

Solution of a Problem proposed by Dr Muir.

By R. E. ALLARDICE, M.A.

The problem is to show that the expression
 $\{(a^{\frac{1}{2}} + b^{\frac{1}{2}})^4 - c\} \{(a^{\frac{1}{2}} + \omega b^{\frac{1}{2}})^4 - c\} \{(a^{\frac{1}{2}} + \omega^2 b^{\frac{1}{2}})^4 - c\} \{(a^{\frac{1}{2}} + \omega^3 b^{\frac{1}{2}})^4 - c\}$,
 where ω is an imaginary fourth root of unity, is symmetrical with respect to a , b , and c .

First Method.—Denote the above expression by P . Then, by means of the identity $x^4 - y^4 = (x + y)(x + \omega y)(x + \omega^2 y)(x + \omega^3 y)$, P may be expressed as the product of sixteen factors, namely, the sixteen values of $a^{\frac{1}{2}} + \omega^r b^{\frac{1}{2}} + \omega^s c^{\frac{1}{2}}$, where r and s have successively the values 1, 2, 3, 4. This product is obviously symmetrical, and the symmetry is not destroyed to the eye by a re-combination of the factors in sets of four, the form thus obtained being

$$(a + b + c - 2a^{\frac{1}{2}}b^{\frac{1}{2}} - 2b^{\frac{1}{2}}c^{\frac{1}{2}} - 2c^{\frac{1}{2}}a^{\frac{1}{2}})(a + b + c - 2a^{\frac{1}{2}}b^{\frac{1}{2}} + 2b^{\frac{1}{2}}c^{\frac{1}{2}} + 2c^{\frac{1}{2}}a^{\frac{1}{2}}) \\ \times (a + b + c + 2a^{\frac{1}{2}}b^{\frac{1}{2}} - 2b^{\frac{1}{2}}c^{\frac{1}{2}} + 2c^{\frac{1}{2}}a^{\frac{1}{2}})(a + b + c + 2a^{\frac{1}{2}}b^{\frac{1}{2}} + 2b^{\frac{1}{2}}c^{\frac{1}{2}} - 2c^{\frac{1}{2}}a^{\frac{1}{2}}).$$

Second Method.—Since

$$(a^{\frac{1}{2}} + \omega b^{\frac{1}{2}})^4 - c = \omega^{12}(a^{\frac{1}{2}} + \omega b^{\frac{1}{2}})^4 - c = (\omega^3 a^{\frac{1}{2}} + b^{\frac{1}{2}})^4 - c,$$

P is evidently symmetrical with respect to a and b . Further, since the change of $b^{\frac{1}{2}}$ into $\omega b^{\frac{1}{2}}$ does not alter P , P is rational in b and therefore also in a . When $b = 0$, P becomes $(a - c)^4$ which is symmetrical in a and c . Hence P has been proved symmetrical in a and b , and symmetrical in a and c except in those terms which contain all the three letters. Thus

$$P = \Sigma a^4 + A \Sigma a^3 b + B \Sigma a^2 b^2 + C(a^2 bc + ab^2 c) + Dabc^2.$$

It remains to prove $C = D$.

The co-efficient of c^2 in P is $\Sigma(a^{\frac{1}{2}} + b^{\frac{1}{2}})^4(a + \omega b^{\frac{1}{2}})^4$ and D is equal to the value of this when $a = b = 1$, less twice the value when $a = 1, b = 0$, that is $-112 - 2 \times 6 = -124$.

The co-efficient of c in P is $-\Sigma(a^{\frac{1}{2}} + b^{\frac{1}{2}})^4(a^{\frac{1}{2}} + \omega b^{\frac{1}{2}})^4(a^{\frac{1}{2}} + \omega^2 b^{\frac{1}{2}})^4$ and $2C$ is equal to the value of this when $a = b = 1$, less twice the value when $a = 1, b = 0$, that is $-(256 - 2 \times 4) = -248 = 2D$.

Therefore $C = D$.