

VOLUME 30

NUMBER 3

JULY 2021

CQ

Cambridge

Quarterly of

Healthcare

Ethics

*A Quarterly Journal Devoted to
Engaging a World Community
of Bioethicists*

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS



**Cambridge
Quarterly of
Healthcare
Ethics**

*A Quarterly
Journal Devoted
to Engaging a
World Community
of Bioethicists*

EDITORS

Thomasine Kushner, *University of California, Berkeley*
Steve Heilig, *San Francisco Medical Society*

ASSOCIATE EDITORS

Matti Häyry, *Aalto University, Helsinki, Finland*
Tuija Takala, *University of Helsinki, Finland*

David C. Thomasma, Co-Editor, 1992–2002

EDITORIAL BOARD

Akira Akabayashi, *Kyoto University, Japan*
William Andereck, *California Pacific Medical Center, San Francisco, USA*
Martin Buijsen, *Erasmus University, Rotterdam, The Netherlands*
Arthur Caplan, *NYU Lagoon Medical Center, New York, USA*
Joseph J. Fins, *Weill Medical College of Cornell University, New York, USA*
Leonard M. Fleck, *Center of Ethics and Humanities, Michigan State University, USA*
Paul J. Ford, *Cleveland Clinic, USA*
James Giordano, *Georgetown University Medical Center, USA*
John Harris, *University of Manchester, United Kingdom*
David Lawrence, *University of Edinburgh, United Kingdom*
Gerrit K. Kimsma, *Vrije University of Amsterdam, The Netherlands*
Guillermo Palchik, *California Pacific Medical Center, USA*
Rosamond Rhodes, *Mount Sinai School of Medicine, New York, USA*
Doris Schroeder, *University of Central Lancaster, United Kingdom*
Pavel Tichtchenko, *Institute of Philosophy, Academy of Science, Moscow, Russia*
Mark R. Wicclair, *University of Pittsburg & West Virginia University, USA*

The Cambridge Bioethics Education Working Groups: Connecting Bioethics Educators Around the World

The purpose of the Cambridge Bioethics Education Working Groups is to encourage people and institutions to work together on developing bioethics education in their countries. These focus groups invite others to share their information and develop mutual projects to further how bioethics is taught in universities, hospitals, and for the general public.
<https://www.cambridge.org/core/journals/cambridge-quarterly-of-healthcare-ethics/cambridge-bioethics-education-working-groups>

CLINICAL NEUROETHICS ADVISORY BOARD

EDITOR

Thomasine Kushner, *University of California, Berkeley*
kushnertk@gmail.com

ASSOCIATE EDITOR

James Giordano, *Georgetown University Medical Center*

EDITORIAL BOARD

Yves Agid, *Institut du Cerveau et de la Moelle Epinière, France*
Martin Buijsen, *Erasmus University, Rotterdam, The Netherlands*
Benjamin Capps, *Dalhousie University, Canada*
John Danaher, *National University of Ireland, Galway, Ireland*
Joseph J. Fins, *Weill Medical College of Cornell University, New York, USA*
Paul J. Ford, *Department of Bioethics, Cleveland Clinic, USA*
Grant Gillett, *University of Otago Medical School, New Zealand*
John Harris, *University of Manchester, England*
Stephen Hauser, *University of California, San Francisco, USA*
Göran Hermerén, *Lund University, Sweden*
Judy Illes, *The University of British Columbia, Canada*
Philipp Kellmeyer, *University of Freiburg Medical Center, Germany*
Karola Kreitmair, *University of Wisconsin-Madison, USA*
David Lawrence, *University of Edinburgh, United Kingdom*
Guillermo Palchik, *California Pacific Medical Center, San Francisco, USA*

Neuroethics Network/Cambridge Consortium for Bioethics Education/International Bioethics Retreat
<http://www.icmbioethics.com/cambridge-home.html>

Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics

Volume 30, Number 3, July 2021

CONTENTS

Contributors 405

Breaking Bioethics

Combatting Covid-19. Or, "All Persons Are Equal but Some
Persons Are More Equal than Others?"

JOHN HARRIS 406

Special Section: Novel Beings

Guest Editorial

Novel Beings: Moral Status and Regulation

DAVID LAWRENCE and SARAH MORLEY 415

Articles

Regulating the Tyrell Corporation: the Emergence of Novel
Beings

DAVID R. LAWRENCE and SARAH MORLEY 421

Artificial Moral Responsibility: How We Can and Cannot
Hold Machines Responsible

DANIEL W. TIGARD 435

Commentary

The Mandatory Ontology of Robot Responsibility

MARC CHAMPAGNE 448

Response

Artificial Agents in Natural Moral Communities: A Brief
Clarification

DANIEL W. TIGARD 455

How Could We Know When a Robot was a Moral Patient?

HENRY SHEVLIN 459

Commentary

What Matters for Moral Status: Behavioral or Cognitive
Equivalence?

JOHN DANAHER 472

What Do We Owe to Novel Synthetic Beings and How Can
We Be Sure?

ALEX MCKEOWN 479

Contents continued

Contents continued

The Moral Status of Cognitively Enhanced Monkeys and Other Novel Beings GARDAR ARNASON	492
The Desirability of Legal Rights for Novel Beings JOSHUA JOWITT	504
Moral Status for Malware! The Difficulty of Defining Advanced Artificial Intelligence MIRANDA MOWBRAY	517
Patents, Governance and Control: Ethics and the Patentability of Novel Beings and Advanced Biotechnologies in Europe AISLING MCMAHON	529
Novel Beings and Assisted Nonexistence ISRA BLACK	543

EDITORIAL OFFICE: Editorial correspondence, including manuscript submission, should be addressed to Thomasine Kushner, PhD. To facilitate review, please submit manuscripts as electronic copy, preferably in MS Word, to kushnertk@gmail.com. Books for review should be sent to Greg Loeben, 2532 N. 4th Street, #442 Flagstaff, AZ 86004. Books for review on neuroethics should be sent to Thomasine Kushner, 1001 Bridgeway #A1, Sausalito, CA 94965.

SUBSCRIPTION INFORMATION: *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics* (ISSN 0963-1801) is published quarterly in January, April, July, and October by Cambridge University Press, One Liberty Plaza, Floor 20, New York, NY 10006/Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, UPH, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8BS, UK. Annual subscription rates for volume 30 (2021) USA, Canada, and Mexico/Elsewhere: Institutional rates, print and online: \$714/£444; online only: \$567/£353; print only: \$708/£442. Individual rates, print only: \$148/£90; online only: \$118/£72. Single part: \$204/£127. Students and retirees: \$125/£79. American Society for Bioethics and Humanities members: \$105/£62. Prices include postage. Subscription offices: One Liberty Plaza, Floor 20, New York, NY 10006, USA; outside the USA, Canada, and Mexico: Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, UPH, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8BS, UK. Claims for missing issues should be made immediately after receipt of the next issue. *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics* and other Cambridge journals can be found at <http://journals.cambridge.org>.

Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics is a partner journal of the American Society for Bioethics and Humanities.

Periodicals postage paid at New York, NY and additional mailing offices. POSTMASTER: Send address changes in the USA, Canada, and Mexico to *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics*, Cambridge University Press, One Liberty Plaza, Floor 20, New York, NY 10006, USA. Send address changes elsewhere to *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics*, Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, UPH, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8BS, UK.

© **Cambridge University Press 2021**. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopying, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. Policies, request forms, and contacts are available at: <http://www.cambridge.org/rights/permissions/permission.htm>

Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics is indexed in Index Medicus and in the ASSIA, ISI, MEDLINE, Philosopher's Index, and Proquest databases.

Permission to copy (for users in the USA) is available from Copyright Clearance Center, <http://www.copyright.com>, email: info@copyright.com.