REVIEW ESSAYS

ART, ARCHITECTURE, AND RELIGIOUS ORDERS IN THE LATIN AMERICAS

From Quebec to Quito

Gauvin Alexander Bailey
Queen's University

Painting of the Kingdoms: Shared Identities; Territories of the Spanish Monarchy, 16th–18th centuries. 4 volumes. Edited by Juana Gutiérrez Haces; introduction by Jonathan Brown. Mexico City: Fomento Cultural Banamex, 2008–2009. Pp. xlviii + 1503. $400.00 cloth. ISBN: 9786077612063.

Les arts en Nouvelle-France. Edited by Laurier Lacroix. Quebec City: Musée National des Beaux-Arts du Québec, 2012. Pp. 296. $59.95 paper. ISBN: 9782551252114.

Jesuiten aus Zentraleuropa in Portugiesisch- und Spanisch-Amerika: Ein bio-bibliographisches Handbuch. Band II: Chile (1618–1771). Edited by Johannes Meier and Michael Müller. Münster: Aschendorff, 2011. Pp. 1 + 458. $60.00 cloth. ISBN: 9783402117897.

Jesuiten aus Zentraleuropa in Portugiesisch- und Spanisch-Amerika: Ein bio-bibliographisches Handbuch. Band III: Neugranada (1618–1771). Edited by Johannes Meier and Christoph Nebgen. Münster: Aschendorff, 2008. Pp. xxxvi + 244. $60.00 cloth. ISBN: 9783402117880.

The Art of Painting in Colonial Quito / El arte de la pintura en Quito colonial. Edited by Susanne L. Stratton-Pruitt. Philadelphia: St Joseph's University Press, 2012. Pp. xii + 337. $75.00 cloth. ISBN: 978091601695.

Imágenes guaraní-jesuíticas: Paraguay, Argentina, Brasil. By Bozidar Darko Sustersic. Asunción, Paraguay: Centro de Artes Visuales / Museo del Barro, 2010. Pp. 421. ISBN: 9789995386948.

Latin American Research Review, Vol. 48, No. 3.

Quito, ciudad de maestros: Arquitectos, edificios y urbanismo en el largo siglo XVII. By Susan V. Webster. Quito: Abya-Yala, 2012. Pp. viii + 298. $40.00 cloth. ISBN: 9789942090706.

The past four years have witnessed a sea change in the scholarship on viceregal Iberian American art history as well as that of the other Latin America, Nouvelle-France. Although the literature on Iberian America continues to focus mainly on the traditional New Spain/Cuzco/Lima corridor, new monographs on the arts of Quito (two in 2012 alone, *The Art of Painting in Colonial Quito;* and *Quito, ciudad de maestros*) and Paraguay (*Imágenes guaraní-jesuíticas,* 2010), as well as superlative archival studies of the impact of non-Spanish Jesuit priests and brothers—many of them craftsmen and architects—on Nueva Granada and Chile (*Jesuiten aus Zentraleuropa in Portugiesisch- und Spanisch-Amerika,* volumes 2 and 3, 2011, 2008) are demanding that scholars no longer treat those regions as marginal to the field. Likewise, a major four-volume compendium of the painting of the Spanish Empire (*Painting of the Kingdoms,* 2008) has focused new attention on transatlantic themes, looking at artistic interaction within the entire Spanish Empire, including the Americas, Flanders, Portugal (under the Spanish monarchy between 1580 and 1640), and Southern Italy, although regrettably neglecting the Philippines. Similarly, colonial Québécois art history, hitherto virtually unknown outside the province and subject primarily to survey treatments, now takes its place on the hemispheric stage with a thematic, intelligent, and visually rich exhibition and companion volume from the Musée des Beaux-Arts in Quebec City (*Les arts en Nouvelle-France,* 2012) that compels us to acknowledge the commonalities of the arts and visual culture of this region and those of its Catholic counterparts to the south.

Although wide ranging, the volumes of *Painting of the Kingdoms*—published in advance of a blockbuster exhibition at the Prado and Palacio Nacional in Madrid (2010–2011)—fall short of being encyclopaedic, since the project limits itself primarily to pre–Bourbon era painting and concentrates on Europe, Mexico, and Peru despite brief forays into Brazil, Quito, and Nueva Granada. Its main theme, that the Spanish Crown and the Catholic Church were "agents of unity" (25) in the Americas, risks turning into a celebration of European sovereignty, but enough of the chapters focus on regional variations that it avoids falling into that trap. Each volume takes a different theme, with some overlap. The first, *One King, Many Kingdoms: New Perspectives,* considers global interaction and the notion of a new artistic language arising from contact between dialects. The second, *The Kingdoms and Painting,* features surveys of painting in Spain, Italy, New Spain, Peru, and Luso-Brazil (mostly Portugal) and is useful in illuminating the diversity within these regions. The third volume, *Transmission and Transformation in the Spanish Realms,* looks primarily at the print medium as a disseminator of styles, with one chapter devoted exclusively to Rubens. The fourth is a catchall called *Matters of Faith: Portraiture,* which includes fascinating articles on the uses of Catholic iconography and a series of chapters on royal and aristocratic portraits, which although primarily European (Spain and Italy dominate) are now essential refer-

ence works on the subject. The volumes are lavishly illustrated in color, but many of the photographs have been spoiled by being digitally cleaned up, removing essential details like brushwork, line, and surface texture.

The authors include some of the leading scholars in the field, including Clara Bargellini, Teresa Gisbert, Ramón Mujica Pinilla, Alexandra Kennedy Troya, Jonathan Brown, Luís de Moura Sobral, and Rogelio Ruiz Gomar, not to mention Juana Gutiérrez Haces—she conceived the show in 2001 but did not live to see its completion—and within the limitations just noted the books represent the state of the field. Nevertheless, they are primarily concerned with Europeans and Creoles as actors on the artistic stage and do not give aboriginal contributions the attention they have received in the wider scholarship. This neglect can be attributed in part to their academic definition of painting as works on canvas, panel, or wall, thus leaving out indigenous formats such as the early postconquest codices of New Spain. But it does not explain the short shrift given to Amerindian iconography in canvas painting, notably the painting of seventeenth-century Cuzco (even in Luis Eduardo Wuffarden's article in volume 2, which discusses the "Inca Renaissance"). The single, thought-provoking, exception is Alessandra Russo's "Maps, Featherwork, and Keros" in volume 3.

In her introductory essay, Gutiérrez Haces seeks the uniqueness of Spanish and viceregal painting paradoxically by concentrating on the features that "stylistically joined these painters" (138), a process she, and many of the other contributors, calls koine, or leveling (the term comes from linguistics), which has the effect of prioritizing standardization over regionalism. As is true of several of these essays, there is a sense of an even balance between Spain and the Americas that does not sufficiently acknowledge the power disparities between conquerors and conquered. Even the overall disinclination to use the term *colonial* (because, as Jonathan Brown remarks, it "conjures up domination and submission" [962], a valid argument when applied to the relationship between Creoles and Spaniards, perhaps) whitewashes over the very real "domination and submission" that existed between whites and nonwhites. And while the point is well taken that it is "highly debatable" (142) whether indigenous content is responsible for making New Spanish painting unique, the tone of the articles by Gutiérrez Haces and others (e.g., that of Oscar Flores Flores and Ligia Fernández Flores) suggests that aboriginal contributions were, as George Kubler once wrote, "like a search for the fragments of a deep-lying shipwreck."[1] Flores and Fernández state that indigenous contributions are "limited to images related to map-making, postconquest codices, illustrations published in several chronicles, and images closely related to the applied arts, such as Peruvian *keros* and New Spanish featherwork" (189). This is a surprisingly inadequate list that overlooks other kinds of painting treated in articles in this very series, such as Teresa Gisbert's contribution on idolatry in volume 4, which includes a discussion of how Marian imagery was co-opted by the Tupac Amaru rebellion of 1781.

In their surveys of New Spanish and Peruvian painting, Rogelio Ruiz Gomar

1. George Kubler, "On the Colonial Extinction of the Motifs of Pre-Columbian Art," in *Studies in Ancient American and European Art*, ed. Thomas F. Reese (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1985), 66.

and Luis Eduardo Wuffarden provide nuanced reconstructions of stylistic developments from the arrival of pioneers such as the painters Andrés de Concha and Bernardo Bitti; thanks to their publication in an English edition, these surveys will be indispensable teaching tools at both an undergraduate and graduate level in North America and the United Kingdom. But while there is acknowledgment of the features that made the art of various regions unique—Palafoxian Puebla versus Mexico City for example—the methodological model of "leveling" and its emphasis on homogeneity seems to undermine Ruiz's and Wuffarden's arguments. And although they provide a welcome challenge to the popular notions that all chiaroscuro equals Zurbaranism or that Seville was the only Spanish city with serious impact on the Americas, the indigenous voice is silent. As Ruiz notes, "in the initial phase of this process of levelling, there was no room for a distinction between Spanish and indigenous painters" (549).

Russo's article is the voice in the wilderness, concentrating precisely on the "other painting arts," the Nahua maps (*figuras*) and feather paintings, and the Quechua *keros*, as examples of "unique space[s] for connections" (777) between the pre-Hispanic and European worlds. She challenges both the prevailing notions of a generic artistic syncretism and a monolithic indigenous culture and questions certain supposedly indigenous elements that are in fact taken from European sources, what Hiroshige Okada calls "inverted exoticism."[2] Russo is a master at using language to draw out cultural ambiguities, and she goes back to textual definitions of artistic and cultural terms to emphasize the essential "untranslatability" (819) between two visual languages that nevertheless coexist in a kind of semantic bilingualism like that of the glyphs of *tlacuilolli* (Nahua picture-writing) which uneasily share space on a 1579 map with Flemish atmospheric perspective. Two more articles in volume 3, by Marta Penhos and Clara Bargellini, are refreshingly innovative approaches to the role of the print medium and the issue of copying. Penhos uses a fascinating painting by Tomás Cabrera of a peace treaty in Salta as a warning about the pitfalls of easy categorization according to style, iconography, or prototype. Bargellini brings us to the very core of issues of copying, influence, and authorship in her study of the tangled but fertile relationship between artists and prints in Spanish America. She asks less about how prints "influenced" artists and more about what artists did with them—a timely subject in our era so concerned with copyright and plagiarism.

The essays in volume 4 are some of the finest, notably Mujica Pinilla's piece on the Eucharist and Jaime Cuadriello's chapter on the Immaculate Conception. Mujica traces the iconographic and cultic use of the Eucharist from Flanders to Peru, and the way the Spanish monarchy manipulated it for political ends. Mujica has a gift for bringing literature and art together, and he draws again upon his seemingly bottomless treasury of little-known paintings with bizarre iconographies. The most unusual is the *University Garden of Saint Anthony Abbot* (Cuzco, 1692), an allegory of the reconciliation between the Seminary of St. Anthony and the Jesuit

2. Hiroshige Okada, "Inverted Exoticism? Monkeys, Parrots, and Mermaids in Andean Colonial Art," in *The Virgin, Saints, and Angels: South American Paintings 1600–1825, from the Thoma Collection*, ed. Suzanne Stratton-Pruitt (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2006), 67–80.

Real Colégio de San Bernardo, which looks like a field of allotment gardens. In the center a fountain crowned with Christ of the Earthquakes flows with water and blood, the latter caught in chalices by the church fathers and the former irrigating the thirty-four garden plots, each sprouting blossoms that open up to reveal illustrious alumni of the college—it catered to the sons of indigenous nobles and mestizos. Pope and king sit under garden trellises, outsized figures of Saint Anthony and Saint Thomas Aquinas till the land, the former with his sharpened spade and the other with his lethal pen—lethal, specifically, to the heretics under his feet—while Saint Michael guards the door. In the sky Divine Wisdom and a smaller Saint Anthony ascend on clouds toward God the Father, and four tablet-bearing Evangelists squirt ink from their pens down onto the already thoroughly irrigated garden. My favourite part is the alumni-sprouting vine which creeps from the Antonine garden to the (of course) much smaller Jesuit one, celebrating a concordance between the two institutions signed in 1692. If anyone still questions the originality of viceregal painting I cannot think of a better rejoinder.

A comparably wide spectrum of viceregal America is represented in an ongoing multi-volume series from Aschendorff on German-speaking Jesuit missionaries in Brazil (volume 1, 2005), Chile (volume 2, 2011), and Nueva Granada (volume 3, 2008). I do not know whether it is in the works, but a volume on the River Plate and Paraguay would complete a set devoted to a part of Latin America that was unusually impacted by Central European culture. Although these books are not exclusively on the history of art, the volume on Chile is dominated by the lay brothers, who as architects, painters, sculptors, silversmiths, and craftsmen gave the arts and architecture of the Cono Sur a Germanic flavor that contrasted with the Spanish/Italian/Flemish-inspired culture of the areas featured in *Painting of the Kingdoms*. The volumes are founded on primary research of frankly astonishing thoroughness. The authors have plumbed archives throughout Europe and Latin America, even going back to baptismal records. Each volume begins with chapters on the foundation, history, institutions, and main activities of the Jesuit enterprises in the region, yet the most valuable section is at the end: a meticulously researched biography of every priest and lay brother to visit the region. This is immediately the authoritative source on the subject and will lay to rest the kind of discrepancies and unfounded commonplaces that have been rife in the seventy-five years of scholarship on Central Europeans in the Americas (e.g., in Vicente Sierra, *Los jesuítas germanos en la conquista espiritual de Hispano-América* [1944]; or Eugenio Pereira Salas, *Historia del arte en el Reino de Chile* [1965]).

The Germanic Jesuit artists and architects who went to the Jesuit province of Chile, which included part of what is now Argentina, included such luminaries as the Tyrolean sculptor Johann Bitterich (1675–1720), the favorite of Lothar Franz von Schönborn (1693–1729), Prince Bishop of Bamberg and Elector of Mainz, and the far-sighted administrator and patron of the arts Karl Haimhausen (or Haimbhausen), who in 1745 exhorted the five German provinces to send young architects, painters, craftsmen, and other skilled workers to join the society and assist the Chile mission, most of them setting up shop in the giant arts and crafts academy at the hacienda Calera de Tango outside Santiago. These men included Jacob Kelner from the Harz woods, a stone mason, sculptor, and draughtsman

who served as a sculptor in Santiago and environs from 1748 until the expulsion of the Jesuits in 1767. Kelner is best known for his contribution to the interior decor of the new church of San Miguel, including the *Death of St Francis Xavier* (ca. 1751) from the former altar of that name, which I and Fernando Guzmán have related to Central European sculpture of the second and third quarter of the eighteenth century (Bailey and Guzmán, "The Saint Sebastian of Los Andes," 2011).

Perhaps the most important figure for bringing the Rococo into Chile was Johann Köhler (1721–1788), a goldsmith, silversmith, and jeweller from Česká Kamenice. Köhler executed some of the most lavish silver and gold church furnishings in the history of Latin America, including the gilt silver monstrance now in the Santiago Cathedral museum, which weighs 15.85 kilograms and is encrusted with around five hundred gemstones given to Haimhausen by his relative Queen Maria Anna of Portugal. Some left the society, such as Georg Lanz (1720–1775), of German descent but born in Leiden, who worked at the Colegio Máximo before leaving the Jesuits in 1751 and working for non-Jesuit patrons in Santiago. He is the author of the magnificent pulpit at La Merced. Lanz is missing in Meier and Müller's study, probably because he did not belong to one of the German provinces of the society. Oddly absent is another architect who reached Chile at this time, Martin Motsch (1714–1740), who noted in a letter to his provincial that his father was an architect at the Bavarian court, and who entered the society in 1714. Motsch is interesting because he also likely comes from a prominent Wessobrunn family of architects and *Stukkatoren* based in Gaispoint, with close ties to the Jesuits. These volumes and (I hope) future ones on the River Plate and Paraguay will finally give Central European missionaries and artists their due as major players on the viceregal scene in southern South America.

In my last review article for this journal I lamented the paucity of publications by Anglophone scholars on colonial Quito / Nueva Granada and the way this vital region remains marginal to a literature still focused on the New Spain-Peru axis. It seems I spoke too soon. In addition to Andrea Lepage's monograph on the Colegio de San Andrés in Quito (*The Art of Evangelization*, forthcoming) which I did note, we now have two new contributions, a lavishly illustrated bilingual volume on *quiteño* painting edited by Susanne L. Stratton-Pruitt—the most comprehensive treatment of viceregal painting from that city in any language—and a study by Susan V. Webster of guilds and artistic training in Quito based on notarial records. These complement a critical recent book of essays edited by Alfonso Ortiz Crespo (*Arte quiteño más allá de Quito*, 2007) on the artworks made in Quito for export. Quito's role as a center for almost industrial artistic production for a world market is one of its distinguishing features in the later eighteenth century. Both Stratton-Pruitt's and Webster's books are old-fashioned in their approach. Stratton-Pruitt's is a catalogue raisonné with a short introductory chapter to contextualize the paintings, and an even shorter epilogue, but with rich catalogue entries by Ángel Justo Estebaranz, Andrea Lepage, and Adriana Pacheco Bustillos. Webster's book is essentially an archival study that treats its material maestro by maestro and church by church.

Stratton-Pruitt's *Art of Painting in Colonial Quito* is a very useful resource for future scholarship and indeed can serve as an accompaniment to the *Painting of the*

Kingdoms volumes. (I should note that Stratton-Pruitt chose not to include mural painting, and the volume is limited to works in Quito.) The introductory section by Carmen Fernández-Salvador provides a useful historiography, highlighting the unsupported theses and nationalistic biases that have hampered the field, and it includes interesting but all-too-brief subsections on training, the roles of European and quiteño artists, and the unusually large number of artists of Native American ancestry working in the city. Despite some shortcomings—notably the lack of chapters by the experts who wrote the catalogue entries, chapters that would reflect cutting-edge new directions in the field that they are exploring (patronage, women artists, and the international diffusion of quiteño painting)—the volume is an indispensable source that will, through its magnificent illustrations by Judy de Bustamente, bring the wonders of this unduly neglected center of viceregal painting to the attention of scholars internationally.

Webster's book treats the viceregal buildings of Quito and the European and Andean architects and artisans who built them. The topic has great promise, particularly since the book is based on concentrated archival research and the author brings to light the names of indigenous architects such as Francisco Tipán. It also has splendid photographs of buildings and artworks and useful illustrations of documents and artists' signatures. But the book reads like a database of sources, with little analysis, synthesis, or attempt to place the material in a wider context; in fact it is rather like the work of José María Vargas in the 1960s and 1970s, a scholar she disparages (17). Archival sources are very important and to a certain extent they speak for themselves, but today a work of this kind needs to engage with current methodologies. A more serious problem is that, except for chapters 5 and 6, the author has published most of the material before in a series of articles and an earlier book (*Arquitectura y empresa en el Quito colonial,* 2002). Indeed the chapters' origins as articles may account for the litany-like presentation of the material, which reads more like an essay collection than a monograph. The issue of prepublication is particularly problematic since she claims on a number of occasions that the "vast majority of the historical documentation" appears here "for the first time" (3). Chapter 1 on guilds covers material treated in her articles "Masters of the Trade" (2009) and "La voz del anonimato" (2010)—the opening paragraph is little more than a Spanish translation of the first paragraph of the two articles—chapters 2 and 3 on Andeans and Europeans and the church of San Francisco both come largely from "Vantage Points" (2011); chapter 4, on Santo Domingo, is essentially a translation of "Art, Identity, and the Construction of the Church of Santo Domingo" (2009); chapter 7 on Francisco Cantuña is a version of "The Devil and the Doloroso" (2010); and chapters 8 and 9 on Francisco Tipán and José Jaime Ortiz are largely taken from her 2002 book as well as "La misteriosa vida del arquitecto José Jaime Ortiz" (2009) and "Maestros indígenas y la construcción del Quito colonial" (2009).

All of these sources are duly listed in the bibliography, yet there are omissions in her acknowledgment of the work of others. The most notable oversight is Tom Cummins, whose extensive work on the interactions of viceregal art in Cuzco is theoretical in a way that could benefit this book. Also noteworthy are Ángel Justo Estebaranz and Kathryn Burns. Estebaranz published a major monograph on

Miguel de Santiago, the most important quiteño artist of the seventeenth century (2008); Stratton-Pruitt praises his book as a "paradigm of the quality of research and publication that needs to be undertaken in order for a clear picture of the development of painting in Quito to emerge" (3). Kathryn Burns has published seminal work on precisely the kind of notarial documents Webster treats here ("Notaries, Truth, and Consequences," 2005; *Into the Archive*, 2010) and could help Webster contextualize her sources into a larger discussion of notarial practices. There is also little from Alexandra Kennedy Troya, the leading scholar on colonial Quito today, whose work has been instrumental in bringing the field to the attention of the scholarly community outside Ecuador. Webster's incomplete engagement with the literature would explain her anachronistic plea that scholars stop treating indigenous artists as anonymous workers who were just "following orders" (9) from Europeans—the point is well taken but is directed against a Eurocentric approach discredited twenty years ago—and her strident dismissal of the association of indigenous stylistic forms with indigenous builders as "racial profiling" (56). This statement reveals a surprising misunderstanding of present-day literature: the corollary of the scholarly acknowledgment of connections between aboriginal forms and aboriginal builders is not an assertion that European-style buildings are necessarily by Europeans. In the final analysis, Webster's book will prove to be useful as a database for future scholarship, but much of its content can be gleaned from previously published articles, and it falls short as a contribution to the larger discussion of viceregal arts in the Americas.

Few art historical subjects in southern South America have received such prolonged attention as the Jesuit missions or Reductions (1609–1767) in Paraguay, although the literature has made little impact on mainstream Latin American art history. The focus of a bewildering number of survey studies that took on a largely celebratory tone (e.g., Guillermo Furlong's *Misiones y sus pueblos de guaraníes*, 1962) and later a wave of insightful anthropological analyses (most notably Ticio Escobar, *Una interpretación de las artes visuales en el Paraguay*, 1980), the field has undergone a renaissance in the past decade with works by anthropologists (Norberto Levinton, *La arquitectura jesuítico-guaraní: Una experiencia de interacción cultural*, 2008, and *El espacio jesuítico-guaraní: La formación de una región cultural*, 2009), art historians (Gianni Baldotto and Antonio Paolillo, *El barroco en las reducciones de Guaraníes*, 2004), and even journalists (Horacio Bollini, *Arte en las misiones jesuíticas*, 2007, and *Misiones jesuíticas: Visión artística y patrimonial*, 2009). But in the early 1990s Darko Sustersic had already established himself as the leading scholar on the Reductions, combining rigorous archival research with anthropological methodologies and visual analysis to reconstruct the chronology of Reduction architecture (*Patrimonio jesuítico: La Compañía de Jesús en América*, 2007; *Templos jesuítico-guaraníes*, 1999) and sculpture ("José Brasanelli: Escultor," 1993; "El Hermano José Brasanelli," 1997). His greatest contribution is his virtual discovery of Giuseppe Brasanelli (1659–1728), the most important European sculptor on the Reductions and one whose incalculable but ambivalent impact on eighteenth-century Guaraní religious sculpture is a major theme in Sustersic's new book, *Imágenes guaraní-jesuíticas*, the culmination of a life's work of studying, discovering, and advocating for the precious sculptural heritage of the Guaraní people.

This is the most comprehensive book to date on Guaraní sculpture. The text is accompanied by a 424-page presentation of color images from all over South America on an accompanying CD-ROM, including many that appear for the first time. Sustersic is outspokenly traditional in his methodology; indeed his defense of visual analysis and connoisseurship is a major theme in the book, taken up at length in part 3. But he is not the reactionary he might at first appear: his chronology and contextualization of the sculptures is supported by the most complete compendium of primary sources on this material ever assembled in one place, and he draws deeply upon the work of anthropologists, from Franz Boas to Josefina Plá. Sustersic's approach is really the only answer to sorting out the bewildering chronological problems that have plagued the field from the beginning—neither signatures nor references to surviving sculptures exist in the sources, unlike in the notarial documents of Quito—which has resulted in a general consensus that the plainest, least European-looking are from the seventeenth century and those more faithful to Baroque models are from the eighteenth. The reality pieced together by Sustersic is much more complicated.

Sustersic's method of crafting family trees based on prototypes has allowed him to show that uniquely Guaraní features were present at all phases of Reduction sculpture. These consist of a tendency toward frontality and rigidity, tube-like tunics and planimetric drapery that favors abstract patterns such as zigzags, and above all a mesmerizing gaze, which he calls "hypnotic" (94) and maintains has a "supernatural" (148) or "magic character" (55). Here Sustersic adopts Martin Buber's relational concept of *Ich und Du* (261), in which worshipers seek the Divine through facial interaction with the image. Even after Brasanelli and European prints interrupted these tendencies with more dynamic, twisting Baroque figures—Sustersic sees these as "the antithesis" (393) of Guaraní aesthetics—Guaraní artists eventually reverted to frontality, symmetry, and the hypnotic gaze, allowing them to coexist, at times uneasily, with the new forms. For Sustersic, sculpture was a ritual act: the Guaraní sculptor was a Santo Apohára, literally "saint maker," which was a "shamanic condition that consisted in evoking figures in a tree-trunk, and later a stone, which possessed a superior power, capable of suggesting, channeling, or reproducing an experience of the Sacred in whomever contemplates it" (383). This supernatural character is manifested through an ascendancy over human suffering and an expression of ecstasy and wonder that anthropologist León Cadogan (*Ayvu Rapita*, 1992) sees as the trademark of Guaraní spirituality; Sustersic considers it to be a "constant characteristic" (379) of Guaraní mission sculpture, whether in the rigid and monumental Christ figures at Santa María de Fé or in the more Baroque and balletic Jesuit saints at San Ignacio Guazú.

In some ways the most exciting book under review here is *Les arts en Nouvelle-France*, since it compels us now to bring France's thriving colony in North America (1608–1759) into the conversation about Latin American art more generally. French America is as legitimately part of the story as Spanish and Portuguese America—indeed Haiti has long been included in works on Latin American arts (e.g., John F. Scott, *Latin American Art*, 1999)—but has been studied almost exclusively within Quebec, the kind of regional isolation that once plagued Latin American stud-

ies in places like Quito or Paraguay. Although the arts of Nouvelle-France have been studied in some depth—particularly architecture (Alan Gowans, *Church Architecture in New France,* 1955; Luc Noppen, *Les églises du Québec,* 1977), sculpture (John R. Porter, *La sculpture ancienne au Québec,* 1986; René Villeneuve, *Baroque to Neo-Classical,* 1997), embroideries (Christine Turgeon, *Le fil de l'art,* 2002), silverwork (Musée du Québec, *François Ranvoyzé, orfèvre,* 1968), or a single region (Madeleine Landry and Robert Derome, *L'art sacré en Amérique française,* 2005, on the Côte-de-Beaupré)—the literature in general has tended to favor the survey or catalogue raisonné format at the expense of analysis or contextualization. Studies also tended to reproduce the same limited number of objects.

By contrast, *Les arts en Nouvelle-France* features thematic chapters that engage the latest theoretical approaches from the leading scholars in the field, including Laurier Lacroix, the author of the main text, François-Marc Gagnon, Christine Cheyrou (formerly Turgeon), Ariane Généreux, and others. It also brings together a much larger corpus of documentary sources and objects than before—two hundred in all—including some extraordinary newcomers like the eighteenth-century Native American painted leather robe featuring naturalistic birds and flowers and Rococo fantasy scrolls at the Musée du Quai Branly in Paris (34), a work that should be known by anyone studying acculturative art in the Americas. The book also treats at some length the Guaman Poma *Corónica* of Quebec: Louis Nicolas's *Codex canadensis* (ca. 1670) is a richly illustrated proto-anthropological text with unique insight into seventeenth-century aboriginal cultures, which has recently appeared in a scholarly edition (François-Marc Gagnon, *The Codex canadensis,* 2011) and amazingly has never been compared to Latin American equivalents. With sections on music, gardens, ephemera, the art market, acculturative aboriginal artworks, and a fascinating study of the impact of the Enlightenment on French-Canadian thought, this book plunges us more deeply into the cultural totality of French Canada than any earlier study.

The book is divided into three main sections: "Exploration" (before 1660), "Implementation" (1660–1710), and "Distinction" (1710–1760), by which Lacroix means the forging of a unique Creole culture. In the first section art is examined as the product of a "mobile and curious society" (17), encompassing Native American trade or treaty artifacts, maps, and early ethnographic prints, all emerging from France's desire to control the cod and fur trade. This phase of French expansion was in the hands of the various companies chartered by the French Crown (Marchands de Rouen, Cent-Associés), which handled trade and colonization before Canada became a royal colony in the 1660s. It was also the era of the Jesuit and Recollect missionary orders and the Augustinian and Ursuline orders of nuns; these women had far greater impact on Amerindian groups and the artistic life of the colony than did their counterparts in New Spain or South America. Small and durable paintings on copper, and ivory and wood statues were the order of the day, first produced in France and commissioned by pious benefactors like the duchesse d'Aiguillon, but soon executed by Canadian artists. The Ursulines went further: under the guidance of their first prioress Marie de l'Incarnation, they established the first arts workshop in Quebec, an all-woman affair that designed

buildings, gilded and perhaps carved sculpture, executed paintings, and made embroideries of the highest quality (the latter are the subject of Cheyrou's essay), becoming the primary supplier of religious art to the fledgling colony and the missions. There is nothing comparable in Spanish or Portuguese America.

This was also the era of the Jesuit *Rélations*, begun in 1632, the published exploits of the short-lived Jesuit mission activities among the Huron and other aboriginals, and a major inspiration for the Paraguay Reductions. As with the early Mendicant missions in New Spain, early mission work was driven by a spirit of utopianism—Fernand Dumont calls it a *"utopie religieuse"* (20)—in which pious French aristocrats and financiers supported what they saw as a return to the values of the early church. But as Muriel Clair indicates in her discussion of the first Jesuit chapels among the Huron, there was a striking dichotomy between the highly acculturative architecture on the missions—the Huron chapels were built inside longhouses—and the emphatically French buildings in the St. Lawrence Valley (44), built in a classicizing Baroque style.

A true Creole style in the arts only developed after 1663 with direct control by Louis XIV, marked by the arrival of the first bishop, the 1665 appearance of Viceroy de Tracy, Intendant Jean Talon, the eight-hundred-strong Carignan-Salières regiment (twice the population of the colony at the time), and in 1663–1673 the thousand *filles du roi*—unmarried women shipped to Quebec to increase the population, which reached seventy thousand by the 1759 British conquest of Nouvelle-France. These events, together with an increasing number of *seigneuries* (land grants) and the first parish churches (after 1678), created rich new opportunities for local architects and artists.

Two such were Bordeaux immigrant sculptor Jacques Leblond de Latour, responsible for one of the most important tabernacles and suites of religious sculptures for the prosperous parish of L'Ange-Gardien from ca. 1690, and Canadian sculptor Pierre-Noël Levasseur, who designed the most important retable in new France in 1726–1736 for the Ursuline convent, a work which bears remarkable similarities to Spanish American *retablos*. This was also the era of the Recollect painter Frère Luc (1614–1685), a pupil of Simon Vouet who spent fifteen months in Quebec in 1670–1671, where he executed pictures on copper or canvas such as the *Holy Family with a Huron Girl* (1671), an allegory for the educational program of the Ursulines. Another kind of painting with resonances in Spanish America are the ex-voto paintings made to Saint Anne of Beaupré in thanksgiving for a safe passage down the St. Lawrence River, often by Canadian painters, that constitute rare documentation of the clothing and furnishings of French Canada. The book also reproduces stark portraits of religious leaders such as Sainte Marguerite Bourgeoys (1700) or the preacher L'Abbé Joseph de la Colombière (1723), which chillingly evoke their ascetic mysticism through angular features and dark backgrounds. As in Spanish America, the retable was the most important type of sculptural commission in the colony. Some look like those in Spanish America, while others take the form of a baldachin, a circle of columns inspired ultimately by Bernini's *baldacchino* at St. Peter's in Rome (1623–1634) but more directly from Gabriel Le Duc's altarpiece at Val-de-Grâce in Paris (1663). Altarpieces also incor-

porated a uniquely Québécois form, monumental tabernacles built to look like the exterior of a Parisian Baroque church—complete with facade with side volutes and dome—which were set above the altar table.

In a 2009 state of the question on viceregal Latin American art written for *Renaissance Quarterly,* I pleaded for more rigorous archival studies and for an expansion of the field to include rich but neglected regions such as Nueva Granada and the Cono Sur, more transatlantic studies, and monographs that drew parallels and connections with the French colonies in North America. In the past four years the field has made bold steps in these directions. This bodes well for future research, which I hope will continue to discover and integrate regions even further from the Mexico-Peru axis and fully to embrace Brazil as part of this viceregal patrimony that can now be seen to extend from the frozen north of Quebec to Chilean Patagonia.