


explain this phenomenon. She points to a notebook at Saint-Benoît-sur-Loire that had drawings added around the year 1000 of various antique sculptures, including Roman capital forms. She then turns to another collection of sketches, assembled in Limoges by Adhémar de Chabannes between 1010 and 1028, that in many instances bear a striking resemblance to details at Selles-sur-Cher. Kahn's evidence is compelling and is likely to generate much discussion among art historians in years to come.

Appending this volume are Latin editions and English translations of the various texts of Eusice's life and miracles, including Gregory's and Letaldus's. A second appendix transcribes with English translation an important charter in Selles-sur-Cher that mentions Béatrix and her husband's release of any jurisdictional claims over the church of Saint Eusice.

In sum, this model study advances our understanding of not only an important monument but, more broadly, the early development of Romanesque sculpture. It is essential reading for anyone interested in that history.

Kirk Ambrose 
University of Colorado Boulder
doi:10.1017/S0009640723000021

Heilige und Heiden im legendarischen Erzählen des 13. Jahrhunderts: Formen und Funktionen der Aushandlung des religiösen Gegensatzes zum Heidentum. By Felix Prautzsch. Literature–Theorie–Geschichte: Beiträge zu einer kulturwissenschaftlichen Mediävistik 20. Berlin and Boston: Walter de Gruyter, 2021. xii + 416 pp. \$118.99 cloth, Open Access at <https://doi.org/10.1515/9783110664720>.

Written as a dissertation under the direction of Marina Münkler, Felix Prautzsch's book examines encounters between Christians and non-Christians, or more specifically between Christian saints and their "heathen" opponents, in Latin and German hagiographic narratives produced in the thirteenth century. Prautzsch's argument is primarily formal, utilizing systems theory grounded in the work of Niklas Luhmann to analyze the structures through which *legenda* constructed and communicated meaning. However, Prautzsch also historically situates these texts in relation to the crusades, the rise of the mendicant orders, the missionary activity of Franciscans to North Africa and Asia, and related phenomena that increased the scope of possibility for actual encounters between Christians and non-Christians to a degree parallel to the situation of early Christians as a persecuted minority in the pagan Roman Empire.

The theoretical and historical frameworks are outlined in the first two chapters, while the remainder of the book focuses on structural and literary analysis of specific hagiographic texts. These include several selections from Jacobus da Voragine's *Legenda Aurea* and the Middle High German *Passional* associated with the Teutonic Order, and a range of other legends in German verse such as Wetzlar von Bernau's *Margaretenlegende*, Reinbot von Durne's *Der heilige Georg*, the material on Pope Sylvester I from Konrad von

Würzburg's *Legenden*, and the *Barlaam und Josaphat* by Rudolf von Ems. In addition to thirteenth-century sources, Prautzsch analyzes selections from the Vulgate Bible as well as relevant texts from the early Christian period that provide models and prototypes for narrating encounters between saints and unbelievers in the Christian tradition.

Prautzsch organizes this material into a consideration of three types of holy person: the martyr (chapter three), the soldier-saint (chapter four), and the missionary (chapter five). He notes that these may seem to align with three forms of religious expression that Jan Assmann and others have ascribed specifically to Christianity and monotheism: dying for God, killing for God, and converting unbelievers to God. However, Prautzsch argues that contrary to what much modern scholarship and the context of the Crusades might suggest, hagiographic narratives of encounter between their holy heroes and non-Christians never associated killing in the service of God with sanctity. Soldiers (including those eventually recognized as saints) could fight justly in support of a divinely ordained worldly authority, or in defense of Christianity and the Christian holy places, but none of these activities had the potential to display saintliness. The military activity of soldier saints like Sebastian and George on behalf of the pagan Roman Empire is not called into question as unjust or contrary to their status Christians, unlike sacrifice to the imperial cult. However, that activity is narratively isolated from, as temporally prior to, the exceptional valor in proclaiming their faith, converting unbelievers to Christianity, and willingness to die in pursuit of those endeavors that mark the soldier-saint as holy through encounter with and in contrast to the unbeliever. Although the papacy instituted Crusade indulgences and supported the concept of military activity in God's service as penitential, no one was proclaimed a saint simply by virtue of their participation in a crusade, as Prautzsch pointedly observes. Even Louis IX of France, much to Jean de Joinville's chagrin, was canonized as a confessor to the faith rather than as a martyr who died fighting against the Muslims of Tunis.

Prautzsch makes a strong case that, whatever may be found in other materials, the narrative sources produced in the thirteenth century to define the lives and virtues of exemplary saints could encompass warfare as just, even holy, as in a biography of St. George written for a courtly audience by the poet Rudolf von Ems, but not as a way to demonstrate sanctity through killing on the battlefield. Instead, these narratives always showed the saint as committed to disseminating the faith through some combination of spreading Christianity through the spoken word and demonstrating an exemplary willingness to commit one's whole being to witness the truth of the faith through the embrace of martyrdom, whether or not that embrace of martyrdom resulted in actual death at the hands of an unbeliever. The formal opposition between saint and heathendom in such legendary encounters functioned to achieve *Identitätsbildung* for thirteenth-century audiences. By systematically contrasting the categories of saint and heathen, these narratives constructed and communicated a normative identity for ordinary Christians: one in which the embrace of religious truth (shared with saint) combined with the heathen-like status of potentially but not yet actually having achieved salvation. The saint's encounter with *Heidentum* also had to communicate the miraculous actuality but also rarity with which transcendent reality was made immanent through the exemplary actions and achievements of missionary and martyr.

In addition to analyzing thirteenth-century representations of early Christian saints, Prautzsch also covers the encounter between St. Francis of Assisi and the Mamluk Sultan al-Kamil as described by Thomas of Celano, Bonaventure, and Lamprecht von Regensburg. He does so in his chapter on martyrdom, as these *vitae* communicate the saint's powerful desire to die for God as witness to the faith, later achieved symbolically

through receipt of the stigmata. Giotto's fresco from Assisi depicting this encounter provides the cover image for the book. However, Prautzsch's handling of the Francis material is not fully persuasive. He notes, but does not explore, why the mission to Egypt is described in only some of the thirteenth-century *vitae* of Francis. He also does not adequately contextualize this specific encounter within the narrative totality of those texts that do include the incident. Finally, Francis is the only thirteenth-century saint whose hagiographic representation is discussed at any length. Within these limits, Prautzsch's analysis does suggest that representations of contemporaneous thirteenth-century saints shared a form and function with representations of early Christian saints. This is a topic well worth further research. Prautzsch's book demonstrates that *legenda* provided a key mechanism for defining and articulating engagement with the non-Christian other in the crusading context, despite or even because of this genre's overall rejection of crusade as an organizing theme.

Scott Wells

California State University, Los Angeles

doi:10.1017/S0009640723000033

***A Companion to the Abbey of Cluny in the Middle Ages.* Edited by Scott G. Bruce and Steven Vanderputten. Leiden: Brill, 2022. xv + 393 pp. €232 hardcover.**

This fine collection of essays is appropriately dedicated to the late Giles Constable († 2021) who contributed so much to Cluniac studies over his long career and with whom the editors discussed plans for the volume. In the very first article of the first volume of *The Journal of Medieval Monastic Studies* published just over ten years ago in 2011, Constable himself drew on his vast expertise to set out his ideas on “The Future of Cluniac Studies” (1–16). His opening sentence (“So much has been written about Cluny—dozens of books and hundreds of articles—that it is easy to forget how much work remains to be done”—quoted by the editors [8]) finds both fulfilment and endorsement here: fulfilment in the sense that the authors demonstrate how much has been added to our knowledge of Cluny and *ecclesia Cluniacensis* over ten years, and endorsement in that the editors and authors point out that the scope for further investigation is still there. The volume mines a vast scholarship of Cluniac studies but asks new questions and sets new agenda that have emerged over the last decades—indeed it is the first volume of collected studies on Cluny for fifty years—and offers lively new approaches and ideas. Among these are investigations of how the Cluniacs themselves fashioned their history and identity, reconsiderations of *ecclesia Cluniacensis* from the bottom up rather than the top down (that is, appreciating local and regional forces that might have shaped it), the role of women, the importance of space and performance, encounters with others, and legacies. At the same time, the editors (perhaps modestly) call it “a starting point” for readers’ own enquiries, and an inspiration for future research.

In the introduction, Scott G. Bruce and Steven Vanderputten give a masterly summary of the historiography of Cluny and of the polarisation of views that see it, on the