

VOLUME 21 NUMBER 4 DECEMBER 2009

Utilitas

# Utilitas

A Leading Journal in Ethics

VOLUME 21

NUMBER 4

DECEMBER 2009

CAMBRIDGE

CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

## Editor

PAUL KELLY, *London School of Economics*

## Associate Editors

ROGER CRISP, *St. Anne's College, Oxford*

BRAD HOOKER, *University of Reading*

PHILIP SCHOFIELD, *University College London*

## Consultant Editor

FRED ROSEN, *University College London*

## Review Editor

DAVID WEINSTEIN, *Wake Forest University*

## Editorial Committee

BRIAN BARRY, *Columbia University*

DAVID BRINK, *University of California, San Diego*

J. H. BURNS, *University College London*

KRISTER BYKVIST, *Jesus College, Oxford*

JONATHAN DANCY, *University of Reading*

H. T. DICKINSON, *Edinburgh University*

JULIA DRIVER, *Dartmouth College*

R. G. FREY, *Bowling Green State University*

JAMES GRIFFIN, *Corpus Christi College, Oxford*

ROSS HARRISON, *University College London*

SAMUEL HOLLANDER, *University of Toronto*

NILS HOLTUG, *University of Copenhagen*

FRANCES KAMM, *Harvard University*

KLEMENS KAPPEL, *University of Copenhagen*

DESMOND KING, *Nuffield College, Oxford*

KASPER LIPPERT-RASMUSSEN, *University of  
Copenhagen*

D. G. LONG, *University of Western Ontario*

DAVID LYONS, *Boston University*

ELINOR MASON, *Edinburgh University*

DENNIS MCKERLIE, *University of Calgary*

DAVID MCNAUGHTON, *Florida State University*

MICHELE M. MOODY-ADAMS, *Cornell University*

ANDREW MOORE, *University of Otago*

TIM MULGAN, *University of St. Andrews*

YOSHIO NAGAI, *Kanto Gakuin University*

SERENA OLSARETTI, *University of Cambridge*

INGMAR PERSSON, *University of Gothenburg*

GERALD J. POSTEMA, *University of North Carolina at  
Chapel Hill*

JONATHAN RILEY, *Tulane University*

ALAN RYAN, *New College, Oxford*

SAMUEL SCHEFFLER, *University of California, Berkeley*

J. B. SCHNEEWIND, *Johns Hopkins University*

AMARTYA SEN, *Harvard University*

JOHN SKORUPSKI, *University of St. Andrews*

MICHAEL SLOTE, *University of Miami*

NICHOLAS STURGEON, *Cornell University*

ROBERT SUGDEN, *University of East Anglia*

L. W. SUMNER, *University of Toronto*

LARRY TEMKIN, *Rutgers, State University of New Jersey*

C. L. TEN, *National University of Singapore*

W. L. TWINING, *University College London*

PETER VALLENTYNE, *University of Missouri*

DONALD WINCH, *University of Sussex*

JONATHAN WOLFF, *University College London*

# Utilitas

## Editorial Policy

*Utilitas* is a pioneering interdisciplinary journal of moral and political philosophy, economic theory, jurisprudence, and intellectual history. It welcomes articles, discussions, debates, and reviews on contemporary themes in those disciplines in which utilitarianism has made a particular contribution and on all aspects of the development of utilitarian thought (including that of its opponents).

The Journal is supported by the International Society for Utilitarian Studies, which sponsors major conferences, seminars, and other meetings, and makes special offers on books at advantageous rates to members. Individual subscribers to the journal automatically become members of the Society.

Other features of *Utilitas* include special issues or parts of issues on particular themes and individuals.

## International Society for Utilitarian Studies

Subscription to *Utilitas* includes membership of the International Society for Utilitarian Studies. The Society, administered from the Bentham Project at University College London, sponsors major conferences, seminars, and other meetings. It aims to provide a forum for scholarly debate and research in the history of utilitarian thought, and its present-day relevance in the fields of ethics, politics, law, economics, and public policy. Members are entitled to a discount on the fees for the Society's conferences and to discounts on volumes in the new authoritative edition of *The Collected Works of Jeremy Bentham*.

For further details visit the ISUS web site at [www.ucl.ac.uk/bentham-project/info/isus.htm](http://www.ucl.ac.uk/bentham-project/info/isus.htm)

For an up-to-date bibliography of writings on Jeremy Bentham visit [www.ucl.ac.uk/Bentham-Project/info/bibliog.htm](http://www.ucl.ac.uk/Bentham-Project/info/bibliog.htm)

*Utilitas* and all other Cambridge journals can be accessed via <http://www.cup.cam.ac.uk> and in North America via <http://www.cup.org>.

This journal issue has been printed on FSC-certified paper and cover board. FSC is an independent, non-governmental, not-for-profit organization established to promote the responsible management of the world's forests. Please see [www.fsc.org](http://www.fsc.org) for information.

© Cambridge University Press 2009

ISSN 0953-8208  
Cambridge University Press

# Utilitas

Volume 21 Number 4 December 2009

## CONTENTS

### *Articles*

- A Conflict in Common-Sense Moral Psychology  
AARON Z. ZIMMERMAN 401
- Ownership and Justice for Animals ALASDAIR COCHRANE 424
- Is Situationism All Bad News? LUKE RUSSELL 443
- A Paradox for Weak Deontology MICHAEL HUEMER 464
- Some Difficult Intuitions for the Principle of Universality  
STEPHEN KERSHNAR 478
- Rawls and Cohen on Facts and Principles A. FAIK KURTULMUS 489
- On Three Alleged Theories of Rational Behavior  
STUART RACHELS 506

### *Book Reviews*

- Joseph Mendola, *Goodness and Justice: A Consequentialist  
Moral Theory* DAVID CUMMISKEY 521
- Martha C. Nussbaum, *Frontiers of Justice: Disability,  
Nationality, Species Membership* SHLOMI SEGALL 526
- Ken Binmore, *Natural Justice* KARL WIDERQUIST 529
- Jonathan Wolff and Avner De-Shalit, *Disadvantage*  
PETER VALLENTYNE 532