machines help to organize and distribute patronage, whereas in Malaysia national political parties and coalitions predominate. In Indonesia, ad hoc personal campaign teams (*Tim Sukses*) prevail. Each of these three types is connected to specific forms of electoral mobilization and patronage. This link between patronage types and networks is conceptualised as "electoral mobilization regimes" (p. 12).

Against this backdrop, in the second chapter the authors analyse the historical and institutional foundations of the electoral mobilization regimes. Following Martin Shefter (1994) and his stress on historical timing and sequencing of electoral mobilization, they add the role of electoral institutions, and then examine three distinct historical pathways (p. 32). Strong bureaucracies either precede the mobilization of mass electorates as in Germany or, as in Italy, the other way round (p. 34) leading to either a "constituency for bureaucratic autonomy" or a "constituency for patronage", respectively. Moreover, Shefter differentiates between externally and internally mobilized parties, according to the location where these have been established, i.e., either outside or within the regime. The authors trace the three national trajectories from the time of colonialism and the formation of state apparatuses before and after independence, the choice and evolution of electoral systems, and they examine historical legacies and pathways shaping political parties, their relation to bureaucracies and the availability of patronage (p. 36ff).

Malaysia's electoral authoritarian system was dominated until 2018 by UMNO (United Malays National Organization), a well-oiled party machinery with 3.35 million members and direct access to state-financed patronage. Thus, macro-particularistic practices of credit-claiming and facilitation overshadowed a limited micro-particularism. In contrast, political parties in the Philippines have always been weak and patronage has been more dependent on pork-barrel politics and local machines using public and private resources. All three types of particularism are used extensively. Political parties in Indonesia are between these two extremes, but an increasingly candidate-centred electoral system has produced a focus on private resources. Ad hoc teams organize the micro-particularistic incentives during campaigning. The extraordinary richness in detailing all these particular mobilization techniques in the three countries is one of the great qualities of this book.

The nuanced analysis also covers some regional patterns deviating from the predominant ones: Sabah and Sarawak in Malaysia, Aceh and Papua in Indonesia, and Mindanao in the Philippines are exceptions to the national trends and patterns and sometimes have more in common with electoral mobilization regimes in neighbouring countries. Another chapter covers the role of ethnic and religious identity networks (p. 179ff), gender disparities (p. 188ff), and class (p. 198ff).

The ambitious endeavour of the research team does not leave much ground for criticism. The historical institutionalism is in itself plausible, but the trajectories of regimes, party systems, campaign strategies, finance regulations, and the like are so complex since colonial times that the reconstruction of causal mechanisms with reference to Shefter's insights is difficult. Shefter's sequencing and the distinction between externally and internally mobilized parties, especially under conditions of colonialism, raises new questions. In addition, the typology is based on only three in-depth country studies and its generalizability is, therefore, restricted as evidenced by the short passages at the end on other cases in Southeast Asia such as Timor Leste, Thailand, and Singapore with their respective specificities.

In sum, the book offers a range of very innovative contributions to the literature. It develops a convincing typology of electoral mobilization regimes (p. 73ff) and I wonder if this typology could be expanded in the future. It would also be interesting to see how populist forms of electoral campaigning, in particular those involving new social media, would fit into the typology presented. The book also succeeds in transcending the usual fixation on micro-level and contingent practices. Instead, the authors deal with practices involving not merely the exchange of patronage for electoral support, they extend the analysis to "internally coherent and consistent systems of governance, with distinct clusterings of patronage forms and networks" (p. 238). This also implies a reconstruction of path-dependent electoral mobilization regimes and an approach that includes anthropological, political science, and politico-economic analyses in order also to understand specific social group characteristics (p. 242ff). Only this comprehensive analysis may help draft refined electoral and party regulations that better take into account the hardly predictable effects of such reforms (p. 251ff).

The Art of Resistance in Islam: The Performance of Politics among Shi'i Women in the Middle East and Beyond. By Yafa Shanneik. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2022. 288p. $85.97 cloth.
doi:10.1017/S1537592723001147

— Shirin Saeidi, *University of Arkansas*
saeidi@uark.edu

Yafa Shanneik's *The Art of Resistance in Islam: The Performance of Politics among Shi'i Women in the Middle East and Beyond* is a groundbreaking study that crosses disciplines, methodologies, and geographies to demonstrate how Shi'i Muslim women's innovative approach to religiosity destabilizes the hegemony of gender norms in their communities and power structurers of the international nation-state system. Based on fieldwork and interviews with Shi'i women in London, Dublin, Kuwait, and Bahrain, Shanneik traces meaningful relations within a rarely accessed Shi'i community that follows the cleric Mohammad

https://doi.org/10.1017/S1537592723001147 Published online by Cambridge University Press

al-Shirazi (1928–2001). This community is generally known as the Shirazis. Shanneik's subtle and insightful theoretical critique in the introduction is reminiscent of, but eloquently glides past, Saba Mahmood's theoretical contribution offered nearly two decades ago (see *Politics of Piety: The Islamic Revival and the Feminist Subject*, 2005), which many feminist scholars have since attempted to surpass with limited success.

Most studies of resistance among Muslims focus on men and center on the nation-state. This book's approach takes place in the context of the recent uprisings in the Middle East and North Africa (see Shamiran Mako and Valentine Moghadam, *After the Arab Uprisings,* 2021) and elsewhere (e.g., see Willow Berridge, Justin Lynch, Raga Makawi, and Alex De Waal, *Sudan's Unfinished Democracy*, 2022), including the September 2022 protests in Iran (Shirin Saeidi, *Women and the Islamic Republic*, 2022) that are led not only by women. Both revolutions and counterrevolutions in the twenty-first century are also transnational in character and demonstrate the limits of the nation-state container, its citizenship regime, and subsequent fantasies of sovereignty (Colin Beck et al., *On Revolutions,* 2022). Although several scholars from different disciplinary perspectives have developed moral arguments on the problematic nature of the modern nation-state and its mechanisms of control such as citizenship, Shanneik illustrates how we can see that the effort to overcome these structures is already underway if we analyze resistance with creative methodological approaches. This study's interdisciplinary contribution is of interest to anyone grappling with the intersection between resistance, the international hierarchical system, ideology, and gender.

Theoretically sophisticated yet accessible to nonspecialists, Shanneik builds on Saba Mahmood's agenda-setting work by reengaging with theorists who influenced Mahmood's conceptualization of agency. In the introduction, Shanneik astutely unpacks the originality of Mahmood's thesis according to which a nonbinary understanding of agency has the capacity to entail both resistance to the status quo and the embodiment of it. Shanneik then sketches the philosophical works that influenced Mahmood's thinking and reconsiders the theoretical contributions of Judith Butler, Michel Foucault, and Jacques Derrida. She reconstructs the ways in which these theorists approach the consolidation of power, subject formation, and agency in their thinking. In doing so, she offers scholars of religion, gender, and politics an exceptionally compelling argument on the force of Muslim women's resistive power beyond Mahmood's field-defining book. Although for Mahmood the body is either "a medium for or a sign of the self," Shanneik argues that "the body in performative practices is regarded as both a sign of the self and a medium for collective gender self-realization" (pp. 17–18).

The new Shi'i ritual practice, which the Shirazi women in Shanneik's study engage in, is one where the performative body crosses individual and collective boundaries to connect to "the transcendental articulated through gendered terms but operating within existing internal and external power structures" (pp. 12–13). These bodily performances include walking on hot coals, self-hitting (*latam*), and self-flagellation (*tatbir*)—practices that have traditionally been regarded as male dominated. As Shanneik explains in chapter 1, these innovative bodily performances fall within a historical context of discrimination and sidelining of Shi'i populations in the Gulf. Against this transnational backdrop, such embodied activities both undergird and encompass resistive politics in the Shi'i European diaspora. Furthering the emphasis on the centrality of historical contingencies to Shi'i women's resistive approaches, chapter 2 argues that the Shi'i women whom Shanneik met during her research reinterpret Shi'i history to address the immediate forms of gender and political discrimination they have experienced. This chapter challenges mainstream feminist studies of the Middle East that shape our understanding of women's role in politics by shifting attention to the past and tracing from it a linear trajectory into the current moment. Following this approach, some analysts even make predictions about the future. Shanneik instead shows how the real-time lived experiences of people in their everyday life shape their engagement with history—even highly protected religious history—in unpredictable ways. The sensory experiences gained from Shi'i rituals, such as those involving food spread on the ground in honor of specific Shi'i figures (*sufra)*, connect women to history, their bodies working as a medium that defies the limits of time and space. In this way, Shanneik's approach unlocks layers of the transcendental, born of imaginative possibilities that are rarely associated with international politics or the international hierarchical system of governance.

The book's central claim—namely, that these new forms of religious practice among Shi'i women galvanize a type of politics geared toward gender justice among Shi'i Muslims globally—may be controversial for readers. I am nevertheless convinced by this line of argumentation. That being said, with respect to gender equality some may wonder what equality between women is when religiosity and exceptionalism continue to undergird women's bids for gender justice. The different sensory-oriented enactments that Shanneik explores in her study—from *tashabih* (passion plays) in chapter 3 and aestheticization of politics with *tatbir* in chapter 4 to Fatima's apparitions in chapter 5 and the politicizing of language in poetry and art in chapter 6 —all rest on the notion that religious authenticity is both a superior virtue and one that can be embodied by some better than others. In other words, this worldview, like many others, also reproduces a citizenry hierarchy that does not jibe with the pursuit of freedom. It poses questions about the outcome of revolutionary cultural practices such as the ones that Shanneik discusses in her study.

https://doi.org/10.1017/S1537592723001147 Published online by Cambridge University Press

One area for future studies to delve into is how technology and social media are often used by states to manipulate these sensory and cultural approaches to resistance among activists, including Shi'i women. This line of inquiry has been explored in other works (e.g., see Marc Owen Jones, "Propaganda, Fake News and Fake Trends," *International Journal of Communication,* 13, 2019). The use of "social media and other digital platforms" by Shanneik's interlocutors was an important factor in her study but ultimately not the main focus of the second half of the book (e.g., Shirazi women identified as "netizens," p. 60). Since the 2011 Arab uprisings, scholars have drawn significant attention to the ways in which states intervene in social media activism with the aim of demobilization. As such, it is important to see how European and Middle Eastern states have reacted to this new gendered activism among Shi'i Muslims and what this means for the real-time potency of such activist enactments.

Shanneik's pathbreaking study not only shows how organized activism among Muslim women transforms their sense of self, the communities, and nation-states in which they live but also has powerful ramifications for the international system and the future of the nation-state. The book demonstrates that citizens deemed as "undesirable" by states can no longer be exiled and forgotten. This is because the bodies of women are crucial to the geopolitics of the Middle East and beyond (e.g., see Nicola Pratt, *Embodying Geopolitics: Generations of Women's Activism in Egypt, Jordan, and Lebanon,* 2020). Indeed, the borders of states and their militaristic capabilities, which uphold state sovereignty, cannot prevent change or the evolution of citizenship within or without specific boundaries. One major question that remains, however, is how states and transnational forces engage in an invisible battle to give life to counterrevolutions and redirect or absorb innovative forms of activism, such as the ones that Shanneik documents, to consolidate their power.

Rolling Transition and the Role of Intellectuals: The Case of Hungary. By András Bozoki. Budapest: Central European University Press, 2022, 618p. $115.00 cloth.
doi:10.1017/S1537592723001615

— Kim Lane Scheppele, *Princeton University*
kimlane@princeton.edu

Rolling Transition is a deeply researched microanalysis of roughly 2,000 Hungarian intellectuals as they navigated 15 years of a "rolling transition" centered around the iconic year of 1989. It is also a theoretically rich study of the role of intellectuals in world-historical moments more generally. András Bozoki has written the most nuanced account yet of the transition from one-party state to multiparty democracy in Soviet-dominated Europe. By focusing on the intellectuals who struggled to understand their role in history as history was changing day by day, Bozoki provides a compelling account of why ideas matter at revolutionary moments.

The book's narrative arc starts by situating 1989 in a century of literature that focuses on the leading role of intellectuals in the process of social transformation (chap. 1) and ends with demonstrating how the particular set of intellectuals who pushed the reform process along in Hungary over nearly two decades was not one bloc of people who stayed the same over time but was instead a "rolling" set of diverse individuals who ducked in and out of this process at different stages, playing different roles as their talents and commitments permitted (chap. 9, co-written with Ágnes Simon). While intellectuals as a group may have been essential to Hungary's transformation, the divisions within the group over strategy and tactics meant that they were constantly debating each other, almost to the point of failing to constitute a coherent opposition force. (Those who follow contemporary Hungarian politics will find this familiar!)

Bozoki argues that "during the era of dictatorship it was the intellectuals who 'substituted for' democracy and kept national consciousness alive" (p. 206). Once multiparty democracy became possible, it was the intellectuals who "reconquer[ed] … the language of freedom" (p. 207). In short, Bozoki demonstrates how intellectuals in Hungary drove the process of political transformation by constantly testing the boundaries of the Soviet system and finally by engaging in negotiations over the peaceful transfer of power. They then occupied many of the key roles in the new system, both in the roundtable negotiations and in the new parliament.

Bozoki challenges many of the now taken-for-granted accounts of what happened in and around the year that the Berlin Wall fell. Instead of seeing 1989 as driven primarily by the change of leadership in the Soviet Union and the improvised reactions of surprised "satellite" states, Bozoki focuses primarily on the internal politics of Hungary, the first country in the region to engage in economic reform in the 1960s. When General Secretary János Kádár loosened rules on censorship in Hungary in the 1970s just enough to allow intellectuals space for maneuver (chap. 2), intellectuals occupied that space with different samizdat journals and a rich set of "civil society" institutions ranging from churches to environmental groups (chap. 3). As the regime loosened its grip further and opened up more space for political contestation, intellectuals began to debate their proper role in relation to political power, from an "antipolitical" stance that emphasized building social solidarity instead of engaging politics directly to theoretical debates over how to constitute a "democratic opposition" in politics with a focus on human rights (chap. 4).

As it gradually became clear through the 1980s that both new economics and new politics were possible, Bozoki's intellectuals reoriented their theories yet again to adapt (chap. 5), all the while arguing with each other

https://doi.org/10.1017/S1537592723001147 Published online by Cambridge University Press