

that we thus account for the conservative tone of Comedy—and the demonstration of Alessandro Chiapelli (knowledge of which I owe to Professor Burnet), that the Socrates of the Clouds is historical. I can find no trace of either of these views in Mr. Helder's thesis.

T. W. ALLEN.

An Elementary Greek Grammar. By the late J. B. ALLEN. Oxford, Clarendon Press. 1902. Pp. iv. + 194. 3s.

THIS appears to be an excellent little book. Mr. J. B. Allen died in the autumn of 1901

leaving some of the Syntax unrevised. Mr. Mairs has however carried out all the revision that was necessary, thereby greatly adding, no doubt, to the value of the book. It would have been more convenient, I think, if the irregular verbs had been put all together and in a tabular form, as they appear in Dr. Rutherford's *First Greek Grammar*. Also the statement that 'accents [instead of marks of accent] did not exist in the times of classical Greek, but were invented about 200 B.C.' might lead some to think that classical Greek was pronounced without accents.

R. C. SEATON.

CORRESPONDENCE.

ON PLATO'S *REPUBLIC*, P. 488.

I CANNOT reply to Professor T. D. Seymour's observations without a few words of preliminary explanation.

1. The volume of Text in the Jowett-Campbell edition was printed before the lamented death of the late Master of Balliol (see the Preface, p. ix), and the marginal analysis was transferred to it from the second edition of his Translation. Hence the words in parenthesis '(the people in their better mind)' are not mine, and I should not have chosen them to render *γενναῖον*, which expresses Plato's half-humorous pity for the grand, ingenuous, simple being, that is thus coerced or cajoled. See, in what follows, *μη̄ πάνυ οὕτω τῶν πολλῶν κατηγορεῖ* (499 D)...*ἄφρονόν τε καὶ πρᾶον ὄντα* (*ib.* E).

2. Having referred to the Translation, let me further explain that any obscurity or uncertainty hereabouts may be due to a difference of opinion which often arose between myself and the Translator in considering the latter portion of the sentence.

3. I have always understood *ναύκληρον* to be the owner of the ship; and it had not occurred to me that any reader of our commentary would imagine otherwise. Professor Seymour's note, however, shows that 'Captain' is not free from ambiguity. But 'Master' is no better; and 'Shipowner' (a clumsy word) is not altogether adequate, because the owner is in this case on board the vessel, and is of course in command:

i.e. he has the right at any moment to determine who shall navigate the ship.

4. The only difference, then, between my view and Professor Seymour's, that is not merely verbal, lies in the acceptation of the words *ὅπως δὲ κυβερνήσει ἂν τέ τινες βούλωνται ἂν τε μή, μήτε τέχνην τούτου μήτε μελέτην οἰόμενοι δυνατόν εἶναι λαβεῖν ἅμα καὶ τὴν κυβερνητικὴν*. I take the indefinite subject of *κυβερνήσει* to be the individual sailor, who aims at becoming steersman (*i.e.* *προστάτης τῆς πόλεως*). I would explain the plural *τινές* to include all whose opposition is to be overborne. And I understand *τὴν κυβερνητικὴν* to mean the true science of navigation (*i.e.* of government). This the actual pilot has never taken the trouble to acquire, because such an effort would have interfered with the one study which appeared to him worth while, *viz.* the art of being the helmsman (*i.e.* of being in power).

This seems to me to agree better than the other interpretation with *ἕκαστον οἰόμενον δεῖν κυβερνᾶν* and *τοῦ δὲ ἀληθινοῦ κυβερνήτου πέρι μηδ' ἐπαύοντες* in the preceding context.

LEWIS CAMPBELL.

S. ANDREA, ALASSIO, ITALY.
Nov. 14th, 1902.

P.S.—The passage of Aristotle's *Politics* quoted in Professor Seymour's P.S. seems

rather to be a reminiscence of Plato's *Politicus*, p. 296, where the philosopher's attitude towards the people, and towards mankind in general, is considerably changed.

L. C.

Since the above was in type, I have seen Mr. Adam's Commentary. He has weighed the conflicting arguments with great care, and his conclusion differs from mine. I will state here very briefly the grounds on which I still adhere to my own view.

1. Schneider's suggestion, 'ὅπως ad τούτου spectans modum et rationem potius quam

finem significat,' is incompatible with the correspondence of ὅπως κυβερνήσει to ὅπως ἄρξει *supra*, where ὅπως is clearly final. And κυβερνήσει also corresponds to δειν κυβερνᾶν *supra*, where κυβερνᾶν is not 'to steer rightly,' but 'to be steersman.'

2. For τέχνη ironical, see the Gorgias: and for μελέτη apart from philosophy, cf. Phaed. 82 B.

3. The notion of compulsory government is irrelevant to the main drift of the passage and alien to the spirit of B. vi.: cf. 502 B. πόλιω ἔχων πειθομένην.

L. C.

REPORTS.

PROCEEDINGS OF THE OXFORD PHILOLOGICAL SOCIETY.—MICHAELMAS TERM, 1902.

ON October 31st, in Trinity College, Professor ELLIS read a paper on Ibis 607, 8 *Qua sua Penteliden proles est ultra Lycurgum, Haec maneat tibi te quoque plaga novii*. He thought that the distich might be explained by the story recounted in Parthenius, *περὶ ἐρωτικῶν παθημάτων* c. xxxv. Parthenius' story is as follows:—

Cydon, a dynast in Crete, had betrothed his daughter Eulimene to a leading Cretan named Apterus (King Ateras, as he is called by Eusebius, Chron. II 30). Eulimene, however, was beloved by another Cretan named *Lycastus*. Some of the Cretan towns having revolted from Cydon and conquered him, he sent to Delphi to inquire by what means he was to be successful against them. The oracle commanded him to sacrifice a virgin: lots were cast, and Eulimene was selected. *Lycastus* in alarm confessed that he had long loved and consorted with Eulimene. The people assembled, we may suppose, to judge the case, were more than ever determined that she should die. After the execution, Cydon ordered the priest to cut open the womb, upon which she was found pregnant. Then Apterus, incensed at the indignity put upon him by *Lycastus*, laid an ambush and killed him.

Reading *Prataliden Lycastum* for *Penteliden Lycurgum*, he would translate the distich thus: 'May the stroke that is in store for you be dealt by the same unlooked for weapon by means of which *Lycastus*' unborn child punished its father.' The barbarous outrage (on Eulimene's body,) of which *Lycastus* was the ultimate cause, brought him in his turn the surprise of an equally unlooked for death; in this way the unborn child punished its father.

If *Lycastum* in the Ibis-distich was corrupted to *Lycurgum*, it is nothing strange to find *Prataliden* has become *Penteliden*, or *Pentiladen*, (so the excellent Gale MS), or *Penteliden* or *Penthidem*. Such transformations of proper names are common generally; very common in Ovid's *Metamorphoses*, and in the *Ibis*. What is more to the purpose, we have a corruption of an almost identical kind in v. 447 of this very poem; for *Panthoides* has there become *Penthides*, *Pentelides*, *Pithoides* in different MSS.

That *Lycastus* is called *Pratalides* I infer from Anth. P. VII, 449, 450, two epigrams which have become amalgamated, but which are certainly distinct as Stadtmüller has shown.

For further proof see *American Journal of Philology* vol. xxiii. pp. 204–5, where the paper is printed entire, with some new emendations of the text of Parthenius.

After this, Mr. E. O. Winstedt read to the Society another paper by Professor ELLIS giving a short account of the Professor's latest exploration of Catullian MSS in Italy (1901–2). This was supplemented by a short notice of the unique MS. of the *Hisperica Famina* in the Vatican; the complete paper is printed in *Hermathena* for 1902.

On November 7th at Exeter College, Dr. FARNELL read a paper on the Greek festival of the Thesmophoria and the meaning of the name *θεσμοφόρος*. After an examination of the records concerning the various Thesmophoria-festivals in the Greek world, he argued that the name *θεσμοφόρια* must have arisen from *θεσμοφόρος*, not vice-versâ: that the ritual which was very archaic, entirely failed to bear out the interpretation of the latter word as 'Legifera,' 'the giver of Law,' which for other reasons was improbable; and that the other interpretation 'the bringer of marriage' also clashed with the facts of the festival, and was linguistically unsound. He suggested that *θεσμοφόρος* as a ritualistic word must originally have had some physical and material sense, and probably preserves some old Ionic use of *θεσμός* that had almost died out: such a use as that attested for Anacreon, *θεσμός* = *θησαυρός*: so that *θεσμοφόρος* might have designated Demeter as 'the bringer of the heaped-up pile,' the 'wealth-bringer': and that this interpretation was entirely in harmony with the ritual, which looked primarily to the fertility of the fields and secondarily to the increase of the family. He further discussed the exclusion of men and the supremacy of women in the management of the festival, and argued that this phenomenon, neither here nor in the other instances of its occurrence in Greek ritual, could be reasonably regarded