kansas* • Susanne Fusso, *Wesleyan University* • Marcus C. Levitt, *University of Southern California* • Harriet Murav, *University of Illinois, Urbana-Champaign* • Andrew Baruch Wachtel, *Northwestern University*

Social Sciences

Cynthia Buckley, *University of Texas* • Valerie Bunce, *Cornell University* • Gerald Creed, *Hunter College and the Graduate Center, CUNY* • Stephen E. Hanson, *University of Washington* • Barry Ickes, *Pennsylvania State University* • Nancy Ries, *Colgate University*

The editors assume no responsibility for statements of fact or opinion made by contributors.

Slavic Review (formerly *The American Slavic and East European Review*) is published quarterly by the American Association for the Advancement of Slavic Studies, Inc., and is sent to all association members. Members also receive *NewsNet*, the AAASS newsletter. Membership is open to individuals interested in Slavic studies and the study of the non-Slavic peoples of eastern Europe and Eurasia. Applications for membership are accepted by the AAASS, 8 Story Street, Cambridge, MA 02138; (617) 495-0677.

Membership Dues: students or those with salaries under \$20,000—\$30.00; those with salaries \$20,000–\$29,999—\$45.00; \$30,000–\$39,999—\$65.00; \$40,000–\$49,999—\$75.00; \$50,000–\$59,999—\$90.00; \$60,000–\$69,999—\$105.00; \$70,000–\$99,999—\$125.00; \$100,000 and over—\$150.00. Joint members with one subscription to *Slavic Review*, add \$30.00 to dues of higher paid member. Subscriptions without membership are \$130.00. For members or subscribers living in Canada or Mexico, please add \$20.00 for shipping; for members living overseas, please add \$35.00. Single current issues and back issues to subscribers are \$25.00; for members, \$20.00 each. Correspondence regarding membership, subscriptions, changes of address, or items for *NewsNet* should be sent to the AAASS headquarters at Cambridge.

Published by the American Association for the Advancement of Slavic Studies, Inc. Cover design by B. Williams & Associates, Durham, North Carolina; the typeface Mason is from Emigre Fonts. Text set in Baskerville by G&S Typesetters, Inc., Austin, Texas. Printed by Cadmus Professional Communications, Ephrata, Pennsylvania. Periodicals postage paid at Boston, Massachusetts, and additional mailing offices. POSTMASTER: Send address changes to AAASS, 8 Story Street, Cambridge, MA 02138.

Copyright © 2004 *Slavic Review* ISSN 0037-6779 by the American Association for the Advancement of Slavic Studies, Inc. Permission to reprint must generally be obtained from the association's office. Copying is permitted in accordance with the fair use guidelines of the US Copyright act of 1976. The association permits the following additional educational uses without permission or payment of fees: academic libraries may place materials from *Slavic Review* on reserve (in multiple photocopied or electronically retrievable form) for students enrolled in specific courses; teachers may reproduce or have reproduced multiple copies (in photocopied or electronic form) for students in their courses. Those wishing to reproduce material from *Slavic Review* for any other purpose (general distribution, advertising or promotion, creating new collective works, resale, etc.) must obtain permission from the association.

(continued on inside back cover)

SLAVIC REVIEW

AMERICAN QUARTERLY OF RUSSIAN, EURASIAN, AND EAST EUROPEAN STUDIES

VOLUME 63 NUMBER 3 • FALL 2004

CONTRIBUTORS	vii
ABSTRACTS	ix
DISCUSSION	
Was the Soviet System Reformable? STEPHEN F. COHEN	459
The Soviet Union: Reform of the System or Systemic Transformation? ARCHIE BROWN	489
The Reform of the Soviet System and the Demise of the Soviet State MARK KRAMER	505
The Question of Questions: Was the Soviet Union Worth Saving? KAREN DAWISHA	513
Reform and Revolution in the Late Soviet Context STEPHEN E. HANSON	527
Alternative Pasts, Future Alternatives? GEORGI M. DERLUGUIAN	535
A Reply STEPHEN F. COHEN	553

ARTICLES

- Regulating Old Believer Marriage: Ritual, Legality, and Conversion in Nicholas I's Russia 555
IRINA PAERT
- How the Soviet Man Was (Un)Made 577
LILYA KAGANOVSKY
- The Material Existence of Soviet Samizdat 597
ANN KOMAROMI

BOOK REVIEWS

- Daniel C. Thomas, *The Helsinki Effect: International Norms, Human Rights, and the Demise of Communism* (Patrick O'Neil) 619
- Renée de Nevers, *Comrades No More: The Seeds of Change in Eastern Europe* (Padraic Kenney) 619
- Marc Morjé Howard, *The Weakness of Civil Society in Post-Communist Europe* (John K. Glenn) 621
- Stephen White, Judy Batt, and Paul G. Lewis, eds., *Developments in Central and East European Politics 3* (Minton F. Goldman) 622
- Tamar L. Gutner, *Banking on the Environment: Multilateral Development Banks and Their Environmental Performance in Central and Eastern Europe* (Tomasz Zylicz) 623
- John Anderson, *Religious Liberty in Transitional Societies: The Politics of Religion* (Derek H. Davis) 624
- Zoltan Barany, *The Future of NATO Expansion: Four Case Studies* (Joyce P. Kaufman) 625
- Martin Åberg and Mikael Sandberg, *Social Capital and Democratisation: Roots of Trust in Post-Communist Poland and Ukraine* (Kristin Bremer) 626
- Marjorie Castle, *Triggering Communism's Collapse: Perceptions and Power in Poland's Transition* (Renée de Nevers) 627
- Bożena Shallcross, ed., *Framing the Polish Home: Postwar Cultural Constructions of Hearth, Nation, and Self* (Ewa Thompson) 628
- Matthias Freise and Andreas Lawaty, eds., *Aleksander Wat und "sein" Jahrhundert* (Joachim T. Baer) 630
- Dejan Djokić, ed., *Yugoslavism: Histories of a Failed Idea, 1918–1992* (Carol S. Lilly) 631

Klaus Schmider, <i>Partisanenkrieg in Jugoslawien 1941–1944</i> (John K. Cox)	633
Rusmir Mahmutćehajić, <i>Sarajevo Essays: Politics, Ideology, and Tradition</i> (Mitja Velikonja)	634
Raju G. C. Thomas, ed., <i>Yugoslavia Unraveled: Sovereignty, Self-Determination, Intervention</i> (Stephen J. Blank)	636
Paulin Kola, <i>The Myth of Greater Albania</i> (Julie A. Mertus)	636
Teuvo Laitila, <i>The Finnish Guard in the Balkans: Heroism, Imperial Loyalty and Finnishness in the Russo-Turkish War of 1877–1878 as Recollected in the Memoirs of Finnish Guardsmen</i> (Joshua Sanborn)	638
Karsten Brüggemann, <i>Die Gründung der Republik Estland und das Ende des “Einen und unteilbaren Rußland”: Die Petrograder Front des Russischen Bürgerkrieges, 1918–1920</i> (Anders Henriksson)	639
Elaine Rusinko, <i>Straddling Borders: Literature and Identity in Subcarpathian Rus'</i> (Natalie Kononenko)	640
Myroslav Shkandrij, <i>Russia and Ukraine: Literature and the Discourse of Empire from Napoleonic to Postcolonial Times</i> (Paul M. Austin)	641
Erika Harber, <i>The Myth of the Non-Russian: Iskander and Aitmatov's Magical Universe</i> (Nadya Peterson)	642
Daniel Brower, <i>Turkestan and the Fate of the Russian Empire</i> (Michael Khodarkovsky)	643
Steven Sabol, <i>Russian Colonization and the Genesis of Kazak National Consciousness</i> (Paula A. Michaels)	645
Boris Rumer, ed., <i>Central Asia: A Gathering Storm?</i> (Anoushiravan Ehteshami)	646
Stephen Lovell, <i>Summerfolk: A History of the Dacha, 1710–2000</i> (Thomas Newlin)	647
Brian D. Taylor, <i>Politics and the Russian Army: Civil-Military Relations, 1689–2000</i> (Roger R. Reese)	648
Valerie A. Kivelson and Robert H. Greene, eds., <i>Orthodox Russia: Belief and Practice under the Tsars and Beyond</i> (Roy R. Robson)	649
Carsten Goehrke, <i>Russischer Alltag: Eine Geschichte in neun Zeitbildern vom Frühmittelalter bis zur Gegenwart. Vol. 1: Die Vormoderne</i> (Charles J. Halperin)	651
Elise Kimerling Wirtschafter, <i>The Play of Ideas in Russian Enlightenment Theater</i> (Lindsey Hughes)	652

- A. N. Zorin, N. V. Zorin, A. P. Kaplunovskii, E. B. Kaplunovskaia, E. V. Kliushnina, and L. Häfner, *Ocherki gorodskogo byta dorevoliutsionnogo Povolzh'ia* (Evel G. Economakis) 653
- Mark D. Steinberg, *Proletarian Imagination: Self, Modernity, and the Sacred in Russia, 1910–1925* (Orlando Figes) 654
- Joshua A. Sanborn, *Drafting the Russian Nation: Military Conscription, Total War, and Mass Politics, 1905–1925* (Yanni Kotsonis) 655
- Mauricio Borrero, *Hungry Moscow: Scarcity and Urban Society in the Russian Civil War, 1917–1921* (Jonathan D. Smele) 656
- L. N. Litoshenko, *Sotsializatsiia zemli v Rossii* (James Heinzen) 657
- David L. Hoffmann, *Stalinist Values: The Cultural Norms of Soviet Modernity, 1917–1941* (William B. Husband) 659
- Igal Halfin, *Terror in My Soul: Communist Autobiographies on Trial* (Catherine Merridale) 660
- James T. Andrews, *Science for the Masses: The Bolshevik State, Public Science, and the Popular Imagination in Soviet Russia, 1917–1934* (Ann Hibner Koblitz) 661
- Mary R. Habeck, *Storm of Steel: The Development of Armor Doctrine in Germany and the Soviet Union, 1919–1939* (Lennart Samuelson) 662
- Barry McLoughlin and Kevin McDermott, eds., *Stalin's Terror: High Politics and Mass Repression in the Soviet Union* (J. Arch Getty) 663
- R. W. Davies, Oleg Khlevniuk, E. A. Rees, Liudmila P. Kosheleva, and Larisa A. Rogovaya, comp. and eds., *The Stalin-Kaganovich Correspondence, 1931–36*, Russian documents translated by Steven Shabad (Nubuo Shimotomai) 665
- James V. Wertsch, *Voices of Collective Remembering* (Nancy Nelson) 665
- Robert Service, *Russia: Experiment with a People* (William Moskoff) 667
- Richard Rose and Neil Munro, *Elections without Order: Russia's Challenge to Vladimir Putin* (Andrew Kuchins) 668
- Tiffany A. Troxel, *Parliamentary Power in Russia, 1994–2001: President vs. Parliament* (Anton Steen) 669
- Vladimir Gel'man, Sergei Ryzhenkov, and Michael Brie, with Vladimir Avdonin, Boris Ovchinnikov, and Igor' Semenov, *Making and Breaking Democratic Transitions: The Comparative Politics of Russia's Regions* (Daniel S. Treisman) 670

Edward W. Walker, <i>Dissolution: Sovereignty and the Breakup of the Soviet Union</i> (Ben Fowkes)	671
Yegor Gaidar, ed., <i>The Economics of Transition</i> (Carol Scott Leonard)	673
Simon Clarke, <i>Making Ends Meet in Contemporary Russia: Secondary Employment, Subsidiary Agriculture and Social Networks</i> (Vladimir Gimpelson)	674
Sarah Ashwin and Simon Clarke, <i>Russian Trade Unions and Industrial Relations in Transition</i> (Debra Javeline)	675
Sascha L. Goluboff, <i>Jewish Russians: Upheavals in a Moscow Synagogue</i> (Betty N. Hoffman)	676
Nikolai V. Ssorin-Chaikov, <i>The Social Life of the State in Subarctic Siberia</i> (Victor L. Mote)	677
Elizabeth Wishnick, <i>Mending Fences: The Evolution of Moscow's China Policy from Brezhnev to Yeltsin</i> (Jan S. Prybyla)	678
Bobo Lo, <i>Russian Foreign Policy in the Post-Soviet Era: Reality, Illusion, and Mythmaking</i> (Peter Shearman)	679
Gabriel Gorodetsky, ed., <i>Russia between East and West: Russian Foreign Policy on the Threshold of the Twenty-First Century</i> (Robert D. English)	680
Janet G. Tucker, ed., <i>Against the Grain: Parody, Satire, and Intertextuality in Russian Literature</i> (Jeremy Hicks)	681
Sabina Siwczyk-Lammers, <i>Brjusov und die Zeitgeschichte: Eine Studie zur politischen Lyrik im russischen Symbolismus</i> (Avril Pyman)	682
Michael S. Gorham, <i>Speaking in Soviet Tongues: Language Culture and the Politics of Voice in Revolutionary Russia</i> (Catriona Kelly)	683
Maria Zalambani, <i>La morte del romanzo: Dall'avanguardia al realismo socialista</i> (Victor Terras)	684
Leonid Livak, <i>How It Was Done in Paris: Russian Émigré Literature and French Modernism</i> (G. S. Smith)	685
Nina Balz, <i>Zwischen Schock und Spiel: Narrative Möglichkeiten in der Kurzprosa Ljudmila Petruševskajas</i> (Benjamin M. Sutcliffe)	686
Emma Widdis, <i>Visions of a New Land: Soviet Film from the Revolution to the Second World War</i> (John E. Bowlt)	687
Nancy Perloff and Brian Reed, eds., <i>Situating El Lissitzky: Vitebsk, Berlin, Moscow</i> (Patricia Railing)	688

REFERENCE BOOKS OF 2002–2003: A SELECTION	690
COLLECTED ESSAYS	697
BOOKS RECEIVED	699
OBITUARY	703