

INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF

# Cultural Property

VOLUME 21 2014 NUMBER 3

THINKING ABOUT CULTURAL PROPERTY:



*The Legal and Public Policy Legacies of John Henry Merryman*

**CAMBRIDGE**

ISSN 0940-7391

**Subscription Information:** *International Journal of Cultural Property* (ISSN 0940-7391) is published quarterly in February, May, August, and November by Cambridge University Press for the International Cultural Property Society. Annual subscription rates for Volume 20 (2013): Institutional subscription rate, print and electronic: US \$435 in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; UK £262 elsewhere. Institutional subscription rate, electronic only: US \$333 in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; UK £200 elsewhere. Individual subscription rate, print only: US \$71 in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; UK £38 elsewhere. Single part rates, print only: US \$119 in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; UK £72 elsewhere. Prices include surface postage.

**Publishing, Advertising, and Subscription Offices:** Cambridge University Press, 100 Brook Hill Drive, West Nyack, NY 10994-2133, USA (for USA, Canada, and Mexico); or Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, England (for UK and elsewhere).

**Society Inquiries:** General inquiries concerning the International Cultural Property Society should be directed to Stanley N. Katz, Director, Center for the Arts and Cultural Policy Studies, Woodrow Wilson School, 428 Robertson Hall, Princeton University, Princeton, NJ 08544. Phone: 609-258-5637; fax: 609-258-1235; email: snkatz@princeton.edu.

**Rights and Permissions:** All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopy, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. General enquiries from the USA, Mexico, and Canada should be addressed to the New York office of Cambridge University Press <http://www.cambridge.org/us/information/rights/contacts/newyork.htm>; general enquiries from elsewhere should be addressed to the Cambridge office <http://www.cambridge.org/uk/information/rights/contacts/cambridge.htm>; permission enquiries from Australia and New Zealand should be addressed to the Melbourne office [http://www.cambridge.org/aus/information/contacts\\_melbourne.htm](http://www.cambridge.org/aus/information/contacts_melbourne.htm); enquiries regarding Spanish-language translation rights (only) should be addressed to the Madrid office <http://www.cambridge.org/uk/information/rights/contacts/madrid.htm>.

**Photocopying information for users in the U.S.A.:** The Item-Fee Code for the publication (0940-7391/10 \$15.00 + .10) indicates that copying for internal or personal use beyond that permitted by Sec. 107 or 108 of the U.S. Copyright Law is authorized for users duly registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC) Transaction Reporting Service, provided that the appropriate remittance of \$15.00 per article is paid directly to CCC, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923. Specific written permission must be obtained for all other copying.

**Abstracting Information:** *International Journal of Cultural Property* is indexed and abstracted in Anthropological Literature; Art and Archaeology Technical Abstracts (Online Edition); ARTbibliographies Modern; Avery Index to Architectural Periodicals; Bibliography of the History of Art (BHA); British & Irish Archaeological Bibliography (Online Edition); IBZ—Internationale Bibliographie der Geistes- und Sozialwissenschaftlichen Zeitschriftenliteratur; Index to Foreign Legal Periodicals; Index to Legal Periodicals & Books; Internationale Bibliographie der Rezensionen Geistes- und Sozialwissenschaftlicher Literatur.

© International Cultural Property Society 2014

**Cover:** South Metope 27 from the Parthenon, Athens, now located in the British Museum, depicting a scene from the battle between the Centaurs and the Lapiths. The debate over the Parthenon/Elgin Marbles and whether they should remain in London or be returned to Greece is one of the most intractable and unending debates in cultural property, and one that John Henry Merryman has discussed throughout his career. His work and its legacy is the subject of this special issue in his honor.

# INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF Cultural Property

VOLUME 21 (2014) NUMBER 3

## Editor

Alexander A. Bauer,  
*Queens College, CUNY, USA*

## Chronicles Editor

Kurt Siehr, *Universität Zürich, Switzerland*  
and *Max-Planck-Institut, Germany*

## Case Notes Editor

Janet E. Blake, *University of Shahid*  
*Beheshti, Iran*

## Book Review Editor

Patrick J. O'Keefe, *University of*  
*Queensland, Australia*

## Associate Editors

Michael F. Brown, *Williams College, USA*

Haidy Geismar, *New York University,*  
*USA*

Sonia Katyal, *Fordham University School*  
*of Law, USA*

Derek Fincham, *South Texas College of Law,*  
*USA*

Lyndel V. Prott, *University of Queensland,*  
*Australia*

## Editorial Board

Gregory J. Ashworth, *Rijksuniversiteit*  
*Groningen, Netherlands*

Márcia Bezerra de Almeida, *Universidade*  
*Federal do Pará, Brasil*

Gregory Borgstede, *University of*  
*Pennsylvania Museum, USA*

Mira Burri, *World Trade Institute,*  
*Switzerland*

Chip Colwell-Chanthaphonh, *Denver*  
*Museum of Nature and Science, USA*

María Luz Endere, *Conicet and Universidad*  
*del Centro de la Provincia de Buenos*  
*Aires, Argentina*

Richard Handler, *University of Virginia,*  
*USA*

Claire Lyons, *Getty Museum, USA*

Stephanie Moser, *University of*  
*Southampton, UK*

Elina Moustaira, *Faculty of Law, University*  
*of Athens, Greece*

Dawson Munjeri, *Delegation of Zimbabwe*  
*to UNESCO, Zimbabwe*  
*and France*

Anila Naeem, *NED University of*  
*Engineering and Technology, Pakistan*

James A. R. Nafziger, *Willamette University*  
*College of Law, USA*

Hyung Il Pai, *University of California,*  
*Santa Barbara, USA*

Robert K. Paterson, *Faculty of Law,*  
*University of British Columbia, Canada*

Jorge Sánchez Cordero, *Mexican Center of*  
*Uniform Law, Mexico*

Daniel Shapiro, *President Emeritus,*  
*International Cultural Property Society,*  
*USA*

Folarin Shyllon, *Faculty of Law, Olabisi*  
*Onabanjo University, Nigeria*

Samuel Sidibé, *National Museum of Mali,*  
*Mali*

Neil Asher Silberman, *University of*  
*Massachusetts, Amherst, USA*

Madhavi Sunder, *UC Davis School of Law,*  
*USA*

David Throsby, *Macquarie University,*  
*Australia*

Alison Wylie, *University of Washington,*  
*USA*

## Board Members Emeritus

Clemency Coggins, *Boston University, USA*

David Lowenthal, *University College*  
*London, UK*

John Henry Merryman (Founder), *Stanford*  
*University Law School, USA*

Stephen K. Urice, *University of Miami*  
*School of Law, USA*

INTERNATIONAL  
**Cultural Property**  
SOCIETY

**BOARD OF DIRECTORS**

**President**

Derek Gillman  
*Barnes Foundation, USA*

**Treasurer**

Stanley N. Katz  
*Center for Arts and Cultural Policy Studies, Princeton University, USA*

**Secretary**

Stephen K. Urice  
*University of Miami School of Law, USA*

**Vice-President**

Stanley N. Katz  
*Center for Arts and Cultural Policy Studies, Princeton University, USA*

Stephen W. Clark

*J. Paul Getty Trust*

Talat S. Halman

*Center for Turkish Literature, Bilkent University, Turkey*

Marc-André Renold

*Art-Law Centre, University of Geneva Law School, Switzerland*

Lawrence Rosen

*Department of Anthropology, Princeton University, USA*

Kurt Siehr, Law School

*Universität Zurich, Switzerland and Max-Planck-Institut, Germany*

Susan Taylor

*New Orleans Museum of Art, USA*

Ana Filipa Vrdoljak

*Faculty of Law, University of Technology, Sydney, Australia*

President Emeritus

Daniel Shapiro





# CONTENTS

## VOLUME 21 (2014) NUMBER 3

### SPECIAL ISSUE:

Thinking About Cultural Property: The Legal and Public Policy Legacies of John Henry Merryman

### COMMENT

*A Universalist: Fathering Fields*

Daniel Shapiro 237

### ARTICLES

*Remarks in Honor of the Legal and Public Policy Legacies of John Henry Merryman: Cultural Property and Human Cells*

Robin Feldman 243

*Thinking about Antiquities: Museums and Internationalism*

Claire L. Lyons 251

*Immovable Cultural Heritage at Risk: Past – Present – Future*

Kurt G. Siehr 267

*Cultural Property, the Palermo Convention, and Transnational Organized Crime*

Greg Borgstede 281

*Seven Years of Implementing UNESCO's 2003 Intangible Heritage Convention—Honeymoon Period or the "Seven-Year Itch"?*

Janet Blake 291

*Collecting "Tribal Art"—Sacred or Secular?*

Robert K. Paterson 305

*Archaeological Heritage Legislation and Indigenous Rights in Latin America: Trends and Challenges*

Maria Luz Endere 319

*Monumentalizing the Ruins of Korean Antiquity: Early Travel Photography and Itinerary of Seoul's Heritage Destinations*

Hyung Il Pai 331

*Global Cultural Law and Policy in the Age of Ubiquitous Internet*

Mira Burri 349

*From Cultural Property to Cultural Data: The Multiple Dimensions of "Ownership" in a Global Digital Age*

Neil Asher Silberman 365