

# PHILOSOPHY OF SCIENCE

*Official Journal of the Philosophy of  
Science Association*



VOLUME 38, NUMBER 4

December, 1971

# PHILOSOPHY OF SCIENCE

JOURNAL OF THE PHILOSOPHY OF SCIENCE ASSOCIATION

## EDITORIAL BOARD:

- RICHARD S. RUDNER, Department of Philosophy, *Washington University*, St. Louis, Missouri 63130, *Editor in Chief*  
ERNEST W. ADAMS, Department of Philosophy, *University of California*, Berkeley, California 94720  
PETER D. ASQUITH, Department of Philosophy, *Michigan State University*, East Lansing, Michigan 48823, *Managing Editor*  
GUSTAV BERGMANN, Department of Philosophy, *University of Iowa*, Iowa City, Iowa 52240  
MAY BRODBECK, Department of Philosophy, *University of Minnesota*, Minneapolis, Minnesota 55455  
ARTHUR BURKS, Department of Philosophy, *University of Michigan*, Ann Arbor, Michigan 48104  
C. WEST CHURCHMAN, Graduate School of Business Administration, *University of California*, Berkeley, California 94720  
THEODOSIUS DOBZHANSKY, *The Rockefeller University*, New York, New York 10021  
ADOLF GRÜNBAUM, Department of Philosophy, *University of Pittsburgh*, Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15213  
EDWARD MADDEN, Department of Philosophy, *State University of New York*, Buffalo, New York 14214  
HENRY MARGENAU, Department of Physics, *Yale University*, New Haven, Connecticut 06520  
GERALD J. MASSEY, Department of Philosophy, *University of Pittsburgh*, Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania, 15213  
ALBERTO PASQUINELLI, Facoltà Di Lettere E Filosofia, Università Degli Studi Di Bologna, *University of Bologna*, Bologna, Italy  
WESLEY C. SALMON, Department of History and Philosophy of Science, *Indiana University*, Bloomington, Indiana 47401  
J. J. C. SMART, Department of Philosophy, *University of Adelaide*, Adelaide, Australia  
MELFORD E. SPIRO, Department of Anthropology, *The University of California at San Diego*, La Jolla, California, 92038  
PATRICK SUPPES, Department of Philosophy, *Stanford University*, Palo Alto, California 94301  
LEWIS K. ZERBY, Department of Philosophy, *Michigan State University*, East Lansing, Michigan 48823

## BOOK REVIEWS:

James Van Evra, Department of Philosophy, *University of Waterloo*, Waterloo, Ontario, Canada

## ASSISTANT EDITORS:

James J. Sweeney and Timothy D. Bryson, Department of Philosophy, *Washington University*, St. Louis, Missouri 63130

## GOVERNING BOARD OF THE ASSOCIATION:

Wesley C. Salmon, *President (1972)*

Israel Scheffler, *Vice-President (1971)*

Peter D. Asquith, *Secretary-Treasurer (1972)*

Robert Cohen (1973)

Ernest Nagel (*Past Pres.*)

Adolf Grünbaum (*Past Pres.*)

Richard S. Rudner

Jaakko Hintikka (1972)

J. J. C. Smart (1971)

Ernan McMullin (1972)

Stephen Toulmin (1973)

Henry Margenau (*Past Pres.*)

H. Tornebohm (1971)

MADE AND PRINTED IN GREAT BRITAIN BY

WILLIAM CLOWES & SONS, LIMITED, LONDON, BECCLES AND COLCHESTER

PHILOSOPHY OF SCIENCE is published quarterly by the Philosophy of Science Association, 18 Morrill Hall, Department of Philosophy, Michigan State University, East Lansing, Michigan 48823. Subscription price \$15.00 per Volume. Single numbers \$5.00. Membership dues, which include subscription, \$10.00. Subscription inquiries should be directed to the Managing Editor. Second-class postage paid at East Lansing, Michigan 48823. © 1971 by the Philosophy of Science Association.

## CONTENTS\*

<b>THE COMPARABILITY OF SCIENTIFIC THEORIES, CARL R. KORDIG</b>	467
<b>REPLACING ONE THEORY BY ANOTHER UNDER PRESERVATION OF A GIVEN FEATURE, ROLF A. EBERLE</b> .....	486
<b>ALTERNATIVES AND INCOMMENSURABLES: THE CASE OF DARWIN AND KELVIN, J. N. HATTIANGADI</b> .....	502
<b>IS QUANTUM LOGIC REALLY LOGIC?, MICHAEL R. GARDNER</b> .....	508
<b>INTENTIONS AND PROGRAMS, WILLIAM TODD</b> .....	530
<b>COVERING LAW EXPLANATION, THOMAS NICKLES</b> .....	542
<b>AN INTERPRETATION OF SCIENTIFIC MODELS INVOLVING ANALOGIES, JACK C. CARLOYE</b> .....	562
<b>REMARKS ON CONCEPT FORMATION: THEORY BUILDING AND THEORY TESTING, JOSEPH M. FIRESTONE</b> .....	570
<b>DISCUSSION: THE LORENTZ-FITZGERALD CONTRACTION HYPOTHESIS AND THE COMBINED ROD CONTRACTION-CLOCK RETARDATION HYPOTHESIS, HERMAN ERLICHSON</b> .....	605
<b>BOOK REVIEWS</b> .....	610
<i>A Deduction Theory of Space and Time, Saul A. Basri; Gordon C. Brittan, Jr.—Probability and Opinion, A Study in the Medieval Presuppositions of Post-Medieval Theories of Probability, Edmund F. Byrne; Ivo Thomas—The Encyclopedia of Philosophy, Paul Edwards, Ed. in Chief; Alex C. Michalos, Robert E. Butts, Michael D. Resnik—Anomalies and Scientific Theories, Willard C. Humphreys; Michael Ruse</i>	
<b>RECENT BOOKS</b> .....	616
<b>ABSTRACTS, Inquiry</b> .....	617
<b>INDEX TO VOL. 38</b> .....	625

\*The contents of *Philosophy of Science* are indexed by *Science Citation Index*.